

**OFFICIAL REPORT OF PROCEEDINGS  
BEFORE THE  
NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD**

---

**In the Matter of:**

**Case No.: 13-RC-198325**

**UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO**

**Employer**

**And**

**GRADUATE STUDENTS UNITED**

**Petitioner**

**Place: Chicago, IL**

**Date: 05/19/17**

**Pages: 106-356**

**Volume: 2**

---

**OFFICIAL REPORTERS**

**Veritext National Court Reporters**

**Mid-Atlantic Region**

**1250 Eye Street, NW – Suite 350**

**Washington, DC 20005**

**888-777-6690**

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
BEFORE THE NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD  
REGION 13

UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO )  
)  
Employer )  
)  
and ) Case No.  
) 13-RC-198325  
GRADUATE STUDENTS UNITED )  
)  
Petitioner )

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing pursuant to notice, before CHRISTINA MOLS, Hearing Officer, at 219 South Dearborn Street, Eighth Floor, Chicago, Illinois, on Friday, May 19, 2017, at 9:00 a.m.

APPEARANCES

On behalf of the Employer:

PROSKAUER ROSE LLP, by  
MR. ZACHARY D. FASMAN,  
MR. ALLAN H. WEITZMAN,  
MR. STEVEN J. PORZIO, and  
MR. STEVEN PEARLMAN  
2255 Glades Road  
Suite 340 West  
Boca Raton, Florida 33431  
561-995-4760  
zfasman@proskauer.com

On behalf of the Petitioner:  
DOWD, BLOCH, BENNETT, CERVONE,  
AUERBACH & YOKICH, by  
MS. MELISSA J. AUERBACH and  
MS. CHANNING M. COOPER  
8 South Michigan Avenue, 19th Floor  
Chicago, Illinois 60603  
312-372-1361  
mauerbach@dbb-law.com

I N D E X

PAGE

WITNESS: David Nirenberg  
Direct Examination by Mr. Fasman 109  
Cross-Examination by Ms. Auerbach 182  
Redirect Examination by Mr. Fasman 260  
Recross-Examination by Ms. Auerbach 269  
Further Redirect Examination by Mr. Fasman 277  
Further Recross-Examination  
by Ms. Auerbach 279

WITNESS: Christopher Wild  
Direct Examination by Mr. Fasman 282

EXHIBIT IDENTIFIED IN EVIDENCE

EXHIBIT	IDENTIFIED	IN EVIDENCE
Employer		
13	115	117
14	124	126
15	132	NOT OFFERED
16	133	166
17	149	166
18	164	167
19	176	176

EXHIBITS (Continued) PAGE

IDENTIFIED IN EVIDENCE

EXHIBIT	IDENTIFIED	IN EVIDENCE
Employer		
20	268	269
Petitioner		
1	199	NOT OFFERED
2	221	NOT OFFERED

Page 110

1 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record.  
2 These proceedings are resumed from the  
3 adjournment yesterday afternoon. I believe the  
4 Employer was going to call its next witness. Is  
5 that correct?  
6 MR. FASMAN: That is correct.  
7 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Call your next  
8 witness.  
9 MR. FASMAN: The University of Chicago  
10 calls David Nirenberg to the stand.  
11 (The witness was duly sworn.)  
12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Please state and  
13 spell your name for the record.  
14 THE WITNESS: David Nirenberg. D-a-v-i-d,  
15 N-i-r-e-n-b-e-r-g.  
16 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you.  
17 DAVID NIRENBERG  
18 having been first duly sworn, was examined and  
19 testified as follows  
20 DIRECT EXAMINATION  
21 BY MR. FASMAN:  
22 Q. Professor Nirenberg, by whom are you  
23 employed?  
24 A. University of Chicago.  
25 Q. And when did you begin working at the

Page 111

1 University of Chicago?  
2 A. I became an employee of the University of  
3 Chicago in 2006, and I moved to the University of  
4 Chicago in 2007.  
5 Q. What is your current job title, sir?  
6 A. I am currently the Deborah R. and Edgar D.  
7 Jannota Distinguished Service Professor on the  
8 Committee on Social Thought, Department of History,  
9 the Department of Languages, Literature --  
10 (Court Reporter requested to  
11 witness to speak more slowly.)  
12 THE WITNESS: Basically I'm the Dean of  
13 Social Sciences.  
14 BY MR. FASMAN:  
15 Q. Thank you. And you are also a professor?  
16 A. And the professorial titles that I began to  
17 recite that is exceedingly long.  
18 Q. In what divisions or schools are you a  
19 professor, sir?  
20 A. I'm a professor in History, in the  
21 Committee on Social Thought, Romance Languages and  
22 Literature, and Center for Middle Eastern Studies,  
23 Program in Jewish Studies, Fundamentals, and the  
24 College.  
25 Q. Okay. And you said you were also the Dean

Page 112

1 of the Division of Social Sciences?  
2 A. Yes.  
3 Q. What is the Division of Social Sciences,  
4 sir?  
5 A. The Division of Social Sciences is the part  
6 of the university that covers all the departments we  
7 associate with the Social Sciences. That is not  
8 always the case at every university, but in our  
9 university that includes History, Anthropology,  
10 Psychology, Sociology, Economics, Political Science,  
11 those kind of departments.  
12 Q. How long had you been Dean of the Division  
13 of Social Sciences?  
14 A. This is the end of my third year as Dean.  
15 Q. And prior to that time you were just a  
16 professor?  
17 A. Prior to that time I was just a professor.  
18 And I directed research programs as well, like the  
19 Neubauer Collegium for Culture and Society, which is  
20 a think tank for the graduate students and faculty.  
21 Q. You mentioned something called on the  
22 Committee on Social Thought. What is that?  
23 A. The Committee on Social Thought, which is  
24 my primary department, is a wonderful thing, founded  
25 during World War II to bring, primarily to bring

Page 113

1 scholars, refugee scholars from the war, people like  
2 Hannah Arendt. It's an interdisciplinary committee.  
3 It has no -- actually it has no undergraduate major  
4 associated with it. Its most famous people, people  
5 like the economist, Hayek, or like the novelist Saul  
6 Bellow or Jonathan Klitsky. So, two Nobel Prizes in  
7 literature, even though it's in the Social Sciences  
8 Division. And occasionally the art historian.  
9 Q. Okay. Tell us briefly about your  
10 educational background, sir.  
11 A. Briefly? But I'm so proud of it. Let's  
12 see. I went to Gildamen (phonetic) Public High  
13 School for high school. I dropped out of that and  
14 worked for a while where I got my best education,  
15 full-time employee in the fast food world. Then I  
16 went to Yale. Did a BA there, and then I went to  
17 Princeton for my combined MA, Ph.D.  
18 Q. And what field is that in, sir?  
19 A. Ph.D.?  
20 Q. Yes.  
21 A. Is in History.  
22 Q. And before you came to Chicago had you been  
23 a professor elsewhere?  
24 A. I had been.  
25 Q. Where, sir?

1 A. I have been a professor at Johns Hopkins in  
2 Baltimore, and before that I've been a professor in  
3 Rice University in Houston, and I've been a visiting  
4 professor in a couple of places.

5 Q. What subjects have you taught at the  
6 University of Chicago?

7 A. Well, that's the beauty of social thought,  
8 that you can teach anything you want. So, I've  
9 taught medieval history. I've also taught religion  
10 jointly in the divinity school. I've taught  
11 medieval Spanish literature. I've taught art  
12 history jointly with the history department. I've  
13 taught lots of different subjects.

14 Q. All right. Let's go back to being the Dean  
15 of the Division of Social Sciences. Can you tell us  
16 what you do as the dean? What is the dean's  
17 function?

18 A. The dean's function is a lot. You know --  
19 yeah. I won't quote opera, but (Italian phrase) the  
20 person who does everything for the town. So, in the  
21 Division of Social Sciences, if you think about all  
22 faculty and all graduate students, the dean of the  
23 division is in charge of that. The dean of the  
24 college is in charge of all undergraduates, but the  
25 dean of the division is in charge of all the

1 departments that manage and teach the majors that  
2 undergraduates take. So, there is an undergraduate  
3 component, but it's primarily a component of  
4 nourishing the faculty, the graduate students and  
5 the research.

6 Q. So, you're in -- the division is -- is a  
7 graduate area of the university?

8 A. The division is a graduate area of the  
9 university. It also, if I might just expatiate, it  
10 also teaches the most undergraduates of any part of  
11 the university, but it's the faculty of the division  
12 that teaches the undergraduates.

13 (Employer Exhibit Number 13 was  
14 marked for identification.)

15 BY MR. FASMAN:

16 Q. Professor Nirenberg, actually I've handed  
17 you a document we've marked for identification as  
18 Employer's Exhibit 13. Can I ask you to take a look  
19 at that please, sir?

20 Have you had a chance to take a look at  
21 that, sir?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. So, I'll represent for the record this is  
24 taken off of the University of Chicago's website on  
25 the date and at the time that is listed in the

1 slugget at the bottom. And I'm specifically -- I  
2 would like to specifically direct your attention to  
3 I think the fifth page from the back, which deals  
4 with the degree programs that the Division of Social  
5 Sciences offers. Under the portion that says,  
6 Degrees and Programs.

7 A. Uh-huh.

8 Q. Do you have that?

9 A. This one?

10 Q. Yes, sir. Let me just ask you if that is  
11 an accurate listing of the degrees and programs, not  
12 the joint degrees, but the degrees and programs that  
13 are offered for Ph.D. students in the Division of  
14 Social Sciences?

15 A. Yes. It is.

16 Q. And would you turn over to the next page  
17 which deals with Master of Arts degrees only?

18 A. Uh-huh.

19 Q. And let me ask you if those are the Master  
20 of Arts degrees that are offered in the Division of  
21 Social Sciences?

22 A. Yes. They are.

23 MR. FASMAN: Okay. I'd move the admission  
24 of Employer's Exhibit 13.

25 MS. AUERBACH: No objection.

1 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Employer Exhibit 13  
2 is received.

3 (Employer Exhibit Number 13 was  
4 received in evidence.)

5 BY MR. FASMAN:

6 Q. Staying right where you were, by the way,  
7 are there in the various degree programs -- let me  
8 ask it a different way.

9 Are there departments within the Division  
10 of Social Sciences? How is the division organized?

11 A. Yes. There are eight departments within  
12 the division and one program, Conceptual and  
13 Historical Studies of Science, that is not a  
14 department.

15 Q. What is that?

16 A. The University of Chicago -- I think it's  
17 technically called a committee. It doesn't have  
18 appointed powers, but it does have a graduate  
19 program.

20 Q. Okay. And that's a committee, and is your  
21 committee within this?

22 A. The Committee on Social Thought, which is  
23 listed here as Social Thought, is a department even  
24 though it's called a committee at the University of  
25 Chicago. So is Comparative Human Development often

Page 118

1 called a committee, even though it's a department.  
2 So, they have an appointed policy.  
3 Q. Of the two committees, when were they  
4 created? I think you told us about your committee,  
5 but what's the other one?  
6 A. Comparative Human Development? That has a  
7 very long history which I don't pretend to get  
8 totally right. It's been around for about 75 years,  
9 but it has always not always been a department. It  
10 has sometimes been a committee, and there has been a  
11 long kind of history of segmentation between  
12 psychology and the Committee on Comparative Human  
13 Development which emerged, you might say as a group  
14 of people specialized in anthropological psychology,  
15 so a different approach to psychology than the  
16 psychology department. It consists of  
17 anthropologists, sociologists, psychologists,  
18 linguists.  
19 Q. Interdisciplinary group?  
20 A. Yes.  
21 Q. How many full-time tenure track faculty  
22 does the Social Sciences Division have?  
23 A. It changes every day, but about 200.  
24 Q. As I think you said this already, but is  
25 that the largest branch or division or department at

Page 119

1 the university?  
2 A. Measured in terms of Ph.D. students, it's  
3 the largest.  
4 Q. And there are -- are there any  
5 undergraduate programs that -- undergraduate majors  
6 that fall within the Social Sciences Division?  
7 A. Yes.  
8 Q. What are those?  
9 A. Oh. I mean there is about 17 of them.  
10 Q. Okay.  
11 A. And each department with the exception of  
12 Social Thought, has -- has one. And then there are  
13 many that are -- that are inter-departmental or even  
14 inter-divisional, so we have about 17 undergraduate  
15 programs in the division.  
16 Q. So, how many undergraduate students have  
17 declared majors within one of the Social Science  
18 Division programs?  
19 A. I can't express it as a number, exact  
20 number. About 1,600. But it's about 45 percent of  
21 the graduating class has a major in the social  
22 sciences.  
23 Q. Is that the largest within the university?  
24 A. Yes. Remember there are double majors, so  
25 there are plenty of people that have a major in

Page 120

1 another divisions as well. When I say -- 45 percent  
2 total of declared majors.  
3 Q. Okay. How many Ph.D. students are within  
4 the Social Science Division?  
5 A. That also changes every day, but about a  
6 thousand.  
7 Q. How does that compare to the other  
8 departments or divisions for graduate programs?  
9 A. So, I don't know so well what the other  
10 divisions have. I think Humanities is slightly  
11 smaller, and I think that the biological sciences  
12 and physical sciences are smaller, but I cultivate  
13 my own garden primarily.  
14 Q. How about Master's students? How many  
15 Master's students are there in the Social Sciences  
16 Division?  
17 A. That varies a lot by year. But right now  
18 it's about 340.  
19 Q. Are you familiar with financial aid that's  
20 provided to Social Science Division graduate  
21 students?  
22 A. Yes. In general I am. I am not always  
23 with every micro-detail because, as you know, there  
24 is a Dean of Students who handles all the specific  
25 details, but I set the policy.

Page 121

1 Q. So, talking about financial aid, is there a  
2 difference between what's provided to Ph.D. students  
3 and Master's students?  
4 A. Oh, absolutely.  
5 Q. So, let's start with Ph.D. students. Can  
6 you describe generally the financial package  
7 provided to Ph.D. students within the Social Science  
8 Division?  
9 A. Yes. So, for the past number of years,  
10 since the beginning of the Graduate Aid Initiative,  
11 which I think has been around for about ten years,  
12 but -- I'm not certain of the date, we haven't  
13 admitted any Ph.D. student without a stipend. Full  
14 tuition -- well, let me correct that. We no longer  
15 today admit, that I know of, Ph.D. students in the  
16 division without full funding. That is without a  
17 tuition waiver and a stipend.  
18 Q. And how about health insurance?  
19 A. And health insurance. And summer research  
20 money and, you know, these kinds of things.  
21 Q. Okay. And that is consistent throughout  
22 the social -- well, we'll get back to that.  
23 You mentioned a stipend for Ph.D. students  
24 in the Social Science Division. Can you tell us in  
25 general terms what that is, sir?

1 A. Yes. Again, there is some variation across  
2 departments, but the minimum last year was 24,000.  
3 I think it had gone up. It's going up to -- by a  
4 couple of thousand, and it's been increasing over  
5 the last -- since the GAI was initiated there have  
6 been periodic increases.

7 Q. So, it was 24,000 last year?

8 A. Yeah. I believe this year it's 25. Again,  
9 that I know we're scheduling an increase in the  
10 coming year.

11 HEARING OFFICER MOLLS: Just a quick  
12 clarifying. When I say GI you're referring to the  
13 graduate initiative that you were referring to  
14 earlier?

15 THE WITNESS: Graduate Aid Initiative. We  
16 speak in acronyms all the time.

17 BY MR. FASMAN:

18 Q. I'll go back to that in just a moment.

19 And the stipend that you mentioned does not  
20 include the summer research funding that you  
21 mentioned?

22 A. No. We offer in addition \$3,000 for summer  
23 research funding for the four years of -- four  
24 summers of study that fall within the five-year  
25 period that we cover with the stipend.

1 Q. Okay. So, the package we're talking  
2 about --

3 A. Is for five years.

4 Q. -- is for five years?

5 A. It's for five years.

6 Q. And I think you said that the amount of the  
7 stipend may vary within the Social Science Division?

8 A. That's true.

9 Q. And how does that work? How does it vary?

10 A. Well, it varies in a number of ways. Some  
11 departments have a prize stipend that they can use,  
12 to -- let's say they want to attract a graduate  
13 student who has received a much higher offer from a  
14 different university, for whatever reason. And so  
15 some of the departments have available an additional  
16 named stipend, you can call it a dean's scholarship  
17 or you can call it whatever you would like, that is  
18 used in those competitive situations.

19 Some departments have higher stipend levels  
20 than others because of market reasons. So,  
21 primarily economics has a higher stipend than the  
22 rest of the departments.

23 Q. And do you know what the economic  
24 department stipend is?

25 A. I think it's -- it's around 34.

1 Q. Okay. Now, let's -- let's switch to  
2 Master's students. Do Master's students within the  
3 SSD pay tuition?

4 A. Master's students within the SSD pay  
5 tuition. In very, very rare cases we do offer a  
6 full tuition waiver to a Master's student. I mean  
7 it's a -- a handful of cases out of those 333. And  
8 it's, as I say, it's very rare.

9 Q. Okay. And is the tuition that they pay  
10 constant or consistent throughout the Social Science  
11 Division?

12 A. Yes. The tuition is, I believe, set the  
13 same for every one of our MA programs.

14 Q. Let me ask you to take a look at a document  
15 that I would like to mark for identification.  
16 (Employer Exhibit Number 14 was  
17 marked for identification.)

18 BY MR. FASMAN:

19 Q. Professor Nirenberg, I've marked a document  
20 for identification as Number 14, which is again from  
21 the university's website. It's called Financing  
22 Your Education.

23 Would you take a look at that for me and  
24 tell us when you're ready to answer a few questions,  
25 sir?

1 Have you had a chance to look at that?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. I'll represent for the record this is taken  
4 off the university website at the slugget on the  
5 bottom at the time and date stated. It is called  
6 Financing Your Education. If I could ask you just  
7 to turn over to Page 2. There is a series of  
8 financial figures for a Master's degree.

9 Are these amounts roughly, not to the  
10 dollar, but roughly what a Master's student would  
11 pay for his or her educational experience at the  
12 University of Chicago in your division?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And further on, about the sixth page in,  
15 there are similar figures for a Ph.D. Do you see  
16 those?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And not asking whether Ph.D. students pay  
19 for that, but whether or not those are the fees that  
20 would be charged if they paid for them?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And I think you testified already that  
23 Ph.D. students do not pay these fees? At least the  
24 top slug, that is, tuition, student life, health  
25 insurance, correct?

1 A. Correct.  
 2 Q. At least in the first five years?  
 3 A. That's correct.  
 4 MR. FASMAN: Okay. I'd move for the  
 5 admission of Exhibit 14, please.  
 6 MS. AUERBACH: No objection.  
 7 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Employer Exhibit 14  
 8 is received.  
 9 (Employer's Exhibit Number 14  
 10 was received in evidence.)  
 11 BY MR. FASMAN:  
 12 Q. Okay. Master's students then do not  
 13 receive a stipend, sir?  
 14 A. No, they don't.  
 15 Q. And they pay for healthcare, they pay their  
 16 healthcare premiums?  
 17 A. They pay their healthcare premiums.  
 18 Q. Are the Master's degrees offered in the  
 19 Social Science Division unique in any way in your  
 20 experience? Are they designed to do something --  
 21 A. Oh, absolutely unique, yes.  
 22 Q. Why is that, sir? Why are they unique?  
 23 A. Well, the university, the Social Sciences  
 24 at the University of Chicago, and I'd say this is  
 25 probably true at the University of Chicago as a

1 whole, are really more focused than any of the peers  
 2 that I know of, have historically been more focused  
 3 just on producing researchers. They call themselves  
 4 the teacher of teachers. Producing professors.  
 5 So, that's why, for example, the college is  
 6 historically relatively so small compared to the  
 7 graduate schools. The graduate schools used to be  
 8 no more numerous than the undergraduate.  
 9 Our Master's programs are very similar,  
 10 that is, our Master's programs are aimed at a very  
 11 narrow group of people, that is, people who think  
 12 they want to do a Ph.D., are not yet -- don't have  
 13 yet necessarily the skills or haven't proven that  
 14 they have the skills and the ability to get into the  
 15 very fast, fully-funded Ph.D. programs, and so are  
 16 willing to come to us to spend a year, in most of  
 17 these programs, two years, in Computational Social  
 18 Science, which is a new program, to get the skills  
 19 they need in order to then go on to a Ph.D.  
 20 So, unlike many Master's in the world which  
 21 is just about getting a skill that you can get a job  
 22 with, our Master's are more focused on taking  
 23 people who aspire to a career in research and  
 24 teaching and getting them the skills they need in  
 25 order to be able to actualize that vision. And

1 forgive me for boasting, our Master's of Arts  
 2 program in Social Sciences, for example, this is  
 3 boasting. I'm just proud of the program. It places  
 4 something like 93 percent of its students who apply  
 5 to a Ph.D. program after doing the year get fully  
 6 funded offers, meaning offers that have all tuition  
 7 and all stipend, in Ph.D. programs. That, no other  
 8 program in the world, I would submit, has that kind  
 9 of success.  
 10 Q. Okay. Let's go back and talk about the  
 11 Graduate Aid Initiative, which you mentioned before.  
 12 I think you testified that it's been around for  
 13 about a decade? Is that right?  
 14 A. Yeah.  
 15 Q. Or would you agree that it has been around  
 16 for a decade?  
 17 A. Something like that, yes.  
 18 Q. Okay. And I think we've gone through the  
 19 various -- the various costs. Did you testify to  
 20 the increase that's projected for next year?  
 21 A. So, I didn't testify to it except my  
 22 awareness that an increase is coming and there have  
 23 been many increases over the last ten years, and I  
 24 should say, if I could add, that some of these  
 25 increases are -- are related to things we don't

1 actually -- so, for example, health insurance had  
 2 increased a lot over the last ten years in its  
 3 costs. I presume -- I'm not a health economist, but  
 4 some of the increases are driven by the world.  
 5 Q. Okay. If I could ask you to turn back to  
 6 Number 14, sir, and specifically to the section that  
 7 deals with cost of attendance.  
 8 A. For MA or Ph.D.?  
 9 Q. Ph.D., sir.  
 10 A. Uh-huh.  
 11 Q. So, and specifically there is a cost of  
 12 attendance that's picked up by the university of  
 13 about \$61,000, sir? It is exclusive of books and  
 14 supplies?  
 15 A. Oh, yes. Okay.  
 16 Q. And to that you would add the stipend?  
 17 A. Right.  
 18 Q. To get a total cost? That's another 27,000  
 19 or something like that?  
 20 A. Yes.  
 21 Q. And that would be over a five-year period,  
 22 correct?  
 23 A. Yes.  
 24 Q. Does that, in your view, represent the  
 25 total cost of training a Ph.D. student at the

1 University of Chicago Social Science Division?  
 2 A. Oh, not even close.  
 3 Q. Why is that?  
 4 A. Well, there is a number of reasons. I mean  
 5 one reason is that we also offer many other things  
 6 to our graduate students than what is here.  
 7 MS. AUERBACH: Objection to relevance.  
 8 MR. FASMAN: I think the relevance is that  
 9 the university expends a tremendous amount of funds  
 10 and energy in teaching students. That's its  
 11 mission. That's part of its metier, and I think  
 12 we're entitled to establish that, to show that these  
 13 teaching assistants are being trained as students  
 14 and not being used as economic labor.  
 15 MS. AUERBACH: May I just distinguish, that  
 16 that trend at Columbia, all top universities are  
 17 training their students, and this witness has  
 18 already testified there is competition for the top  
 19 students. The issue is whether they are employees  
 20 and whether it's distinguishable at Columbia to the  
 21 extent they are employed, not whether or not they  
 22 train students.  
 23 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I would like to  
 24 briefly know what, if any, additional costs the  
 25 university incurs for training, but I don't know

1 that we need much more than that.  
 2 MR. FASMAN: There won't be much more than  
 3 that. Thank you.  
 4 THE WITNESS: Okay. I'll be as brief as  
 5 possible.  
 6 I think it comes into three packages. The  
 7 one is the additional resources that we give our  
 8 graduate students to do their research. So, we have  
 9 research funds, grants, all kinds of things that are  
 10 not part of this package that we give our students  
 11 as they are moving through the program to be able to  
 12 do their research.  
 13 The second is what are called the indirect  
 14 costs of giving them the spaces, the labs, the  
 15 libraries, the areas in which they do their  
 16 research. And the third and most obvious is that  
 17 for every graduate class we give, and we give many,  
 18 many, more than any of our competitors as a  
 19 percentage of -- we are foregoing an undergraduate  
 20 class or a Master's class which generates revenue.  
 21 So, undergraduates and Master's students  
 22 are tuition paying students. In Ph.D. we are  
 23 supporting the student. And so when we offer these  
 24 graduate classes, we are deliberately opting not to  
 25 offer an undergraduate class. Of course I could put

1 a price very easily on what the foregone cost of  
 2 what those undergraduate classes is. That's what  
 3 makes us a research university.  
 4 A research university is a university  
 5 that's willing to take resources that are -- that  
 6 could otherwise be productively employed in a  
 7 different activity, like teaching undergraduates,  
 8 often a revenue producing activity, and dedicating  
 9 it into basic research which is otherwise not  
 10 sustainable. And the cost of that is enormous.  
 11 So, it's not a cost that is a few thousand  
 12 per student. It's a cost that if we allocate it, it  
 13 would be hundreds of thousands per student.  
 14 (Employer Exhibit Number 15 was marked  
 15 for identification.)  
 16 BY MR. FASMAN:  
 17 Q. Professor Nirenberg, I've put before you a  
 18 document that we've marked as Employer Exhibit  
 19 Number 15 for identification. And I think in  
 20 off-the-record discussions I've advised the Hearing  
 21 Officer and opposing counsel that this is a document  
 22 that was created with some degree of difficulty, I  
 23 might add, summarizing the teaching requirements  
 24 throughout the University of Chicago's graduate  
 25 divisions.

1 I would only ask you, sir, to take a look  
 2 at Page 4 where the document talks about teaching  
 3 requirements in the Social Sciences Division. Have  
 4 you got that?  
 5 A. I do.  
 6 Q. And is that an accurate depiction of  
 7 teaching requirements in the Social Sciences  
 8 Division?  
 9 A. It is.  
 10 Q. All right. Thank you.  
 11 So, let me ask you to take a look at one  
 12 other thing before I begin a series of questions on  
 13 this.  
 14 (Employer Exhibit Number 16  
 15 was marked for identification.)  
 16 Professor Nirenberg, I've put before you a  
 17 document we've marked for identification as Employer  
 18 Exhibit Number 16, which I will represent is taken  
 19 off the Social Sciences portion of the website at  
 20 the time and date that's listed on the -- what do  
 21 you call that at the bottom? I want to say slug.  
 22 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: URL.  
 23 BY MR. FASMAN:  
 24 Q. URL. Thank you very much.  
 25 And ask you, can you identify this for us?

1 What is it?  
 2 A. I mean --  
 3 Q. It is a portion of the website?  
 4 A. Okay. I haven't read the website, but it  
 5 accurately represents our -- my understanding of our  
 6 teaching policy.  
 7 Q. And can you restate that in your own words?  
 8 What do you require? What are the teaching  
 9 requirements, speaking generally, within the Social  
 10 Sciences Division?  
 11 A. Well, generally we require five points.  
 12 And those points are accumulated in different ways  
 13 over the third, fourth and fifth year of the study  
 14 period.  
 15 What I would state more generally is this  
 16 practical -- the first sentence, practical  
 17 pedagogical experience in the form of teaching  
 18 assignments is entitled to a doctoral program, an  
 19 important part of the complete curriculum vitae.  
 20 I wouldn't have used the phrase, complete  
 21 curriculum vitae, because this isn't just about  
 22 building your CV.  
 23 Life as a social scientist in the  
 24 university depends upon being able to do two things  
 25 well: Research and teaching. And that's -- it's a

1 sine qua non. It's not simply, you know, another  
 2 item on your CV.  
 3 So, practical pedagogical experience for us  
 4 is actually crucial to be able to provide, just like  
 5 I received it when I was a graduate student, to be  
 6 able to provide that pedagogical experience and  
 7 more, to provide that pedagogical mentoring if we're  
 8 going to send people out into a world in which they  
 9 are going to function as professors.  
 10 So, it's not just about a complete CV.  
 11 It's about what's absolutely basic function of what  
 12 we do as professors.  
 13 Q. Let's talk for a moment, and I want to get  
 14 back to that subject, but let's talk for a moment  
 15 how this point system works. Okay? What -- tell us  
 16 a little bit about how the point system works for  
 17 the record.  
 18 A. Well, for the record, and again, this is  
 19 the kind of thing that the Dean of Students handles  
 20 mostly, so my knowledge of it is just from a certain  
 21 altitude.  
 22 The certain forms of teaching experience,  
 23 practica, are assigned a point value with the  
 24 highly, highly supervised and mentored relationship  
 25 that, for example a TA has receiving one point, and

1 then culminating in a lectureship in which you are  
 2 still working closely in a mentored relationship but  
 3 have responsibility for your class receiving two  
 4 points.  
 5 Q. Okay. And students acquire different  
 6 points as they go along, correct?  
 7 A. Right.  
 8 Q. Is it a requirement that they obtain five  
 9 teaching points to receive their Ph.D. degree?  
 10 A. It is a requirement. You know, with all  
 11 requirements, we are to some degree flexible. So,  
 12 and -- on both ends. You know, sometimes a student  
 13 can't get a point in a year, and we let them do it  
 14 the following year. There is all kinds of  
 15 flexibility.  
 16 Q. But this is an academic requirement within  
 17 the Social Science Division?  
 18 A. It is.  
 19 Q. Why is it an academic requirement?  
 20 A. Because life -- well, I don't want to  
 21 repeat myself, but we want our graduate students to  
 22 be able to go into the walk of life they want to go  
 23 into, and for many, that is the professoriat. And  
 24 in the professoriat, at least in the disciplines  
 25 that are in the Social Sciences, the way in which we

1 work requires us to do -- to be excellent at two  
 2 things: Research and teaching. That's the way in  
 3 which this country has always subsidized basic  
 4 research is by tying it to teaching.  
 5 That's not the case in other countries.  
 6 Other countries you could -- you could be a basic  
 7 researcher in a research center with no teaching  
 8 involved. But in the US and I think this is a very  
 9 good thing and I'd love to expatiate on why it's  
 10 made our universities different from all other  
 11 universities in the world and better, but in the US,  
 12 in the liberal arts and sciences, teaching and  
 13 research are mutually supported and mutually  
 14 constituted.  
 15 So, for us, we have to make sure that our  
 16 students have that teaching experience that we can  
 17 say to their future university employers, yes, they  
 18 know how to do this thing that is so crucial to you,  
 19 and we know they know how to do it because we taught  
 20 them how to do it. We did it with them.  
 21 So, in that sense the practical pedagogical  
 22 experience is integral to the educational  
 23 experience.  
 24 Q. So, let's go back to me as a Ph.D. student,  
 25 for example, within one of the social sciences

1 programs. How do I get my five points? Is there a  
2 normal sequence that goes on within the -- within  
3 the division? What would you expect in those  
4 circumstances?

5 A. So, yeah. I mean there are -- there are  
6 many different ways of doing it, and people do take  
7 different paths, but there are some numerically  
8 predominant, and I also think pedagogically  
9 recommendable ways, which are the ones we most  
10 emphasize.

11 Q. And what are they?

12 A. So, for example, we have a number of large  
13 programs called the Cores and the CIVs that are  
14 structured around what we think to be basic  
15 questions in the social sciences, and that many  
16 undergraduates take.

17 So, these are programs which we bring  
18 together groups of faculty, sometimes post docs and  
19 other kinds of -- like Harper fellows, different  
20 kinds, different levels of experience of teaching  
21 and graduate students and we -- so let's take the  
22 example of Classics of Social and Political Thought,  
23 which is one popular course which I've taught, so I  
24 can speak for firsthand experience.

25 A graduate student would normally have to

1 three points, and then you have increasing degree of  
2 independence. And ideally -- this is done largely  
3 through -- only through competition. Only the most  
4 accomplished teachers do this. You might get to  
5 design your own course, working with a professor,  
6 usually your advisor, what a syllabus should look  
7 like, etcetera, submit it for a prize fellowship and  
8 then get a chance to teach a course of your own  
9 design as judged by the faculty of the department  
10 that you're submitting it to be -- to the judges of  
11 whether it's an adequate course of instruction, make  
12 recommendations of how the syllabus might be  
13 changed.

14 It's a kind of a graded path to increasing  
15 responsibility in the classroom.

16 Q. And the last segment you talked about,  
17 would those people be deemed to have a lectureship?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Is that the term that's used?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And that would be beyond the five GAI  
22 points or would that be part of it?

23 A. Again, there are many different terms that  
24 I've used, and I don't want to get stuck on a term  
25 because some of these terms are very rare in the

1 be an assistant, a TA, in three sections of -- in  
2 all three sections of that sequence each quarter.

3 We're on the quarter system, so that's three  
4 quarters. So that they are learning with a  
5 professor what the material in the class is, how  
6 it's discussed, how the -- how discussion is  
7 fomented with undergraduates. How to frame a  
8 question. How to assign a paper topic, etcetera.

9 Then after having done three and now  
10 they've acquired three points, been a TA in three  
11 classes, they ideally get to run their own section  
12 of Classics of Social and Political Thought.  
13 Meaning now they are responsible for their own 19  
14 students. They are responsible for running the  
15 discussion for those students, for grading those  
16 students, but every week they come together with the  
17 entire group, all the faculty, all the others  
18 teaching in that course. They discuss the text.  
19 They approach us to starting a discussion. What's  
20 important in the material being covered. How to get  
21 that out. How to set paper stimuli that might be  
22 helpful to undergraduates, and then they go back and  
23 do it.

24 So, you have a kind of a highly mentored  
25 setting in which you're never independent, the first

1 social sciences and common elsewhere, and simply  
2 borrowed, but there are people who reach that point  
3 of an autonomous course within the five years of the  
4 GAI.

5 Q. Okay.

6 A. I wouldn't say it's that common, but it  
7 happens.

8 Q. But it could be afterwards, too?

9 A. And it could be afterwards. That's more  
10 common.

11 Q. Okay. So, you mentioned that you have  
12 taught courses in which you had, I think  
13 introductory -- is it fair to say introductory, that  
14 is, first time TAs?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. In the course? So, tell us the -- for the  
17 record, tell us about your, your form of interaction  
18 with students in that situation as a professor of  
19 teaching that section. Let's just take, for an  
20 example, I'm brand new as a teaching assistant,  
21 whatever you call me, course assistant. What  
22 happens? How do I -- how do I interact with you?

23 A. Well, I mean obviously it depends on how  
24 large the course is. If it's just one person or if  
25 it's more. But in general what I need to achieve

Page 142

1 over the course of the course with my course  
2 assistant is to help them see what the difficulties  
3 are and what the solutions to those difficulties are  
4 for each stage of teaching. For each aspect of  
5 teaching. Stage is the wrong word. Each aspect.  
6 Let me give you an example, and stop me if  
7 I'm too loquacious. Everything we do in the  
8 classroom has to -- actually is an art. And so for  
9 example, just asking a question to start a  
10 discussion is a very difficult thing, as everyone  
11 who has been in a classroom knows. And one of the  
12 first things my TAs discover is how hard it is to  
13 frame a question. If a question which is too broad,  
14 what did you think about the reading, is not going  
15 to get a kind of discussion you want, although  
16 that's the first instinct.  
17 If a question is too narrow, on what date  
18 did, is not going to get an answer either, because  
19 all the students are afraid that -- they know there  
20 is a right answer and they don't want to risk  
21 themselves into a wrong answer.  
22 So, how you frame a question is already  
23 something that needs to be learned. I needed to  
24 learn it. I learned it from a book, actually. It  
25 needs to be learned.

Page 143

1 What is specific to this material that  
2 people who have really specialized in this material  
3 think is important? If we're reading Plato's  
4 Phaedrus, what is it about Plato's Phaedrus that  
5 we -- we really want to make sure we get out of it.  
6 That needs to be taught, too.  
7 If I am trying to communicate to a student  
8 what's wrong with a piece of writing, it's -- that's  
9 not a trivial thing at all. I actually need to  
10 first know what good writing is. Know what a good  
11 argument is. Know how to communicate what's wrong  
12 with a given piece of writing or a given argument  
13 and that, that -- if you've ever tried to  
14 communicate, for example, why this paragraph doesn't  
15 work, if you do it, for example, in words you could  
16 write a paper longer than the paper itself just  
17 trying to explain what's wrong with the paper.  
18 So, you have to learn how to economically,  
19 concisely diagnose what's wrong with a piece of  
20 writing and communicate it to a student.  
21 So, for example, one of the things I do  
22 with my TAs is help them learn symbols, learn common  
23 problems like, for example, transition problems and  
24 informal logic of the argument or subject-verb  
25 agreement, and then give them shorthand to express

Page 144

1 that to students. That is something someone did  
2 once and it's been useful for me for the rest of my  
3 life.  
4 Lecturing. So, I was just reminded of  
5 Jessica Andress, who is a TA in a CIV program that I  
6 did in Jerusalem. I was reminded of her because she  
7 now a professor at the University of Virginia, and  
8 she came up on a letter of recommendation. And I  
9 remembered preparing her and her preparing for her  
10 first -- I asked her, you know, I felt she was ready  
11 to give a lecture in this course. And it was on  
12 material she felt she knew fairly well. And we  
13 worked together for a day before she gave the  
14 lecture, and then we got together for hours after  
15 she gave a lecture to talk about, okay, what -- what  
16 did you -- what worked here, what didn't, because  
17 speaking in public, lecturing, not going too high,  
18 not going too low, catching interest, all kinds of  
19 things that we need to teach. We're not born  
20 knowing how to do these things.  
21 So, that's my responsibility when I have  
22 a -- whether I have just one TA or in a large course  
23 I might have many.  
24 Q. So, you actually teach them how to grade  
25 papers?

Page 145

1 A. Absolutely. You know, nothing under -- I  
2 guess I should say there is nothing any of us care  
3 more in academics than grades, and it's very  
4 important that we have grading that reflects what's  
5 important about a course. What students should have  
6 learned. But what we really want to be learning.  
7 Grading is consistent across the course. And  
8 grading that a student can understand.  
9 So, at every stage with every different  
10 kind of exercise, whether it be an exam with IDs or  
11 maps, we have to sit down as a group, if we're -- if  
12 we're teaching a course together, meaning me and my  
13 TAs, grading a course together. We have to sit down  
14 as a group and decide what's important in this  
15 exercise, how many points is that importance worth,  
16 and those -- the points are easier than deciding  
17 what's important. That's an intellectual  
18 discussion.  
19 What are the concepts that are really key  
20 in this course? And then we have to make sure that  
21 we've all applied that more or less the same way or  
22 we're getting inconsistencies in the course. And so  
23 then we have to meet and talk about, well, how did  
24 you do this?  
25 So, I would say the beginning of a course

1 is a very intensive operation to just get a common  
2 language about grading. And as you have more and  
3 more time together, then say the second exam, just  
4 show me five of your exams and I'll compare them to  
5 my five.

6 So, but at the beginning it's really kind  
7 of -- has to be a very almost a page-by-page  
8 comparison.

9 Q. And is this something that happens  
10 throughout the first three experiences that a TA has  
11 in one of your courses?

12 A. Yeah. I'm telling you only about my  
13 courses.

14 Q. I'm asking you about you.

15 A. I've never had a TA go through all three in  
16 a sequence. I've only had -- because I haven't  
17 taught all three in a sequence myself.

18 Usually TAs have -- will experience many  
19 different teachers. And there is a lot of variety  
20 about how professors teach teaching, and I don't  
21 claim that my experience is the only one. But I  
22 think in general, every professor has -- faces the  
23 same -- has the same sense of responsibility about,  
24 for example, grading, about evaluating students'  
25 writing, about fomenting good discussion, about

1 teaching those skills.

2 Q. How about -- do you explain to teaching  
3 assistants in your courses why you lecture as you  
4 lecture?

5 A. Yeah. So, of course, you know, I often --  
6 we talk about why I chose what I chose, or sometimes  
7 we just change what I chose because, you know, a  
8 student may say to me, that's not -- that's not as  
9 good a text to represent this question that we're  
10 trying to elucidate.

11 The thing about the social sciences, we're  
12 all learning from each other. I'm learning from my  
13 students, and I'm sure this is true of all of my  
14 colleagues, and my students are learning from me.  
15 So, in that sense, we're constantly discussing why.  
16 The "why" of a given material or of a given  
17 experimental design or anecdote in lecture.

18 The reason I smiled when you said that is  
19 because in so many ways lecturing is a very  
20 idiosyncratic activity, meaning each of us has a  
21 different way of doing it. And I think that my job  
22 as a teacher is understanding both, you know, the  
23 particular ways of learning of my students. When it  
24 comes to graduate students, it's also understanding  
25 their particular gifts of teaching, which can be

1 very different, right?

2 So, and then trying to figure out how to  
3 turn them into, how to help them find their voice as  
4 teachers, which is going to be different from my  
5 voice.

6 Q. So, how frequently during the first, if I  
7 were a new teaching assistant trying to earn in the  
8 sequence you were talking about, like my first few  
9 points, how frequently would I expect to meet with  
10 you and discuss issues like this?

11 A. I would say that every lecture or every  
12 class meeting which, of course, my TAs attend,  
13 right, ends with or is preceded by a discussion  
14 amongst us. And then there is usually a weekly kind  
15 of team meeting. How long those are depends on  
16 whether we're talking about, okay, what are we  
17 trying to, depends on what the tasks are for the  
18 students. Whether we have a grading thing ahead,  
19 whether we are talking about the material we're  
20 going to be discussing. But I would say that there  
21 is a -- with each class meeting there is a -- there  
22 is a coming together and then kind of an organized  
23 once-a-week group meeting. And that's true for the  
24 large courses, and I'm describing my own  
25 idiosyncratic ways, but it's also how our large

1 structured courses, the Cores and the CIVs work.  
2 They have these structural required meetings to get  
3 together to talk about these things.

4 Q. How frequent are those?

5 A. I don't remember how frequent it was in  
6 Classics of Social Thought, and each would one is  
7 going to have a different -- depending on its  
8 leader, but I think all of us who teach in those  
9 course teach in them because of those meetings.  
10 That is to say, the coming together to talk about  
11 the materials is where we learn from each other, and  
12 it's where the material becomes new and alive to us.  
13 And these are courses that many of us have taught  
14 over and over again, right? And material we're  
15 constantly reviewing.

16 MR. FASMAN: Can I suggest that this would  
17 be a good time for a quick break?

18 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Sure. Off the  
19 record.

20 (There was a discussion  
21 held off the record.)

22 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record.

23 MR. FASMAN: Thank you.  
24 (Employer Exhibit Number 17 was  
25 marked for identification.)

1 BY MR. FASMAN:  
 2 Q. Mr. Nirenberg, I've handed you a document  
 3 that's marked for identification as Exhibit Number  
 4 17, and I wonder if you can take a look and tell us  
 5 what that is, sir.  
 6 A. I haven't seen it before, but it seems to  
 7 describe what I was describing earlier, the  
 8 educational sequence that people follow, graduate  
 9 students follow when they do a course in the Core  
 10 and also in the CIVs. Cores and CIVs.  
 11 Q. So you were -- when we took a break, I  
 12 think, and correct me if I'm wrong, I think you were  
 13 talking about initial, your initial meetings with,  
 14 or meetings with people in early stages of learning  
 15 how to teach.  
 16 What happens at the later stages? You  
 17 mentioned the sequence. So, if I have -- as I go  
 18 along the sequence, what happens to me? Do I end up  
 19 in charge of a section? How does that work?  
 20 A. Yeah. And I think this document describes  
 21 pretty well how it works. You end up -- the goal of  
 22 being an intern in, let's say, the first three  
 23 points that you accumulate going through a Core or  
 24 CIVs sequence is to then be in a position to then  
 25 teach your own course in that CIVs sequence.

1 When you do that, as it says in this  
 2 document, you have main responsibility for that  
 3 course. But at that point, you are participating in  
 4 the staff meetings, brings us all together, for that  
 5 Core or CIVs. And there, I've never been a  
 6 coordinator, so each Core, each CIV has a faculty  
 7 person who is in charge of it and who runs all of  
 8 these -- what is it called here -- meetings of the  
 9 staff teaching the course, and who are responsible,  
 10 obviously, for making sure that those meetings are a  
 11 form of mentoring the people that are teaching their  
 12 own section, responsible for their own section.  
 13 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Just for  
 14 clarification purposes, you say Core and CIV, you're  
 15 referring to Core sequence and Civilization  
 16 sequence?  
 17 THE WITNESS: That's right.  
 18 BY MR. FASMAN:  
 19 Q. When you were just saying, teaching their  
 20 own sections, what does that mean? Are they  
 21 actually teaching the course, or are they meeting  
 22 with a particular segment of students within the  
 23 course?  
 24 A. No. I think so when -- once they've done  
 25 their three -- I think this document describes it

1 very well. Once they've done their internships, the  
 2 three points of their internships and now having a  
 3 lectureship in a Core or a CIV, they are --  
 4 basically they have full responsibility for their  
 5 section, but the mentoring continues in the sense  
 6 that they come together every week to discuss the  
 7 readings, to talk about what everyone else is  
 8 teaching. They have some flexibility in setting the  
 9 syllabus but quite minimal.  
 10 The faculty all come together in each Core  
 11 and each CIV and set the syllabus, and then they  
 12 decide, well, what is optional? If you think, you  
 13 know, for example, how to introduce post-colonialism  
 14 into a syllabus of books, very traditional. It  
 15 could be debates. And then one would say, well, I  
 16 want Fulco (phonetic) in here, and someone says I  
 17 would rather have, you know, someone else. So,  
 18 there is a new bit of flexibility, but all of it is  
 19 set by the group and faculty leading the CIV and  
 20 Core.  
 21 Q. That would be for someone who is considered  
 22 a lecturer?  
 23 A. Right. In a CIV or a Core.  
 24 Q. In a CIV or a Core. And that's a different  
 25 function than a teaching assistant in a CIV or a

1 Core?  
 2 A. Right. And again, I mean I think this  
 3 document does a good job, it calls them interns, but  
 4 it's -- it's the TA point and lecture.  
 5 Q. And lecturers receive more points?  
 6 A. Right. You have the one point for TA-ship,  
 7 and two points for a lectureship.  
 8 Q. Someone is actually teaching a section,  
 9 that's two points?  
 10 A. That's my understanding, yes.  
 11 Q. Let's not get to lecturer yet.  
 12 Is there an interim step, that is, the  
 13 three internships and then you just go progress  
 14 directly to a lectureship, or there is a possibility  
 15 of leading a section without teaching it?  
 16 A. Well, okay. You know, I mean there are so  
 17 many different kinds of courses. The Cores and the  
 18 CIVs are what you just showed me here.  
 19 Q. Yes.  
 20 A. And they have this structure. There are  
 21 many other ways in which you can be a TA outside of  
 22 a Core or a CIV. You can be a writing intern. You  
 23 can be a TA in a large lecture course that has more  
 24 than 25 students. There is all kinds of things, and  
 25 every course has a different design.

1 Some courses have sections, discussion  
2 sections which a graduate student might lead. Some  
3 courses don't. And the TA there might be doing more  
4 of a different kind of collaboration. So, you know,  
5 I don't know how to answer your question  
6 specifically.

7 Q. Okay. Philosophically, within the Social  
8 Science Division, what's the function of the various  
9 -- let me strike that question.

10 Within the Social Science Division is there  
11 a philosophy about whether or not students, graduate  
12 students, should be allowed to teach without being  
13 fully qualified?

14 A. Oh. I don't know that's a philosophy so  
15 much as a dogma. Look. Our undergraduates are --  
16 maybe I should draw an analogy to medicine. We  
17 wouldn't let someone operate on a patient who wasn't  
18 qualified. Why would we let someone teach their own  
19 course who wasn't qualified? Our undergraduates --  
20 teaching is something that's very difficult to do.  
21 You need to both control the domain that you want to  
22 teach in, meaning know the contents, and also know a  
23 fair bit of how to teach before you should be  
24 teaching a course.

25 So, I would -- in the social sciences,

1 So, you know, far from thrusting students  
2 wholesale into any teaching context, that's what we  
3 would avoid. Abhor.

4 Q. Okay. Is there a requirement within the  
5 Social Sciences Division that you need to earn your  
6 points within -- by teaching within the division?

7 A. I think there is. Now, we're getting into  
8 a level of detail that I don't always control,  
9 because again, the Dean of Students can make  
10 exceptions to these rules.

11 So, for example, and I -- I seem from my  
12 own experience to feel that we do make exceptions  
13 when that's necessary.

14 Q. Give us an example of an exception being  
15 made.

16 A. Well, an exception, most of them -- many of  
17 them would come from my own department, Committee on  
18 Social Thought, because as I've described it, you  
19 may have noticed that it contains poets and art  
20 historians and people who, you know, in a different  
21 university would be in the humanities compared to  
22 literature people.

23 Now, let's say that a graduate student on  
24 the Committee on Social Thought is a specialist in  
25 Italian literature. In order for them to get a job,

1 first, you know, we don't have many prize  
2 lectureships for graduate students to teach their  
3 own course, and even those, we run them as  
4 competitions. We make sure we're mentoring the  
5 students as they create the syllabi. The faculty  
6 committee that chooses is supervising what a  
7 curriculum course should be.

8 Our undergraduates are -- education is a --  
9 it's a very complicated thing, so absolutely. We --  
10 I would say it's a dogma that we would not allow, or  
11 we would not knowingly allow someone who is not  
12 ready to teach, to teach our undergraduates.

13 Q. Would you say, sir, that at the University  
14 of Chicago in your experience that teaching  
15 assistants are thrust wholesale into the Core duties  
16 of teaching, planning and giving lectures, writing  
17 exams, things along those lines?

18 A. Well, it sounds like you're quoting  
19 something, but I certainly would say that in no way  
20 describes what we do at the University of Chicago.  
21 I can't imagine a context in the Social Science  
22 Division that I know where we would thrust students.  
23 Let alone -- we're now offering seminars for our  
24 faculty on how to teach, I mean especially when new  
25 faculty arrive.

1 they are presumably going to need to show that they  
2 have experience in teaching Italian. That's just  
3 the way the job market works for people who do  
4 Italian literature.

5 So, we want to have the flexibility to  
6 allow that student to teach Italian, which is in the  
7 Humanities Division, in order to get the points they  
8 need in the Social Sciences Division, and we would  
9 do that.

10 Q. How much of the -- you mentioned this just  
11 now. How much of the teaching requirements that  
12 we're talking about, are those -- are those geared  
13 or gauged at all in terms of having graduate  
14 students acquire jobs when they get out of the  
15 university? Do you take that into consideration?

16 A. You mean when -- when the five points are  
17 planned?

18 Q. Well, in general terms. I mean you've  
19 described teaching pedagogy in the five point  
20 sequence. Does that have any relationship to the  
21 outside job market, and if does, what's the  
22 relationship?

23 A. So, yes. I mean the whole reason why we  
24 have pedagogical requirements in the Ph.D. and the  
25 Social Sciences is because teaching is such an

1 important part of how the job market is going to  
2 look at you when you're done.

3 It's not really for much of any other  
4 reason. It's because teaching is a skill you have  
5 to show you've had and you've acquired when you go  
6 into the job market, and to such a degree that we  
7 now, I think almost every graduate student who  
8 applies for a job in any field in the Social  
9 Sciences has a -- a professorial job -- has to  
10 produce a teaching statement. And my students come  
11 to me and ask me, okay, would you read my draft of  
12 my teaching statement, work on my teaching statement  
13 with me?

14 Departments often run seminars. This has  
15 nothing to do with teaching in a course. Just has  
16 to do with how do you help a student express their  
17 teaching experience in a way that will best  
18 communicate it to an employer who is looking at  
19 teaching experience?

20 So, departments run seminars on how to put  
21 together a good teaching statement. Often a  
22 director of a graduate department will read, your  
23 advisor will read your teaching statement. So,  
24 absolutely it's highly, yeah, geared to the fact  
25 that if you want a career in the professorial,

1 A. Right. I was -- my initial kind of  
2 hesitant answer to the question I wasn't fully sure  
3 I was understanding, we do, for -- I don't know what  
4 to call it exactly, whether it's bookkeeping or  
5 motivational purposes, assign a certain part of the  
6 stipend to teaching points.

7 Q. Okay. And do you have any understanding of  
8 why the university does this?

9 A. Well, I can't say I do. I did once ask.

10 Q. And what was the answer that you received?

11 A. The answer I received -- and the reason I  
12 asked, because it's not how we think. How I think  
13 or how any professor thinks about the stipend.

14 We think of it as a stipend that makes it  
15 possible for us when we were graduate students or a  
16 graduate student now to actualize the path that  
17 leads them to a Ph.D. We don't think of it as, this  
18 is for teaching, this is for your research, this  
19 is -- so, when I asked --

20 MS. AUERBACH: Objection as to foundation.  
21 Hearsay.

22 BY MR. FASMAN:

23 Q. Let's not go there.

24 Do you have any understanding of that being  
25 driven by the tax laws?

1 you're going to be teaching.

2 Q. Okay. Are graduate students -- let me see  
3 if I can ask this the right way.

4 Are graduate students compensated for the  
5 teaching that they do at the University of Chicago?

6 A. I'm not sure -- I'm not sure if I would  
7 call it -- if I would call it compensated. There is  
8 a system through which we -- parts of the stipend  
9 are attributed to their teaching points.

10 Q. The teaching points that you've described,  
11 though, the five teaching points, is that considered  
12 part of the -- part of the financial package?

13 A. I'm sorry to be dense. You know, from my  
14 point of view, the financial package is for being a  
15 graduate student at the University of Chicago and  
16 learning, learning what it takes to be a professor.  
17 Now -- or to be a Ph.D. And you're asking  
18 specifically what?

19 Q. Well, I'm asking whether this is all part  
20 of the package, that is, learning to teach as you've  
21 just discussed?

22 A. Yes. It's all one thing.

23 Q. Are you aware that part -- a certain  
24 portion of a student's stipend at the University of  
25 Chicago is earmarked for teaching roles?

1 A. That's what I have been told.

2 Q. All right. Does the Social Sciences  
3 Division limit the hours that students are permitted  
4 to teach each week?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. What is the limitation?

7 A. Well, first there is -- we have an  
8 expectation of what each role takes, how much time  
9 each role should take.

10 Second, we have a limit on how many  
11 teaching assignments you're going to accept in any  
12 period. So, no more than four in a year or two in a  
13 given quarter, I think.

14 And third, we have a total limitation on  
15 how many hours you can spend on any activity other  
16 than your research, which is 20 hours. Or roughly  
17 20 hours.

18 Q. And that includes --

19 A. Anything. I mean anything that isn't your  
20 research, because, you know, you're here to learn.  
21 You're here to do the things you need to do to be a  
22 successful Ph.D. in the Social Sciences, and those  
23 are research and pedagogy. I would say this much  
24 research and this much pedagogy.

25 Q. Let the record --

1 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: We'll reflect that.  
 2 When you said 20 hours, that's 20 hours a week,  
 3 correct?  
 4 THE WITNESS: 20 hours a week.  
 5 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. And when you  
 6 said -- when you were gesturing earlier, you are  
 7 referring to a larger amount of --  
 8 THE WITNESS: I mean, look, this -- and I  
 9 don't want -- this may reflect -- pedagogy is very  
 10 important. It's very important to be able to teach  
 11 and one of the reasons it's very important is  
 12 because you won't get a chance to do research if you  
 13 aren't pedagogged in the arts and sciences. That's  
 14 just the way the modern American University is.  
 15 However, research is why you're at the  
 16 University of Chicago, so we need to teach you to  
 17 teach, but we cannot let you think that that's  
 18 why -- that's the principal reason you're here. If  
 19 that were the principal reason you could be doing  
 20 something else. You could be getting a certificate  
 21 as a high school teacher and teaching high school.  
 22 Now, I think many -- there is a tendency,  
 23 and I -- this worries me, of thinking that one  
 24 should do more teaching than one has to as a  
 25 graduate student. Graduate student is the one

1 more than one such course in their career. Just to  
 2 show, to gain the experience of having done it and  
 3 having done one, and if a students asks me, should I  
 4 do another, I always tell them no. You should focus  
 5 on your dissertation.  
 6 That's what the stipend is for. It's to  
 7 enable you to do your dissertation and do research,  
 8 and the teaching is something that is important that  
 9 we need to equip you with, but the stipend is for  
 10 doing what you can do only at the University of  
 11 Chicago.  
 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Quick question. How  
 13 often in an academic year would you say you have  
 14 those types of conversations?  
 15 THE WITNESS: So, that kind of conversation  
 16 I have only with my own advisees, so I would say  
 17 every other year. But I'm sure other faculty are  
 18 having them constantly with their advisees. But  
 19 that would be hearsay, I imagine. I don't know.  
 20 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you.  
 21 BY MR. FASMAN:  
 22 Q. Let me ask you, if you would, please --  
 23 (Employer Exhibit Number 18 was  
 24 marked for identification.)  
 25 Mr. Nirenberg, I've asked you to take a

1 chance you really have to focus on your research  
 2 primarily, and you should take that chance. That's  
 3 my feeling, and I think it's a pretty common one  
 4 amongst faculty.  
 5 BY MR. FASMAN:  
 6 Q. During the GAI period, that is, the five  
 7 years when students are receiving the funding  
 8 package, is it common for students within the SSD to  
 9 exceed five teaching points?  
 10 A. No. I mean it's not, it's not -- I would  
 11 say, and here, you know, I'm just being fairly  
 12 rough, that it's between 20, 25 percent.  
 13 Q. And have you discussed that subject with  
 14 students from time to time?  
 15 A. Have I discussed whether they should exceed  
 16 their teaching points?  
 17 Q. Yes.  
 18 A. Yes. I mean I can -- yes. First let me  
 19 say it's only common in -- within the first five  
 20 years of the GAI, I think, in one department, and  
 21 that is in economics.  
 22 There are simply -- it's a different  
 23 teaching structure. There is more opportunities to  
 24 have a course of that sort.  
 25 I don't think a graduate student should do

1 look at a document that we've marked as Employer  
 2 Exhibit 18. Can you tell us what that is?  
 3 A. It's a teaching appointments transcript  
 4 Which -- it seems like a fictitious one.  
 5 Q. We'll stipulate.  
 6 A. The Smurphy theory, the Smurphy thing.  
 7 That tracks how many -- how you fulfilled your point  
 8 requirement.  
 9 Q. Okay. Is this the type of document that a  
 10 student would receive in Social Sciences Division  
 11 from time to time?  
 12 A. So, the truth is yes, but it's not  
 13 something that I do. It's something the Dean of  
 14 Student's office does, so the details of the when, I  
 15 wouldn't be able to tell you.  
 16 MR. FASMAN: I would move for its  
 17 admission.  
 18 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. So, this is  
 19 Employer 18. We haven't moved 15, 16, or 17,  
 20 correct?  
 21 MR. FASMAN: I move in then 16 and 17. 15,  
 22 I think, is the chart.  
 23 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Yes. So, you're  
 24 moving 16, 17 and 18?  
 25 MR. FASMAN: Yes, ma'am.

1 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Any objections?  
 2 MS. AUERBACH: Just a minute.  
 3 What were the documents that were moved?  
 4 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: 16, 17 and 18. So  
 5 15 has not yet been moved.  
 6 MS. AUERBACH: I have no objection to 16.  
 7 No objection to 17. Wait.  
 8 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: 17 was the course  
 9 internships document.  
 10 MS. AUERBACH: Right. No objection to  
 11 that. And I'm taking a minute on the other one.  
 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So, Employer 16 and  
 13 17 are received, and 18 is still outstanding.  
 14 (Employer Exhibits 16 and 17 were  
 15 received in evidence.)  
 16 MR. FASMAN: As I said, 15 we will move in  
 17 once it's been --  
 18 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Fully authenticated?  
 19 MR. FASMAN: Authenticated. Thank you.  
 20 MS. AUERBACH: I have no objection to the  
 21 document coming in.  
 22 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Employer Exhibit 18  
 23 is received.  
 24 MR. FASMAN: Thank you.  
 25 (Employer Exhibit Number 18 was

1 professor is going to be teaching a large course on  
 2 the Early Islam and they want the chance to learn  
 3 how to teach that subject because they are going to  
 4 be -- they might say, could I take my point in a  
 5 different year than this one? And the Dean of  
 6 Students would hear the -- would hear that and grant  
 7 that flexibility.  
 8 BY MR. FASMAN:  
 9 Q. Okay. So, let me ask another question  
 10 along those same lines: Within the Social Sciences  
 11 Division, does the division make possible teaching  
 12 opportunities for graduate students seeking to earn  
 13 their GAI points?  
 14 A. Does the division make possible?  
 15 Q. That was not a great question. Thank you.  
 16 A. Absolutely it does. The answer is yes.  
 17 Q. Well, what happens -- and here is what I  
 18 was trying to ask: Are there situations where there  
 19 is no, for a given quarter for me as a student,  
 20 there may be nothing or no teaching position  
 21 available for me? Is it sometimes the case that  
 22 Social Sciences Division would create one to allow  
 23 me to earn my GAI points?  
 24 A. Yes. So, it's -- it's pretty rare. Mostly  
 25 the system works very well in matching people to

1 received in evidence.)  
 2 BY MR. FASMAN:  
 3 Q. Without going into this in great detail,  
 4 does this contain the various limitations that were  
 5 you talking about, that is, for example, the  
 6 italicized language in Paragraph 1, 2, 3 here?  
 7 A. Yes. That's right.  
 8 Q. And why -- why are those limitations  
 9 imposed?  
 10 A. Because we don't want -- pedagogical  
 11 training is important, and we want you to get the  
 12 pedagogical training you need, but you don't want it  
 13 to interfere with the research, which is the reason  
 14 for the season.  
 15 I would note one thing about this, though.  
 16 There are limitations, and there is also  
 17 flexibility. Students may take an assignments on a  
 18 different schedule according to their needs and  
 19 opportunities.  
 20 We want the pedagogical opportunity to  
 21 match the student's particular interests and needs  
 22 as much as possible.  
 23 So, let me give you an example, if I may.  
 24 You know, if someone is working on a dissertation in  
 25 Early Islam, and they know that next year their

1 opportunities.  
 2 In those cases where it doesn't, what often  
 3 happens is that a student will go to their advisor  
 4 and -- or to people in their field and say, no,  
 5 you're teaching this course. Is there any way I  
 6 could have such a role? And, you know, that  
 7 happens. I know I've done that at least once in my  
 8 -- so, yes.  
 9 There is -- departments work very hard, and  
 10 the Core coordinators work very hard, and the Master  
 11 of the Social Science Collegiate Division works very  
 12 hard to create those opportunities. Dividing  
 13 internships are also an area in which these things  
 14 arise.  
 15 So, I think the whole institution is very  
 16 focused on making sure that the opportunities arise  
 17 when you need them.  
 18 Q. Let me skip that and go on to something  
 19 else.  
 20 Do Master's students within the Social  
 21 Science Division, do they have a teaching  
 22 requirement?  
 23 A. No.  
 24 Q. Why not?  
 25 A. Well, I think it's two really basic

1 reasons. One is they are not ready to teach. Just  
2 as our Ph.D. students aren't ready to teach until  
3 they've had experience in their domain, so we don't  
4 ask them. In fact, we rarely allow them to teach in  
5 the first two years of their study, and they are  
6 coming in often with a Master's.

7 Our Master's students are not -- they don't  
8 have the degree of domain knowledge that would allow  
9 us to responsibly ask them to teach. That's one  
10 reason. And the second reason is they are paying,  
11 you know, large amounts of money for their education  
12 and they are very focused on -- they are paying that  
13 money for a purpose which is, as I mentioned  
14 earlier, to try to get the skills in one year to  
15 then be competitive for the very best Ph.D.  
16 programs. And so, you know -- we don't ask -- we  
17 couldn't responsibly put them in front of the  
18 classroom and we couldn't responsibly ask them to  
19 fulfill what they need to do in that one year and  
20 also learn to teach.

21 Q. Okay. Is it -- does it happen that a  
22 Master's student would teach within the Social  
23 Science Division?

24 A. If you had asked me that, you know, some  
25 time ago I would have said absolutely not. But I

1 recently saw something that said that we have four  
2 out of 300-something students who have taught  
3 something in the Social Science Division. So we  
4 have 333 -- 335 students this year, and I understand  
5 that two or four of them have some role. But I only  
6 understand that because I asked. I would never have  
7 imagined that any had such a role.

8 Q. Okay. Let's -- are you familiar with  
9 situations where an undergraduate -- where  
10 undergraduate enrollment does not reach 24 students,  
11 where a TA would nonetheless be appointed?

12 A. I mean, I'm not -- I'm not. Not in my --

13 Q. That's fine.

14 Let's go back to me as a TA, which I've  
15 never been. And let's say I'm not doing a good job.  
16 Within my five matching -- my five GAI points. What  
17 happens to me? We are meeting and I'm not so good  
18 at what I'm doing. What happens?

19 A. You know, in my case I'll keep on trying to  
20 explain or suggest ways in which you could do  
21 better. Not much else happens, right? You finish  
22 the course. You get the point.

23 Q. How about if I -- if I'm not -- I'm just  
24 not interested in teaching, and I don't expend any  
25 effort in this aspect of the program? Same thing?

1 A. Yes. I mean, look. We -- our  
2 responsibility is to try to teach you to teach, and  
3 you know, I can't -- I don't know how every Core  
4 coordinator would handle this situation. I'm sure  
5 they each handle it in their own way.

6 I guess I could hypothetically imagine  
7 someone who really just never shows up. But even  
8 then, you know, our responsibility is to get you  
9 those five points, and we'll do our best. There is  
10 no -- we don't -- you know, we don't fire you.  
11 There is no -- this is a pedagogical component.  
12 We're teaching you something.

13 Q. So, I wouldn't be removed as a TA in those  
14 circumstances?

15 A. I can't -- I've never heard of that  
16 happening. I mean, look. Even a tenured professor  
17 can be removed if they misbehave sufficiently.

18 Q. Let's put aside the misbehave aspects.

19 A. I've never heard of that happening.

20 Q. How common is it for a TA to have  
21 performance issues?

22 A. So, I've never heard of a problem arising  
23 to the level of someone that's discussed. I only  
24 hear anecdotally from other professors, you know,  
25 about, for example, you know, a TA who doesn't come

1 to all the sessions, etcetera, and I think the  
2 professor speaks to the TA and says, that's not my  
3 expectation of how this should work.

4 You can't learn how to teach Latin if  
5 you're not showing up in the Latin class. But, you  
6 know, how common it is, I wouldn't say. I think  
7 it's very common for us, as we learn to teach, to  
8 not be good at some aspect or the other of it, maybe  
9 to be terrified at some aspects or the other of it,  
10 but our job is to actually help you get over it.

11 Q. At the end of a quarter where I've acted as  
12 a TA, do I meet with a professor to discuss how I  
13 did?

14 A. Yes. I mean I can't say in general.

15 Q. Well, let's take you.

16 A. I would say in my case, absolutely. And  
17 also, you know, I think especially in the larger  
18 structures, the Cores and the CIVs, if you're  
19 following through the three points, say, as an  
20 intern in a CIV, there is a community that knows  
21 about how you're doing and that talks to you about  
22 how you're doing.

23 Q. And does that community also take into  
24 account student reaction if it's available?

25 A. Yeah, I don't know. I mean I imagine they

1 do, just like I take into account student reaction  
 2 about faculty teaching.  
 3 MR. FASMAN: Okay. We'll leave that for  
 4 another day.  
 5 Let me take about a minute and make sure I  
 6 have all my questions answered. Okay?  
 7 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Yes.  
 8 MR. FASMAN: Thank you.  
 9 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Off the record.  
 10 (There was a discussion held  
 11 off the record.)  
 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record.  
 13 BY MR. FASMAN:  
 14 Q. Professor Nirenberg, in your experience is  
 15 there a difference between how you would relate to a  
 16 teaching assistant teaching beyond his GAI points  
 17 and someone who was teaching within his GAI points  
 18 or her GAI points? In other words, people who are  
 19 coming up and people who are teaching, you know,  
 20 beyond five points?  
 21 A. Yes. Let me, in my own experience --  
 22 Q. Yes.  
 23 A. -- with people who are in their GAI points,  
 24 gaining the five points that they need for the GAI,  
 25 I have an obligation to provide them that experience

1 the Social Sciences Division?  
 2 A. Yes.  
 3 Q. In what department?  
 4 A. (Inaudible) and Psychology.  
 5 (Court Reported requested that the  
 6 witness repeat his answer.)  
 7 THE WITNESS: Psychology.  
 8 (Employer Exhibit Number 19 was marked  
 9 for identification.)  
 10 BY MR. FASMAN:  
 11 Q. Professor Nirenberg, I've placed before you  
 12 a document we've marked for identification as  
 13 Employer Exhibit 19, which is entitled Psychology  
 14 Labs, taken off the University of Chicago website as  
 15 on the date and time recorded in the URL at the  
 16 bottom, and ask you if you can identify this  
 17 document?  
 18 A. Yeah. It looks like Department of  
 19 Psychology website about its lab.  
 20 MR. FASMAN: I'd move for the admission of  
 21 this document.  
 22 MS. AUERBACH: No objection.  
 23 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Employer Exhibit 19  
 24 is received.  
 25 (Employer Exhibit Number 19 was

1 of teaching.  
 2 With people beyond those five points, I  
 3 feel -- I feel I don't. And so, for example, I  
 4 wouldn't -- I wouldn't hire someone beyond the five  
 5 points if at that point it's -- it's not a teaching  
 6 obligation, it's not part of the degree program, if  
 7 I didn't think, you know, they had learned to teach.  
 8 If I didn't think they were good. There is, whereas  
 9 with the people in the five points, it's my job to  
 10 teach them how to teach. It's not just my job.  
 11 It's part of their -- of the requirement.  
 12 So, I do think there is a difference.  
 13 I would not hesitate to say to someone who is a bad  
 14 teacher who showed no interest in learning how to  
 15 teach, who came to me past the five points and said,  
 16 I would like to do a course, I would say no. If  
 17 they came within the -- and I'm -- personally I  
 18 don't as Dean of the division make such decisions.  
 19 I don't personally involve myself in any such  
 20 decisions. But if someone came to me as -- and  
 21 said, could I TA for you; I'm past my five points,  
 22 or will you recommend me to do a prize lectureship,  
 23 I'm past my five points, and they were not -- and I  
 24 couldn't in good faith recommend them, I wouldn't.  
 25 Q. Okay. Are there laboratory programs within

1 received into evidence.)  
 2 BY MR. FASMAN:  
 3 Q. Professor Nirenberg, are you aware that  
 4 there are graduate students who participate in the  
 5 laboratories listed, sir?  
 6 A. Yes.  
 7 Q. Do you know how they are classified by the  
 8 Social Sciences Division?  
 9 A. They are graduate students.  
 10 Q. To the best of your knowledge, are they  
 11 classified as research assistants?  
 12 A. To my knowledge, and -- they are classified  
 13 as research assistants only for summer months when  
 14 they are on a grant, on a faculty member's grant, to  
 15 get supplemental summer income as they carry out  
 16 their summer research.  
 17 So, on an -- not an NSF grants, NIH grant,  
 18 then that classification to pay them for that summer  
 19 period as research assistants, but to us they are  
 20 graduate students, and they receive a stipend from  
 21 us as graduate students.  
 22 Q. Okay. Have you ever worked with a research  
 23 assistant, you personally, have you ever worked with  
 24 a research assistant who is helping you on a book,  
 25 for example? Someone from the -- a graduate student

1 from the University of Chicago?  
 2 A. Yes. Yes.  
 3 Q. How have you worked with them?  
 4 A. It's funny because I just -- we seem to --  
 5 received the Laing Prize from the University of  
 6 Chicago, when I received it, I assigned my student,  
 7 Mohammad Balan (phonetic spelling) who is in the  
 8 audience, and I called him -- and he had been my  
 9 research assistant on this book, and I called him my  
 10 student and my teacher, because although I had -- in  
 11 fact, it was a book mostly of articles that I  
 12 previously published before ever meeting Mohammad,  
 13 but working with him, to think about how to make  
 14 these things into a book was -- was a dialogue, in  
 15 which he learned a lot about his field because he's  
 16 in my field and I learned a lot about a part of my  
 17 field that I didn't know about.  
 18 So in that sense, but that's just an  
 19 example that I maybe in -- is particularly close to  
 20 my heart because it happened so recently.  
 21 You know, we -- in my field, unlike say in  
 22 psychology, we make pretty sharp distinctions about,  
 23 so -- and this really depends on subjects, right?  
 24 In psychology, many of the articles people write are  
 25 coauthored between graduate students and -- that's

1 A. I'd say that the more a student, the more  
 2 advanced, the more a student knows about a topic,  
 3 the more -- it's actually a collaboration. So, when  
 4 I have a research assistant who is an undergraduate,  
 5 generally that research assistant is only doing  
 6 things that are quite -- getting things from the  
 7 library, finding objects, maybe classifying objects,  
 8 maybe building a database. Those are skills, but  
 9 they are not the high level skills of the graduate  
 10 student.  
 11 When I work with a graduate student, so to  
 12 think of another case now, I have a graduate student  
 13 who helps me maintain a database of primary  
 14 documents. Why did I ask her to work with me on  
 15 this? Because she needs to learn how to use that  
 16 type of document. She didn't have that skill. And  
 17 so by building this database we sit down and look at  
 18 the documents, and she learns to read 14th Century  
 19 script and to think about what an archival text can  
 20 tell you that published texts can't.  
 21 It's a mutual -- we're building together a  
 22 new kind of data set. If that's an example of kind  
 23 of how a research assistant learns through, then --  
 24 Q. Through working with you?  
 25 A. Right.

1 not the case in, say, history. In Econ, a lot of  
 2 things are coauthored. So, it really depends on the  
 3 field. But I think for fields where that kind of  
 4 collaborative research is how you do research, it's  
 5 a collaboration of that intimate sort, and in fields  
 6 where you don't work that way, it's -- it can be  
 7 quite different.  
 8 Q. So, in your -- in the example you gave of  
 9 the student that assisted you or that worked with  
 10 you on the recent book --  
 11 A. Yes.  
 12 Q. -- is that in your view an academic  
 13 exercise for the student? Does the student benefit  
 14 -- let's ask it this way. Does the student benefit  
 15 from that?  
 16 A. Well, you would have to ask him. I think  
 17 he did in the sense that we got to see how we each  
 18 think about material that is relevant to -- that can  
 19 be potentially relevant to our research, to both of  
 20 our research. But, you know, again, that's my view  
 21 about that, and I -- I'll ask him next time I see  
 22 him if he feels the same way.  
 23 Q. Have you ever participated in --  
 24 A. Can I to return to your --  
 25 Q. Sure.

1 Q. Okay. Great. I want to shift gears and  
 2 ask about a different topic, which is the Council on  
 3 Advanced Studies. Are you familiar with that  
 4 entity?  
 5 A. Yes.  
 6 Q. When was it -- when was it formed, to the  
 7 best of your knowledge, and for what reason?  
 8 A. Well, I mean I don't know exactly when.  
 9 It's about 30 some odd years ago, but I do know by  
 10 whom, Keith Baker, who is a historian, was one of  
 11 the animating intellects behind it.  
 12 The idea was that, how do we learn to do  
 13 what we do? I mean teaching is one thing that we  
 14 learn to do together in the classroom. The other  
 15 thing we learn to do together is arguing.  
 16 Criticizing our research. And seeing what makes a  
 17 good argument, what makes a good paper in our given  
 18 discipline.  
 19 So the idea of the Council for Advanced  
 20 Studies was to create workshops in which graduate  
 21 students and faculty came together to discuss each  
 22 other's work. So, graduate students were presented  
 23 into it. Faculty was presented into it. Sometimes  
 24 invite outsiders to present into it. Always -- I  
 25 mean Chicago, the tradition is circulate papers so

Page 182

1 that everyone has a chance to really pull them apart  
2 and then publicly together debate how they could  
3 have been made better and what's wrong with this  
4 part or that part of it. So, the workshop  
5 tradition. Since Chicago invented it, it's been  
6 copied by many other institutions.  
7 Q. How long ago was this, did it start?  
8 A. I want to say in 1980. 1970-something.  
9 Q. Have you participated or have you led any  
10 of these workshops?  
11 A. Yes. I was one of the faculty directors,  
12 co-directors of the Medieval studies workshop, and I  
13 participated in many others.  
14 Q. And during those -- when you were the  
15 faculty member responsible for the medieval --  
16 A. Studies.  
17 Q. Medieval studies?  
18 A. Yes.  
19 Q. Is that what it's called? Medieval Studies  
20 Workshop, did you have any occasion to interact with  
21 workshop coordinators?  
22 A. Of course.  
23 Q. And with whom did you interact, and in what  
24 way?  
25 A. Well, over my time there are about six

Page 183

1 different coordinators, because they change every  
2 year, and I was director for multiple years or  
3 codirector. So, I won't name names, but basically  
4 we would get together periodically to talk, and my  
5 codirector who I think was William Cuman (phonetic  
6 spelling) would get periodically together to talk  
7 about what will next year look like? Who do people  
8 want to bring? You know, there is this great art  
9 historian. This person in Germany (inaudible). The  
10 graduate student might be very eager to hear from  
11 someone in particular that -- knew about, so that  
12 kind of discussion. Would map out what the year's  
13 calendar would look like. Since it's very much  
14 designed to give this research discussion experience  
15 equally across the board, we would always assign the  
16 graduate student presenter to introduce the  
17 criticism of each paper.  
18 Q. Would that be the workshop coordinator or  
19 someone else?  
20 A. No. No. Anyone in the community whose  
21 work is closest to -- or who wants to criticize that  
22 paper. Or get to know that professor's work or that  
23 visitor's work or that other student's work  
24 particularly well.  
25 So, it's an area around which intellectual

Page 184

1 community and learning what intellectual debate is,  
2 gets modeled and performed on a biweekly basis.  
3 Q. What does a workshop coordinator do?  
4 A. Well, when I was co-directing, the workshop  
5 coordinator works -- so, for example, because  
6 Advanced Studies has funds to fly in a limited  
7 number of people, maybe two people, three people  
8 across the whole year, workshop coordinator would  
9 work with that visitor and make sure they got  
10 reimbursed from the Council of Advanced Studies.  
11 So, be the liaison with the Council of Advanced and  
12 the visitor, because the workshops often themselves  
13 have an accounting function. Council does. That  
14 kind of thing.  
15 Q. Okay. Administrative duties, is that a  
16 fair statement?  
17 A. Yes.  
18 Q. Are they -- does a workshop coordinator in  
19 your experience, do they teach in the same way a  
20 teaching assistant would?  
21 A. They don't teach at all. I mean not in the  
22 same way. I don't think that's a teaching function.  
23 That's a -- it's, along with all of us, it's a  
24 building we're participating in the intellectual  
25 community function.

Page 185

1 Q. Okay. The non-lab research assistants who  
2 have worked with you, Mohammad and others who have  
3 with you. When they've worked with you, do they  
4 engage in a teaching function? Aside from teaching  
5 you about your prior --  
6 A. No.  
7 Q. Not similar to a TA?  
8 A. Not at all. No. I mean I have sometimes  
9 hired a graduate students who had at once been my  
10 research assistant to be my TA. Totally different.  
11 Q. Do they get academic credit for that?  
12 A. For being a research assistant?  
13 Q. Yes.  
14 A. No.  
15 Q. How about workshop coordinators?  
16 A. No.  
17 Q. Do they get academic credit?  
18 A. No.  
19 MR. FASMAN: Okay. I've asked enough  
20 questions, I believe. Thank you Professor  
21 Nirenberg.  
22 THE WITNESS: Thank you.  
23 MR. FASMAN: For your testimony. I think  
24 it's someone else's turn.  
25 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Are you ready?

1 MS. AUERBACH: Just a minute. I'm ready to  
2 start, and I may want to break at some point.

3 CROSS-EXAMINATION

4 BY MS. AUERBACH:

5 Q. You said that you have taught in the  
6 college, correct? You taught in the college?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And part of the mission of the college is  
9 to educate undergraduates, correct?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Undergraduates pay tuition to attend the  
12 University of Chicago? Is that right?

13 A. Yes. Some do.

14 Q. Those who don't receive financial aid pay  
15 full tuition, and those who receive financial aid  
16 pay partial tuition or maybe -- at least partial  
17 tuition or maybe none if they have full --

18 MR. FASMAN: Wait. What?

19 BY MS. AUERBACH:

20 Q. In other words, undergrads pay tuition to  
21 attend unless they have financial aid, correct?

22 A. Right. You have financial aid, you pay  
23 tuition. A large number of undergrads have  
24 financial aid but it's really not my --

25 Q. Right. You were talking about the funding

1 to say, I don't have any function in my office that  
2 I know of that has any intelligence on what other.  
3 Now, when we send a Master's student out into the  
4 world and they get offers, they know what offers  
5 they got because they tell us, and rarely when we're  
6 turned down by someone, we know, you know, what they  
7 got because they tell us.

8 Q. Well, you said that some departments offer  
9 hire stipend levels due to market reasons. So, what  
10 did you mean by market reasons?

11 A. I meant that, so, in economics in  
12 particular, the stipends that some universities  
13 can -- have offered, and the top five Econ  
14 departments in particular, who are much higher than  
15 the ones we could offer. Or offered.

16 Q. And -- but your testimony was that the  
17 economics department stipend is higher than the  
18 stipend in some of the other departments in the  
19 Social Sciences Division because of the fact that  
20 other top universities offer higher stipends to  
21 economic applicants?

22 A. That's correct.

23 Q. That's correct?

24 A. That's right.

25 Q. So, there are some competition among top

1 offer to graduate students, and you said that some  
2 department have prize stipends that they can use to  
3 attract graduate students who have received higher  
4 offers from other universities.

5 Why does the University of Chicago want to  
6 attract those graduate students?

7 A. We want to attract any graduate student  
8 that our faculty thinks is outstanding.

9 Q. And why is that?

10 A. Because we believe that creating great  
11 teachers and researchers is what we're about.

12 Q. And it adds to the prestige of the  
13 university to have high quality graduate students,  
14 correct?

15 A. I've never imagined -- I mean I don't know  
16 about prestige. I know about the quality of  
17 research, which is what I'm in charge of.

18 Q. So, when you said that you may -- the  
19 university may offer or departments may offer these  
20 price stipends to attract grad students who receive  
21 offers from other universities, the university keeps  
22 an eye on what financial packages are offered to  
23 potential grad students at other universities?

24 A. We, so I think -- I can -- I'm not sure if  
25 I should -- I mean, not in any formal way, that is

1 universities, or universities -- the top departments  
2 in certain areas, to attract the top graduate  
3 students?

4 A. Yeah. I think we all -- we all, we don't  
5 all agree on what the top graduate students are.  
6 It's a complex ecosystem. But just like with  
7 undergrads, we have a sense of what makes for a  
8 future excellent researcher, and we want them here.

9 Q. You talked about the Core classes in the  
10 Social Science Division. How many Core classes are  
11 there?

12 A. Oh, I don't know the answer to that.  
13 That's the domain of the Master of the Social  
14 Sciences Collegiate Division.

15 Q. Can you tell me what it means to be a Core  
16 class?

17 A. That's a very Chicago thing, and honestly  
18 it's also part of something that I have paid little  
19 attention to, but the university has long had kind  
20 of what's sometimes called a general education  
21 requirement.

22 So, the Core classes are classes that it  
23 was agreed upon fulfill that requirement and that  
24 every students who enters the university has to take  
25 a certain number of those Core classes in Social

1 Sciences, Humanities, Physical Sciences.  
 2 Q. And what are the Civilization sequences?  
 3 A. The Civilization sequences are also part of  
 4 that undergraduate required component, and there is  
 5 a lot of them, and they are actually growing -- new  
 6 ones offered, which are sequences within which you  
 7 can fulfill the requirement that an undergraduate  
 8 has, and I don't know how many courses they do.  
 9 So, there are sequences like European Civilization,  
 10 African Civilization, Latin American Civilization,  
 11 Ancient Mediterranean Civilization, Asia, and there  
 12 is also other forms that are emerging now. Gender  
 13 Studies. Many of our -- Social Center for Race  
 14 Studies has worked on one as well.  
 15 The definition of CIV is changing. There  
 16 is an Islamic Study CIV, Jewish Studies CIV. The  
 17 definition changes, but the courses through which an  
 18 undergraduate can achieve that exposure to culture.  
 19 The history of culture.  
 20 Q. And in these, the Core classes and the  
 21 Civilization sequence classes in the Social Science  
 22 Division, for each such class there is more than one  
 23 section of the class taught in a given quarter?  
 24 A. Yeah. I think so. I mean I -- I don't  
 25 know that domain well enough to say there is any

1 exception to that, but in general.  
 2 Q. And those sections can be -- you said that  
 3 they the sections coordinate, so for any given  
 4 course all the sections are doing the same readings,  
 5 correct?  
 6 A. Right.  
 7 Q. So, the general curriculum for each of the  
 8 sections for a given course is fairly standardized?  
 9 A. Right. With some leeway for an agreed-upon  
 10 replacement in any given category.  
 11 Q. And the sections in the core classes in  
 12 civilization classes are taught by a combination of  
 13 faculty post docs and graduate students?  
 14 A. Not -- I wouldn't -- again, I don't staff  
 15 these, so you would need to talk to a Master, but in  
 16 the Social Sciences Division, not post docs.  
 17 Q. Not post docs. So, some of the sections  
 18 have taught by faculty members and some are taught  
 19 by graduate students?  
 20 A. And some by Harper fellows. Actually, I  
 21 should correct that. We do now have post docs who  
 22 are graduate students who finish their Ph.D. within  
 23 a certain period of time and have shown excellence  
 24 in teaching, and we have just introduced last year a  
 25 post doc for them to both gain more experience

1 teaching, and usually in these sequences, and turn  
 2 their dissertation into a book.  
 3 Q. And so in any given course where it  
 4 sections -- some sections, one section may be taught  
 5 by faculty member, one may be taught by a post doc  
 6 and one may be taught by a graduate student, they  
 7 are all essentially teaching the same class at the  
 8 same time, correct?  
 9 A. They are all --  
 10 Q. Teaching essentially the same course at the  
 11 same time?  
 12 A. They are using the same syllabus and they  
 13 are showing their experience and thus teaching  
 14 together.  
 15 Q. I'm talking, right -- they are teaching  
 16 separate sections of same course so they are  
 17 following the same syllabus?  
 18 A. Yeah. It's more than separate sections,  
 19 though, right? They are actually coming together in  
 20 a co-produced course weekly, unions to talk about  
 21 how to teach and what to take out of the texts.  
 22 Q. Right. I understand you have those weekly  
 23 meetings, but when they go back and hold their  
 24 sections, they are each essentially teaching roughly  
 25 the same material?

1 MR. FASMAN: Objection.  
 2 MS. AUERBACH: In the course.  
 3 MR. FASMAN: Asked and answered.  
 4 MS. AUERBACH: I'm not sure that was  
 5 clearly answered.  
 6 THE WITNESS: That's the first time someone  
 7 has said that to me.  
 8 You know, I don't know. I'm working on a  
 9 book right now on sameness and difference, so I'm  
 10 sorry to be pedantic, but I -- that's the kind of  
 11 things I focus. I don't see, you know -- maybe I'm  
 12 just focusing on differences and you're asking about  
 13 sameness.  
 14 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 15 Q. Well, I'm looking at -- so an undergrad --  
 16 the university has an online course catalog,  
 17 correct?  
 18 A. I don't know.  
 19 Q. Do you know?  
 20 A. No.  
 21 Q. So, how would undergrads go about finding  
 22 these course?  
 23 A. I mean they may, but it's beyond me.  
 24 Q. Okay.  
 25 HEARING OFFICER MOLLS: Can we maybe talk

1 about an example of a course that you know of that  
 2 is taught to undergrads that perhaps has a number of  
 3 sections? History 100 or --  
 4 THE WITNESS: Well, I mean these are the  
 5 Cores and CIVs. Exactly what she talking about.  
 6 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So, maybe just talk  
 7 about a course in particular.  
 8 THE WITNESS: One course?  
 9 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Yes. Let's talk  
 10 about a course as an example, one of these Core  
 11 classes offered to -- Core classes, general  
 12 education credit. Has a number of different  
 13 sections. Let's say, for example, this general  
 14 course has, you know, faculty and grad students  
 15 teaching the different sections.  
 16 THE WITNESS: Uh-huh.  
 17 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: For this course the  
 18 curriculum is expected to be communicated to the  
 19 students. Is it generally expected for the  
 20 different instructors of the different sections that  
 21 they meet certain topics or subject matters across  
 22 all sections, you know, within that curriculum? I'm  
 23 sorry if that was a little wordy.  
 24 THE WITNESS: No. Much less wordy than my  
 25 answers are. The -- what is expected is that the

1 Q. They both get the credit for fulfilling  
 2 that requirement to take a Core class, that counts  
 3 toward their satisfying their undergraduate Core  
 4 curriculum requirements?  
 5 A. Yes. Just like, you know, if I have my  
 6 hernia repaired by a resident doing their second  
 7 operation, it's the same, you know, as if I have it  
 8 done by a surgeon who has done 5,000.  
 9 Q. A long-term faculty member may do a better  
 10 job of teaching, is that what you're saying, than a  
 11 graduate student?  
 12 A. May. Has more familiarity with the  
 13 material.  
 14 Q. And in those weekly meetings you talked  
 15 about, those are attended by everyone teaching a  
 16 particular course including faculty members, post  
 17 docs and graduate students?  
 18 A. In the sequences I've taught in, yes.  
 19 Q. And in the sequences you've taught it, that  
 20 group of people who are all teaching the course then  
 21 together discuss the materials for the course?  
 22 A. Absolutely.  
 23 Q. And one of the goals of that it is, as you  
 24 said, to share ideas about what's important in all  
 25 of the texts, correct?

1 texts that the group has decided are the really  
 2 significant texts, so let's say it's American CIVs,  
 3 a course I've never taught. But the Declaration of  
 4 Independence or the Bill of Rights or the Federalist  
 5 Papers, that everyone agrees those have to be on  
 6 there.  
 7 Now, what each person -- and that they do  
 8 meet to talk about what they each think are the  
 9 important ideas in those texts. Of course, someone  
 10 who's been teaching these texts for 30 years and has  
 11 read them many times, discussed many times, will  
 12 teach a different class, a different section than  
 13 someone who is perhaps a TA, lecturer teaching for  
 14 the first time who hasn't spent their life with this  
 15 material. And in that sense it's not the same  
 16 course but it's the same syllabus.  
 17 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 18 Q. And an undergrad taking the course taught  
 19 by a faculty member gets the same credit for taking  
 20 that course as an undergraduate taking the course  
 21 taught and the same material taught by a graduate  
 22 student, correct?  
 23 A. Yes. Now, that's not the same thing as  
 24 saying they get the same thing out of the course,  
 25 but they get the same credit.

1 A. That's right.  
 2 Q. And that's partly to help people be better,  
 3 do a better job of teaching the course?  
 4 A. Yes.  
 5 Q. And it's also partly to ensure there is  
 6 some uniformity in the information relayed to the  
 7 undergraduates in each section of the course,  
 8 correct?  
 9 A. That there is uniformity especially about  
 10 the things we think we've learned through experience  
 11 are most important, right?  
 12 I mean one can imagine people approaching a  
 13 text for the first time and not knowing a text well  
 14 can take all kinds of things from it that are quite  
 15 incidental, so we want to make sure important stuff  
 16 gets covered. If that's what you mean by  
 17 uniformity, yes.  
 18 Q. Right. And that's partly to make sure the  
 19 undergraduates taking the course are hearing the  
 20 things that you think are essential and most  
 21 important for them to hear in that course, correct?  
 22 A. Yes.  
 23 Q. The better job a teaching assistant does in  
 24 teaching his or her section of that course, the  
 25 better education the undergraduate students in that

1 course get in that course, correct?  
 2 A. I have to think so.  
 3 Q. And that's an important mission to the  
 4 university, to give a good quality of undergraduate  
 5 courses to its undergraduate students, correct?  
 6 A. Absolutely.  
 7 Q. The teaching assistants who teach, who work  
 8 in the Core or CIVs classes, how do they -- they  
 9 have to apply for those positions, correct?  
 10 A. They do.  
 11 Q. They are not just automatically assigned,  
 12 it's now year three, you're going to be assigned to  
 13 this class? Rather, they are have to apply?  
 14 A. Right.  
 15 Q. And they have to fill out an application?  
 16 A. I don't -- I've never seen an application,  
 17 but I know they are to apply. My role is in that is  
 18 simply writing letters of recommendation for them  
 19 when they do apply.  
 20 Q. Okay. Who do they apply to?  
 21 A. They apply to the Social Sciences  
 22 Collegiate Division, so the Master in the college.  
 23 The people who run the Cores and the CIVs.  
 24 Q. I'm going to show you a document that I'm  
 25 marking as Petitioner's Exhibit 1.

1 (Petitioner's Exhibit Number 1 was  
 2 marked for identification.)  
 3 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 4 Q. So, this says that it's a Social Sciences  
 5 Division Employee application. Are you familiar  
 6 with this document?  
 7 A. I've never seen it before, no.  
 8 Q. Do you know who Latisha is?  
 9 A. No.  
 10 Q. Okay. But so do you know whether -- you  
 11 said employees apply to the Master? Is that what  
 12 you said?  
 13 A. No, what I said was -- I guess I did say  
 14 that, but what I know is when they ask me to send a  
 15 recommendation, I send it to the Social Science  
 16 Collegiate Division Master's address that they send  
 17 me. That's basically all I know of the mechanics of  
 18 the process.  
 19 Q. And who asks to you send the  
 20 recommendation?  
 21 A. The student.  
 22 Q. Do you know how the student is notified,  
 23 whether they successfully get that job and are going  
 24 to be a TA for a class?  
 25 A. I don't know.

1 Q. How do you get notified if you're assigned  
 2 a TA for a class, that that TA was going to be the  
 3 TA?  
 4 A. Well, if it's in the -- if it's in a CIV or  
 5 a Core it's supervised -- just -- this was many  
 6 years ago, about seven years ago. I can't -- I  
 7 don't remember how I was notified, but if it's a  
 8 class that I'm teaching that has enrollment of more  
 9 than 25, generally those students have asked me if  
 10 they could be TAs if I made enrollment, and just so  
 11 I know that -- since I'm the person making the  
 12 choice.  
 13 Q. Okay. So, is it always the professor who  
 14 is over the class who makes the choice?  
 15 A. Only in -- well, I can't speak for always,  
 16 but when I'm teaching a course that's larger than  
 17 that it's, it's -- I suppose, maybe there be a  
 18 plenty of classes in which I would be conjecturing.  
 19 Q. So you don't know?  
 20 A. I don't know.  
 21 Q. And the teaching assistants for these  
 22 class, do they run a discussion section?  
 23 MR. FASMAN: I'm going to object. For  
 24 what?  
 25 BY MS. AUERBACH:

1 Q. We're talking about Core classes and CIVs.  
 2 Do those classes usually have discussion sections?  
 3 A. No. They are themselves.  
 4 Q. The classes?  
 5 A. The classes, students.  
 6 Q. If it's a large -- TAs also work in larger  
 7 classes? Large lecture class?  
 8 A. Yes.  
 9 Q. Again, do some of those classes have  
 10 discussion sections?  
 11 A. Yeah. I think that's up to the professor.  
 12 Q. Do you know if teaching assistants lead  
 13 some of those discussion sections?  
 14 A. I don't. And again, I have not done this  
 15 at the University of Chicago. Now, partly that's  
 16 because it's hard to get rooms to do such things,  
 17 so, a mechanical thing. I do think it would be good  
 18 to have it, but I'm expatiating.  
 19 Q. Are you aware that some other classes do  
 20 have discussion sections, or you don't know?  
 21 A. I don't know. I wouldn't be surprised if  
 22 some did.  
 23 Q. The teaching assistants in the Core classes  
 24 and CIVs classes grade students' papers and exams?  
 25 A. That depends on what the person leading

1 that section has them do. That's a -- each person  
 2 teaching the section who has an intern in the  
 3 section can decide how to work. You know, the  
 4 intern and the teacher decide together.  
 5 Q. So you don't know what they do?  
 6 A. No. In my experience, I did not. I -- you  
 7 know, well -- okay. My experience is not very vast.  
 8 It's just my own anecdote.  
 9 Q. So, you don't know whether or not in other  
 10 courses teaching assistants have graded papers and  
 11 exams?  
 12 A. I would be very surprised if they hadn't,  
 13 but I don't know.  
 14 Q. You would be surprised if they had not done  
 15 that?  
 16 A. Right. I mean it's one thing we need to  
 17 teach people to do, so I would be surprised people  
 18 they are not teaching them to do that.  
 19 Q. It also helps the faculty members if the  
 20 graduate students grade some of the papers and  
 21 exams, correct?  
 22 A. Well, in my experience, which again, it's  
 23 just my experience, it doesn't help the faculty  
 24 member because it's more work to make sure that  
 25 the -- that your collaborator knows what -- what you

1 student signing up to take a Core Social Science  
 2 class or CIV Social Science class where there are  
 3 several sections taught, whether that undergraduate  
 4 student would know whether the person teaching the  
 5 class is a faculty member or graduate student at the  
 6 time they are signing up?  
 7 A. Right. I can speak, again, only from  
 8 experience, and I do have some experience because my  
 9 -- I know that some students try to find that out,  
 10 because it's not written on the course descriptions  
 11 that I know of, and may have preferences if they do  
 12 find it out. But I would imagine most students  
 13 don't put the effort in to figure it out, but they  
 14 do talk about it.  
 15 Q. So, when the student signs up for the  
 16 class, it may list the course and the person  
 17 teaching it, but it does not list whether that  
 18 person is a faculty member or post doc or a graduate  
 19 student?  
 20 A. Again, I don't know the course listings.  
 21 I'm just thinking about undergraduates I have known  
 22 who have -- who I have talked to who have expressed  
 23 frustration that not having as much faculty exposure  
 24 as they expected because they signed up to a course  
 25 which turned out not to be taught by a faculty

1 think as the person in charge of the class is  
 2 important and is grading in a way that is consistent  
 3 and reflects what you're trying to communicate.  
 4 So, that in itself involves a large amount  
 5 of effort. And so I would say that from my point of  
 6 view, especially in a class of 19, having someone  
 7 grading is not a relief to me.  
 8 Q. That may -- you don't know that's the case  
 9 for your fellow faculty members or not?  
 10 A. No, but I say that whatever benefit they  
 11 are receiving is incidental to the task that -- the  
 12 responsibility they have, which is to teach -- how  
 13 to teach.  
 14 Q. Do graduate students who are teaching  
 15 assistants hold office hours?  
 16 A. Again, you know, I can only speak for my  
 17 own, for my own graduate students, and with the  
 18 exception of a graduate student who met with people  
 19 who want to read texts together in Arabic, they have  
 20 no office hours.  
 21 Q. You don't know whether or not other  
 22 teaching assistants working in the Social Science  
 23 Division have held office hours or not?  
 24 A. I do not.  
 25 Q. Do you know whether an undergraduate

1 member.  
 2 So, I know both, they are not always  
 3 looking, and second, that they do have preferences  
 4 or views.  
 5 Q. And you talked about a handful of  
 6 undergraduates may take the effort to research and  
 7 find out who is teaching the course, and that  
 8 happens even in terms of different faculty members  
 9 teaching courses, undergraduate may seek a faculty  
 10 member over another faculty member because one has a  
 11 strong reputation as a teacher, correct?  
 12 MR. FASMAN: I try not to object to long,  
 13 compound questions, but that's three different  
 14 questions. I don't think that's fair.  
 15 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 16 Q. We can rephrase it.  
 17 Undergraduates may shop around between two  
 18 faculty members who -- where they think one has a  
 19 higher reputation as a teacher, correct?  
 20 A. I'm sure they do. I don't know how I --  
 21 but we want them to.  
 22 Q. You were asked some questions about  
 23 graduate students who work past the five years. If  
 24 a graduate student obtains a position as a lecturer  
 25 in a class, and that graduate student is past the

1 five years and past the five points, that person  
 2 still performs the same work teaching that class as  
 3 a lecturer who has not yet achieved -- graduate  
 4 student has not yet achieved the five points,  
 5 correct?  
 6 MR. FASMAN: I'm going to object. I'm not  
 7 sure -- I'm not sure what that -- what the question  
 8 was.  
 9 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 10 Q. So, if you have a grad student who is, say,  
 11 a fifth year, has not yet achieved five points, and  
 12 obtains a position as a lecturer for a given class,  
 13 and then there is a second graduate student who  
 14 already has the five points, maybe has already  
 15 passed the fifth year, is a lecturer for another  
 16 section, same course. They are both doing the same  
 17 work, correct?  
 18 A. I mean --  
 19 MR. FASMAN: Objection. They are not  
 20 working. They are teaching.  
 21 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: We're getting into  
 22 semantics at this point. They are expected to teach  
 23 the same curriculum; would that be accurate?  
 24 THE WITNESS: Yes. I think that's right.  
 25 I mean if you're creating this hypothetical

1 situation, again, I don't know that that ever  
 2 arises, in which you have someone in the GAI acting  
 3 as a lecturer in a course -- well, anyway, and  
 4 someone not in a GAI in a course that also has  
 5 multiple lectures, I can imagine that the teaching  
 6 is the same, yes.  
 7 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 8 Q. And they have the other same  
 9 responsibilities, to grade papers, hold office  
 10 hours, correct?  
 11 A. I would think so, but I've never been, you  
 12 know, in this situation.  
 13 Q. You're not aware of any differing  
 14 responsibilities that they have?  
 15 A. Someone pre-GAI and post-GAI? I think it's  
 16 not so much differing responsibilities, it's  
 17 differing consequences, right? I mean someone pre-  
 18 GAI --  
 19 Q. I'm only asking about the responsibilities.  
 20 A. But I think --  
 21 MR. FASMAN: I'm going to object. The  
 22 witness hadn't finished his answer.  
 23 MS. AUERBACH: I'm asking him to focus on  
 24 the question that was asked, which was just the  
 25 responsibilities.

1 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: That's an accurate  
 2 representation. She asked about the  
 3 responsibilities. And he's entered into territory  
 4 that was not asked.  
 5 MR. FASMAN: He's got to finish his answer,  
 6 though.  
 7 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So --  
 8 MR. FASMAN: She can move to strike.  
 9 That's just courtesy.  
 10 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Your testimony, is  
 11 it correct that the responsibilities are the same as  
 12 far as what's expected of the lecturer?  
 13 THE WITNESS: You may see this as  
 14 semantics, but I don't think the word  
 15 responsibilities actually covers what I'm saying is  
 16 the same.  
 17 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: What word would you  
 18 use to describe it?  
 19 THE WITNESS: Well, I think the difference  
 20 is, you might say that the material they need to  
 21 cover is the same, and our expectations, our hopes  
 22 for how they cover it is the same, but the  
 23 responsibilities, should they fail to cover it, is  
 24 different, in the sense that when they are in the  
 25 GAI, you know, it's our commitment to train them

1 through this. They are not responsible in the same  
 2 way.  
 3 If they don't succeed in the same way, we  
 4 don't take the same actions. Whereas post-GAI -- so  
 5 this is why I say responsibility does cover what I'm  
 6 trying to describe. Post-GAI, if they don't succeed  
 7 in the things that we expect them, we do take  
 8 different actions. We hold them responsible in a  
 9 different way.  
 10 For example, we wouldn't renew them. Renew  
 11 is the wrong word. We wouldn't consider them again  
 12 for that function.  
 13 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 14 Q. When I'm talking about responsibilities,  
 15 I'm talking about the responsibilities toward the  
 16 undergraduates in teaching the class. Those  
 17 responsibilities are the same regardless of whether  
 18 someone has fulfilled the GAIs or not fulfilled  
 19 them, correct?  
 20 A. Yes. I think that's -- I think that  
 21 responsibility is the same insofar as I understand  
 22 the narrow question you're trying to ask.  
 23 Q. You talked about teaching graduate students  
 24 who are TAs about grading, and you want consistency  
 25 in grading, correct?

1 A. Yes. I mean if they are teaching a class  
 2 in which we are all in the same -- it's different if  
 3 they are teaching their own section, so, if they are  
 4 grading in my course where all the students are the  
 5 same, I want as much consistency and common sense of  
 6 what's important in the exercise as possible.  
 7 Q. And that's because it's important to the  
 8 education of the undergraduates to have meaningful  
 9 and consistent grading, correct?  
 10 MR. FASMAN: Objection.  
 11 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Grounds?  
 12 MR. FASMAN: I'll withdraw it.  
 13 THE WITNESS: I'm not even sure where I am  
 14 now.  
 15 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: You may repeat the  
 16 question.  
 17 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 18 Q. You want consistency in grading because  
 19 it's important to be -- it's important to the  
 20 education of the undergraduates to have meaningful  
 21 and consistent grading, correct?  
 22 A. I want consistent grading for many reasons.  
 23 Partly because I want --  
 24 Q. Is that one of the reasons?  
 25 A. I think that's definitely one.

1 MR. FASMAN: Can he finish his answer he  
 2 was about to answer?  
 3 MS. AUERBACH: He's been doing a lot of  
 4 evading with the answers. It may just be because  
 5 he's a professor and that's how he talks, but I'm  
 6 trying to get answers to the questions.  
 7 MR. FASMAN: When I was in school we were  
 8 always very courteous to our professors and allowed  
 9 them to answer the question fully before we  
 10 interrupted them.  
 11 MS. AUERBACH: Well, we're not in school  
 12 right now.  
 13 MR. FASMAN: I think it's obnoxious,  
 14 frankly.  
 15 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: We can seek the --  
 16 counsel's has a right to seek the answer to the  
 17 specific questions.  
 18 MR. FASMAN: I have no problem with that,  
 19 but I don't think the witness should be interrupted  
 20 on the stand. If he is answering the question as  
 21 best he can, he should be allowed to finish his  
 22 answer before counsel snaps off another question in  
 23 the middle of his answer. That's called courtesy.  
 24 MS. AUERBACH: I think I'm allowed to try  
 25 to get answers to my questions.

1 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Let's move on.  
 2 THE WITNESS: And I'll do my best.  
 3 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 4 Q. Thank you.  
 5 You said that at the beginning of a course  
 6 you discussed grading, and then after a while you  
 7 may tell a graduate student who is working as a TA,  
 8 just show me five of your gradings, correct?  
 9 MR. FASMAN: Objection. I don't think that  
 10 fairly characterizes it.  
 11 MS. AUERBACH: That's why I'm asking him.  
 12 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 13 Q. Was that accurate as you to what you  
 14 testified?  
 15 A. Yes. That as I get more confidence in our  
 16 having gained together common skills, I move on to  
 17 focus on other skills.  
 18 Q. And then at that point the TA will be  
 19 grading papers, some of which you do not review,  
 20 correct?  
 21 A. Yes. To be totally clear -- I'm trying to  
 22 think. I'll just say -- that's perfectly possible.  
 23 Q. And in that case, the grade that the TA  
 24 gives is the grade on that paper given to the  
 25 undergraduate student, correct?

1 A. Yes. Unless the -- so, I will have seen  
 2 some material from every student, and unless a  
 3 student comes to me and says -- for an object I  
 4 didn't see, with a complaint, that would be the  
 5 case.  
 6 Q. Do you know what percentage of graduate  
 7 students in the Social Science Division teach in the  
 8 Core classes or the CIV classes?  
 9 A. I don't. But I imagine it's quite high.  
 10 But I don't know.  
 11 Q. Graduate students --  
 12 A. And that really varies by department.  
 13 Q. Some departments are higher than others?  
 14 A. Right. The smaller the major of a  
 15 department, the more, the greater proportion of its  
 16 student would be teaching a course.  
 17 Q. Graduate students from other schools and  
 18 divisions at the university also TA and lecture in  
 19 the Social Sciences Division Core and CIV classes,  
 20 correct?  
 21 A. That I don't know.  
 22 Q. You don't know?  
 23 A. Because the Master does all of this, and  
 24 that's a different position in the college.  
 25 Q. So, you're not sure?

1 A. And part of my hesitation in answering your  
2 question has to do with the fact that my own domain  
3 is quite restricted. So, I don't -- I'm in a way  
4 talking about my own experience, which is just my  
5 own experience.

6 Q. I'm just asking if you're aware. If you're  
7 not aware --

8 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I don't know is a  
9 perfectly acceptable answer.

10 THE WITNESS: Okay.

11 BY MS. AUERBACH:

12 Q. With respect to the teaching, fulfilling  
13 the teaching requirements in the Social Science  
14 Division for graduate students, they can fulfill  
15 some of those requirements outside of the Social  
16 Science Division?

17 A. Like I said, that's rare. And I think in  
18 theory it's not -- I don't believe it's the general  
19 rule. I mean the general rule is that they can't,  
20 but we make exceptions as needed. And I think I  
21 gave the example of one exception I think I know of,  
22 although I don't know the details of it, where it's  
23 important for students' career paths to do it  
24 elsewhere. But I don't really know how flexible the  
25 rule is or even that the rule is -- how fixed the

1 his testimony was, and what my questions are were, I  
2 don't think that's a proper question.

3 MS. AUERBACH: If he doesn't remember  
4 saying that, he can say it.

5 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: What was the --

6 MS. AUERBACH: I heard you a couple of  
7 times say -- I said a couple of times when he was  
8 asked questions related to wanting grad students to  
9 be qualified to teach, he started answer saying "our  
10 undergraduates are" and then didn't really finish  
11 the question, and I was trying to understand what he  
12 was trying to say by that.

13 MR. FASMAN: I still think it's improper  
14 cross. Objection.

15 MS. AUERBACH: Just asking about something  
16 he testified to.

17 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So, can you repeat  
18 the question that Employer counsel had asked that  
19 you were seeking the additional response to or the  
20 clearer response to?

21 BY MS. AUERBACH:

22 Q. You were asked a question about whether  
23 it's the philosophy for graduate students to teach  
24 without being fully qualified, and you started  
25 saying, "our undergraduates are" -- and then you

1 rule is.

2 Q. Okay. Do you know if some of the graduate  
3 students fulfill the requirements by being a writing  
4 intern or a lecturer in the writing program?

5 A. I don't know with certainty, but I think --  
6 I know students who have done that. I don't know if  
7 they have gotten points for it. I just know they've  
8 done it, and I think that's an important pedagogical  
9 skill to get, too.

10 Q. And do you know if some students have done  
11 it by being language assistants?

12 A. In the Social Sciences Division, other than  
13 the one case I mentioned about Committee on Social  
14 Thought student, I don't know of any.

15 Q. You were asked a couple of questions  
16 related to whether you want graduate students to  
17 teach without being qualified, and your answers on  
18 two different occasions started, our undergrads --  
19 our undergraduates are -- and then you didn't really  
20 finish that sentence. So, I wasn't clear what you  
21 were trying to say when you say "our undergraduates  
22 are."

23 MR. FASMAN: I'm going to object as to the  
24 form of the question. I don't know that it's  
25 comprehensible. Unless he remembers exactly what

1 didn't answer. Finish saying what our  
2 undergraduates are, and I was trying to understand  
3 what you were trying to --

4 A. What I was getting at? Well, what I was  
5 getting at, I think, and I say this just -- okay. I  
6 say this as a parent and I say this as a teacher of  
7 graduate students. I think there is a delicate  
8 balance between making sure that all of our graduate  
9 students get trained in teaching and making sure  
10 that all of our undergraduates receive the kind of  
11 education that we most want to give them, the best  
12 education we can possibly give them. And I think,  
13 you know, there is a similar balance, say, in a  
14 teaching hospital, and I think that's kind of -- so  
15 I know that -- I know this just from conversations,  
16 that the Dean of the College certainly feels that  
17 faculty teaching is crucial, and that that's the  
18 experience undergraduates -- and at the same time we  
19 want to make sure we provide a teaching opportunity  
20 for our graduate students so that they can learn how  
21 to teach.

22 So, that tension is what I meant. We are  
23 not -- we do not want to forget that we have this --  
24 these two responsibilities that are not -- not  
25 necessarily trivially reconciled. I say a phrase

1 like not necessarily trivially reconciled, and I  
 2 understand what you mean by professor.  
 3 Q. So, when you said education is complicated,  
 4 is that what you were getting at, that it's  
 5 important to make sure that the undergraduates  
 6 receive a high quality education, that they also  
 7 want to teach the graduate students?  
 8 A. I don't remember when I said education is  
 9 complicated, but I'll be happy to answer the  
 10 question if you tell me what context I said it in.  
 11 Q. It was in the fair context.  
 12 MR. FASMAN: I don't think that's a fair  
 13 question. He said he didn't remember that context.  
 14 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 15 Q. Well, you said that in social sciences you  
 16 don't have many prize lectureships and you run them  
 17 as competitions, and then you again said "our  
 18 undergraduates are -- education is complicated."  
 19 A. Oh. I simply meant that delivering a great  
 20 education is something that's very hard to do. I  
 21 mean being a great teacher is very hard to do. Not  
 22 everyone is going to be a great teacher, and that's  
 23 also true with faculty, but we want to make sure  
 24 that our undergraduates, who, for the same reason as  
 25 our -- you know, they are making -- they are making

1 a huge investments of their time and resources to  
 2 acquire the best education they can, that's what  
 3 we're providing them.  
 4 You know, I'd go back to my analogy with  
 5 medicine. That the more often you've taught, the  
 6 more variety of students you've seen, the more times  
 7 you've worked with this material, read these texts,  
 8 thought about them, debated them, the better teacher  
 9 you're going to be. I think that's the case. And  
 10 so, you know, just like it's crucial to provide  
 11 training opportunities so that our graduate students  
 12 learn to do what they are going to need to do once  
 13 they become professors or that our surgeons learn  
 14 what they need to learn before they become surgeons,  
 15 it's also crucial to make sure that that doesn't  
 16 interfere or come at the cost of this other side of  
 17 things.  
 18 Q. And you said that the seminars are offered  
 19 for faculty, especially new faculty, on how to  
 20 teach, correct?  
 21 A. We -- I said -- I have occasionally  
 22 organized, I think last year, right, seminar for new  
 23 faculty on how to teach.  
 24 Q. And that's because you want high quality  
 25 teaching for the undergraduates?

1 A. That's because the University of Chicago is  
 2 a different place than other places I've taught, and  
 3 we want them to get some sense, transition sense of,  
 4 look, of course, it's the goal of all of it is to  
 5 make them better teachers, make us all better  
 6 teachers.  
 7 Q. And that's so that you providing --  
 8 providing high quality teacher for the  
 9 undergraduates?  
 10 A. Right. I should say we're focused here  
 11 just on the undergraduates, and the difficulty of  
 12 teaching is also teaching graduate students  
 13 teaching.  
 14 Q. When you said that any graduate student who  
 15 applies for a job has to produce a teaching  
 16 statement, does that apply for grad students  
 17 applying for jobs either at the University of  
 18 Chicago or another university?  
 19 A. Oh, I don't know. I just meant that most  
 20 jobs as today, say, please submit a statement of  
 21 teaching and of research.  
 22 Q. Right. I was just trying to clarify, you  
 23 were not referring to just to jobs at the University  
 24 of Chicago?  
 25 A. No. I mean in the world. So when

1 students -- the vast number of these students are  
 2 not applying for jobs at the University of Chicago.  
 3 They are applying outside.  
 4 (Petitioner's Exhibit Number 2 was  
 5 marked for identification.)  
 6 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 7 Q. I'm handing you a document that's been  
 8 marked Petitioner's Exhibit 2, which is the from the  
 9 university's website on student employment. Are you  
 10 familiar with this?  
 11 A. Not yet. As soon as I finish reading it I  
 12 will be.  
 13 Q. Thank you.  
 14 A. Okay. Thanks.  
 15 Q. Are you familiar with that policy?  
 16 A. No. I'm familiar with the 20-hour limit on  
 17 labor, which I think I talked about earlier, on  
 18 non-- you know, non-research work. I thought that  
 19 was an absolutely fixed rule.  
 20 Q. You thought was a fixed rule?  
 21 A. 20-hour cap.  
 22 Q. Okay. So, the -- to your understanding,  
 23 the limit on 20 hours of work in a week is a  
 24 standard requirement?  
 25 A. Absolutely.

1 Q. Across the university?  
 2 A. I can't speak for the university, but  
 3 certainly for the Division of Social Sciences.  
 4 Q. Okay. And that 20-hour cap applies to any  
 5 kind of employment a student in the division does?  
 6 A. Right. I mean I think it can expand to 22  
 7 if it's all teaching, because of the way it's  
 8 accounted for in our system, but it's an absolute  
 9 cap in terms of -- and I'm not sure about the  
 10 detail. An absolute cap as far as I know. And I  
 11 don't know of any exception that this seems to imply  
 12 that there is a way to -- I don't know of any such.  
 13 Q. You're not aware in the Social Science  
 14 Division of any exceptions to the 20-hour cap except  
 15 you said a couple of cases maybe of 22?  
 16 A. If you're teaching two sections  
 17 simultaneously, then the way we would account for  
 18 that would be, I think, 22, to allow you to teach a  
 19 maximum of two sections in a quarter.  
 20 Q. And teaching a section then is considered  
 21 11 hours?  
 22 A. Yes. I believe that we have a different  
 23 hour allocation, and again here, these are details  
 24 that are part of a Workday accounting system that I  
 25 don't control. I don't control the details. I

1 believe that internship is a certain number of hours  
 2 and teaching your own section is a different number  
 3 of hours. Slightly more.  
 4 Q. And those are -- that's done by some  
 5 computation of the number of hours expected to  
 6 take --  
 7 A. Yes.  
 8 Q. To do that job?  
 9 A. Right.  
 10 Q. To have those responsibilities?  
 11 A. Right.  
 12 Q. And you referred to -- was it Workday?  
 13 A. Yes. I just know that the large software  
 14 system that drives people crazy.  
 15 Q. That's a software system where employment  
 16 hours are recorded?  
 17 MR. FASMAN: I think he says what drives  
 18 people crazy.  
 19 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 20 Q. Separate question. I'm saying is that a  
 21 computer system where employment hours are --  
 22 A. I don't know the details. I know that we  
 23 have administrative systems. I know we have a set  
 24 of hours we assume that each task, in this case,  
 25 teaching, takes. And I don't know how -- I'm just

1 aware.  
 2 Q. Is that a system that you work with, or no?  
 3 A. No.  
 4 Q. Was it your testimony that in the Social  
 5 Science Division about 25 percent of the graduate  
 6 students exceed five teaching points?  
 7 A. Within the first five years.  
 8 Q. Within the first five years?  
 9 A. Yes. And again, I don't know the number.  
 10 I could -- you know, if I had known that was going  
 11 to be a question I could have probably found it out,  
 12 but I'm just guessing because I only know of one  
 13 area where that is at all common, and that's in  
 14 economics.  
 15 Q. And those graduate students who teach  
 16 beyond the five points earn extra compensation  
 17 beyond their other funding?  
 18 A. I don't know, but I would imagine. I don't  
 19 know.  
 20 Can I just add this? One of the reasons  
 21 for this is that in economics the time to degree is  
 22 five years. Like in psychology. So, when you  
 23 get -- if you want to teach such a course it's going  
 24 to be in those five years.  
 25 Q. There is no rule prohibiting a graduate

1 student from achieving more than five points in five  
 2 years, correct?  
 3 A. There is a rule.  
 4 Q. Prohibiting it?  
 5 A. Well, you need to petition for an exemption  
 6 from the rule that prohibits it. I think that was  
 7 in one of the documents we just read. I can't say  
 8 which exhibit number, but it was in one of them. If  
 9 you want to exceed five points in your GAI you need  
 10 to petition the Dean of Students. And that's  
 11 because we don't see teaching as what you're  
 12 receiving the stipend for. We see the research.  
 13 So, if you're going to spend more time teaching, we  
 14 don't want you to do that unless there is a specific  
 15 reason that we would grant an exception for.  
 16 Q. Okay. I guess I don't see anything -- I  
 17 think you're looking at Employer Exhibit 18. I  
 18 don't see anything in there that says it's  
 19 prohibited. It just says that you need to petition  
 20 the Dean of Students.  
 21 A. That's all I mean. If you don't get  
 22 approval from the Dean of students it's not allowed.  
 23 HEARING OFFICER MOLLS: I have a clarifying  
 24 question. So, assuming you have a graduate student,  
 25 they have met their five GAI points and they are

1 petitioning to teach another lecture, even though  
 2 they have met those five points, assuming they are  
 3 approved to teach again, there would still be  
 4 another point, so they are at six points? Or I  
 5 guess seven potentially? Or do the points just  
 6 stop?  
 7 THE WITNESS: I don't know, because I think  
 8 at that point, the points are bookkeeping way of  
 9 saying have you got these practicum experiences,  
 10 right? And once you're beyond the five points for  
 11 the GAI, I don't know even in this sheet you showed  
 12 me earlier tracks beyond the five years of GAI.  
 13 That I don't know.  
 14 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Thank you.  
 15 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 16 Q. And you were asked about conversations you  
 17 have about recommending not teaching beyond the five  
 18 points. Other than the conversations you've had  
 19 with your advisees, you do not know what other  
 20 faculty members have told advisees about that, do  
 21 you?  
 22 A. No. And again, every student is different,  
 23 so one can imagine circumstances where I might tell  
 24 them, you're right, you really should do that.  
 25 That's a great opportunity. But as a rule, focusing

1 reading this document, if they get a prize  
 2 lectureship in their first five years and they are  
 3 already at four points they don't need approval to  
 4 get it.  
 5 Q. Okay. Do you know if it also means that if  
 6 they have a full five points they can then take on a  
 7 lectureship without permission of the Dean of  
 8 Students?  
 9 A. I don't know.  
 10 Q. You're not aware of anything that prohibits  
 11 doing that?  
 12 A. This is the --  
 13 Q. You didn't write this document?  
 14 A. No.  
 15 Q. And you don't know the answer?  
 16 A. No.  
 17 Q. You said that Master's students for the  
 18 most part don't teach because they don't have the  
 19 degree knowledge and because they are paying for  
 20 their education. What is the relevance of the fact  
 21 that they are paying for their education to the fact  
 22 that they are not teaching?  
 23 MR. FASMAN: I don't know that that  
 24 adequately -- if that accurately characterizes his  
 25 testimony, but I don't think that's the question.

1 on research is what is going to be most important.  
 2 Q. Okay. I'm looking again at Employer  
 3 Exhibit 18, this teaching appointments transcript.  
 4 The sentence in bold that you were looking at. It  
 5 says: With the exception of lectureships, students  
 6 must petition the Dean of Students to take a  
 7 teaching assignment that will exceed the total of  
 8 five points all together before the sixth year of  
 9 study.  
 10 A. Uh-huh.  
 11 Q. So, does that mean that graduate students  
 12 do not need the permission of a Dean of Students to  
 13 take a lectureship even if they've already  
 14 accumulated their five points?  
 15 A. That could be. I mean as I think about why  
 16 that would be there, I would imagine, and again, I'm  
 17 hypothesizing and I don't certainly don't sit over  
 18 the Dean of Students and ask him or her why they  
 19 have their decisions, but it would be because they  
 20 do not want -- you saw how the points work. You're  
 21 usually getting one-point courses as you go, and  
 22 let's say you've got four points and then you have a  
 23 chance to teach a prize lectureship. That's a great  
 24 thing, so we want you to have a chance to teach your  
 25 own class. So I don't know -- it sounds like,

1 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Can you restate the  
 2 question?  
 3 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 4 Q. The question was: You testified that  
 5 Master's students for the most part don't teach  
 6 because they don't have the degree knowledge, and  
 7 because they are paying for their education. What's  
 8 the relevance of the fact that they are paying for  
 9 the education to the fact that they don't generally  
 10 teach?  
 11 MR. FASMAN: Once again, I object to the  
 12 lead-up to the question. But I have no objection to  
 13 the actual question.  
 14 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: You can answer the  
 15 question.  
 16 THE WITNESS: Yeah. I mean what we are --  
 17 with our Master's students we are saying to them  
 18 that we can in a year get them from this level, from  
 19 Point A to Point B in terms of their preparation,  
 20 their skills, and their abilities and the  
 21 recognizability of the quality of their work, and  
 22 that's extremely hard to achieve, and we're asking  
 23 them -- we're telling them it's an investment in  
 24 their future that we can do that for them.  
 25 If we then added a requirement that is not

1 necessary for them to do that, because beyond Ph.D.  
2 no one is looking whether you can teach. Then we  
3 wouldn't be helping them, and we would be harming  
4 the program. We would be creating a program that  
5 wouldn't be able to achieve its ends.

6 It would be like saying that we wanted to  
7 charge our undergraduates tuition and make them work  
8 I don't know how many hours a week for us, and -- I  
9 don't know that that's what it would be like, but,  
10 you know, we couldn't then achieve the education we  
11 need to achieve in that period of time.

12 It's extraneous to what we're telling the  
13 Master's we're doing for them. We're not telling  
14 the Master's we're teaching them to teach. We are  
15 telling graduate students, the Ph.D. students, that  
16 we're teaching them to teach because they need to  
17 have that skill.

18 BY MS. AUERBACH:

19 Q. You said that you asked for information and  
20 found out that there were a handful of Master's  
21 students who had taught, correct?

22 A. Right.

23 Q. And were those -- were they doing teaching  
24 assistant work?

25 A. I have no idea what they were doing.

1 Q. You don't know what they were doing?

2 A. And I don't know if it was even in their  
3 field. You know, one can imagine all kinds of  
4 situations if someone comes in with a skill, like,  
5 for example, a native speaker of Farsi, I don't  
6 know, and they are doing Computational Social  
7 Science and someone asks them if they would do a  
8 seminar for us, I have no idea. But it worked out  
9 to around in my head to less than 1 percent.

10 Q. If a graduate student who works as a  
11 teaching assistant does not do a good job, it would  
12 make it harder for that graduate student to get an  
13 additional teaching assignments, correct?

14 MR. FASMAN: Objection. Hypothetical.

15 MS. AUERBACH: He was asked a number of  
16 questions about if there were any consequences for a  
17 teaching assistant who doesn't do a good job, and  
18 I'm allowed to ask.

19 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: You can answer.

20 THE WITNESS: I don't know of any -- so, I  
21 know of cases where a student hasn't done a good  
22 job. I don't know of any consequences for not  
23 having done a good job. That is to say, the  
24 consequence is to go on to the next task and try to  
25 do it better, maybe with more supervision. Maybe

1 with more inputs about what you did badly. But --  
2 but that's it.

3 BY MS. AUERBACH:

4 Q. Well, for instance, you talked about the  
5 prize lectureship, graduate students who had not  
6 done a good job --

7 A. That's for sure.

8 Q. -- and teaching assistants would be  
9 unlikely to be awarded one of these prize  
10 lectureships, right?

11 A. Right. The prize lectureships are  
12 stand-alone courses that you compete for. That's  
13 absolutely the case. And usually they are beyond  
14 the -- not always, because like I said in economics  
15 we do -- but they would be beyond the GAI. Beyond  
16 the five points.

17 Q. And the --

18 A. Not always.

19 Q. To be awarded one of those prize  
20 lectureships the graduate student would have to be  
21 someone who has done a good job in the prior  
22 teaching they've done, correct?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. You said that you take into account student  
25 reaction to faculty teaching. What did you mean by

1 that?

2 A. I mean that it's important that faculty  
3 take -- put attention into their teaching, just like  
4 it's important that graduate students who are going  
5 to become faculty learn to teach, and that I and the  
6 Master of the College and the Dean of the College  
7 and Chair of the department, mostly the Master of  
8 the College and I, look at that and worry about  
9 that, and in cases where we see a problem, we talk  
10 to the faculty member. We reflect it in a number of  
11 ways, disciplinary ways, let's call them.

12 There is a teaching component, for  
13 example -- may not be relevant to your question to  
14 how we -- I think it is. Certainly how I think  
15 about your question. To how we compensate faculty.

16 Q. Do you have any role in sending out the  
17 admissions letters to students, graduate students in  
18 the Division of Social Sciences?

19 A. No.

20 Q. Do you see those letters or no?

21 A. I have not seen one. No.

22 Q. You don't see those letters?

23 A. No.

24 Q. How about the documents notifying graduate  
25 students that they are appointed to a particular

1 position such as a lectureship; do you see those  
 2 documents?  
 3 A. No, I haven't. No.  
 4 Q. And who sends those --  
 5 A. In fact, you know, even this tracking sheet  
 6 is not something I see.  
 7 Q. Who sends those documents out?  
 8 A. I don't know.  
 9 Q. You don't know?  
 10 A. Who sends out appointments? I don't know.  
 11 Q. Like a document saying you've been  
 12 appointed to do this lectureship?  
 13 A. I don't know. I would imagine -- I don't  
 14 know.  
 15 MR. FASMAN: Can we ask if we're coming to  
 16 a convenient breaking point?  
 17 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Why don't we finish  
 18 with cross, and then we'll break for lunch.  
 19 MR. FASMAN: All right. If cross is going  
 20 to be finished at 2:00 o'clock. That's what I was  
 21 asking.  
 22 MS. AUERBACH: Some of this is just cut out  
 23 because he says he's not familiar with the type of  
 24 document I was going to show him.  
 25 MR. FASMAN: I still think -- it's 12:15.

1 How long are we going to go?  
 2 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Do you think you'll  
 3 be finished by 1:00 o'clock?  
 4 MS. AUERBACH: Yes.  
 5 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: That's fine.  
 6 MR. FASMAN: Okay.  
 7 Does the witness need a break?  
 8 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: If you would like a  
 9 break we can take a break.  
 10 THE WITNESS: I'm fine. I don't know if  
 11 I'll make it until 1:00.  
 12 MS. AUERBACH: It may not take that long,  
 13 actually.  
 14 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 15 Q. You identified Employer Exhibit 19, which  
 16 is a list of psychology labs. Are you familiar with  
 17 how -- so, do graduate students work as research  
 18 assistants in those labs?  
 19 A. So, let me return to what I said, and what  
 20 I said I know from my colleagues who work in  
 21 psychology, I don't myself work in psychology, the  
 22 research assistant title which might be loosely used  
 23 only applies officially to students in labs when  
 24 they are on -- usually just for the summer  
 25 component, a grant of a faculty member. That's the

1 way in which we get additional summer funding to  
 2 graduate students in psychology, but they are from  
 3 my point of view and the division's point of view  
 4 just graduate students in psychology who receive the  
 5 same stipend that any graduate student receives.  
 6 Q. And do you know when those graduate  
 7 students work as research assistants over the summer  
 8 for a faculty member on a grant, whether the funding  
 9 to pay those graduate students comes out of the  
 10 faculty member's grant?  
 11 A. I mean it must. But I don't know. I mean,  
 12 I'm just -- now I'm just -- it's just my common  
 13 sense that if you put someone in a grant the money  
 14 will come out of the grant.  
 15 Q. And when the faculty member applies for the  
 16 grant, there is a section they have to fill out that  
 17 includes the personnel who will be working on --  
 18 A. Oh, no. That's an interesting thing. We  
 19 do not put -- in the division, this is different in  
 20 other divisions, but it's certainly the case in  
 21 Social Sciences, our faculty do not put graduate  
 22 student stipends on grants. It's very common in  
 23 the -- in the university world to do that. But we  
 24 don't. We provide that stipend.  
 25 So, I don't know the details about what

1 each NSF or NIH grant might say that they are doing,  
 2 but I am sure they are following appropriate, you  
 3 know, uses of their funds when they say.  
 4 Q. So, for the Psychology Department you're  
 5 saying that funding for their summer research  
 6 assistants comes out of the Division of Social  
 7 Sciences general funding?  
 8 A. Yes. The psychology graduate students  
 9 receive the same \$3,000 of summer research, but, you  
 10 know -- well, psychology, well, the world of grants  
 11 in psychology is beyond me to a certain degree, but  
 12 one of the jobs that the psychology faculty carry  
 13 out in their teaching is, in a graduate teaching, is  
 14 teaching their graduates to apply for grants. And  
 15 those students after their first year seminar often  
 16 get NSFs of their own.  
 17 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: What is an NSF?  
 18 THE WITNESS: National Science Foundation.  
 19 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you.  
 20 THE WITNESS: So, you know, the space of  
 21 the lab is a collaborative lab, meaning everybody is  
 22 doing their research together. That's why there is  
 23 so much subject area. The cost of the lab is to  
 24 some degree, you know, hidden from the researcher  
 25 and some degree known by the researcher.

1 So the university carries a huge amount of  
2 indirect cost to the lab, and the researchers bring  
3 in, each in their own way, different parts of the  
4 cost, whether it's through a National Foundation  
5 Grant or Principal Investigator Grant that they can  
6 use to support the purchase of equipment that a  
7 graduate student would use or whatever.

8 In that space it's very hard to say, no  
9 one -- you know, it's a very specific collaboration.

10 Q. And the graduate students who work in one  
11 of the psychology labs over the summer is doing  
12 research related to the faculty member's grant?

13 A. I think that graduate students, a person  
14 working in the lab is doing research related to the  
15 work of the lab of which their own dissertation  
16 is -- emerges, but so will multiple other graduate  
17 student dissertations. It's not -- you can't --  
18 they are not working on the professor's individual  
19 research. They are working on the lab's research,  
20 which is also theirs. Their research is the lab's  
21 research.

22 Q. And it's also the faculty member's  
23 research?

24 MR. FASMAN: Objection.

25 BY MS. AUERBACH:

1 of it that way.

2 BY MS. AUERBACH:

3 Q. What does PI stand for?

4 A. Principal investigator.

5 Q. The principal investigator is the faculty  
6 member in the lab?

7 A. It depends. Right. I mean. The  
8 university has rules about who can be a PI or co-PI,  
9 and each foundation has -- the National Science  
10 Foundation, they all have different rules. Normally  
11 it would be a faculty member somewhere in the  
12 university.

13 Q. You talked about a student who worked as a  
14 research assistant for you on a book. And what did  
15 the -- that research assistant do for you?

16 A. A variety of things, beginning with sitting  
17 down with me, looking at -- okay. We did this by  
18 email. I was in Spain. And saying, here is 12  
19 articles. Which ones do you think still speak to  
20 your sense -- I asked him -- to your sense of where  
21 you think the field is going? And so in that sense  
22 he helped me select which of my articles I wanted to  
23 turn into a book. Right. By writing a new  
24 introduction, by filling in the material in the  
25 beginning and end. By updating the research. So,

1 Q. It's all the same area?

2 MR. FASMAN: Objection. Asked and  
3 answered.

4 MS. AUERBACH: He didn't answer that  
5 question.

6 MR. FASMAN: She's arguing with the  
7 witness.

8 MS. AUERBACH: No. He said it's the lab's  
9 research, and I'm asking if it's related to the  
10 faculty member's research.

11 THE WITNESS: I don't know how to think  
12 about that. You know, even the terms that we use  
13 when we -- when we apply for collaborative research,  
14 PI, co-PI, etcetera, they are not -- they are not  
15 very helpful to answering your question because this  
16 is work that really is -- so when, to give you an  
17 example, the psychologist who is listed here, Susan  
18 Golden Meadow, recently gave a lecture about her  
19 life's work because she was recognized this way, and  
20 along with each of her important papers or  
21 discoveries, many of many of which were coauthored  
22 with her graduate students, so they're reflective,  
23 she also had the graduate students whose  
24 dissertation's initial papers had moved that  
25 question forward. It's -- I don't think they think

1 from the very beginning can he helped me get a sense  
2 of what across -- let's say across generations of  
3 what is still an interesting question about articles  
4 I've written ten years ago.

5 Then he also helped me with much more  
6 mundane things like saying, you know, you really  
7 missed this -- the best edition of this is not the  
8 one you cited. It's this one. And vice-versa.  
9 That from that work with me, he went on to write a  
10 piece of his own.

11 Q. Were there any -- you said he did some more  
12 mundane things. Were there any other mundane things  
13 that he does?

14 A. Yes. So, for example, he would send me a  
15 PDF of an article he thought I should read. In the  
16 sense he did not -- he didn't do any work with the  
17 text itself, with the text of the book.

18 Q. Anything else that he did?

19 A. Not that I recall.

20 Q. And did he work for you a certain number of  
21 hours a week?

22 A. You know, I'm sure we had an arrangement  
23 where he worked maybe ten hours a week, but I don't  
24 know how many hours he actually worked. I didn't  
25 check his time. He filed time cards.

1 Q. Who did he file the time cards with?  
 2 A. With my -- a department administrator of  
 3 the Committee on Social Thought.  
 4 Q. He was paid hourly for that work?  
 5 A. Yes.  
 6 Q. And that he was paid out of the division?  
 7 A. Ultimately, in the sense that my research  
 8 fund came from the division.  
 9 Q. You talked about articles being coauthored.  
 10 You were talking about co-authorship between a  
 11 faculty member and graduate student?  
 12 A. I'm talking about the field in which that  
 13 is how work is done. My focus is not one of them,  
 14 but psychology, for example is. But also coauthored  
 15 between graduate students themselves and between  
 16 graduate students and faculty at other institutions,  
 17 which is also very common. Less common in  
 18 psychology. Because in psychology you tend to work  
 19 with a faculty member in your lab because it's a  
 20 shared lab space. In economics, graduate students  
 21 collaborate with faculty members and graduate  
 22 students. It's all over the world.  
 23 Q. So, if a graduate student in psychology  
 24 working in a lab co-authors an article with the  
 25 faculty member over the lab, then they both get

1 publish articles, correct?  
 2 A. Yes.  
 3 Q. So, if a graduate student works on a  
 4 research project with a faculty member and helps  
 5 write an article, that also furthers the faculty  
 6 member's interests, correct?  
 7 A. Well, I don't -- yeah. I would imagine it  
 8 does. I think it's important to a graduate student  
 9 to write an article, too. I think it's really  
 10 important, and I think a faculty member has -- well,  
 11 I don't know. I mean -- again, I don't work in  
 12 these disciplines.  
 13 Q. When a research assistant worked for you,  
 14 you benefitted from the student's help, correct?  
 15 A. I think I did. I certainly did. I benefit  
 16 from every conversation I have with a student.  
 17 Q. I'm not just talking about conversations.  
 18 You mentioned the graduate student who, you know,  
 19 did some, what you call mundane tasks for you. That  
 20 was a help, that benefitted you in doing your work  
 21 book, correct?  
 22 A. You know, I think they have maybe a very  
 23 different sense of what we mean by benefit. So, I  
 24 keep on talking about the debt I owe to my graduate  
 25 student. It's not a material debt. It's not a

1 credit, or are both getting credit for that article?  
 2 MR. FASMAN: I'm going to object to the  
 3 form.  
 4 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Rephrase.  
 5 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 6 Q. If a graduate student working in a  
 7 psychology lab under a faculty member co-authors an  
 8 article with the faculty member, they both get  
 9 credit for having published that article, correct?  
 10 A. Yes. Often it's not just the faculty  
 11 member. It's also other people. But there is a  
 12 protocol in each field and, you know, again, this  
 13 escapes me, but one could write an article about it,  
 14 about the order of authors' names and what indicates  
 15 who has done which level of -- which parts of the  
 16 research and how much credit each should get, and  
 17 each field has a very elaborated sense, and it's not  
 18 the same sense. Some fields it's alphabetical, but  
 19 then the footnote says. Other fields it's the order  
 20 in which the name -- so it's all -- these fields  
 21 have worked out the ways in which they recognize the  
 22 various contributions in a collaborative project.  
 23 Someone like me who doesn't work in a collaborative  
 24 discipline, you know.  
 25 Q. It's important to faculty members to

1 question of time, of time value. It's a question  
 2 of, well, in this case, a question of watching  
 3 someone become -- I think is he going to be a great  
 4 historian, and I played a role in that.  
 5 Q. Okay. Did you get any benefit from the  
 6 student doing the work for you?  
 7 MR. FASMAN: I think he answered.  
 8 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 9 Q. I'm not asking what you did for the  
 10 student. I'm asking in terms of what you got out of  
 11 what he did for you.  
 12 A. Yeah. I think so.  
 13 Q. And that was help in getting your book  
 14 finished?  
 15 A. I mean I would have finished the book  
 16 faster a different way, but it would have been a  
 17 different book. I just think, you know, for me the  
 18 benefit of, again, when I talk to you in a very, not  
 19 even professorial, just philosophical tone, I think  
 20 that for me to benefit is about what what  
 21 intellectuals called the collective intellect. That  
 22 is this notion that we together are building  
 23 knowledge. And, you know it's not a question of,  
 24 look, these articles were already written. I'm not  
 25 sure, you know, what benefit means in this context

1 other than what I'm trying to express.  
 2 Q. With respect to the graduate student who  
 3 helped maintain a database, was there a need for  
 4 that database?  
 5 A. In that case absolutely there is -- yeah.  
 6 I think one way of thinking about that example is  
 7 that very often we try to find things we can do with  
 8 our resources that will help a student in more ways  
 9 than one. Help them materially, that is, help them  
 10 do meaningful work that they can also be paid for.  
 11 And help them intellectually, that is, help them  
 12 gain knowledge that they need.  
 13 Q. The question was: Was there a need for  
 14 that database?  
 15 A. Yes. That was the question. The need is  
 16 to help her. Honestly, I mean honestly, I doubt I  
 17 will ever use that database.  
 18 Q. You talked about the Council on Advanced  
 19 Studies workshops. Those workshop coordinators are  
 20 all graduate students?  
 21 A. I don't know.  
 22 Q. You don't know?  
 23 A. I think most of them are, but I  
 24 wouldn't know if --  
 25 Q. Do you know if there are any who are not

1 It might on occasion be, but it's usually any  
 2 graduate student who -- on occasion a faculty  
 3 member.  
 4 Q. Do you know whether some of the workshop  
 5 coordinators coordinate the discussion in the  
 6 workshops?  
 7 A. I'm sorry. What do you mean, coordinate  
 8 discussion?  
 9 Q. Ask questions of the presenter and --  
 10 A. I've never seen --  
 11 Q. -- and try to keep the discussion going?  
 12 A. I've never seen that.  
 13 Q. Do you know whether that happens or not?  
 14 It hasn't happened in the ones you --  
 15 A. It hasn't happened in any workshop that  
 16 I've been a regular participant in.  
 17 Q. You don't know whether it's happened in  
 18 others?  
 19 MR. FASMAN: Objection. That's just  
 20 argument.  
 21 THE WITNESS: I really don't.  
 22 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 23 Q. Were you asked whether workshop  
 24 coordinators teach. The purpose of the workshop  
 25 itself is not to teach; is that correct?

1 graduate students?  
 2 A. I don't know any current coordinators by  
 3 name. So --  
 4 Q. And --  
 5 A. It's meant to be graduate students.  
 6 Q. And do you know why that is?  
 7 A. Yes. Because when the University of  
 8 Chicago started those programs, the idea was to  
 9 create a workshop in which faculty and graduate  
 10 students criticized each other's work and learned to  
 11 think about work together.  
 12 Q. And do you know whether there are some  
 13 workshop coordinators who function as a coordinator  
 14 for more than one year in a row?  
 15 A. I don't know, but I can imagine there would  
 16 be.  
 17 Q. And do you know whether some of the  
 18 workshop coordinators carry out the function of  
 19 introducing the presenter and introducing the  
 20 material to the workshop?  
 21 A. The -- in the workshops I've been in, the  
 22 introduction, I mean apart from saying, welcome,  
 23 which is usually the coordinator or the director,  
 24 the -- the critique, introduction of the paper, the  
 25 10-minute critique is not the workshop coordinator.

1 A. Again, I -- I hate to -- I mean the purpose  
 2 of the workshop is to learn to think together, so  
 3 that's teaching, in that sense. But we're all doing  
 4 it all the time. We are -- that's how we get to a  
 5 better idea is by arguing about an idea. You have  
 6 to learn how to argue, and that's what the workshop  
 7 does.  
 8 Q. So, all of those who participate in the  
 9 workshop participate in that function?  
 10 A. Yes. If you're not getting -- if you're  
 11 not getting anything intellectually out of the  
 12 workshop, then you just stop going, I would imagine.  
 13 MS. AUERBACH: Can I take a couple of  
 14 minutes?  
 15 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Off the record.  
 16 (There was a discussion  
 17 held off the record.)  
 18 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record.  
 19 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 20 Q. You said that your understanding is that  
 21 the stipend to the graduate students are paid  
 22 differently in the years where they teach; is that  
 23 correct?  
 24 A. Yes. I understand that from -- that there  
 25 is some way in which the teaching points are

1 reflected in the disbursement of the stipend.  
 2 Q. And is it true that in the years -- the  
 3 years that the university graduates are expected to  
 4 teach are years three, four and five, correct?  
 5 A. Yes.  
 6 Q. And in those years their stipend is reduced  
 7 and then they are compensated separately for the  
 8 teaching? Correct?  
 9 A. Oh. Yeah. I would -- yeah. I think in  
 10 those years, if they don't teach, then their stipend  
 11 is reduced, or I guess -- I would -- the way you put  
 12 it is --  
 13 Q. What I said is the stipend is reduced and  
 14 then they are paid separately for the same amount of  
 15 reduction for teaching if they teach, correct?  
 16 A. Yes. I don't know about the mechanics, but  
 17 yes.  
 18 Q. In some cases the student may change the  
 19 standard format of teaching because somebody next  
 20 year -- you gave example -- somebody next year is  
 21 teaching the class they want to work in?  
 22 A. Right.  
 23 Q. So, in that case if the student did one  
 24 class instead of two in a year, they would have less  
 25 funding in that year?

1 MR. FASMAN: I'm going to object to that  
 2 question. I'm not sure I followed it.  
 3 THE WITNESS: I followed it, but I don't  
 4 know the answer.  
 5 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 6 Q. You don't know the answer?  
 7 A. Yes. And I just -- I would add that the  
 8 teaching isn't the -- we require the teaching points  
 9 even if you don't --  
 10 Q. No, no --  
 11 A. -- even if you're not receiving the stipend  
 12 and you have external funding we still require it.  
 13 Q. Right. I'm just asking about the people  
 14 who are receiving the stipend and how they are paid.  
 15 So, you don't know if they defer teaching, whether  
 16 they get less funding that year?  
 17 A. I think the answer to that is yes. What I  
 18 don't know the answer to, is if we grant a  
 19 flexibility that when to do it, whether it's  
 20 reflected that way, that I don't know.  
 21 Q. Do you know whether the compensation they  
 22 receive for the teaching is paid, like biweekly?  
 23 A. No. I don't know that.  
 24 Q. You don't have an opinion? Do you know  
 25 whether the compensation they receive for the

1 teaching has tax withholdings from it?  
 2 A. I don't.  
 3 MS. AUERBACH: Those are all the questions  
 4 I have.  
 5 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: All right. With  
 6 that we will break for lunch. So, it's now 10 to  
 7 1:00. You want to say 2:00 o'clock?  
 8 MR. FASMAN: 2:00 o'clock would be fine.  
 9 Thank you.  
 10 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Off the record.  
 11 (Luncheon recess.)  
 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record.  
 13 So, Petitioner has finished questioning for  
 14 a moment. So, before we go back to redirect I have  
 15 a few questions for you.  
 16 You had testified that the Social Sciences  
 17 Division is the largest in terms of Ph.D. students;  
 18 is that correct?  
 19 THE WITNESS: Yes. I think it is. We have  
 20 more Ph.D.s than any other division. I believe  
 21 that's the case.  
 22 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Do you happen to  
 23 know what the enrollment numbers are for the  
 24 college?  
 25 THE WITNESS: You mean in terms of

1 percentages or in terms of butts in seats, or in  
 2 terms of majors?  
 3 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So, your division  
 4 covers part of the college; is that correct?  
 5 THE WITNESS: Yes, indeed.  
 6 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: What about your  
 7 division --  
 8 THE WITNESS: Let me put this way. I don't  
 9 remember, it's 16,000 per quarter or per year, but  
 10 our division teaches 30 percent of the registrations  
 11 each year, roughly. It alternates. It's between 29  
 12 and 32 percent for the last five years, so let's  
 13 just say 30 percent.  
 14 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Do you have  
 15 happen to know just approximately what overall  
 16 enrollment numbers are for the college?  
 17 THE WITNESS: No, I don't. That's a  
 18 college question.  
 19 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Just bear  
 20 with me for a moment.  
 21 MR. FASMAN: Would you like those numbers  
 22 for the record? We can do that.  
 23 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I would, actually.  
 24 MR. FASMAN: I thought you might. We'll  
 25 get transcript and get answers.

1 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you.  
 2 MR. FASMAN: Sure.  
 3 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So, you had  
 4 testified sort of generally about when you  
 5 personally have had TAs and research assistants, and  
 6 for now I want to focus on your experience with TAs.  
 7 So, when you have had TAs, has the -- and you can  
 8 tell me if it's been one, neither, or both. Has it  
 9 been in where they have assisted you in a large  
 10 lecture setting, or it has been multiple sections of  
 11 a particular course, or some other scenario?  
 12 THE WITNESS: So, at the University of  
 13 Chicago, I've only had TAs in small -- as interns.  
 14 At other universities I've had TAs as part of  
 15 lecture courses.  
 16 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So, the University  
 17 of Chicago, you know, you had them in the smaller  
 18 class settings, as you've described. So, would it  
 19 be that you are teaching a section and they are  
 20 teaching other sections?  
 21 THE WITNESS: No. No. It's that -- so,  
 22 for example, let me take the example of the  
 23 Jerusalem CIVs course. It's one of the CIVs  
 24 sequence. I mentioned the person who was the  
 25 assistant in that already. I would do all of the --

1 all of the sections. All of the meetings. Run  
 2 discussion in all of them. But before we started,  
 3 about a week or so in, I offered her, once I had  
 4 seen how she attracted the students, the opportunity  
 5 to run one of the sections there. Not sections, but  
 6 the sessions. Sorry. On a topic she was  
 7 particularly interested in, in the Old Testament,  
 8 and I was in the audience or the discussion group  
 9 while she ran that discussion.  
 10 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: That clears up my  
 11 question.  
 12 Have you ever taught a course that has had  
 13 other sections of that same course being taught by  
 14 TAs, graduate students?  
 15 THE WITNESS: Yes. I have taught in the  
 16 Classics of Social Thought sequence. And so in that  
 17 case, I didn't have an intern in my section, but I  
 18 was with all of us together in the staff meetings.  
 19 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: The weekly meetings?  
 20 THE WITNESS: Yes. The Core meeting.  
 21 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So, going back to  
 22 the intern arrangement that you discussed before.  
 23 If that individual had been a poor performer in the  
 24 discussion that she had led or other work that you  
 25 had assigned her to perform, what action would you

1 have taken to correct that behavior?  
 2 THE WITNESS: I would say, I mean the same  
 3 action I took at -- at her good performances, that  
 4 is, it's not a question of saying bad and good.  
 5 It's a question of saying, so, here is what you did.  
 6 Here is how you could have done it differently. So,  
 7 it's not -- she was not good at everything, right?  
 8 And if she had proven, for example, to have given a  
 9 very bad running of the section on the materials she  
 10 wanted to do, the sessions she wanted to do, I would  
 11 have said to her, let's try this again, but let's  
 12 just carve out 15 minutes of the session and focus  
 13 on you -- you take us through one, one passage and  
 14 we'll -- you know, I would try to break it up into  
 15 more manageable bits because it's -- you know, we're  
 16 all better at some things than others.  
 17 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So, with regard to  
 18 the section scenario where you may be teaching a  
 19 section and a grad student is teaching another  
 20 section.  
 21 THE WITNESS: Right.  
 22 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: And you have weekly  
 23 meetings. Let's get away from the hypothetical. In  
 24 those instances that you personally have  
 25 experienced, have you ever had to deal with or

1 address a grad student that you have seen as a poor  
 2 performer?  
 3 THE WITNESS: You mean a student who's  
 4 leading their own part of one of those courses? No.  
 5 I mean all I've seen is when an student comes and  
 6 says -- one leading a session says -- or a section,  
 7 says, I'm having problem with this. Can you help?  
 8 And then, you know, that I've seen, but I've never  
 9 seen any, if you're asking about disciplinary  
 10 function, no.  
 11 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. So, in the  
 12 intern scenario, how frequently do you meet with the  
 13 intern?  
 14 THE WITNESS: Every session.  
 15 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Do you meet outside  
 16 of the session?  
 17 THE WITNESS: Yes.  
 18 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: How often?  
 19 THE WITNESS: Well, sometimes, you know,  
 20 again, it depends on which example I take. If I  
 21 take Jerusalem CIVs, we're meeting every day, and  
 22 we're actually traveling together with students to  
 23 cites. We're discussing everything together. But  
 24 if we talk about a more normal situation, I might  
 25 see them in their -- before or after each class and

1 then once in the week.  
 2 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: And what about for  
 3 the different sections; how frequently do you meet  
 4 with the other instructors of the other sections,  
 5 whether they be faculty or Ph.D. students?  
 6 THE WITNESS: The staff meetings?  
 7 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Yes.  
 8 THE WITNESS: I can't remember if it was  
 9 once a week or every other week that we had Classics  
 10 of Social Thought. That was a while ago.  
 11 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So, with regard to  
 12 the interns -- I keep jumping back and forth. Would  
 13 there ever be an instance when an intern would  
 14 conduct a course without -- conduct a session  
 15 without you present? Or did that ever happen, I  
 16 should say?  
 17 THE WITNESS: No. Not in my case, no.  
 18 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: And so I think this  
 19 may have been answered a little bit, but maybe just  
 20 make a little more clear for the record. What is  
 21 the difference between the Core sequence and the  
 22 CIVs sequence?  
 23 THE WITNESS: Oh. That's really a question  
 24 for the people who have Master's at the college.  
 25 The Core is a very restrictive set of courses that

1 think it's important to have the option because they  
 2 have to think about what they want to be teaching  
 3 when they finish. So, I gave that example of  
 4 someone who wants to -- who knows they are going to  
 5 need to show they can teach Islamic civilization.  
 6 They might not want to do the European CIVs core.  
 7 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: It may depend on  
 8 their area?  
 9 THE WITNESS: Absolutely. It has to depend  
 10 on their area.  
 11 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So, you had  
 12 mentioned, you know, when the Ph.D. students are  
 13 preparing to go off into the broader world, they  
 14 prepare the teaching statements to present to  
 15 prospective employers. Do you know if U of C, when  
 16 looking to hire post docs, if they look at these  
 17 teaching statements?  
 18 THE WITNESS: Post docs?  
 19 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Or faculty, let's  
 20 say.  
 21 THE WITNESS: Yes. When we hire faculty,  
 22 and when we tenure faculty, we -- in the cases of  
 23 tenure, it is now always. In the cases of hire I  
 24 think it's also always, but I can't be absolutely  
 25 sure if it's always, require as part of the case, a

1 were part of this general education world, began  
 2 with the Hutchins College, and some of them have  
 3 been around for a very long time. In social  
 4 sciences I think there is only -- I think maybe four  
 5 courses that come to mind. Mine, Classics of Social  
 6 and Political Thought. There is one on power in  
 7 society. Very few. Those are large groups of  
 8 people, and there is many sections of them.  
 9 The CIVs are these kind of more history and  
 10 culture component of the general education  
 11 requirement which can be fulfilled by studying a  
 12 culture across time over the course of usually three  
 13 quarters.  
 14 So, American CIVs is American History and  
 15 Culture from colonial times to the present.  
 16 European CIVs, etcetera. African CIVs.  
 17 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So, with regard to  
 18 the Ph.D. students' teaching requirements, do they  
 19 have to teach courses within a particular sequence,  
 20 or does it vary?  
 21 THE WITNESS: No.  
 22 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Or do they have the  
 23 option?  
 24 THE WITNESS: They have the option. And,  
 25 you know, I don't -- I don't want to expand, but I

1 teaching and research statement from the applicant.  
 2 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you.  
 3 THE WITNESS: Not necessarily as part of  
 4 the initial application, but yes, as part of any  
 5 case that goes up to appointment.  
 6 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: This may have been  
 7 covered, and I apologize if it was. For those  
 8 individuals who end up teaching a course past their  
 9 five points, is there a difference in their stipend  
 10 amount compared to those who are still earning their  
 11 five points? Or would it be the same for just  
 12 teaching a course, if you know?  
 13 THE WITNESS: I don't know, and I think --  
 14 I think -- I think -- I don't know. I think it's  
 15 also paid by a different part.  
 16 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Formula?  
 17 THE WITNESS: So I don't know.  
 18 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. So, I know  
 19 you had said that you personally do not make the  
 20 decisions of who are granted the TA appointments.  
 21 Do you know who does make those decisions?  
 22 THE WITNESS: So, in the case of the Cores  
 23 and the CIVs, that's all administered through the  
 24 collegiate division part of the college. Most of  
 25 Social Science Division and often called the

1 Graduate Division Or the Research Division or  
 2 whatever you want to call it.  
 3 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So, you had  
 4 mentioned that you personally led a workshop, a  
 5 Medieval studies workshop. When was that; do you  
 6 recall?  
 7 THE WITNESS: Not exactly. About four or  
 8 five years ago. I did it for about three years.  
 9 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So, it ended about  
 10 four or five years ago but it lasted about three  
 11 years?  
 12 THE WITNESS: It ended about four years ago  
 13 and I continue, of course, to go.  
 14 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: You just personally  
 15 are not leading it anymore?  
 16 THE WITNESS: Right. The faculty takes  
 17 turns co-directing or directing, as do the workshop  
 18 coordinators take turns.  
 19 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Do you know who, for  
 20 lack of a better term, appoints the workshop  
 21 coordinators?  
 22 THE WITNESS: I don't. I'm trying to  
 23 remember. I mean, so one of my students is now  
 24 workshop coordinator. I don't know that it's so  
 25 much an appointment process as kind of a communal

1 anointment process. People who have been regularly  
 2 attending and contributing and, you know, and since  
 3 -- usually come every year or different two every  
 4 year, or process of -- I don't know what the  
 5 official appointment which I imagine must come from  
 6 this Council on Event Studies.  
 7 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So, with regard to  
 8 the research assistant who assisted you personally  
 9 with your book, I know that you had said that the  
 10 research assistant did not get academic credit for  
 11 that work; is that correct? But was the work that  
 12 they performed either part of, taken under like --  
 13 sorry. Let me rephrase.  
 14 THE WITNESS: Sure.  
 15 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Was the work that  
 16 they performed accounted for in their stipend in  
 17 some way, or via grant?  
 18 THE WITNESS: No.  
 19 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So, it was  
 20 voluntary?  
 21 THE WITNESS: No. Although, very often  
 22 students will say -- not very often, he has said and  
 23 other students have said, I just want to work with  
 24 you on a project, but I don't believe in that. So,  
 25 it was compensated from my research account for

1 whatever hours he dedicated to that, which students  
 2 can do for up to 20 hours.  
 3 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So for the same cap  
 4 as you had previously discussed?  
 5 THE WITNESS: All employment. Cannot add  
 6 up to more than 20 hours. It doesn't matter what.  
 7 If it's being a research assistant or working the  
 8 library or anything.  
 9 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I believe that's all  
 10 of my questions for now. Employer counsel would  
 11 like to redirect?  
 12 MR. FASMAN: My colleagues want to take a  
 13 minute.  
 14 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Off the record.  
 15 (There was a discussion held  
 16 off the record.)  
 17 REDIRECT EXAMINATION  
 18 BY MR. FASMAN:  
 19 Q. Professor Nirenberg, just a few questions  
 20 on redirect. On workshop coordinators, the last  
 21 subject that the Hearing Officer was asking you  
 22 about, when someone is appointed, how long does the  
 23 appointment last?  
 24 A. I think it's a year.  
 25 Q. A year. Okay. And what's the relationship

1 between a graduate student workshop coordinator and  
 2 other Ph.D.s who may be in the workshop?  
 3 A. I mean I -- I think, certainly my -- I know  
 4 the Medieval students best. I think they all see  
 5 each other as peers. It's just that this year that  
 6 person has a specific role that's listed. It's  
 7 not -- they are not intellectually different.  
 8 Q. So, they would all be part of the workshop?  
 9 A. Yes.  
 10 Q. Okay. And one would not function any  
 11 differently than the other except in the ways you've  
 12 described?  
 13 A. Right.  
 14 Q. Thank you. I believe you just testified  
 15 that when an intern is teaching in one of your  
 16 courses, you sit in. Or when a teaching assistant  
 17 is teaching you generally sit in. Why do you do  
 18 that?  
 19 A. I mean these were cases in which, so, like  
 20 in the CIVs and the Core, where I'm the teacher of  
 21 the section, the intern is there to learn how to  
 22 teach. So, why wouldn't -- I mean of course I'm  
 23 going to be there. I'm doing the teaching.  
 24 Q. Okay. With regard to teaching portfolios,  
 25 do you have occasion to review those from applicants

1 for positions at the University of Chicago?  
 2 A. Yes.  
 3 Q. And how about -- let's put tenure aside.  
 4 A. You're talking about for faculty positions?  
 5 Q. Yes. For faculty positions. What do you  
 6 look for in a teaching portfolio? If I want a  
 7 position at the University of Chicago Tenure Track  
 8 Faculty position, what are you going to look for in  
 9 my teaching portfolio?  
 10 A. That's interesting, because you're also  
 11 pointing to one of the divisions of labor in the  
 12 university, which is that we have the Master of the  
 13 College, who is also Deputy Dean of the Division.  
 14 The Master of the College is in charge of  
 15 undergraduate education, and the Dean of the  
 16 Division who is paying more attention to research.  
 17 So, I don't pay the same attention that the  
 18 Master of the college pays.  
 19 Q. We'll look at -- we'll get that another  
 20 way. You know, I want to, I would like to, if I  
 21 may, introduce an exhibit. I know that's not  
 22 standard procedure in redirect. But there is an  
 23 exhibit that I think clarifies something that I  
 24 would like in the record.  
 25 A. Could I also just add to that? It's not

1 well how that is going when you're teaching here for  
 2 six years. At hire it's a little harder because you  
 3 have only a teaching statement, and so that's why  
 4 those teaching statements really matter and a CV  
 5 that says -- sometimes graduate student applicants  
 6 send in teaching evaluations so that's a useful  
 7 component that we pay attention to.  
 8 Q. All right. Let me ask that this be marked  
 9 as our next exhibit.  
 10 (Employer Exhibit Number 20 was marked  
 11 for identification.)  
 12 I've just handed you a document that we've  
 13 marked for identification as Employer Exhibit 20,  
 14 and I wonder if you can take a look at tell us what  
 15 it is, sir?  
 16 A. Let me read it first.  
 17 Q. Sure.  
 18 A. So, it's the Topical Program Teaching  
 19 Requirements for the funding, the Dean of Students  
 20 for the Division of Social Sciences, and it outlines  
 21 the requirements for achieving practical pedagogical  
 22 experience.  
 23 Q. Okay. I move the admission of Employer's  
 24 Exhibit 20.  
 25 MS. AUERBACH: No objection.

1 just -- it's not just hiring, it's also a promotion,  
 2 so tenure review and promotion to full would go to  
 3 the same process. There is going to be a thorough  
 4 evaluation by the Master of the College of the  
 5 teaching portfolio of the person being promoted or  
 6 tenured, and also by me. And there are cases in  
 7 which Master and I, the Dean of the College and I  
 8 feel that the teaching portfolio does not --  
 9 Q. What do you look for when this -- when this  
 10 occurs? I guess what I'm saying, what would you  
 11 look for in a teaching portfolio that you would find  
 12 particularly useful or unuseful? Is there -- are  
 13 there things that you would look for?  
 14 A. When we're at the level of promotion we  
 15 have a lot of information about how someone teaches.  
 16 A lot of feedback from undergraduate students, from  
 17 graduate students, from colleagues. So, there we  
 18 usually have a lot of material to assess, and it's  
 19 not a popularity contest. Popularity is not  
 20 necessarily kind to how effective a teacher is. But  
 21 there is a component of how successful we think the  
 22 outcomes have been, undergraduates think outcomes  
 23 have been, and graduate students think this person  
 24 as a teacher.  
 25 So, one's colleagues generally know pretty

1 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Employer Exhibit 20  
 2 is received.  
 3 (Employer Exhibit Number 20 was received  
 4 in evidence.)  
 5 MR. FASMAN: Thank you.  
 6 BY MR. FASMAN:  
 7 Q. I would like you, Professor Nirenberg, to  
 8 take a look at Paragraph 2 of this document and to  
 9 clear up something that may be unclear in the  
 10 record.  
 11 You testified that there were interns and  
 12 then other positions as the sequence went along of  
 13 acquiring TA points or GAI points, sir?  
 14 A. Yes.  
 15 Q. It's not just course interns and then a  
 16 lectureship, is there? There are other intermediate  
 17 positions?  
 18 A. Oh, yes. There are many positions, some of  
 19 which I don't even know because they are used in one  
 20 department or one subspecialty. There are many  
 21 positions and many ways to acquire these points.  
 22 Q. Let's break some of those down. You have a  
 23 course intern or CA, right, and that's in College  
 24 Core Sequences, sir?  
 25 A. Yes.

1 Q. And then a TA. What can TAs do? You just  
2 don't go from being a CA to a lecturer is my point?  
3 What would a teaching assistant do that's different  
4 from a CA or a lecturer?

5 A. I'm not sure I can help you on this because  
6 I think some of these, like course interns, it's a  
7 term that we use only for that specific Core/CIV  
8 culture, but it may be the same that the TA is doing  
9 elsewhere. I don't know. That really depends on  
10 how each professor and TA relate in the many  
11 different contexts, right? So there are many  
12 conflicts are different. You wouldn't call them a  
13 course intern. You would call them a TA, but they  
14 are doing the same thing a course intern might do.

15 Technically that's also true of our title  
16 lecturer. Technically, and our statutes I believe a  
17 lecturer is someone who holds a Ph.D. who is the  
18 cognizant, responsible person for a course.

19 So, when we say lecturer here, it's not the  
20 same use we're using in the statute. It's a  
21 different use. We use it all the time, but these  
22 words mean many different things across the many  
23 languages of the university.

24 Q. That's what I was trying to get at is, what  
25 is the difference between a lecturer and an

1 Q. And if that's you, as a faculty member,  
2 you're responsible, right?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. So, when you were talking about using  
5 teaching assistants as graders, I think you  
6 basically said you looked at -- for introductory  
7 ones, you looked at everything they did and selected  
8 a sample and then maybe none?

9 A. It all depends on how well it's going,  
10 right? I mean with each person, you know, Socrates  
11 says that to be a teacher you need to know the soul  
12 of your student. With each person you want to see  
13 how they're doing on each -- the many different  
14 things that there is to do in a class. If someone  
15 is having trouble grading, and actually it is  
16 something that people have trouble with, then I'll  
17 focus on that all the time. If someone is not  
18 having trouble grading but they are having trouble  
19 leading a class discussion, you know, with them I'll  
20 focus on that. There is no formula to where, you  
21 know, you focus your attention.

22 Q. Okay. There was some questions, the  
23 Hearing Officer asked you some questions about what  
24 would happen to a poor performer in a TA position.  
25 Let's put aside the definition of what a poor

1 instructor of record, or is there a difference?

2 A. You know, I think I'm going to ask you to  
3 leave that question to -- well, I'm just going to  
4 say I don't know. I know there are people in the  
5 institution who can answer that question with much  
6 more accuracy.

7 Q. To become a lecturer as -- in your first  
8 five years, is that unusual?

9 A. This I think we covered. I mean I think  
10 it's relatively unusual, and some disciplines, like  
11 economics, more common than others.

12 Q. And why would a lecturer be serving as a  
13 lecturer, in this definition, be important? I'm a  
14 student. Do I want to become a lecturer?

15 A. Yes. I think you'll want to teach a course  
16 with more autonomy, more responsibility, and be able  
17 to show you've done that. Ideally even perhaps  
18 through one of the prize lectureships, for example,  
19 a course close to your own dissertation topic, for  
20 example, so an advanced seminar close to your own  
21 dissertation topic.

22 Q. Okay. There was some questions about  
23 grading, sir. Who is ultimately responsible for the  
24 grade a student receives in a class?

25 A. Well, the instructor.

1 performer is, because as you said, not everybody is  
2 equally good at everything.

3 Have you ever seen a teaching assistant  
4 disciplined for poor performance?

5 A. You mean someone in the GAI period?

6 Q. Yes.

7 A. No.

8 Q. Or terminated for poor performance?

9 A. No.

10 MR. FASMAN: Thank you. I have no further  
11 questions on redirect. Thank you.

12 HEARING OFFICER MOLLS: Petitioner have any  
13 further questions?

14 RE-CROSS-EXAMINATION

15 BY MS. AUERBACH:

16 Q. Employer Exhibit 20, the document you were  
17 just asked to identify, on the second page it has a  
18 date of March, 2014. Is that document the one  
19 currently in effect?

20 A. I don't know.

21 Q. You don't know?

22 A. The Dean of Students office could certainly  
23 answer that.

24 Q. And you were asked about a course intern,  
25 but the term CA was used. So, does a CA stand for

1 course intern or course assistant?  
 2 A. I believe I didn't use the term CA.  
 3 Q. You're not really familiar with that  
 4 position?  
 5 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Acronym.  
 6 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 7 Q. Or the use of that term?  
 8 A. No.  
 9 Q. You were asked if it's unusual to become a  
 10 lecturer in the first five years. Looking at  
 11 Employer Exhibit 20, talking about the teaching  
 12 requirements and listing what teaching positions  
 13 qualify, it lists lectureships. So, does that mean  
 14 that people don't really get lectureships in the  
 15 first five years, even though it's listed here as  
 16 one of the ways you can satisfactory your points?  
 17 A. No. I said it was relatively unusual. I  
 18 didn't say they don't. Again, just to go back, I  
 19 think we mean multiple things by the word  
 20 lectureship, but in this case I think they mean, the  
 21 document means a course in which you are the  
 22 responsible teacher. So, like a prize lectureship  
 23 which I think I mentioned, we have something in the  
 24 division, and there it's unusual to do them in the  
 25 first five years just because you usually haven't

1 do and you can talk to, dictates what are the  
 2 titles, the actual formal positions to which people  
 3 can get appointed and what are the constraints for  
 4 those titles. And lecturer is a specific position  
 5 in the statutes which I believe requires Ph.D. in  
 6 hand to have to have the appointment, title of  
 7 lecturer from the university.  
 8 Now, how we use it is amongst ourselves as  
 9 trainers, and graduate students use them amongst  
 10 themselves, and that even differs from, you know,  
 11 different parts of the division to different parts  
 12 of the university is different. That's kind of  
 13 colloquial.  
 14 When you say research assistant to someone  
 15 in a psychology lab, they are not a research  
 16 assistant by any of our appointment methods unless  
 17 they are on that summer part of an NSF grant.  
 18 Q. Okay. So, when a person gets, a graduate  
 19 students gets assigned to be the person in charge of  
 20 teaching a section of one of these Core classes  
 21 where it's a small group section, isn't it true that  
 22 that person is told that that position is the  
 23 position of a lecturer?  
 24 A. I don't know what they are told, but I  
 25 think that's what lecturer means here.

1 gained the experience necessary to equip you to do  
 2 that. And I think I said a few times that in some  
 3 areas of the division, like in economics where  
 4 actually you only are there for five years and the  
 5 courses are quite modular, then it's more common.  
 6 Q. Doesn't the term lectureship in this  
 7 document also refer to the situation you talked  
 8 about where a graduate student may teach a small  
 9 section of one of the Core classes?  
 10 A. I couldn't -- I don't think so. I think  
 11 here -- oh, you mean a small section, be responsible  
 12 for a small section? It might. Yes. I mean  
 13 certainly that's the loose which in which we use the  
 14 term lectureship, if you're responsible for the  
 15 section --  
 16 Q. You're called a lecturer?  
 17 A. -- or you have a stand-alone course you get  
 18 two points. Sometimes they are called a lecturer.  
 19 That's not what the statutes call them. It just  
 20 depends on --  
 21 Q. When you say the statutes, what are you  
 22 talking about?  
 23 A. So, a part of the university governance  
 24 that I pay -- I don't, I don't have to pay attention  
 25 to but it's very important, and there are people who

1 Q. And people do do that during their first  
 2 five years?  
 3 A. Yes. Yes. It's not -- it's not the  
 4 majority of the people, but yes.  
 5 Q. Do you know what percentage it is in social  
 6 sciences?  
 7 A. No. I mean I would -- I would put it in  
 8 the 30s, but I don't know. I mean certainly it's  
 9 something we want everyone to eventually have the  
 10 opportunity to do before they apply for a job. But  
 11 I don't know what percentage get it in the first  
 12 five years.  
 13 Q. When you say in the 30s, you mean  
 14 approximately 30 percent of the graduate students in  
 15 the Social Science Division do that in the first  
 16 five years?  
 17 A. I think I'm getting confused with my  
 18 statistics. I think I'm trying to answer a question  
 19 you're not asking. When I say 30 percent I mean  
 20 people who exceed five points in the first five  
 21 years.  
 22 Q. I wasn't talking about exceeding five  
 23 points. I was talking about -- I was following up  
 24 on questions about being a lecturer in the first  
 25 five years.

1 A. Oh, I don't know the proportion, but the  
2 whole gradation of our point system where you do  
3 these three internships, let's say in the Core or a  
4 CIV, ideally in year three you get through your --  
5 three or part of four you get through your  
6 internships, and then you can ideally do your own  
7 section of that CIVs or Core.

8 So, our goal is to give people the  
9 opportunity to be responsible for a section before  
10 their GAI points are up.

11 Q. And responsible for the section, that's the  
12 position called a lecturer?

13 A. That's the position that I -- this argument  
14 is calling a lecturer.

15 Q. So, most people do do that by the fifth  
16 year?

17 A. I don't know about most, but I do think  
18 it's a goal.

19 Q. It's a goal to have most people do it by  
20 the fifth year?

21 A. It would be my goal. I want people to  
22 complete all the teaching they need to complete in  
23 order to aspire to their positions within the period  
24 of the GAI.

25 Q. But you don't know what percentage actually

1 described? So, as far as their grading or the  
2 discussions they choose to lead -- I'll rephrase.

3 To what extent could an individual such as  
4 yourself affect the teaching of the individuals in  
5 their section?

6 THE WITNESS: So, in my own experience, the  
7 most effect I can have is when they are my intern,  
8 but that's because I've never been the head of -- so  
9 the people who are in charge of the overall kind of  
10 pedagogical structure of the course can very well --  
11 and I don't know, you know, which ones do or how  
12 often they do it, actually, say, well, can I attend  
13 the discussion section, you know, one of your  
14 sections. That's a very common practice. You know,  
15 to give advice, to see how things are going, to  
16 take -- provide an outside -- we can even offer  
17 services, which we sometimes do, where we offer to  
18 bring in -- and this is through, set up a  
19 teaching -- we offer to bring in a video camera and  
20 show you how -- give you an opportunity to see what  
21 you're doing in your own section.

22 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Have you ever  
23 personally done something like that, sit in on  
24 someone's section?

25 THE WITNESS: So, like I say, I've never

1 do that?

2 A. I don't.

3 MR. FASMAN: Asked and answered.

4 MS. AUERBACH: I don't have anything else.

5 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: One question, just a  
6 clarifying question.

7 So, in the position that Petitioner counsel  
8 was just asking questions about, an individual  
9 who -- a Ph.D. student who is in charge of teaching  
10 their own section.

11 THE WITNESS: Uh-huh.

12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Is that individual  
13 expected to complete all of the grading for the  
14 students in their section themselves? The  
15 undergraduates in the section, they complete all the  
16 grading?

17 THE WITNESS: Yeah. They are in charge of  
18 that section. They usually are participating in the  
19 larger umbrella of meetings, etcetera, but they are  
20 in charge of leading the discussion, grading,  
21 deciding, you know, how they want to evaluate all  
22 the different assignments, including discussion.

23 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: To what -- as far as  
24 you know, what is the level of oversight given to  
25 these individuals from the larger group that you've

1 been the head of Core, so I've only sat in on the  
2 discussions led by my own intern.

3 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you. That was  
4 my question.

5 FURTHER REDIRECT-EXAMINATION  
6 BY MR. FASMAN:

7 Q. One or two more.

8 There is a position at the university, is  
9 there not, where, as a graduate student I'm allowed  
10 to create my own course?

11 A. Yes. These are these prize lectureships.

12 Q. That's a different use of the term?

13 A. They are not really a position, right?

14 Q. What are they?

15 A. They are -- I mean it is a position in the  
16 sense that there is a -- I don't know what its  
17 official Human Resources label is, but different  
18 departments have different opportunities. Often  
19 they name them, let's just call it the Joe Smith,  
20 Helen Zell, the whatever unit, prize lectureship,  
21 and then -- that's a created really by the faculty  
22 as an opportunity.

23 So, one thing is the departmental culture  
24 that creates that opportunity. The other one is  
25 where it's paid from. And the third one is how it's

1 officially appointed, and I don't know how it's  
 2 officially appointed.  
 3 Q. Under those circumstances with the prize  
 4 lectureship, and we're calling it the same thing,  
 5 that's why I'm bringing this out, it's different  
 6 than merely being in charge of a section?  
 7 A. That's right. It is different. But  
 8 generally there, I mean you submit your -- it's  
 9 different in the sense you have much more  
 10 independence.  
 11 You're not doing a shared syllabus like in  
 12 the course. But you're doing a syllabus that has  
 13 been highly vetted by the faculty that you,  
 14 presumably you developed in consultation with your  
 15 advisor. At least that's the case in the ones I've  
 16 supported. And the faculty then has feedback on.  
 17 To say, well, this syllabus, we want you to  
 18 do this, it's a good course, but you have way too  
 19 much reading in week three, and you're totally  
 20 neglecting this -- etcetera. So, and how you're  
 21 weighting the grading and all these kind of  
 22 questions where they feed back, they provide  
 23 feedback even to the students both -- ideally it  
 24 would be to both the successful and the unsuccessful  
 25 students, but I think it's more common that it's the

1 that correct?  
 2 A. I would imagine so.  
 3 Q. And you were asked if those people have  
 4 anybody watching at their sessions, and you said the  
 5 people in charge of a structure can attend a  
 6 discussion section. Do you know how often that  
 7 happens?  
 8 A. No, I don't, because I haven't supervised a  
 9 Core or a CIV.  
 10 Q. And the Ph.D. students who have the  
 11 opportunity to teach these, what you call prize  
 12 lectureships, they also are responsible for leading  
 13 the discussions, doing the grading, and holding  
 14 office hours?  
 15 A. Yes.  
 16 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have.  
 17 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: No further  
 18 questions?  
 19 MR. FASMAN: No further questions. Thank  
 20 you.  
 21 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: You are excused.  
 22 THE WITNESS: Thank you.  
 23 (Witness excused.)  
 24 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Off the record.  
 25 (There was a discussion

1 successful one that gets the feedback.  
 2 Q. During the time when -- let's just say that  
 3 you are a faculty advisor to someone who has won one  
 4 of these prizes and he's creating his or her own  
 5 course, what would your level and type of  
 6 interaction be with that person?  
 7 MS. AUERBACH: Objection, unless he's done  
 8 this.  
 9 THE WITNESS: I haven't.  
 10 BY MR. FASMAN:  
 11 Q. That's fine.  
 12 A. I have supervised the student's application  
 13 if they didn't get it. So I haven't.  
 14 MR. FASMAN: That's fine. I'll represent  
 15 for the record that this is the most recent  
 16 iteration, Exhibit 20 is the most recent iteration  
 17 that we've been able to find of the teaching  
 18 requirements.  
 19 I have no further redirect.  
 20 FURTHER RECROSS-EXAMINATION  
 21 BY MS. AUERBACH:  
 22 Q. You said that the Ph.D. students who are in  
 23 charge of teaching their own section of a course  
 24 lead the discussion and do the grading. They also  
 25 are expected to hold office hours for students; is

1 held off the record.)  
 2 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record.  
 3 Before Employer counsel calls its next  
 4 witness, it's my understanding that the Employer has  
 5 another appearance entered into the record.  
 6 MR. PEARLMAN: That's correct, Madam  
 7 Hearing Officer. My name is Steven Pearlman.  
 8 P-e-a-r-l-m-a-n. Counsel also for the University of  
 9 Chicago.  
 10 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you. Call  
 11 your next witness.  
 12 MR. PEARLMAN: Your Honor, the University  
 13 calls as its next witness Mr. Christopher Wild.  
 14 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: While I appreciate  
 15 the "Honor" you can refer to me as Madam Hearing  
 16 Officer.  
 17 MR. PEARLMAN: I will do so.  
 18 (The witness was duly sworn.)  
 19 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Please state and  
 20 spell your name for the record.  
 21 THE WITNESS: Christopher Wild.  
 22 C-h-r-i-s-t-o-p-h-e-r, W-i-l-d.  
 23 CHRISTOPHER WILD  
 24 having been first duly sworn, was examined and  
 25 testified as follows:

## DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MR. PEARLMAN:

Q. Good afternoon, Dr. Wild. By whom are you employed?

A. The University of Chicago.

Q. When did you start working at the University of Chicago?

A. 2008.

Q. And do you have a position now with the University of Chicago?

A. Yes.

Q. Would you please tell us what that position is?

A. I am an Associate Professor of Germanic Studies, and I am Master of the Humanities Collegiate Division, Deputy Dean of the College, and Deputy Dean of the Humanities Division.

Q. How long have you held each of these positions that you just identified?

A. I'm Associate Professor of Germanic Studies since 2008, and this is my second year that I have the latter position.

Q. Dr. Wild, have you held any other positions at the University of Chicago?

A. No.

Q. Have you held the position of Director of Graduate Studies and Undergraduate Studies in your department?

A. Yes, I have, in my department.

Q. Could you please us, Dr. Wild, what your educational background is.

A. I hold a Ph.D. from Johns Hopkins, in German Literature from Johns Hopkins University.

Q. Please tell us, where did you work immediately before coming to the University of Chicago?

A. At UCLA.

Q. And what position did you hold at UCLA?

A. Associate Professor of German.

Q. How long did you work at UCLA?

A. 2006 to 2008.

Q. Did you work anywhere prior to working at UCLA?

A. Yes.

Q. And where was that?

A. 2004 to 2006 I was a visiting professor at the University of Konstanz in Germany. In 1997 to 2004 I was First Assistant Professor and then Associate Professor of German at the University of North Carolina in Chapel Hill.

Q. What position did you hold when you were at the University of Konstanz in Germany?

A. I was a Visiting Professor of German Literature.

Q. And tell us again how long did you work at the University of Konstanz?

A. Two years.

Q. That was 2004 to 2006, did you say?

A. That's correct.

Q. Okay. And what years did you work at UNC?

A. 1997 to 2004.

Q. And your position there?

A. First, Assistant Professor and then Associate Professor of German.

Q. Let's now turn to your current responsibilities at the University of Chicago. What are your responsibilities as the Deputy Dean and Collegiate Master at the Humanities Division?

A. I oversee undergraduate education at the university.

Q. And where does that undergraduate education take place?

A. In the college.

Q. Where does graduate education take place?

A. In the division.

Q. Could you tell us briefly, what is the history behind this model?

A. Well, University of Chicago was founded on the model of the German research university of the 19th century, which is focussed primarily on graduate education, and then later I think in the early 20th century it -- college was added according to the model of Oxford and Cambridge, that was, so to say, lodged in the research university, focused on graduate education.

Q. Where do the faculty in the Humanities Division have appointments?

A. They have their primary appointment in the in the Humanities Division and then a secondary appointment in the college.

Q. So, do all faculty have those two appointments?

A. Yes.

Q. Where are graduate students homed?

A. In the division.

Q. Why is that?

A. Because the divisions are responsible for graduate education, and their purpose is -- they are there for graduate training, and so their home is in the division.

1 Q. By contrast, what is the college focused  
 2 on?  
 3 A. On undergraduate education.  
 4 Q. Dr. Wild, do you have any responsibilities  
 5 for graduate students?  
 6 A. Well, insofar as I teach in the college.  
 7 Q. So, if you could be a little more specific  
 8 and tell us what then are your responsibilities  
 9 vis-à-vis those graduate students?  
 10 A. Well, I see, oversee the appointment  
 11 process of graduate students teaching in the college  
 12 in their various roles that they have as teachers.  
 13 Q. Are you responsible for making teaching  
 14 appointments?  
 15 A. Well, technically I just simply recommend  
 16 them, but yes, I handle the process and I make the  
 17 recommendation to the college Dean and vested by the  
 18 provost to make that appointment.  
 19 Q. Is that for all graduate students teaching  
 20 in the college?  
 21 A. For all graduate students. For graduate  
 22 students teaching Humanities Collegiate Division, so  
 23 not all but only the graduate students teaching in  
 24 the Humanities Collegiate Division.  
 25 Q. So, you're responsible for making teaching

1 positions?  
 2 A. Yes.  
 3 Q. What is the Chicago Center for Teaching? I  
 4 may refer to it as CCT. Do you know what I'm  
 5 talking about?  
 6 (Court Reporter requested that the  
 7 last question be repeated.)  
 8 Q. My question is: What is the Chicago Center  
 9 For Teaching, which I may refer to from time to time  
 10 as CCT?  
 11 A. It's a center that focuses on teaching  
 12 teachers, and so it covers really almost all aspects  
 13 of pedagogy, whether instructional technology or  
 14 wholesale pedagogy, i.e., how to conduct a  
 15 discussion. It does teaching consultations, offers  
 16 workshops in various aspects of teaching. It has  
 17 various other programs to enhance teaching to  
 18 improve teaching both on the level of the faculty as  
 19 well as graduate students.  
 20 Q. Are you involved with the CCT with respect  
 21 to the training of graduate students?  
 22 A. Well, on the one hand I'm on the advisory  
 23 board of the CCT, and on the other hand I work  
 24 closely together with the CCT when it comes to  
 25 training all instructors in the Core. The Core is

1 appointments?  
 2 A. Correct.  
 3 Q. Are you responsible for the budget that  
 4 pays for teaching assistantships?  
 5 A. I'm also responsible for the college  
 6 instructional budget, and that would include course  
 7 assistantship or --  
 8 (Court Reporter requested that the  
 9 Witness repeat last portion of  
 10 the answer.)  
 11 That would include course or teaching  
 12 assistantships.  
 13 Q. To whom do you recommend appointments?  
 14 A. To the Dean of the College.  
 15 Q. Do you make any recommendations to the  
 16 Provost Office?  
 17 A. Since there is a very large volume of  
 18 appointments, the Provost Office technically makes  
 19 the appointments, but since there is a very large  
 20 volume of appointments we have, you know, the  
 21 Provost Office has delegated that power to the Dean  
 22 of the College, and I work for the Dean of College  
 23 and make recommendations to the Dean of the College.  
 24 Q. Do you receive recommendations from the  
 25 individual departments to appoint teaching

1 housed in the college, you know, entirely under my  
 2 purview, and when it comes to, as I said, training  
 3 instructors to teach in the Core, I work together  
 4 with the CCT.  
 5 Q. How long have you worked in that regard or  
 6 that manner with the CCT?  
 7 A. Really from the first day that I stepped  
 8 into the Master's office two years ago.  
 9 Q. How much involvement do you have with the  
 10 CCT? In other words, how much time do you spend  
 11 doing that?  
 12 A. Well, I think that's hard to say how much  
 13 times. It depends on the time of the year, but for  
 14 instance, now we're meeting regularly to plan for  
 15 the orientation workshops in the fall for incoming  
 16 instructors in the Core.  
 17 Q. Who establishes the academic criteria for  
 18 the Humanities, and by that question, what I'm  
 19 really asking you, is it the Humanities Division  
 20 itself, or does the academic criteria come from a  
 21 department above or other than the Humanities  
 22 Division?  
 23 A. It's the Humanities Division.  
 24 Q. What is the Humanities Division academic  
 25 criteria based upon?

1 A. That's a very broad question. Can you  
2 specify it a little more? Of course there are  
3 various aspects of teaching and it depends on really  
4 what we're talking about.

5 Q. Is one consideration of the development of  
6 the academic criteria what the division needs for  
7 its students to graduate?

8 A. Well, certainly. One of the criteria for  
9 teaching of graduate students is what they need to  
10 have, you know, learned by the time they are  
11 graduates, so it depends from discipline to  
12 discipline, i.e., it varies from department to  
13 department, and it's largely the individuals  
14 departments who set what graduate students need to  
15 have learned as teachers, as pedagogs, by the time  
16 they graduate.

17 Q. Does the Humanities Division in that  
18 particular regard consider the idea that these  
19 graduate students may graduate to become future  
20 faculty members?

21 A. Yes. That's always -- that's the primary  
22 concern.

23 Q. And does the department set certain  
24 minimums based on their judgment of how much  
25 teaching experience it requires?

1 A. That's what departments do. They -- they  
2 set these minimums depending on their disciplinary  
3 requirements, needs, and the disciplinary culture.  
4 Some departments will -- English and Philosophy,  
5 will handle this different than languages.

6 Q. And they form their own independent  
7 judgments?

8 A. That's correct.

9 Q. It's not foisted upon them by another  
10 department or division?

11 A. No.

12 Q. Dr. Wild, are you familiar with the  
13 graduate teaching program at the University of  
14 Chicago?

15 A. You know, that's, again, a very broad  
16 question. I can speak for the Humanities. In the  
17 Humanities we have 15 departments that have a lot of  
18 local practices, but yes, I think I can say that  
19 I -- that I have a pretty good sense of what happens  
20 in the Humanities Division or the Humanities  
21 Collegiate Division in regard to what -- how  
22 graduate students are trained and what they teach.

23 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: A quick question. I  
24 apologize. Maybe you were going to ask this.

25 So, you had mentioned before that each of

1 the departments sets their own requirements. So,  
2 those 15 departments within the Humanities may each  
3 have different requirements for their graduate  
4 students as far as teaching requirements to get  
5 their degree?

6 THE WITNESS: Yes.

7 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Go ahead.

8 BY MR. PEARLMAN:

9 Q. What's the purpose of teaching as a  
10 teaching assistant, which I may refer to from time  
11 to time as a TA?

12 A. Well, it's to learn how to, you know, how  
13 to teach from an experienced teacher.

14 Q. So, then can this be referred to as  
15 experiential learning?

16 A. That's a way of characterizing, yes.

17 Q. Would that be an accurate characterization?

18 A. I think so.

19 Q. How do students learn to teach as TAs?

20 A. Well, they work or they teach alongside an  
21 experienced faculty member under the tutelage of an  
22 experienced faculty member.

23 TAs are present during the weekly lectures,  
24 so they observe an experienced faculty, the  
25 instructor teaching, and then they conduct their own

1 discussion sessions -- discussion sections, which  
2 are planned in collaboration with the instructor of  
3 record, i.e., the faculty member. And the same, of  
4 course, goes to giving feedback on papers, marking  
5 papers, etcetera.

6 Q. Is it accurate and fair to characterize the  
7 interaction that you just described between the  
8 graduate students on the one hand and the faculty  
9 member on the other as a mentoring relationship?

10 A. I think that's correct.

11 Q. Where do graduate students perform their  
12 teaching?

13 A. In the college.

14 Q. Have you heard the term, course assistants,  
15 before?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. What is a course assistant?

18 A. Well, we use it synonymously with TA. A  
19 teaching assistant.

20 Q. So, does a course assistant learn to teach  
21 by observing a faculty member?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And does the course assistant then execute  
24 by applying and implementing what they observed and  
25 learned from the faculty member?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. What skills do TAs learn through their

3 appointments?

4 A. Well, as I mentioned before, they observe a

5 faculty member lecturing or conducting the main

6 class session. They learn how to, you know, select,

7 again in collaboration with the faculty member,

8 materials for the discussion section. They learn

9 how to conduct a discussion. And they learn how to

10 give feedback on papers.

11 Q. Do they also learn how to grade papers?

12 A. Well, grading is part of it. The grading

13 falls to the instructor of record. That's means the

14 faculty member. And in that sense they are not --

15 they aren't responsible for grading, but of course

16 since they are participating in the whole process,

17 and certainly when I am, you know, if I'm teaching a

18 class that has TAs, we normally discuss the papers

19 and what grade we would assign, it falls to me to

20 assign the final grade on every paper, and the final

21 grade -- but I value the input of the TA and, you

22 know, the process of talking about how to arrive at

23 a certain grade. What are the criteria for

24 evaluating the paper is one that is very helpful to

25 the TA who is, you know, doesn't have the experience

1 that I have of 20 years of grading papers.

2 Q. So, just to be clear, who then bears

3 ultimate responsibility for deciding upon an issue

4 in the grade?

5 A. The instructor of record, the faculty

6 member.

7 Q. And does the graduate student give input or

8 feedback or thoughts to the faculty instructor

9 through an interactive process in that regard?

10 MS. AUERBACH: Objection. This was just

11 testified to.

12 THE WITNESS: Well, again --

13 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Before you answer

14 the question --

15 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry.

16 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Can you repeat the

17 question?

18 MR. PEARLMAN: I think she's right,

19 actually. I think he has answered that question.

20 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay.

21 BY MR. PEARLMAN:

22 Q. Do TAs ever substitute for the faculty

23 member?

24 A. No.

25 Q. What's the benefit to the graduate student

1 of assisting a professor?

2 A. As I mentioned before, is that they, you

3 know, that they gain experience in teaching. They

4 learn from -- by observing to teach, and then learn

5 by doing.

6 Q. Is that part of this experiential learning

7 process?

8 MS. AUERBACH: Objection. It's leading.

9 It's also asked and answered.

10 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I think we have

11 covered that.

12 BY MR. PEARLMAN:

13 Q. Okay. How do graduate students learn to

14 grade the papers?

15 A. Well, they grade alongside a faculty

16 member. I mean, again, there is various different

17 practices in how faculty members do it. Sometimes

18 the TA will grade the first part, the first draft,

19 if there is a first draft. And the faculty member

20 will, you know, supervise that process and then be

21 responsible for the final draft.

22 Sometimes a faculty member and the TA or

23 the TAs split it up and then come together again to

24 discuss, you know, the grading process and discuss

25 each individual paper and the feedback that they are

1 going to give and the grade that the faculty member

2 and the TA will assign for the group of students

3 that the TA is responsible for.

4 Q. Why does the graduate student need to know,

5 in the university's view, how to grade papers?

6 A. Well, grading papers is an essential part

7 of what you do as a Humanities faculty, and so you

8 need to know how to grade a paper.

9 Q. Now, do Ph.D. students in Humanities

10 undergo writing intern training?

11 A. Well, some of them do. Those students who

12 want to serve as writing interns or who want to

13 teach in the Core need to undergo training as a

14 writing intern. So it's the preliminary step to say

15 on the progression to become serving as a

16 stand-alone instructor in the Core.

17 Q. Does writing intern training teach the

18 graduate students grading skills?

19 A. It primarily actually teaches them how to

20 get feedback on papers, but writing is, of course,

21 obviously a component of that. And it teaches them

22 how to, in a much broader sense, how to teach

23 writing.

24 Q. You mentioned earlier that TAs lead small

25 group discussions. How do they learn to do that?

1 A. Well, small group discussions is, on the  
 2 one hand, of course the format of most graduate  
 3 seminars, so they would have their first encounter  
 4 very early in their career as graduate students when  
 5 they sit themselves, when they are students. And  
 6 then it depends a little bit, you know, varies from  
 7 department by department, but a number of  
 8 departments' pedagogy programs, leading small group  
 9 discussions would be one of the things that are  
 10 covered by the pedagogy seminar. And then this is  
 11 also one of the teaching techniques that is covered  
 12 by the CCT.

13 Q. Do professors also teach the graduate  
 14 students how to lead small group discussions?

15 A. And that is, so to say -- well, yes. They  
 16 would have been, too. I mean they have done that  
 17 as, you know, students in my department would, of  
 18 course, have been, you know, sitting in my seminar,  
 19 so that would be the first step, and then in -- they  
 20 would also, if they are supervising TAs within  
 21 their -- or mentoring TAs in the courses that they  
 22 are teaching, and one of the things that certainly I  
 23 discuss is how do you lead an effective discussion.

24 Q. So, any other ways that you can tell us in  
 25 terms of how a faculty member teaches students how

1 obviously the TA. If the TA doesn't want to, I  
 2 wouldn't force the TA, but usually the TA wants to  
 3 take advantage of that opportunity.

4 Q. So, does the individual faculty have  
 5 discretion to decide whether to give this  
 6 opportunity?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Do TAs receive any mentoring prior to guest  
 9 lecturing?

10 A. Again, I -- I can't speak for every  
 11 colleague, but I certainly would hope so, and I do  
 12 so. So, we, you know, discuss the lecture together.  
 13 Again, it's something that where TAs take sort of  
 14 the next step. At some point they are going to have  
 15 to do this themselves, but you want to accompany  
 16 them on that step of preparing a lecture that they  
 17 are responsible for themselves. So, it's not about  
 18 basically handing the material and here, do this,  
 19 this is the lecture, but you're trying to assist  
 20 them in putting together a lecture or putting  
 21 together a lesson plan that they then can present  
 22 themselves. By themselves.

23 Q. Well, Dr. Wild, have you personally  
 24 mentored any graduate students prior to their guest  
 25 lecture?

1 to lead small group discussions?

2 A. No. I think that's -- I think I covered at  
 3 least what I can think of right now.

4 Q. For whose benefit are the graduate students  
 5 taught how to lead small group discussions?

6 A. Well, again, this is something that's an  
 7 essential skill that they need to learn to be  
 8 effective teachers and thereby, of course, and  
 9 ultimately to be successful in finding an academic  
 10 job upon graduation.

11 Q. Are TAs ever given the opportunity to guest  
 12 lecture?

13 A. Yes. Again, this varies widely. There is  
 14 no policy on this, but when I teach a lecture  
 15 course, then I have my TA or TAs teach one or two  
 16 classes and observe them and then give them feedback  
 17 on their performance.

18 Q. So, how often would you say that it occurs  
 19 that a TA is given an opportunity to be a guest  
 20 lecturer?

21 A. Not more than once or twice per quarter.

22 Q. Who makes that decision as to whether or  
 23 not they are going to have to have the opportunity  
 24 to be a guest lecturer?

25 A. Well, the instructor on record and

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And what have you done in order to mentor  
 3 them in this regard?

4 A. Well, we discuss the topic of that  
 5 particular class. We discuss, you know, the  
 6 materials at hand. Most of the time, of course, the  
 7 materials have been put together by me. And then we  
 8 discuss the readings and putting together a lesson  
 9 plan. And, you know, and then normally what happens  
 10 is that the TA will put together a lesson plan and  
 11 run that by me, and I will comment on it, give  
 12 constructive criticism, and that's, I think, sort of  
 13 in a nutshell what the mentoring consists of before  
 14 the lesson is presented.

15 Q. What about CCT training? Is that provided  
 16 before guest lecturing?

17 A. Well, of course they -- they can always  
 18 draw on the resources of the CCT. And, in fact,  
 19 they can also ask the CCT for a teaching  
 20 consultation.

21 So, it doesn't only have to be the  
 22 instructor of record who does then the observing,  
 23 but it can also being be the CCT who comes in and  
 24 videotapes the presentation or the performance of  
 25 the lesson and then also gives feedback.

1 Q. For whose benefit is that done?  
 2 A. For the graduate student or for the TA who  
 3 is teaching the lesson.  
 4 Q. Now, does the TA in this circumstance  
 5 submit any written work to the faculty member before  
 6 guest lecturing?  
 7 A. Well, it depends, but normally there will  
 8 be some written work. It will consist out of, you  
 9 know, the lesson plan or an outline of -- basically  
 10 a lesson plan is an outline of the materials  
 11 covered. How it is covered. The kind of sort of  
 12 pedagogical format.  
 13 If they decide to -- you know, not every  
 14 lecture has to be a lecture from beginning to end.  
 15 There can be sort of a presentation component and  
 16 the lecture can move then to an orchestrated  
 17 discussion that could involve group work.  
 18 All of these things are part of a lesson  
 19 plan or an outline, and often a TA will bring that  
 20 outline to the conversation that we have in advance  
 21 of -- or the conversations that we have in advance  
 22 of them being -- you know, taking over one of the  
 23 class sessions.  
 24 Q. Now, after the TA guest lectures, what  
 25 happens between the TA and the professor?

1 A. Well, they sit down, just like they sat  
 2 down before, and review the lesson and discuss what  
 3 went well and what didn't go so well. And from  
 4 my -- from my perspective there is also often to  
 5 help students, graduate students or TAs really  
 6 self-reflect the teachers.  
 7 So, it's about getting them to think about  
 8 how they go about teaching whatever material they  
 9 are teaching. And there is many ways to teach the  
 10 same material. And so to reflect on their choices  
 11 to be cognizant of the effectiveness of the  
 12 individual choices. And sometimes also to acquire  
 13 the vocabulary described. So, I observed a number  
 14 of TAs who are brilliant teachers but who couldn't  
 15 describe afterwards what actually went on in the  
 16 classroom, and so part of the exercise is also to be  
 17 able to acquire this vocabulary which is, you know,  
 18 essential in any job interview for an academic job.  
 19 Q. Is it accurate to characterize what you  
 20 just described as a continuous learning cycle?  
 21 MS. AUERBACH: Objection to leading.  
 22 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I don't think we  
 23 covered what a continuous learning cycle is.  
 24 BY MR. PEARLMAN:  
 25 Q. Well, maybe I could rephrase it to avoid

1 any ambiguity.  
 2 Is the graduate student continuing to learn  
 3 through that process of meeting with the professor  
 4 after they guest lecture?  
 5 A. Definitely. I'm learning, you know, for  
 6 every class that I'm teaching. That's the whole  
 7 point of the CCT and critique. I think we're in  
 8 this game because we want to be life-long learners  
 9 both in our research but also teachers.  
 10 Q. How is the workload of the faculty affected  
 11 by the use of TAs in these courses?  
 12 A. I would say that on balance, actually  
 13 setting up a class with TAs is more work than a  
 14 class without TAs.  
 15 Q. Why would you reach that conclusion?  
 16 A. Well, for a number of reasons. Because,  
 17 you know, you have to plan for the discussion  
 18 sections. You have to, you know, do all the things  
 19 that I -- that we just discussed. All of these  
 20 things take time. Take extra effort. Take  
 21 planning, etcetera, etcetera.  
 22 Q. Let's shift gears for a moment and talk  
 23 about matching TAs to courses. Are you familiar  
 24 with the process by which a TA is appointed to a  
 25 specific course?

1 A. In broad outlines, yes. Of course, again,  
 2 there is varying local practices, so I'm -- I can't  
 3 speak for, you know, to all of those local  
 4 practices, but yes.  
 5 Q. How does that process work?  
 6 A. Well, it's both dependent on the faculty  
 7 member involved and the department in which the  
 8 faculty member and the TAs are. So, it has both  
 9 something to do with the set of intellectual  
 10 interests and the area of specialization in which  
 11 the graduate student is.  
 12 So, you would normally try to match that  
 13 with the topic of the class talk. And then, of  
 14 course, it also has to do with where the graduate  
 15 students -- the graduate student is in their  
 16 particular pedagogical training. It would also  
 17 depend on whether they are -- they need to fulfill  
 18 GAI points, etcetera.  
 19 So, these are broad outlines, some of the  
 20 criteria that determine the assignment of TAs to  
 21 particular courses.  
 22 Q. Are you responsible for overseeing this  
 23 appointment process?  
 24 A. I only responsible for the tail end of it.  
 25 So, I don't see the individual deliberation very

1 often. I see them on occasion. I see, of course,  
 2 the part in regard to the fulfillment of GAI points.  
 3 Q. And Dr. Wild, are you responsible for  
 4 recommending the ultimate appointments?  
 5 A. Yes.  
 6 Q. To whom do you make those recommendations?  
 7 A. As I said, it's the Dean of the College  
 8 that stands in for the Provost Office.  
 9 Q. Could you tell us, how does the process of  
 10 appointing student teachers begin? Does a budget  
 11 need to be prepared?  
 12 A. Yes. Annually every department prepares a  
 13 college instructional budget dependent upon their  
 14 particular needs, and I then approve that budget.  
 15 Q. So, how does the department decide who  
 16 should be appointed to each position?  
 17 A. Well, again, it has something to do with  
 18 where -- in the broadest sense, if we leave aside,  
 19 so to say, you know, the question of whether a TA is  
 20 particularly suited to teach a particular course, it  
 21 has to do with where the graduate student is in the  
 22 pedagogical training process. That can be simply  
 23 put, in which year are they in, have they undergone  
 24 the pedagogy seminar that the particular department  
 25 offers, and then also what -- what kind of course

1 they are supposed to -- or in what kind of role they  
 2 are supposed to function at that particular point,  
 3 because we have -- we generally have a progression.  
 4 You don't get simply thrown into being a stand-alone  
 5 instructor, i.e., a lecturer. You start with  
 6 something, some intermediary step, and so that would  
 7 also determine which student serves in which role,  
 8 in which pedagogical role.  
 9 Q. Is there a specific structure in Germanic  
 10 Studies? You said there was variance, so I would  
 11 like you to comment on that.  
 12 A. In Germanic Studies we have, you know,  
 13 students start out in their first year to take a  
 14 pedagogy seminar on second language acquisition.  
 15 And then in their second year teach elementary  
 16 German. Every -- all of the instructors that are  
 17 teaching in a given year do a pedagogy workshop  
 18 during O Week and then in the --  
 19 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: What is O Week?  
 20 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry. That's  
 21 orientation week.  
 22 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you.  
 23 THE WITNESS: It's the week before classes  
 24 start.  
 25 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you.

1 THE WITNESS: That's why it's called  
 2 O Week. And then in the second -- in their third  
 3 year they would teach intermediary German, and the  
 4 fourth year so called dissertation year, and fifth  
 5 year they teach a self-designed course of advanced  
 6 German or third-year German.  
 7 BY MR. PEARLMAN:  
 8 Q. Are certain students given priority in  
 9 teaching appointments?  
 10 A. Well, students that have to fulfill GAI  
 11 points in most general terms, and of course students  
 12 who need to teach the kind of course that is in that  
 13 particular sequence.  
 14 So, you're not going to put a student who  
 15 has taught in intermediate German but needs to teach  
 16 advanced German, give that student preference over  
 17 someone else who has taught elementary but needs to  
 18 teach intermediate German.  
 19 Q. What's the reason? Why do certain students  
 20 falling under those categories that you mentioned  
 21 get priority?  
 22 A. Well, because we see it as part of their  
 23 pedagogical training, as their pedagogical training  
 24 has a logic and progression to it. So, they move  
 25 systematically through that. And the formal side of

1 the pedagogical training is fulfillment of GAI  
 2 points, but as I said, underlying rationale is that  
 3 you start first with elementary German before you go  
 4 to intermediate German before you go to advanced  
 5 German, and the level of autonomy that is given to  
 6 students by each stage grows because they are  
 7 becoming more independent teachers.  
 8 In the third year we have so-called third  
 9 year working group for -- that's under the  
 10 supervision of Cathy Baumann, our director of the  
 11 language program, and for many years, me, students  
 12 who have taught third-year German courses will  
 13 basically -- will present their experiences teaching  
 14 to the students who will offer these courses in the  
 15 following year, and there is also a component --  
 16 it's a modular approach -- there is also a component  
 17 that they take over from either their peers who have  
 18 taught it or from the materials that are given, and  
 19 then there is a component where they design -- that  
 20 they design themselves.  
 21 So, it's really at the very end of the  
 22 culmination of those five years that they teach a  
 23 course of their own design and on -- as I said, on a  
 24 third-year German level, i.e., that means also in  
 25 terms of the focus of the course isn't a primarily

1 language acquisition, but it's also on the contents  
 2 side.  
 3 Q. You mentioned the name Cathy Baumann?  
 4 A. Uh-huh.  
 5 Q. Who is that?  
 6 A. Cathy Baumann is a senior lecturer in our  
 7 department who is the director of the language  
 8 program, and she is also serving currently as the  
 9 director of the Chicago Language Center, the CLC.  
 10 Q. Are departmental faculty consulted in the  
 11 process of selecting students for various  
 12 appointments?  
 13 A. Yes. They are all part of a conversation.  
 14 We get together and review how each student -- how  
 15 each student is doing in the spring quarter. And  
 16 that's also the time when the teaching assignments  
 17 are discussed. And Cathy is part of that  
 18 conversation.  
 19 Q. Are dissertation advisors consulted?  
 20 A. Yes.  
 21 Q. Why?  
 22 A. Well, because with almost -- with almost  
 23 anything on the academic progress of the students,  
 24 of the graduate students, is the most important  
 25 consideration. And so we always have to balance

1 teaching and progress on the dissertation. And  
 2 sometimes, you know, the dissertation will be, so to  
 3 say, more important. If it's not -- if it's not  
 4 progressing as it should be. And sometimes the  
 5 teaching will be more important in a given quarter  
 6 or year.  
 7 Q. So, does the level of faculty involvement  
 8 vary with respect to the appointment process?  
 9 A. I'm not quite sure I understand your  
 10 question. Do you mean from department to  
 11 department?  
 12 Q. Correct. Yes.  
 13 A. I would imagine. I think that there are  
 14 departments where faculty are more involved, and  
 15 there are departments where faculty are less  
 16 involved.  
 17 You know, particularly departments like  
 18 Philosophy or English that don't have a language  
 19 program that is somewhat separate, faculty are more  
 20 involved. It's really the DGS in consultation with  
 21 DUS and the rest of the faculty will determine that.  
 22 In our case, as I said, Cathy Baumann as a senior  
 23 lecturer is the one who runs the language program,  
 24 and so she has really the best overview of where  
 25 each student is in the progression of, you know,

1 that sort of -- the classes that we want them to  
 2 have taught to reach the level of, you know,  
 3 pedagogical expertise. But she is -- but she's part  
 4 of that conversation, and we all sit together, as I  
 5 said, get together. There is all always a faculty  
 6 meeting in the spring where it's devoted to nothing  
 7 but going name by name. We're a small department,  
 8 of course. Name by name and discussing the  
 9 student's progress and previewing teaching  
 10 assignments for next year.  
 11 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Very quick  
 12 clarifying. You use the term DGS and DUS.  
 13 THE WITNESS: Sorry. Director of Graduate  
 14 Studies and Director of Undergraduate Studies.  
 15 BY MR. PEARLMAN:  
 16 Q. So, this process where you just described  
 17 where all the student names are discussed and the  
 18 various circumstances are discussed, for whose  
 19 benefit is that conducted?  
 20 A. Well, the benefit is, obviously the  
 21 graduate students. We need to make sure the  
 22 graduate are always on track. We need to know where  
 23 they are in term terms of their progress, both on  
 24 the side of their own research -- their course work  
 25 and research, and then in terms of teaching.  
 1 Q. Do you have an example of the appointment  
 2 process being managed at an administrative level?  
 3 A. You mean with administrative level, the  
 4 department administrator that doesn't have a role as  
 5 a teacher or -- you know, Cathy isn't technically  
 6 faculty. She is so-called, other academic  
 7 appointee. But she is, of course, a teacher and so  
 8 do you mean that, or do you mean really the  
 9 departmental administrator, so-called department --  
 10 call her the departmental secretary?  
 11 Q. Director, for example?  
 12 A. Well, as I said, in our department the  
 13 director of the language program is involved in  
 14 that. She administers the language program. But I  
 15 would hope that departmental administrators or  
 16 coordinators or are not involved in this process, or  
 17 only on the back end or bureaucratic end in terms of  
 18 making sure that classrooms and are assigned and  
 19 things like that.  
 20 Q. Are you an appointed faculty member in  
 21 Germanic Studies?  
 22 A. Yes.  
 23 Q. Are you familiar with the process by which  
 24 Germanic Studies Department selects students for  
 25 teaching appointments?

1 A. Yes. As I just explained.  
 2 Q. And you mentioned Cathy Baumann again as  
 3 the director of the language program. Does she have  
 4 any other positions with the university?  
 5 A. Well, as I mentioned already, she is  
 6 director of CLC, Chicago Language Center, which  
 7 really coordinates all language teaching across the  
 8 university.  
 9 Q. Does she have a lecturer --  
 10 A. She is a senior lecturer.  
 11 Q. So, how is it determined what courses a TA  
 12 is assigned to?  
 13 MS. AUERBACH: I believe this is asked and  
 14 answered.  
 15 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I agree. I think  
 16 we've covered that.  
 17 BY MR. PEARLMAN:  
 18 Q. In particular, though, I want to talk to  
 19 you for a moment about the size of the course. Does  
 20 that matter in terms of assigning a TA?  
 21 A. It does matter in the case of the  
 22 assignment of a TA. You know, roughly we -- it  
 23 should be a ratio of 24 to one. 24 undergraduate  
 24 students per TA.  
 25 Q. Are there any exceptions to this rule?

1 A. Well, we have a number of departments that  
 2 don't offer courses that draw those kind of numbers,  
 3 and yet they want to give their graduate students  
 4 the experience of TAs, and this is something that,  
 5 and I'm not speaking as a faculty member of Germanic  
 6 Studies, but a Master of the Humanities Collegiate  
 7 Division who authorizes or approves these  
 8 apartments. And so in those cases we then are  
 9 flexible and, you know, allow for a much smaller  
 10 ratio than that.  
 11 Q. And has that, in fact, occurred where the  
 12 number of students is less than 24 but the  
 13 university would nevertheless give an opportunity to  
 14 the grad students --  
 15 A. Just this quarter a number of times, yes.  
 16 Q. What determines whether a course with low  
 17 enrollment gets a TA?  
 18 A. Well, as I said, I look at the department.  
 19 I look at past enrollments. And if you do this, of  
 20 course you know which departments have -- don't  
 21 normally draw those kind of enrollments. And  
 22 departments also then will make a special  
 23 recommendation and say this particular student, you  
 24 know, is working on X. The faculty member is  
 25 offering a course that is related to that. And

1 we're, you know, working, doing our best to reach  
 2 the enrollments, but we can't guarantee it. And  
 3 then I normally give the approval despite the fact  
 4 that we don't -- it doesn't reach the ratio that we  
 5 normally try to uphold.  
 6 Q. So, what happens once you approve a TA  
 7 appointment decision?  
 8 A. Well, the TA gets assigned to the course.  
 9 Or not -- and, you know, serves in that role as TA.  
 10 Q. Does the department write a letter of  
 11 recommendation?  
 12 A. Right. Yes. They first write a  
 13 recommendation, a memo, and then we, in turn,  
 14 recommend the appointment. And then, as I said, the  
 15 College Dean approves it.  
 16 Q. Are you familiar with the funding of  
 17 teaching positions?  
 18 A. Yes.  
 19 Q. How is a teaching position in the college  
 20 funded in a situation where a student is teaching to  
 21 fulfill teaching points?  
 22 A. GAI points?  
 23 Q. Yes, sir.  
 24 A. There the funds for that teaching position  
 25 actually comes from the division.

1 Q. What about a situation where the student is  
 2 not teaching to fulfill teaching points, where does  
 3 the funding come from?  
 4 A. It comes out of the college budget.  
 5 Q. Are you familiar with the teaching  
 6 requirements for Ph.D. students in the Humanities?  
 7 A. Again, this is a very broad question, and  
 8 as I indicated, we have a lot of local practices.  
 9 It depends on department from department, but yes.  
 10 In general, yes.  
 11 Q. Is teaching an academic requirement?  
 12 A. Yes. Every graduate student in Humanities  
 13 Division has to fulfill a certain number of GAI  
 14 points. The number of GAI points varies from  
 15 department to department.  
 16 Q. How many GAI teaching points are Humanities  
 17 Ph.D. students required to obtain?  
 18 A. Anywhere between five and 12.  
 19 Q. And what does that variance depend on?  
 20 A. Well, it depends on what the department  
 21 believes, you know, amount of teaching experience  
 22 that the student should acquire upon graduation,  
 23 depending on the discipline.  
 24 So, you know, German has a -- has a certain  
 25 set of beliefs. The German Department believes that

1 graduate student should have taught all three levels  
2 of German, and so that sets the number of GAI points  
3 that the students in the German Department have to  
4 fulfill.

5 Q. How many points do the majority of the  
6 students in the departments other than German need  
7 to fulfill?

8 A. Five.

9 Q. What about German, how many points?

10 A. In German it's 12.

11 Q. What causes this variance in the number of  
12 a teaching points that are required?

13 A. Well, in German, as I said, we believe  
14 that -- that graduate students should teach all  
15 three levels, and in all language departments, or in  
16 most language departments, when students teach the  
17 language, they do not serve as TA, which is --  
18 yields one GAI point; but they serve as stand-alone  
19 instructors, instructor of record, so they fulfill  
20 two GAI points.

21 So, in that sense, they get very quickly to  
22 the 12 points with the teaching that we think they  
23 need to do to be competitive on the job market.

24 Q. Who sets the number of teaching points that  
25 are needed?

1 A. The department. I mean the -- the  
2 Humanities Division makes sure that the departments  
3 don't set a too high number, but within that  
4 framework, individual departments have autonomy to  
5 set their own number of teaching points.

6 Q. You said that most of the departments  
7 within the Humanities require five teaching points  
8 and German requires 12?

9 A. Uh-huh.

10 Q. Does that requirement of 12 in Germanics  
11 have an impact on the time to degree, how long it  
12 takes to get a Ph.D. degree for a Germanic Studies  
13 Ph.D.?

14 A. Well, we believe that it doesn't have an  
15 adverse effect. Our time to degree is among the  
16 best in the division. So, in that sense we, of  
17 course, always strive for a balance between making  
18 sure that students graduate as early as possible and  
19 have the necessary teaching experience. But as I  
20 said, our graduate students have one of the lowest  
21 time to degree in the division, so we feel that we  
22 have struck the right balance.

23 Q. What is the Germanic Studies' Ph.D.  
24 program's average time to degree?

25 A. Six to seven years.

1 Q. So, do you see on -- and I apologize, Madam  
2 Hearing Officer. I don't recall offhand the exhibit  
3 number.

4 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: 15.

5 BY MR. PEARLMAN:

6 Q. Exhibit 15. Thank you very much.

7 Do you see on the demonstrative identified  
8 as Germanic Studies, as Exhibit 15 where it says  
9 Germanic Studies?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Do you see to the right of that there is a  
12 question of whether or not there is a teaching  
13 requirement?

14 A. Uh-huh.

15 Q. I apologize. You'll just need to say yes  
16 or no for the record.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And is it accurate there where it says the  
19 12 GAI teaching points are required?

20 A. That's correct. That's accurate.

21 Q. This chart also indicates that teaching is  
22 an academic requirement. Do you see that?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Is that accurate?

25 A. That's also accurate.

1 Q. Okay. And to the right of that there is a  
2 column that says, recommended years to fulfill  
3 teaching requirement, and what correlates to  
4 Germanic studies is years two through five. Is that  
5 accurate?

6 A. That's accurate with a small qualification  
7 that it's two, three, and five. Students usually do  
8 not teach in the fourth year. We sometimes make  
9 exceptions if they -- you know, they might,  
10 particularly when they come in with an MA they might  
11 take their dissertation year a year earlier, but  
12 there is what we call dissertation year where they  
13 focus on nothing but either, you know, the first  
14 chapter of the dissertation or writing up the  
15 proposal and then getting into the first chapter.  
16 But usually it's the 4th year. So, it's correct in  
17 the sense of it's two -- the second to the fifth  
18 year, but the fourth year would not -- there would  
19 be no teaching in the fourth year.

20 Q. Dr. Wild, is there any limitation on the  
21 type of courses that graduate students are permitted  
22 to teach?

23 A. Well, graduate students usually -- yes, it  
24 depends on their area of specialization. So,  
25 graduate students in South Asian will teach normally

1 in their department. And then, of course, also it  
2 depends on the pedagogical training they have  
3 received and the teaching experience that they have  
4 acquired.

5 Q. What types of teaching appointments are  
6 available in the college?

7 A. Well, in the college we have, you know,  
8 teaching assistantships or course assistantships,  
9 writing interns, graduate student lecturers in the  
10 Core. Preceptorships, language assistants, writing  
11 tutors, writing lecturers. I think that's it, or at  
12 least I can't think of any others right now.

13 Q. What is a graduate student lecturer?

14 A. A graduate student lecturer is our  
15 qualification of the term lecturer. That means they  
16 are a stand-alone instructor in that particular  
17 class and the instructor of record, i.e., then they  
18 are responsible for most aspects of the class,  
19 including the grading.

20 Q. Does this confer any value upon the  
21 graduate student?

22 A. As I indicated, you know, in a little bit  
23 different context, in German we see it as the  
24 culmination, really, of the pedagogical training to  
25 be a stand-alone instructor and be responsible for

1 the teaching of all or most aspects. Again, there  
2 is different types of classes, so in some -- in some  
3 types of classes they wouldn't be responsible for  
4 designing a syllabus. In some other types of  
5 classes they would be responsible for designing the  
6 syllabus. But that they, in some sense, you know,  
7 are autonomous and autonomously responsible for  
8 teaching the class. That's the end point in some  
9 sense before they are able to then graduate.

10 Q. Are Germanics Ph.D. students appointed as  
11 lecturers?

12 A. Yes. Because as I said, this is specific  
13 to a language programs. We -- there are some  
14 language program that have language assistants, but  
15 language assistants don't function as TAs. They are  
16 really -- sort of gives students the language  
17 exposure to the language mostly in conversations.  
18 So, what they end up doing is meeting with students  
19 for 20 minutes or a half an hour, and we don't have  
20 that in the German department. And so our students  
21 are primarily teaching as lecturers, i.e., they are  
22 responsible for their -- for the class by  
23 themselves, and it's for that reason that we have  
24 such an elaborate pedagogy program to make sure that  
25 when students in their second year of teaching

1 elementary German they are adequately prepared.  
2 That's why we have a modular approach so they are  
3 not just thrown in a classroom and suddenly they  
4 have to -- no one helps them how to teach the  
5 particular text book. But there is a community of  
6 other teachers who pass on their knowledge. There  
7 is Cathy Baumann, who has a Ph.D. in Second Language  
8 Acquisition. And there is, as I said, a pedagogy  
9 seminar, workshops, and regular meetings for each  
10 level of language to discuss issues with teaching,  
11 and Cathy Baumann also observes all graduate  
12 students teaching in the German program on a regular  
13 basis and gives some feedback.

14 Q. What is a preceptor?

15 A. A preceptor is responsible for a group of  
16 seniors writing their BA pieces and helps the  
17 students with the -- their writing process, but it's  
18 not responsible for the grading and not responsible  
19 in some sense for the -- for the -- how shall I say,  
20 for the particular topic of the paper. That's up to  
21 the faculty member who is the advisor of the BA  
22 thesis, but they help them with their -- the writing  
23 process. And one reason why we also have  
24 preceptorships or preceptors is that students then  
25 come together, a group of eight to ten students, and

1 in a type of senior seminar, it's sort of a  
2 collective process.

3 Writing can be awfully solitary, and that  
4 makes it more of a collective process that they can  
5 share their work. They can workshop their work.  
6 And the preceptors is responsible for, in some  
7 sense, guiding that process and overseeing that  
8 process.

9 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Those are  
10 undergraduates you're referring to?

11 THE WITNESS: No. The students who are  
12 writing the BA thesis are seniors, i.e., they are  
13 four year college students, and the preceptors are  
14 graduate students.

15 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you.  
16 BY MR. PEARLMAN:

17 Q. Are Humanities graduate students appointed  
18 as preceptors?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. What's a language assistant?

21 A. A language assistant, as I mentioned, is  
22 they are -- gives a student in language classes  
23 additional practice in -- in that language.  
24 Primarily conversation.

25 Q. Are Germanics Ph.D. students appointed as

1 language assistants?  
 2 A. No. We don't have language assistants.  
 3 They tend to be -- there are some exceptions, but  
 4 they tend to be in languages that require more  
 5 contact hours, like Chinese or Japanese, Russian.  
 6 The one exception is that -- and that's due to their  
 7 particular pedagogical approach that romance  
 8 languages, language assistants in Spanish and  
 9 French, but we believe that we can do what we need  
 10 to do in the classroom setting, and we don't need  
 11 additional language assistants.

12 Q. What a writing intern?

13 A. A writing intern is sort of a TA in the  
 14 core curriculum in the sense of that the writing  
 15 intern helps the students with the writing process  
 16 and teaches them writing. But instead of a TA in a  
 17 lecture class would conduct the discussion sections,  
 18 in the case of a Core course, which are capped at  
 19 19, having an extra discussion section would  
 20 obviously not make much sense. And they then -- and  
 21 what we do is they offer three writing workshops and  
 22 individual writing consultations for the  
 23 undergraduate in the Core section. And also attend  
 24 every class session and then assist the instructor  
 25 of record with the feedback on papers and also on

1 Q. For a language assistant?

2 A. A half a teaching point.

3 Q. A writing intern?

4 A. One.

5 Q. You're saying a lectureship obtains more  
 6 teaching points?

7 A. Yes. Correct.

8 Q. Why is that?

9 A. Well, because it's -- you know, it requires  
 10 more experience, and it requires more time  
 11 investment on the part of the graduate student.

12 Q. Why?

13 A. Well, because they are responsible for all  
 14 aspects of the course, even if, you know, we -- I'm  
 15 using German as an example. Even if there is many  
 16 things that we, you know, many prepared materials,  
 17 you know, we're not just simply telling them, here,  
 18 go teach, it's still more than it would be to -- to  
 19 serve or teach as a teaching assistant or writing  
 20 intern.

21 Q. Why does the Humanities Division allow  
 22 students to hold these lectureships?

23 A. Again, as I mentioned before, because we  
 24 see them as really the logical conclusion of their  
 25 training as teachers.

1 the grading.

2 Q. Are Germanics Ph.D. students appointed as  
 3 writing interns?

4 A. Rarely. Because they fulfill their  
 5 teaching points in teaching language classes, so  
 6 they don't -- you know, they graduate before they  
 7 have a chance, because one should also say that, you  
 8 know, one of the incentives of doing the writing  
 9 internship training and then serving as a writing  
 10 intern is, of course, that it's the precondition to  
 11 be a lecturer in the Core, i.e., a stand-alone  
 12 instructor in the Core. And so our students rarely  
 13 do that unless they seek it out deliberately, and  
 14 usually they graduate before that.

15 Q. Does the number of teaching points obtained  
 16 vary based on the type of position that the graduate  
 17 students is filling?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. How many teaching points are obtained for  
 20 holding a lectureship?

21 A. Two.

22 Q. For a teaching assistant?

23 A. One.

24 Q. For a preceptor?

25 A. One.

1 Q. Aside from teaching courses within their  
 2 field of study, where else do graduate students take  
 3 on teaching assignments?

4 A. Now, I mean that's a very broad question,  
 5 and I can't, of course, answer to every, every  
 6 possibility, but, you know, I think one of the areas  
 7 where they primarily teach if they are not teaching  
 8 in the department would be in the Core curriculum or  
 9 in the writing program.

10 Q. So, the Core curriculum, I'll just refer to  
 11 as the brevity sake as the Core. What is the Core?

12 A. Our version of the general education  
 13 curriculum, i.e., the introductory course of study  
 14 for every college student. About the third of the  
 15 courses that students take in college are Core  
 16 courses.

17 Q. What is a Core sequence?

18 A. A Core sequence is the way that Core  
 19 courses in the Humanities and the Social Sciences  
 20 primarily are organized. So, in the Humanities we  
 21 have eight Core sequences, and each of the Core  
 22 sequence is composed of three quarters, and each of  
 23 the Core sequences have a particular thematic focus.

24 Q. What are those Core sequences?

25 A. All right. Human Being and Citizen,

1 Philosophical Perspective, Readings in World  
 2 Literature, Reading Cultures, Language in the Human,  
 3 Poetry in the Human. I think I'm forgetting  
 4 something.  
 5 Q. Is Media --  
 6 A. Media Aesthetics.  
 7 Q. Are there parallel sections in the Core  
 8 sequences?  
 9 A. Yes.  
 10 Q. How many?  
 11 A. Anywhere between five and 15 or 20.  
 12 Q. So, in each of the sequences, those  
 13 sequences, do the instructors teach the same  
 14 materials?  
 15 A. Yes. There is a common syllabus for almost  
 16 all -- for all Core sequences in the fall and  
 17 winter, and for most Core sequences in the spring.  
 18 Q. When are graduate students permitted to  
 19 teach in the Humanities Core?  
 20 A. Well, when they have passed through the  
 21 similar progression as I indicated for German, i.e.,  
 22 they first undergo the writing internship training.  
 23 Then serve for one or several quarters as a writing  
 24 intern, and then they teach as a lecturer in one of  
 25 the Humanities Core sequences.

1 Q. In general how long are the Humanities Core  
 2 sequences?  
 3 A. Well, they are three quarters.  
 4 Q. Do you regularly teach courses that have  
 5 TAs?  
 6 A. Yes.  
 7 Q. Which ones?  
 8 A. Well, whenever -- when I teach a lecture  
 9 course that has broad appeal and draws sufficient  
 10 enrollments, then I design it in the format that --  
 11 you know, that includes discussion sections, and  
 12 it's based on a more lecture style format. And I  
 13 will do so, in fact, next spring. I'll teach a  
 14 course on the Grimm's Fairy Tales.  
 15 Q. Is the TA evaluated?  
 16 A. Yes.  
 17 Q. How is the TA evaluated?  
 18 A. Well, the TA is evaluated primarily by  
 19 the -- by the instructor on record, i.e., the  
 20 faculty member. As I said, a number of departments  
 21 also have pedagogy programs that include TAs and, as  
 22 I said in the German Department less so because our  
 23 focus is more of a language program and language  
 24 instruction. And there then others would be  
 25 involved, namely the DGS, Director of Graduate

1 Studies, and faculty members who are involved in the  
 2 pedagogy seminars, for instance.  
 3 Q. Are there student evaluations?  
 4 A. And then there is, of course, student  
 5 evaluations, yes. We have a separate student  
 6 evaluation for the -- for TAs or writing -- and  
 7 writing interns.  
 8 Q. Does the CCT staff give feedback to the TA?  
 9 A. Yes. But that is -- is to a certain extent  
 10 optional. Some departments have brought in a CTT to  
 11 really -- to observe and give feedbacks on a regular  
 12 basis, and in some cases it's more an ad hoc basis.  
 13 So, for instance, the Department of Near Eastern  
 14 Languages and Cultures have now been increasingly  
 15 drawing on the CTT for their pedagogy courses and  
 16 for consultations, etcetera.  
 17 Q. Dr. Wild, what happens if a student TA's  
 18 performance is poor in a given term?  
 19 A. Well, I think we try everything to make it  
 20 better. And I can, of course, go into -- I can go  
 21 into detail again. It depends on what kind of  
 22 course we're talking about. But the primary focus  
 23 is to improve the teaching of graduate students, so,  
 24 you know, we will do everything to improve their  
 25 abilities and their performance. And as I said,

1 that can -- you know, it would -- depending again on  
 2 the course, if it's, for instance, in a German  
 3 course where there are stand-alone instructors,  
 4 Cathy Baumann will observe the course and will  
 5 observe their teaching and then sit down with them  
 6 and, you know, plot strategies how to improve the  
 7 teaching, and then observe again and see how those  
 8 strategies, how they were implemented.  
 9 So, it really depends a little bit on the  
 10 context of the format of the course how to address  
 11 that, the performance.  
 12 Q. How common is it for a TA to have very poor  
 13 performance?  
 14 A. I would say rare. It's very rarely that it  
 15 happens.  
 16 Q. So, what happens if Cathy provides this  
 17 additional counseling, like you said, and there is  
 18 other faculty working with the TA and there are  
 19 still troubles with the TA's teaching, and it  
 20 doesn't improve? What happens then?  
 21 A. Well, we -- I mean it would -- continue to  
 22 work on that, and in very rare cases would then a  
 23 TA -- you know, probably what we would do first is  
 24 move the TA in a different type of course, in a  
 25 different -- into a different course format, because

1 sometimes it's the question of the format. But I  
2 can think of a single case in 20 years where the  
3 student just simply had a severe case of stage  
4 fright and could not -- could simply not function in  
5 front of a class of undergraduates, and we just had  
6 to then say, you know, this doesn't make any sense.

7 Q. What ultimately happened with that TA?

8 A. Well, the student graduated successfully.  
9 In fact, the graduate student who was one of my  
10 graduate students, wrote a really truly brilliant  
11 dissertation. You know, sort of that made all the  
12 difference. That student gained confidence, and I  
13 was by then in the Master's position and he taught  
14 as a lecturer in the Core, and I observed him on  
15 various occasions, the problems had sort of  
16 completely sort of disappeared. But as I said, at  
17 that point there was just no -- we could not find a  
18 remedy to that, and in that sense then we decided it  
19 made no sense.

20 Q. So, if a student TA is really struggling  
21 and performing poorly in teaching, will they be  
22 disciplined?

23 A. No.

24 Q. Will they be fired from that position?

25 A. No.

1 Q. Once a student TA is matched with a course,  
2 who advises and mentors the student throughout the  
3 term?

4 (There was a discussion held  
5 off the record.)

6 THE WITNESS: Can you please repeat that  
7 question?

8 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Off the record.

9 (There was a discussion  
10 held off the record.)

11 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record.

12 BY MR. PEARLMAN:

13 Q. We're back on the record, Dr. Wild.

14 How does the Germanic studies -- actually,  
15 we were talking about the situation where the TA has  
16 very poor performance. Would there be any financial  
17 consequences to the TA if they demonstrated very  
18 poor performance?

19 A. No, not that I'm aware. As long as they  
20 are -- you know, it's part of their GAI package and  
21 they are fulfilling GAI points.

22 Q. Would their stipend amount go down?

23 A. I don't handle that part. I don't see  
24 their stipend. That's handled by the division. But  
25 I would imagine not.

1 Q. Let's talk a little bit more about  
2 mentoring. How does the Germanic Studies department  
3 mentor graduate students, Ph.D. students?

4 A. Well, it mentors them in a variety of ways,  
5 both in terms of their own course work, their  
6 research and their teaching. And those different  
7 components are, you know, in different hands. So,  
8 the teaching is primarily overseen by Cathy Baumann,  
9 although when they serve as TAs and we're  
10 increasingly teaching lecture courses in the  
11 Department of Germanic Studies, then the mentoring  
12 is in the hands of the faculty member who teaches  
13 the course. And, of course, when it comes to course  
14 work and dissertation work, it's in the hands of the  
15 faculty.

16 Q. When I say stand-alone course, what does  
17 that mean?

18 A. It means that -- well, you mean stand-alone  
19 instructor? Stand-alone course, it means that a  
20 stand-alone instructor is responsible for almost --  
21 for all or most aspects of the course.

22 Q. What kind of mentoring do those students  
23 receive?

24 A. Well, they -- the students in Germanic  
25 Studies, as I explained, that we have, you know, a

1 very elaborate sort of system of mentoring in place  
2 that starts with a pedagogy seminar, and, of course,  
3 we -- a pedagogy seminar, and it doesn't even end  
4 there, but I would say our third-year working group  
5 and then the observations that happen in the third  
6 year, for the -- for the third-year course that they  
7 teach. That -- and to make sure that, you know,  
8 they, you know, get feedback and are provided, you  
9 know, the resources that they need for teaching a  
10 stand-alone course at the end of their -- in their  
11 fifth year.

12 Q. Does departmental mentoring differ from the  
13 mentoring that's provided in the Core?

14 A. Well, in detail, yes, but not in  
15 philosophy. The Core teaching in the Humanities  
16 Division, the Humanities Core follows a similar  
17 progression, that we, so to say, break it down in  
18 steps. In pedagogical term, scaffolding, that we  
19 sort of scaffold the teaching experience that  
20 graduate students acquire if they are teaching in  
21 the Core.

22 Q. Do teachers in the Core ever meet to  
23 discuss the Core sequence?

24 A. All teachers in a given Core Sequence meet  
25 weekly to discuss teaching in that Core Sequence.

1 Q. Who attends these meetings?  
 2 A. All instructors in a given Core Sequence.  
 3 We have some Core Sequences where the writing  
 4 interns are included in these weekly meetings.

5 Q. So, do graduate students, in fact, attend  
 6 these meetings?

7 A. Well, if private students serve as  
 8 lecturers, then they are part of these meetings,  
 9 yes.

10 Q. What's the goal of these meetings?

11 A. Well, in some sense teaching in the Core  
 12 is -- you know, no one who teaches in the Core is an  
 13 expert on every aspect of the teaching materials, so  
 14 in some sense you could say it's a collective  
 15 learning and teaching experience to teach in the  
 16 Core.

17 So, in some sense, the instructors in the  
 18 Core assist each other teaching in the Core. So,  
 19 that applies to faculty just as much as to those  
 20 less experienced teachers in the Core.

21 So, I taught this winter in the Human Being  
 22 Citizens, and we read Aristotle's Nicomachean  
 23 Ethics, Augustine's Confessions, and Dante's  
 24 Inferno, and I've worked, although I'm in Germanic  
 25 Studies, I've worked on the Confessions but I'm not

1 an experts in Aristotle or Dante, and there is  
 2 always, thankfully, someone in the room who knows  
 3 these texts better and so we basically learn from  
 4 each other. And the graduate students, if they are  
 5 teaching in the Core as lecturers, would be part of  
 6 that community.

7 Q. Are graduate students taught to teach --  
 8 teach during these meetings?

9 A. Yes. Absolutely.

10 Q. How?

11 A. Well, they, you know, it depends again from  
 12 Core Sequence to Core Sequence. But most Core  
 13 sequences really sort of have a very hands-on  
 14 approach to teaching the materials. To -- how to  
 15 teach the materials that are on the syllabus. So,  
 16 for instance, in Media Esthetics, that weekly  
 17 meeting is on Friday and they -- the purpose of the  
 18 meeting is to preview the lesson plans for the  
 19 sessions on the next week. And there is always one  
 20 instructor who is responsible for presenting their  
 21 lesson plan for next week, for the next week. And  
 22 that lesson plan is then discussed. Other  
 23 instructors chime in and suggest, you know,  
 24 alternative ways of doing, you know, often using  
 25 different examples. You know, essay on photography

1 they might say, I have my students take iPhone  
 2 photos, and we then discuss that. Another  
 3 instructor prefers to use early black-and-white  
 4 photography, as an example. And so, you know,  
 5 the -- they -- the graduate students teaching within  
 6 the Core would, you know, profit immensely really  
 7 along with everyone else from participating in these  
 8 meetings, and graduate students then will also down  
 9 the line later in the quarter be asked to present  
 10 their own lesson plans and would get feedback on the  
 11 lesson plans that they presented on the two sessions  
 12 that -- the following week.

13 Q. Are student teachers ever given feedback on  
 14 their actual teaching?

15 A. Yes. Every Core coordinator or Core chair,  
 16 we have every Core Sequence of the Core chair or  
 17 Core coordinator, mostly a faculty member and  
 18 sometimes it's a lecturer who sort of coordinates  
 19 all aspects of the Core. Coordinates, for instance,  
 20 the redesign of the syllabus and orders the  
 21 materials, the readings and things like that.

22 Part of the duties of that Core chair is to  
 23 observe all new teachers in the Core, and in  
 24 particular graduate students. So, the primary  
 25 mentor of graduate students teaching the Core are

1 the Core chairs. And so they would observe the a  
 2 class or classes taught by graduate students and  
 3 then sit down with the graduate student and discuss  
 4 their performance. I served as Core chair of Core  
 5 Sequence that we have redesigned. I think it was  
 6 called Greek Thon Literature, and I actually forgot.  
 7 Listed into the Greece and Rome, Text, Traditions  
 8 and Transformations. And there I regularly would  
 9 observe the teaching the teaching of the graduate  
 10 students in the Core and then sit down with them.  
 11 And I usually also would write a letter of  
 12 recommendation for their dossier because, you know,  
 13 I could speak directly there, their teaching  
 14 contrast to the dissertation advisor who primarily  
 15 focused on their dissertation work, so I would write  
 16 a letter focusing exclusively on the teaching.

17 Q. Is there other training that student  
 18 teachers in the Core receive?

19 A. Well, they -- as I mentioned, they start  
 20 out as writing interns They receive the writing  
 21 intern training. They have had at least one quarter  
 22 if not more quarter watching another instructor in  
 23 the Core and more experienced instructor in the Core  
 24 teach the Core, that Core section. And then we have  
 25 now, and this is only about -- we have now an

1 orientation workshop of the beginning of the year  
2 for all new teachers and returning teachers in the  
3 Core that is jointly organized by the Collegiate  
4 Master's of Social Science and the Humanities and  
5 the CTT for, as I said, incoming and returning Core  
6 teachers.

7 Q. Why does the University of Chicago provide  
8 all this training?

9 A. Well, to ensure that, you know, graduate  
10 students -- well, just in general, that instructors  
11 in the Core are as well prepared as possible, and in  
12 respect to graduate students, that they are as  
13 successful in teaching in the core, and thereby then  
14 of course, you know, as teachers, we can -- we can  
15 provide.

16 Q. Let's talk about the writing program. Are  
17 you familiar with the writing program at the  
18 college?

19 A. I am.

20 Q. And what is the writing program with  
21 respect to graduate students?

22 A. Well, the writing program has sort of two  
23 aspects. On the one hand it actually directly helps  
24 graduate students with their own writing so they can  
25 seek help with their own writing if need be, but

1 those positions, or do Master's students fill them  
2 as well?

3 A. To my knowledge, only Ph.D. students.

4 Q. What's a writing tutor?

5 A. A writing tutor provides one-on-one  
6 instruction or consultation to other students,  
7 primarily, of course, undergraduates that come in to  
8 get advice and feedback on their paper.

9 Q. Do you have any writing tutors in your  
10 department?

11 A. Again, we rarely, in part because we  
12 have -- our students are trained to become language  
13 teachers, and so that's what they do while they are  
14 in our department. But we have occasionally  
15 students who, you know, seek out that additional  
16 qualification and undergo training in the writing  
17 program.

18 Q. What's a writing intern?

19 A. A writing intern is basically a TA within  
20 the Core, i.e., is affiliated -- every writing  
21 intern is affiliated with a section in the  
22 Humanities, in the Humanities Core Sequence and is  
23 responsible for, to put it somewhat crudely, the  
24 writing mechanics that helps students with the  
25 writing mechanics and works alongside the

1 also in the -- the writing program provides the  
2 training for graduate students to become teachers of  
3 writing. So, they have various seminars and  
4 training opportunities for graduate students to  
5 become teachers of writing.

6 Q. Does the program train writing interns?

7 A. It trains writing interns, writing lectures  
8 and writing tutors.

9 Q. What's the benefit to the graduate students  
10 participating in the writing program?

11 A. Well, the benefit is twofold. On the one  
12 hand, graduate students become teachers of writing,  
13 and in the Humanities that is essential for their  
14 success. As, you know, future faculty and future  
15 teachers of writing. But it's also important  
16 insofar as generally knowing how to teach writing  
17 makes you a better writer, and so we also see the  
18 direct benefit of the writing internship training or  
19 the writing tutor training, writing lector training  
20 for their own work.

21 Q. I'm sorry. You said writing tutor, writing  
22 intern and writing --

23 A. Lector.

24 Q. With respect to those three positions that  
25 you just identified, do only Ph.D. students fill

1 instructor.

2 Q. Do you have any in your department?

3 A. Again, relatively rarely, but it does  
4 happen because our students increasingly realize  
5 that they are not only going to teach language, they  
6 are also going to teach courses that require the  
7 teaching of writing, so they seek that additional  
8 opportunity. But again, as I detailed, we have a  
9 relatively elaborate program and often they graduate  
10 by the time they get to that point.

11 Q. What's a lector in writing?

12 A. Writing lector is -- is a teacher of small  
13 writing seminars within the so-called Little Red  
14 School House which is, so to say, the physical place  
15 in which the writing program is housed. And so it's  
16 similar to a preceptor, so to say. They teach  
17 writing to a small group of students where the  
18 students can workshop their writing.

19 Q. Do you have any in your department?

20 A. Again, relatively rarely, for the  
21 aforementioned reasons.

22 Q. How does a graduate student become a lector  
23 in writing?

24 A. Well, they have to apply for the writing  
25 internship training. They have to submit a writing

1 sample. And if the director of the writing  
2 internship training, the associate director of the  
3 writing program, Kathy Cochran, deems them suitable,  
4 i.e., that their writing sample passes muster, they  
5 undergo the writing intern training, and then are  
6 assigned a particular section in the Humanities  
7 Core.

8 Q. So, to teach writing, does a graduate  
9 student need to undergo any type of training?

10 A. Yes. The writing internship. The  
11 writing -- well, there is various, so depending on  
12 whether they serve as a writing intern or serve as a  
13 writing -- as a lector, they undergo a different  
14 kind of training. I don't know the title of the  
15 seminars, but there is two types of seminars. One  
16 qualifies students to serve or teach as writing  
17 lectors as well as interns, and one, I think, only  
18 as interns and tutors but not as lectors.

19 Q. How long do these training programs last?

20 A. If they are doing the academic year, a  
21 whole quarter, and if they are in the summer then  
22 slightly shorter, and I think just eight weeks or  
23 something like that.

24 Q. Now, during the appointment of a graduate  
25 student whose appointed to a writing position, are

1 it may not be a specific -- or a skill that is  
2 specific to a particular discipline. It defines the  
3 Humanities and also to a certain extent Social  
4 Sciences, but I think particularly the Humanities  
5 generally.

6 The Humanities are the area where writing  
7 is taught, so, for instance, in our case we don't  
8 have an English Composition requirement. In our  
9 case the Humanities Core Sequence fulfills the  
10 college writing requirement, so you can see that  
11 Humanities and writing are, so to say, aligned. And  
12 so in that sense that's how we feel, it's defining  
13 of a thorough and broad education in the Humanities  
14 and for a Ph.D. in Humanities, or from the  
15 Humanities Division.

16 Q. Let's shift gears for a moment and talk  
17 about Master's students. Are there any differences  
18 you're aware of between funding for Master's  
19 students and Ph.D. students?

20 A. Well, Master's students don't get funded.  
21 Occasionally they will get a tuition remission or  
22 partial tuition remission, but even that is a rare  
23 case.

24 Q. Is there an academic requirement for  
25 Master's students to teach?

1 they mentored and advised during the course of that  
2 appointment?

3 A. Well, yes, and in the case of in the Core  
4 they would be advised by the faculty teaching the  
5 Core section. In the writing program itself, it  
6 would be Kathy Cochran who provides that kind of  
7 mentorship. In fact, she always provides that kind  
8 of mentorship. She's the, so to say, the resident  
9 expert on writing pedagogy.

10 Q. Does participation in the writing program  
11 count toward a graduate student's teaching points?

12 A. Participation in the -- serving as a  
13 writing intern certainly does. Participation in the  
14 writing program I -- I don't know.

15 Q. Now, earlier --

16 A. I mean the writing -- I'm sorry. Writing  
17 internship training, that I don't know.

18 Q. Earlier you mentioned how graduate students  
19 need to take on teaching opportunities within their  
20 own area of study. Does that align with the ability  
21 to earn credit by teaching writing?

22 A. Well, I think that writing is a general  
23 skill. I think that no graduate, no Ph.D. of the  
24 Humanities Division should leave the Humanities  
25 Division without being able to teach writing. So,

1 A. No. Not that I'm aware of.

2 Q. Do Master's students teach?

3 A. Again, we have a number of programs, and I  
4 can't -- I'm not able to, you know, say that they  
5 never teach, but generally I don't think that they  
6 teach.

7 Q. Do Master's students take the CCT course?

8 A. Most Master's programs are too short to  
9 allow for that kind of additional training, so I  
10 would say probably not.

11 Q. Does the university cover healthcare  
12 premiums for Master's students?

13 A. No.

14 Q. In your opinion, when a student is acting  
15 as a TA, are they acting as an employee or a  
16 student?

17 MS. AUERBACH: Objection.

18 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm not sure what --  
19 why we need his opinion on it.

20 MR. PEARLMAN: I think his answer would  
21 bear on the question here of whether and to what  
22 extent this is distinguishable from Columbia. It  
23 could show whether or not there is an economic  
24 relationship. It could show whether or not there is  
25 control. It could show whether or not --

1 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I don't know that it  
 2 would show that. It's still his opinion. He  
 3 testified about what benefit he believes the  
 4 students glean from -- you know, in these teaching  
 5 positions. He testified about the relationship  
 6 between the advisors and the students. You know,  
 7 whether or not he personally would consider them  
 8 employees, I don't know that that's relevant. Maybe  
 9 there is -- maybe I'm misunderstanding and you're  
 10 trying to get to something else.  
 11 MR. PEARLMAN: I understand your position,  
 12 and we'll tender the witness at this point.  
 13 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So, you want to go  
 14 off the record?  
 15 MS. AUERBACH: Yes. We should go off the  
 16 record.  
 17 (There was a discussion  
 18 held off the record.)  
 19 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record.  
 20 So, in an off-the-record discussion the  
 21 parties determined that we would not be able to  
 22 finish with the witness' cross and redirect in the  
 23 remaining time on this day, so we will adjourn for  
 24 the day and resume proceedings Monday morning at  
 25 9:00 a.m.

1 CERTIFICATION  
 2 This is to certify that the attached  
 3 proceedings before the National Labor Relations  
 4 Board (NLRB), Region 13, in the matter of UNIVERSITY  
 5 OF CHICAGO and GRADUATE STUDENTS UNITED, Case  
 6 13-RC-198325, at Chicago, Illinois, on May 19, 2017,  
 7 was held according to the record, and that this is  
 8 the original, complete, and true and accurate  
 9 transcript that has been given compared to the  
 10 recording, at the hearing, that the exhibits are  
 11 complete and no exhibits received in evidence or in  
 12 the rejected exhibit files are missing.  
 13  
 14  
 15  
 16 Jeanine Watkins, CSR  
 17 Licence 084-001629  
 18  
 19  
 20  
 21  
 22  
 23  
 24  
 25

1 Off the record.  
 2 (Hearing adjourned at 4:46 p.m.)  
 3  
 4  
 5  
 6  
 7  
 8  
 9  
 10  
 11  
 12  
 13  
 14  
 15  
 16  
 17  
 18  
 19  
 20  
 21  
 22  
 23  
 24  
 25

<b>A</b>				
<b>abhor</b> 156:3	222:24	251:7 264:5	<b>advised</b> 132:20	319:9 332:21
<b>abilities</b> 229:20	<b>accumulate</b> 150:23	266:25	351:1,4	353:9
336:25	<b>accumulated</b>	<b>added</b> 229:25	<b>advisees</b> 164:16,18	<b>allowed</b> 154:12
<b>ability</b> 127:14	134:12 227:14	289:7	226:19,20	211:8,21,24
351:20	<b>accuracy</b> 271:6	<b>addition</b> 122:22	<b>advises</b> 339:2	225:22 231:18
<b>able</b> 127:25 131:11	<b>accurate</b> 116:11	<b>additional</b> 123:15	<b>advisor</b> 140:6	281:9
134:24 135:4,6	133:6 206:23	130:24 131:7	158:23 169:3	<b>alongside</b> 296:20
136:22 162:10	208:1 212:13	216:19 231:13	282:15 283:3	300:15 348:25
165:15 230:5	296:17 297:6	236:1 329:23	328:21 345:14	<b>alphabetical</b>
271:16 283:17	307:19 324:18,20	330:11 337:17	<b>advisors</b> 314:19	243:18
307:17 327:9	324:24,25 325:5,6	348:15 349:7	354:6	<b>alternates</b> 253:11
351:25 353:4	356:8	353:9	<b>advisory</b> 292:22	<b>alternative</b> 343:24
354:21	<b>accurately</b> 134:5	<b>address</b> 199:16	<b>aesthetics</b> 334:6	<b>altitude</b> 135:21
<b>aboveentitled</b>	228:24	257:1 337:10	<b>affect</b> 280:4	<b>ambiguity</b> 308:1
106:12	<b>achieve</b> 141:25	<b>adds</b> 187:12	<b>affiliated</b> 348:20,21	<b>america</b> 106:1
<b>absolute</b> 222:8,10	190:18 229:22	<b>adequate</b> 140:11	<b>aforementioned</b>	<b>american</b> 162:14
<b>absolutely</b> 121:4	230:5,10,11	<b>adequately</b> 228:24	349:21	190:10 195:2
126:21 135:11	<b>achieved</b> 206:3,4	328:1	<b>afraid</b> 142:19	259:14,14
145:1 155:9	206:11	<b>adjourn</b> 354:23	<b>african</b> 190:10	<b>amount</b> 123:6
158:24 168:16	<b>achieving</b> 225:1	<b>adjourned</b> 355:2	259:16	130:9 162:7 203:4
170:25 173:16	268:21	<b>adjournment</b> 110:3	<b>afternoon</b> 110:3	238:1 250:14
196:22 198:6	<b>acquire</b> 136:5	<b>administered</b>	286:3	261:10 321:21
221:19,25 232:13	157:14 219:2	261:23	<b>ago</b> 170:25 181:9	339:22
246:5 260:9,24	269:21 307:12,17	<b>administers</b> 317:14	182:7 200:6,6	<b>amounts</b> 125:9
343:9	321:22 341:20	<b>administrative</b>	241:4 258:10	170:11
<b>academic</b> 136:16	<b>acquired</b> 139:10	184:15 223:23	262:8,10,12 293:8	<b>analogy</b> 154:16
136:19 164:13	158:5 326:4	317:2,3	<b>agree</b> 128:15 189:5	219:4
179:12 185:11,17	<b>acquiring</b> 269:13	<b>administrator</b>	318:15	<b>ancient</b> 190:11
263:10 293:17,20	<b>acquisition</b> 311:14	242:2 317:4,9	<b>agreed</b> 189:23	<b>andress</b> 144:5
293:24 294:6	314:1 328:8	<b>administrators</b>	<b>agreedupon</b> 191:9	<b>anecdotally</b> 172:24
303:9 307:18	<b>acronym</b> 274:5	317:15	<b>agreement</b> 143:25	<b>anecdote</b> 147:17
314:23 317:6	<b>acronyms</b> 122:16	<b>admission</b> 116:23	<b>agrees</b> 195:5	202:8
321:11 324:22	<b>acted</b> 173:11	126:5 165:17	<b>ahead</b> 148:18 296:7	<b>animating</b> 181:11
350:20 352:24	<b>acting</b> 207:2	176:20 268:23	<b>aid</b> 120:19 121:1,10	<b>annually</b> 310:12
<b>academics</b> 145:3	353:14,15	<b>admissions</b> 233:17	122:15 128:11	<b>anointment</b> 263:1
<b>accept</b> 161:11	<b>action</b> 255:25	<b>admit</b> 121:15	186:14,15,21,22	<b>answer</b> 124:24
<b>acceptable</b> 214:9	256:3	<b>admitted</b> 121:13	186:24	142:18,20,21
<b>accompany</b> 304:15	<b>actions</b> 209:4,8	<b>advance</b> 306:20,21	<b>aimed</b> 127:10	154:5 160:2,10,11
<b>accomplished</b>	<b>activity</b> 132:7,8	<b>advanced</b> 180:2	<b>align</b> 351:20	168:16 176:6
140:4	147:20 161:15	181:3,19 184:6,10	<b>aligned</b> 352:11	189:12 207:22
<b>account</b> 173:24	<b>actual</b> 229:13	184:11 246:18	<b>alive</b> 149:12	208:5 211:1,2,9
174:1 222:17	276:2 344:14	271:20 312:5,16	<b>allan</b> 107:4	211:16,22,23
232:24 263:25	<b>actualize</b> 127:25	313:4	<b>allocate</b> 132:12	214:9 216:9 217:1
<b>accounted</b> 222:8	160:16	<b>advantage</b> 304:3	<b>allocation</b> 222:23	218:9 228:15
263:16	<b>ad</b> 336:12	<b>adverse</b> 323:15	<b>allow</b> 155:10,11	229:14 231:19
<b>accounting</b> 184:13	<b>add</b> 128:24 129:16	<b>advice</b> 280:15	157:6 168:22	239:4 251:4,6,17
	132:23 224:20	348:8	170:4,8 222:18	251:18 271:5

273:23 277:18 291:10 299:13 333:5 353:20 <b>answered</b> 174:6 193:3,5 239:3 245:7 258:19 279:3 299:19 300:9 318:14 <b>answering</b> 211:20 214:1 239:15 <b>answers</b> 194:25 211:4,6,25 215:17 253:25 <b>anthropological</b> 118:14 <b>anthropologists</b> 118:17 <b>anthropology</b> 112:9 <b>anybody</b> 284:4 <b>anymore</b> 262:15 <b>anyway</b> 207:3 <b>apart</b> 182:1 247:22 <b>apartments</b> 319:8 <b>apologize</b> 261:7 295:24 324:1,15 <b>appeal</b> 335:9 <b>appearance</b> 285:5 <b>applicant</b> 261:1 <b>applicants</b> 188:21 265:25 268:5 <b>application</b> 198:15 198:16 199:5 261:4 283:12 <b>applied</b> 145:21 <b>applies</b> 158:8 220:15 222:4 235:23 236:15 342:19 <b>apply</b> 128:4 198:9 198:13,17,19,20 198:21 199:11 220:16 237:14 239:13 277:10 349:24 <b>applying</b> 220:17 221:2,3 297:24	<b>appoint</b> 291:25 <b>appointed</b> 117:18 118:2 171:11 233:25 234:12 264:22 276:3 282:1,2 308:24 310:16 317:20 327:10 329:17,25 331:2 350:25 <b>appointee</b> 317:7 <b>appointing</b> 310:10 <b>appointment</b> 261:5 262:25 263:5 264:23 276:6,16 289:13,15 290:10 290:18 309:23 315:8 317:1 320:7 320:14 350:24 351:2 <b>appointments</b> 165:3 227:3 234:10 261:20 289:12,17 290:14 291:1,13,18,19,20 298:3 310:4 312:9 314:12 317:25 326:5 <b>appoints</b> 262:20 <b>appreciate</b> 285:14 <b>approach</b> 118:15 139:19 313:16 328:2 330:7 343:14 <b>approaching</b> 197:12 <b>appropriate</b> 237:2 <b>approval</b> 225:22 228:3 320:3 <b>approve</b> 310:14 320:6 <b>approved</b> 226:3 <b>approves</b> 319:7 320:15 <b>approximately</b> 253:15 277:14 <b>arabic</b> 203:19 <b>archival</b> 180:19	<b>area</b> 115:7,8 169:13 183:25 224:13 237:23 239:1 260:8,10 309:10 325:24 351:20 352:6 <b>areas</b> 131:15 189:2 275:3 333:6 <b>arendt</b> 113:2 <b>arent</b> 162:13 170:2 298:15 <b>argue</b> 249:6 <b>arguing</b> 181:15 239:6 249:5 <b>argument</b> 143:11 143:12,24 181:17 248:20 278:13 <b>arises</b> 207:2 <b>arising</b> 172:22 <b>aristotle</b> 343:1 <b>aristotles</b> 342:22 <b>arrangement</b> 241:22 255:22 <b>arrive</b> 155:25 298:22 <b>art</b> 113:8 114:11 142:8 156:19 183:8 <b>article</b> 241:15 242:24 243:1,8,9 243:13 244:5,9 <b>articles</b> 178:11,24 240:19,22 241:3 242:9 244:1 245:24 <b>arts</b> 116:17,20 128:1 137:12 162:13 <b>asia</b> 190:11 <b>asian</b> 325:25 <b>aside</b> 172:18 185:4 266:3 272:25 310:18 333:1 <b>asked</b> 144:10 160:12,19 164:25 170:24 171:6 185:19 193:3	200:9 205:22 207:24 208:2,4 215:15 216:8,18 216:22 226:16 230:19 231:15 239:2 240:20 248:23 272:23 273:17,24 274:9 279:3 284:3 300:9 318:13 344:9 <b>asking</b> 125:18 142:9 146:14 159:17,19 193:12 207:19,23 212:11 214:6 216:15 229:22 234:21 239:9 245:9,10 251:13 257:9 264:21 277:19 279:8 293:19 <b>asks</b> 164:3 199:19 231:7 <b>aspect</b> 142:4,5 171:25 173:8 342:13 <b>aspects</b> 172:18 173:9 292:12,16 294:3 326:18 327:1 332:14 340:21 344:19 346:23 <b>aspire</b> 127:23 278:23 <b>assess</b> 267:18 <b>assign</b> 139:8 160:5 183:15 298:19,20 301:2 <b>assigned</b> 135:23 178:6 198:11,12 200:1 255:25 276:19 317:18 318:12 320:8 350:6 <b>assigning</b> 318:20 <b>assignment</b> 227:7 309:20 318:22 <b>assignments</b>	134:18 161:11 167:17 231:13 279:22 314:16 316:10 333:3 <b>assist</b> 304:19 330:24 342:18 <b>assistant</b> 139:1 141:20,21 142:2 148:7 152:25 174:16 177:23,24 178:9 180:4,5,23 184:20 185:10,12 197:23 230:24 231:11,17 235:22 240:14,15 244:13 254:25 263:8,10 264:7 265:16 270:3 273:3 274:1 276:14,16 287:23 288:13 296:10 297:17,19,20,23 329:20,21 331:22 332:1,19 <b>assistants</b> 130:13 147:3 155:15 177:11,13,19 185:1 198:7 200:21 201:12,23 202:10 203:15,22 215:11 232:8 235:18 236:7 237:6 254:5 272:5 297:14 326:10 327:14,15 330:1,2 330:8,11 <b>assistantship</b> 291:7 <b>assistantships</b> 291:4,12 326:8,8 <b>assisted</b> 179:9 254:9 263:8 <b>assisting</b> 300:1 <b>associate</b> 112:7 286:14,20 287:14 287:24 288:14 350:2 <b>associated</b> 113:4 <b>assume</b> 223:24
---	--	--	---	--

<b>assuming</b> 225:24 226:2	268:25 273:15 274:6 279:4 283:7	282:22 317:17 339:13	252:20 263:24 264:9 265:14	<b>biweekly</b> 184:2 251:22
<b>attached</b> 356:2	283:21 284:16	<b>background</b> 113:10 287:6	270:16 274:2 276:5 318:13	<b>blackandwhite</b> 344:3
<b>attend</b> 148:12 186:11,21 280:12 284:5 330:23 342:5	299:10 300:8 307:21 318:13 353:17 354:15	<b>bad</b> 175:13 256:4,9	322:13 323:14 330:9	<b>bloch</b> 107:10
<b>attendance</b> 129:7 129:12	<b>augustines</b> 342:23	<b>badly</b> 232:1	<b>believes</b> 321:21,25 354:3	<b>board</b> 106:1 183:15 292:23 356:4
<b>attended</b> 196:15	<b>authenticated</b> 166:18,19	<b>baker</b> 181:10	<b>bellow</b> 113:6	<b>boasting</b> 128:1,3
<b>attending</b> 263:2	<b>authorizes</b> 319:7	<b>balan</b> 178:7	<b>benefit</b> 179:13,14 203:10 244:15,23	<b>boca</b> 107:7
<b>attends</b> 342:1	<b>authors</b> 243:14	<b>balance</b> 217:8,13 308:12 314:25 323:17,22	245:5,18,20,25 299:25 303:4 306:1 316:19,20 347:9,11,18 354:3	<b>bold</b> 227:4
<b>attention</b> 116:2 189:19 233:3 266:16,17 268:7 272:21 275:24	<b>automatically</b> 198:11	<b>baltimore</b> 114:2	<b>benefitted</b> 244:14 244:20	<b>book</b> 142:24 177:24 178:9,11 178:14 179:10 192:2 193:9 240:14,23 241:17 244:21 245:13,15 245:17 263:9 328:5
<b>attract</b> 123:12 187:3,6,7,20 189:2	<b>autonomous</b> 141:3 327:7	<b>based</b> 293:25 294:24 331:16 335:12	<b>bennett</b> 107:10	<b>bookkeeping</b> 160:4 226:8
<b>attracted</b> 255:4	<b>autonomously</b> 327:7	<b>basic</b> 132:9 135:11 137:3,6 138:14 169:25	<b>best</b> 113:14 158:17 170:15 172:9 177:10 181:7 211:21 212:2 217:11 219:2 241:7 265:4 315:24 320:1 323:16	<b>books</b> 129:13 152:14
<b>attributed</b> 159:9	<b>autonomy</b> 271:16 313:5 323:4	<b>basically</b> 111:12 152:4 183:3 199:17 272:6 304:18 306:9 313:13 343:3 348:19	<b>better</b> 137:11 171:21 182:3 196:9 197:2,3,23 197:25 219:8 220:5,5 231:25 249:5 256:16 262:20 336:20 343:3 347:17	<b>born</b> 144:19
<b>audience</b> 178:8 255:8	<b>available</b> 123:15 168:21 173:24 326:6	<b>basis</b> 184:2 328:13 336:12,12	<b>beyond</b> 140:21 174:16,20 175:2,4 193:23 224:16,17 226:10,12,17 230:1 232:13,15 232:15 237:11	<b>borrowed</b> 141:2
<b>auerbach</b> 107:10 107:11 108:5,7,10 116:25 126:6 130:7,15 160:20 166:2,6,10,20 176:22 186:1,4,19 193:2,4,14 195:17 199:3 200:25 205:15 206:9 207:7,23 209:13 210:17 211:3,11 211:24 212:3,11 212:12 214:11 216:3,6,15,21 218:14 221:6 223:19 226:15 229:3 230:18 231:15 232:3 234:22 235:4,12 235:14 238:25 239:4,8 240:2 243:5 245:8 248:22 249:13,19 251:5 252:3	<b>avenue</b> 107:12	<b>baumann</b> 313:10 314:3,6 315:22 318:2 328:7,11 337:4 340:8	<b>bear</b> 253:19 353:21	<b>bottom</b> 116:1 125:5 133:21 176:16
<b>average</b> 323:24	<b>avoid</b> 156:3 307:25	<b>bears</b> 299:2	<b>beauty</b> 114:7	<b>branch</b> 118:25
<b>awarded</b> 232:9,19	<b>aware</b> 159:23 177:3 201:19 207:13 214:6,7 222:13 224:1 228:10 339:19 352:18 353:1	<b>becoming</b> 313:7	<b>became</b> 111:16 259:1	<b>brand</b> 141:20
<b>awareness</b> 128:22	<b>awfully</b> 329:3	<b>began</b> 111:16 259:1	<b>beginning</b> 121:10 145:25 146:6 212:5 240:16,25 241:1 306:14 346:1	<b>break</b> 149:17 150:11 186:2 234:18 235:7,9,9 252:6 256:14 269:22 341:17
	<b>B</b>	<b>began</b> 111:16 259:1	<b>bill</b> 195:4	<b>breaking</b> 234:16
	<b>b</b> 229:19	<b>beginning</b> 121:10 145:25 146:6 212:5 240:16,25 241:1 306:14 346:1	<b>biological</b> 120:11	<b>brevity</b> 333:11
	<b>ba</b> 113:16 328:16 328:21 329:12	<b>behalf</b> 107:2,9	<b>bit</b> 135:16 152:18 154:23 258:19 302:6 326:22 337:9 340:1	<b>brief</b> 131:4
	<b>back</b> 114:14 116:3 121:22 122:18 128:10 129:5 135:14 137:24 139:22 171:14 192:23 219:4 252:14 255:21 258:12 274:18	<b>behavior</b> 256:1	<b>bits</b> 256:15	<b>briefly</b> 113:9,11 130:24 289:1
		<b>beliefs</b> 321:25		<b>brilliant</b> 307:14 338:10
		<b>believe</b> 110:3 122:8 124:12 185:20 187:10 214:18 222:22 223:1		<b>bring</b> 112:25,25 138:17 183:8 238:2 280:18,19 306:19
				<b>bringing</b> 282:5
				<b>brings</b> 151:4
				<b>broad</b> 142:13 294:1

295:15 309:1,19 321:7 333:4 335:9 352:13 <b>broader</b> 260:13 301:22 <b>broadest</b> 310:18 <b>brought</b> 336:10 <b>budget</b> 291:3,6 310:10,13,14 321:4 <b>building</b> 134:22 180:8,17,21 184:24 245:22 <b>bureaucratic</b> 317:17 <b>butts</b> 253:1	<b>cant</b> 119:19 136:13 155:21 160:9 172:3,15 173:4,14 180:20 200:6,15 214:19 222:2 225:7 238:17 258:8 260:24 304:10 309:2 320:2 326:12 333:5 353:4 <b>cap</b> 221:21 222:4,9 222:10,14 264:3 <b>capped</b> 330:18 <b>cards</b> 241:25 242:1 <b>care</b> 145:2 <b>career</b> 127:23 158:25 164:1 214:23 302:4 <b>carolina</b> 287:25 <b>carries</b> 238:1 <b>carry</b> 177:15 237:12 247:18 <b>carve</b> 256:12 <b>case</b> 106:6 112:8 137:5 168:21 171:19 173:16 179:1 180:12 203:8 212:23 213:5 215:13 219:9 223:24 232:13 236:20 245:2 246:5 250:23 252:21 255:17 258:17 260:25 261:5,22 274:20 282:15 315:22 318:21 330:18 338:2,3 351:3 352:7,9,23 356:5 <b>cases</b> 124:5,7 169:2 222:15 231:21 233:9 250:18 260:22,23 265:19 267:6 319:8 336:12 337:22 <b>catalog</b> 193:16	<b>catching</b> 144:18 <b>categories</b> 312:20 <b>category</b> 191:10 <b>cathy</b> 313:10 314:3 314:6,17 315:22 317:5 318:2 328:7 328:11 337:4,16 340:8 <b>causes</b> 322:11 <b>cct</b> 292:4,10,20,23 292:24 293:4,6,10 302:12 305:15,18 305:19,23 308:7 336:8 353:7 <b>center</b> 111:22 137:7 190:13 292:3,8,11 314:9 318:6 <b>century</b> 180:18 289:5,7 <b>certain</b> 121:12 135:20,22 159:23 160:5 189:2,25 191:23 194:21 223:1 237:11 241:20 294:23 298:23 312:8,19 321:13,24 336:9 352:3 <b>certainly</b> 155:19 217:16 222:3 227:17 233:14 236:20 244:15 265:3 273:22 275:13 277:8 294:8 298:17 302:22 304:11 351:13 <b>certainty</b> 215:5 <b>certificate</b> 162:20 <b>certification</b> 356:1 <b>certify</b> 356:2 <b>cervone</b> 107:10 <b>chair</b> 233:7 344:15 344:16,22 345:4 <b>chairs</b> 345:1 <b>chance</b> 115:20	125:1 140:8 162:12 163:1,2 168:2 182:1 227:23,24 331:7 <b>change</b> 147:7 183:1 250:18 <b>changed</b> 140:13 <b>changes</b> 118:23 120:5 190:17 <b>changing</b> 190:15 <b>channing</b> 107:11 <b>chapel</b> 287:25 <b>chapter</b> 325:14,15 <b>characterization</b> 296:17 <b>characterize</b> 297:6 307:19 <b>characterizes</b> 212:10 228:24 <b>characterizing</b> 296:16 <b>charge</b> 114:23,24 114:25 150:19 151:7 187:17 203:1 230:7 266:14 276:19 279:9,17,20 280:9 282:6 283:23 284:5 <b>charged</b> 125:20 <b>chart</b> 165:22 324:21 <b>check</b> 241:25 <b>chicago</b> 106:4,15 107:12 110:9,24 111:1,3,4 113:22 114:6 117:16,25 125:12 126:24,25 130:1 155:14,20 159:5,15,25 162:16 164:11 176:14 178:1,6 181:25 182:5 186:12 187:5 189:17 201:15 220:1,18,24 221:2 247:8 254:13,17	266:1,7 285:9 286:5,7,10,24 287:11 288:16 289:3 292:3,8 295:14 314:9 318:6 346:7 356:5 356:6 <b>chicagos</b> 115:24 132:24 <b>chime</b> 343:23 <b>chinese</b> 330:5 <b>choice</b> 200:12,14 <b>choices</b> 307:10,12 <b>choose</b> 280:2 <b>chooses</b> 155:6 <b>chose</b> 147:6,6,7 <b>christina</b> 106:13 <b>christopher</b> 108:12 285:13,21,22,23 <b>circulate</b> 181:25 <b>circumstance</b> 306:4 <b>circumstances</b> 138:4 172:14 226:23 282:3 316:18 <b>cited</b> 241:8 <b>cites</b> 257:23 <b>citizen</b> 333:25 <b>citizens</b> 342:22 <b>civ</b> 144:5 151:6,14 152:3,11,19,23,24 152:25 153:22 173:20 190:15,16 190:16 200:4 204:2 213:8,19 270:7 278:4 284:9 <b>civilization</b> 151:15 190:2,3,9,10,10 190:11,21 191:12 260:5 <b>civs</b> 138:13 149:1 150:10,10,24,25 151:5 153:18 173:18 194:5 195:2 198:8,23 201:1,24 254:23
<b>C</b>				
<b>c</b> 107:1 260:15 <b>ca</b> 269:23 270:2,4 273:25,25 274:2 <b>calendar</b> 183:13 <b>call</b> 110:4,7 123:16 123:17 127:3 133:21 141:21 159:7,7 160:4 233:11 244:19 262:2 270:12,13 275:19 281:19 284:11 285:10 317:10 325:12 <b>called</b> 112:21 117:17,24 118:1 124:21 125:5 131:13 138:13 151:8 178:8,9 182:19 189:20 211:23 245:21 261:25 275:16,18 278:12 312:1,4 345:6 <b>calling</b> 278:14 282:4 <b>calls</b> 110:10 153:3 285:3,13 <b>cambridge</b> 289:8 <b>camera</b> 280:19				

254:23 257:21	331:5 345:2	237:21 239:13	156:17 158:10	194:18
258:22 259:9,14	<b>classics</b> 138:22	243:22,23	172:25 219:16	<b>community</b> 173:20
259:16,16 260:6	139:12 149:6	<b>collaborator</b>	236:14 259:5	173:23 183:20
261:23 265:20	255:16 258:9	202:25	263:3,5 293:20	184:1,25 328:5
278:7	259:5	<b>colleague</b> 304:11	300:23 321:3	343:6
<b>claim</b> 146:21	<b>classification</b>	<b>colleagues</b> 147:14	325:10 328:25	<b>comparative</b>
<b>clarification</b>	177:18	235:20 264:12	348:7	117:25 118:6,12
151:14	<b>classified</b> 177:7,11	267:17,25	<b>comes</b> 131:6	<b>compare</b> 120:7
<b>clarifies</b> 266:23	177:12	<b>collective</b> 245:21	147:24 213:3	146:4
<b>clarify</b> 220:22	<b>classifying</b> 180:7	329:2,4 342:14	231:4 236:9 237:6	<b>compared</b> 127:6
<b>clarifying</b> 122:12	<b>classroom</b> 140:15	<b>college</b> 111:24	257:5 292:24	156:21 261:10
225:23 279:6	142:8,11 170:18	114:24 127:5	293:2 305:23	356:9
316:12	181:14 307:16	186:6,6,8 198:22	320:25 321:4	<b>comparison</b> 146:8
<b>class</b> 119:21 131:17	328:3 330:10	213:24 217:16	340:13	<b>compensate</b> 233:15
131:20,20,25	<b>classrooms</b> 317:18	233:6,6,8 252:24	<b>coming</b> 122:10	<b>compensated</b> 159:4
136:3 139:5	<b>clc</b> 314:9 318:6	253:4,16,18	128:22 148:22	159:7 250:7
148:12,21 173:5	<b>clear</b> 212:21	258:24 259:2	149:10 166:21	263:25
189:16 190:22,23	215:20 258:20	261:24 266:13,14	170:6 174:19	<b>compensation</b>
192:7 195:12	269:9 299:2	266:18 267:4,7	192:19 234:15	224:16 251:21,25
196:2 198:13	<b>clearer</b> 216:20	269:23 286:16	287:10	<b>compete</b> 232:12
199:24 200:2,8,14	<b>clearly</b> 193:5	288:23 289:7,15	<b>comment</b> 305:11	<b>competition</b> 130:18
200:22 201:7	<b>clears</b> 255:10	290:1,6,11,17,20	311:11	140:3 188:25
203:1,6 204:2,2,5	<b>close</b> 130:2 178:19	291:5,14,22,22,23	<b>commitment</b>	<b>competitions</b> 155:4
204:16 205:25	271:19,20	293:1 297:13	208:25	218:17
206:2,12 209:16	<b>closely</b> 136:2	310:7,13 320:15	<b>committee</b> 111:8	<b>competitive</b> 123:18
210:1 227:25	292:24	320:19 321:4	111:21 112:22,23	170:15 322:23
250:21,24 254:18	<b>closest</b> 183:21	326:6,7 329:13	113:2 117:17,20	<b>competitors</b> 131:18
257:25 271:24	<b>coauthored</b> 178:25	333:14,15 346:18	117:21,22,24	<b>complaint</b> 213:4
272:14,19 298:6	179:2 239:21	352:10	118:1,4,10,12	<b>complete</b> 134:19,20
298:18 305:5	242:9,14	<b>collegiate</b> 169:11	155:6 156:17,24	135:10 278:22,22
306:23 308:6,13	<b>coauthors</b> 242:24	189:14 198:22	215:13 242:3	279:13,15 356:8
308:14 309:13	243:7	199:16 261:24	<b>committees</b> 118:3	356:11
326:17,18 327:8	<b>coauthorship</b>	286:16 288:18	<b>common</b> 141:1,6	<b>completely</b> 338:16
327:22 330:17,24	242:10	290:22,24 295:21	141:10 143:22	<b>complex</b> 189:6
338:5 345:2	<b>cochran</b> 350:3	319:6 346:3	146:1 163:3,8,19	<b>complicated</b> 155:9
<b>classes</b> 131:24	351:6	<b>collegium</b> 112:19	172:20 173:6,7	218:3,9,18
132:2 139:11	<b>codirecting</b> 184:4	<b>colloquial</b> 276:13	210:5 212:16	<b>component</b> 115:3,3
189:9,10,22,22,25	262:17	<b>colonial</b> 259:15	224:13 236:12,22	172:11 190:4
190:20,21 191:11	<b>codirector</b> 183:3,5	<b>columbia</b> 130:16	242:17,17 271:11	233:12 235:25
191:12 194:11,11	<b>codirectors</b> 182:12	130:20 353:22	275:5 280:14	259:10 267:21
198:8 200:18	<b>cognizant</b> 270:18	<b>column</b> 325:2	282:25 334:15	268:7 301:21
201:1,2,4,5,7,9,19	307:11	<b>com</b> 107:8,13	337:12	306:15 313:15,16
201:23,24 213:8,8	<b>collaborate</b> 242:21	<b>combination</b>	<b>communal</b> 262:25	313:19
213:19 275:9	<b>collaboration</b>	191:12	<b>communicate</b>	<b>components</b> 340:7
276:20 303:16	154:4 179:5 180:3	<b>combined</b> 113:17	143:7,11,14,20	<b>composed</b> 333:22
311:23 316:1	238:9 297:2 298:7	<b>come</b> 127:16	158:18 203:3	<b>composition</b> 352:8
327:2,3,5 329:22	<b>collaborative</b> 179:4	139:16 152:6,10	<b>communicated</b>	<b>compound</b> 205:13

<b>comprehensible</b> 215:25	<b>constantly</b> 147:15 149:15 164:18	226:16,18 244:17 306:21 327:17	335:1 338:14 341:13,15,16,21	<b>cost</b> 129:7,11,18,25 132:1,10,11,12
<b>computation</b> 223:5	<b>constituted</b> 137:14	<b>cooper</b> 107:11	341:22,23,24,25	219:16 237:23
<b>computational</b> 127:17 231:6	<b>constraints</b> 276:3	<b>coordinate</b> 191:3	342:2,3,11,12,16	238:2,4
<b>computer</b> 223:21	<b>constructive</b> 305:12	<b>coordinates</b> 318:7	342:18,18,20	<b>costs</b> 128:19 129:3
<b>concepts</b> 145:19	<b>consultation</b> 282:14 305:20	344:18,19	343:5,12,12,12	130:24 131:14
<b>conceptual</b> 117:12	315:20 348:6	<b>coordinator</b> 151:6	344:6,15,15,16,16	<b>couldnt</b> 170:17,18
<b>concern</b> 294:22	<b>consultations</b> 292:15 330:22	172:4 183:18	344:17,19,22,23	175:24 230:10
<b>concisely</b> 143:19	336:16	184:3,5,8,18	344:25 345:1,4,4	275:10 307:14
<b>conclusion</b> 308:15 332:24	<b>consulted</b> 314:10 314:19	247:13,23,25	345:10,18,23,23	<b>council</b> 181:2,19
<b>conduct</b> 258:14,14 292:14 296:25	<b>contact</b> 330:5	262:24 265:1	345:24,24 346:3,5	184:10,11,13
298:9 330:17	<b>contain</b> 167:4	344:15,17	346:11,13 348:20	246:18 263:6
<b>conducted</b> 316:19	<b>contains</b> 156:19	<b>coordinators</b> 169:10 182:21	348:22 350:7	<b>counsel</b> 132:21
<b>conducting</b> 298:5	<b>contents</b> 154:22 314:1	183:1 185:15	351:3,5 352:9	211:22 216:18
<b>confer</b> 326:20	<b>contest</b> 267:19	246:19 247:2,13	<b>cores</b> 138:13 149:1	264:10 279:7
<b>confessions</b> 342:23 342:25	<b>context</b> 155:21 156:2 218:10,11	247:18 248:5,24	150:10 153:17	285:3,8
<b>confidence</b> 212:15 338:12	218:13 245:25	262:18,21 264:20	173:18 194:5	<b>counseling</b> 337:17
<b>conflicts</b> 270:12	326:23 337:10	317:16	198:23 261:22	<b>counsels</b> 211:16
<b>confused</b> 277:17	<b>contexts</b> 270:11	<b>copi</b> 239:14 240:8	<b>correct</b> 110:5,6	<b>count</b> 351:11
<b>conjecturing</b> 200:18	<b>continue</b> 262:13 337:21	<b>copied</b> 182:6	121:14 125:25	<b>countries</b> 137:5,6
<b>consequence</b> 231:24	<b>continued</b> 109:1	<b>coproduced</b> 192:20	126:1,3 129:22	<b>country</b> 137:3
<b>consequences</b> 207:17 231:16,22	<b>continues</b> 152:5	<b>core</b> 150:9,23 151:5	136:6 150:12	<b>counts</b> 196:2
339:17	<b>continuing</b> 308:2	151:6,14,15 152:3	162:3 165:20	<b>couple</b> 114:4 122:4
<b>consider</b> 209:11 294:18 354:7	<b>continuous</b> 307:20 307:23	152:10,20,23,24	186:6,9,21 187:14	215:15 216:6,7
<b>consideration</b> 157:15 294:5	<b>contrast</b> 290:1 345:14	153:1,22 155:15	188:22,23 191:5	222:15 249:13
314:25	<b>contributing</b> 263:2	169:10 172:3	191:21 192:8	<b>course</b> 131:25
<b>considered</b> 152:21 159:11 222:20	<b>contributions</b> 243:22	189:9,10,15,22,25	193:17 195:22	138:23 139:18
<b>consist</b> 306:8	<b>control</b> 154:21 156:8 222:25,25	190:20 191:11	196:25 197:8,21	140:5,8,11 141:3
<b>consistency</b> 209:24 210:5,18	353:25	194:10,11 196:2,3	198:1,5,9 202:21	141:16,21,24
<b>consistent</b> 121:21 124:10 145:7	<b>convenient</b> 234:16	198:8 200:5 201:1	205:11,19 206:5	142:1,1,1 144:11
203:2 210:9,21,22	<b>conversation</b> 164:15 244:16	201:23 204:1	206:17 207:10	144:22 145:5,7,12
<b>consists</b> 118:16 305:13	306:20 314:13,18	213:8,19 255:20	208:11 209:19,25	145:13,20,22,25
<b>constant</b> 124:10	316:4 329:24	258:21,25 260:6	210:9,21 212:8,20	147:5 148:12
	<b>conversations</b> 164:14 217:15	265:20 269:24	212:25 213:20	149:9 150:9,25
		270:7 275:9	219:20 225:2	151:3,9,21,23
		276:20 278:3,7	230:21 231:13	153:23,25 154:19
		281:1 284:9	232:22 243:9	154:24 155:3,7
		292:25,25 293:3	244:1,6,14,21	158:15 163:24
		293:16 301:13,16	248:25 249:23	164:1 166:8 168:1
		326:10 330:14,18	250:4,8,15 252:18	169:5 171:22
		330:23 331:11,12	253:4 256:1	175:16 182:22
		333:8,10,11,11,15	263:11 284:1	191:4,8 192:3,10
		333:17,18,18,21	285:6 288:9 291:2	192:16,20 193:2
		333:21,23,24	295:8 297:10	193:16,22 194:1,7
		334:7,16,17,19,25	315:12 324:20	194:8,10,14,17
			325:16 332:7	195:3,9,16,18,20
			<b>correlates</b> 325:3	195:20,24 196:16

196:20,21 197:3,7 197:19,21,24 198:1,1 200:16 204:10,16,20,24 205:7 206:16 207:3,4 210:4 212:5 213:16 220:4 224:23 254:11,23 255:12 255:13 258:14 259:12 261:8,12 262:13 265:22 269:15,23 270:6 270:13,14,18 271:15,19 273:24 274:1,1,21 275:17 280:10 281:10 282:12,18 283:5 283:23 291:6,11 294:2 297:4,14,17 297:20,23 298:15 301:20 302:2,18 303:8,15 305:6,17 308:25 309:1,14 310:1,20,25 312:5 312:11,12 313:23 313:25 316:8,24 317:7 318:19 319:16,20,25 320:8 323:17 326:1,8 330:18 331:10 332:14 333:5,13 335:9,14 336:4,20,22 337:2 337:3,4,10,24,25 339:1 340:5,13,13 340:13,16,19,21 341:2,6,10 346:14 348:7 351:1 353:7	258:25 259:5,19 265:16 275:5 302:21 308:11,23 309:21 313:12,14 318:11 319:2 325:21 333:1,15 333:16,19 335:4 336:15 340:10 349:6 <b>court</b> 111:10 176:5 291:8 292:6 <b>courteous</b> 211:8 <b>courtesy</b> 208:9 211:23 <b>cover</b> 122:25 208:21,22,23 209:5 353:11 <b>covered</b> 139:20 197:16 261:7 271:9 300:11 302:10,11 303:2 306:11,11 307:23 318:16 <b>covers</b> 112:6 208:15 253:4 292:12 <b>crazy</b> 223:14,18 <b>create</b> 155:5 168:22 169:12 181:20 247:9 281:10 <b>created</b> 118:4 132:22 281:21 <b>creates</b> 281:24 <b>creating</b> 187:10 206:25 230:4 283:4 <b>credit</b> 185:11,17 194:12 195:19,25 196:1 243:1,1,9 243:16 263:10 351:21 <b>criteria</b> 293:17,20 293:25 294:6,8 298:23 309:20 <b>criticism</b> 183:17 305:12	<b>criticize</b> 183:21 <b>criticized</b> 247:10 <b>criticizing</b> 181:16 <b>critique</b> 247:24,25 308:7 <b>cross</b> 216:14 234:18,19 354:22 <b>crossexamination</b> 108:5 186:3 <b>crucial</b> 135:4 137:18 217:17 219:10,15 <b>crudely</b> 348:23 <b>csr</b> 356:16 <b>ctt</b> 336:10,15 346:5 <b>culminating</b> 136:1 <b>culmination</b> 313:22 326:24 <b>cultivate</b> 120:12 <b>culture</b> 112:19 190:18,19 259:10 259:12,15 270:8 281:23 295:3 <b>cultures</b> 334:2 336:14 <b>cuman</b> 183:5 <b>current</b> 111:5 247:2 288:15 <b>currently</b> 111:6 273:19 314:8 <b>curriculum</b> 134:19 134:21 155:7 191:7 194:18,22 196:4 206:23 330:14 333:8,10 333:13 <b>cut</b> 234:22 <b>cv</b> 134:22 135:2,10 268:4 <b>cycle</b> 307:20,23	127:12,15,19 128:5,7 129:8,9 129:25 131:22 136:9 137:24 157:24 159:17 160:17 161:22 170:2,15 191:22 230:1,15 252:17 252:20 258:5 259:18 260:12 265:2 270:17 276:5 279:9 283:22 284:10 287:7 301:9 321:6 321:17 323:12,13 323:23 327:10 328:7 329:25 331:2 340:3 347:25 348:3 351:23 352:14,19 <b>dante</b> 343:1 <b>dantes</b> 342:23 <b>data</b> 180:22 <b>database</b> 180:8,13 180:17 246:3,4,14 246:17 <b>date</b> 115:25 121:12 125:5 133:20 142:17 176:15 273:18 <b>david</b> 108:3 110:10 110:14,14,17 <b>day</b> 118:23 120:5 144:13 174:4 257:21 293:7 354:23,24 <b>dbblaw</b> 107:13 <b>deal</b> 256:25 <b>deals</b> 116:3,17 129:7 <b>dean</b> 111:12,25 112:12,14 114:14 114:16,22,23,25 120:24 135:19 156:9 165:13 168:5 175:18 217:16 225:10,20	225:22 227:6,12 227:18 228:7 233:6 266:13,15 267:7 268:19 273:22 286:16,17 288:17 290:17 291:14,21,22,23 310:7 320:15 <b>deans</b> 114:16,18 123:16 <b>dearborn</b> 106:14 <b>debate</b> 182:2 184:1 <b>debated</b> 219:8 <b>debates</b> 152:15 <b>deborah</b> 111:6 <b>debt</b> 244:24,25 <b>decade</b> 128:13,16 <b>decide</b> 145:14 152:12 202:3,4 304:5 306:13 310:15 <b>decided</b> 195:1 338:18 <b>deciding</b> 145:16 279:21 299:3 <b>decision</b> 303:22 320:7 <b>decisions</b> 175:18,20 227:19 261:20,21 <b>declaration</b> 195:3 <b>declared</b> 119:17 120:2 <b>dedicated</b> 264:1 <b>dedicating</b> 132:8 <b>deemed</b> 140:17 <b>deems</b> 350:3 <b>defer</b> 251:15 <b>defines</b> 352:2 <b>defining</b> 352:12 <b>definitely</b> 210:25 308:5 <b>definition</b> 190:15 190:17 271:13 272:25 <b>degree</b> 116:4 117:7 125:8 132:22 136:9,11 140:1
<b>D</b>				
	<b>d</b> 107:4 108:1 111:6 113:17,19 116:13 119:2 120:3 121:2 121:5,7,13,15,23 125:15,18,23			

158:6 170:8 175:6 224:21 228:19 229:6 237:11,24 237:25 296:5 323:11,12,15,21 323:24 <b>degrees</b> 116:6,11 116:12,12,17,20 126:18 <b>delegated</b> 291:21 <b>deliberately</b> 131:24 331:13 <b>deliberation</b> 309:25 <b>delicate</b> 217:7 <b>delivering</b> 218:19 <b>demonstrated</b> 339:17 <b>demonstrative</b> 324:7 <b>dense</b> 159:13 <b>department</b> 111:8 111:9 112:24 114:12 117:14,23 118:1,9,16,25 119:11 123:24 140:9 156:17 158:22 163:20 176:3,18 187:2 188:17 213:12,15 233:7 237:4 242:2 269:20 287:3,4 293:21 294:12,13 294:23 295:10 302:7,7,17 309:7 310:12,15,24 314:7 315:10,11 316:7 317:4,9,12 317:24 319:18 320:10 321:9,9,15 321:15,20,25 322:3 323:1 326:1 327:20 333:8 335:22 336:13 340:2,11 348:10 348:14 349:2,19 <b>departmental</b>	281:23 314:10 317:9,10,15 341:12 <b>departments</b> 112:6 112:11 115:1 117:9,11 120:8 122:2 123:11,15 123:19,22 158:14 158:20 169:9 187:19 188:8,14 188:18 189:1 213:13 281:18 291:25 294:14 295:1,4,17 296:1 296:2 302:8 315:14,15,17 319:1,20,22 322:6 322:15,16 323:2,4 323:6 335:20 336:10 <b>depend</b> 260:7,9 309:17 321:19 <b>dependent</b> 309:6 310:13 <b>depending</b> 149:7 295:2 321:23 337:1 350:11 <b>depends</b> 134:24 141:23 148:15,17 178:23 179:2 201:25 240:7 257:20 270:9 272:9 275:20 293:13 294:3,11 302:6 306:7 321:9 321:20 325:24 326:2 336:21 337:9 343:11 <b>depiction</b> 133:6 <b>deputy</b> 266:13 286:16,17 288:17 <b>describe</b> 121:6 150:7 208:18 209:6 307:15 <b>described</b> 156:18 157:19 159:10 254:18 265:12	280:1 297:7 307:13,20 316:16 <b>describes</b> 150:20 151:25 155:20 <b>describing</b> 148:24 150:7 <b>descriptions</b> 204:10 <b>design</b> 140:5,9 147:17 153:25 313:19,20,23 335:10 <b>designed</b> 126:20 183:14 <b>designing</b> 327:4,5 <b>despite</b> 320:3 <b>detail</b> 156:8 167:3 222:10 336:21 341:14 <b>detailed</b> 349:8 <b>details</b> 120:25 165:14 214:22 222:23,25 223:22 236:25 <b>determine</b> 309:20 311:7 315:21 <b>determined</b> 318:11 354:21 <b>determines</b> 319:16 <b>developed</b> 282:14 <b>development</b> 117:25 118:6,13 294:5 <b>devoted</b> 316:6 <b>dgs</b> 315:20 316:12 335:25 <b>diagnose</b> 143:19 <b>dialogue</b> 178:14 <b>dictates</b> 276:1 <b>didnt</b> 128:21 144:16 175:7,8 178:17 180:16 213:4 215:19 216:10 217:1 218:13 228:13 239:4 241:16,24 255:17 274:2,18	283:13 307:3 <b>differ</b> 341:12 <b>difference</b> 121:2 174:15 175:12 193:9 208:19 258:21 261:9 270:25 271:1 338:12 <b>differences</b> 193:12 352:17 <b>different</b> 114:13 117:8 118:15 123:14 132:7 134:12 136:5 137:10 138:6,7,19 138:20 140:23 145:9 146:19 147:21 148:1,4 149:7 152:24 153:17,25 154:4 156:20 163:22 167:18 168:5 179:7 181:2 183:1 185:10 194:12,15 194:20,20 195:12 195:12 205:8,13 208:24 209:8,9 210:2 213:24 215:18 220:2 222:22 223:2 226:22 236:19 238:3 240:10 244:23 245:16,17 258:3 261:15 263:3 265:7 270:3 270:11,12,21,22 272:13 276:11,11 276:12 279:22 281:12,17,18 282:5,7,9 295:5 296:3 300:16 326:23 327:2 337:24,25,25 340:6,7 343:25 350:13 <b>differently</b> 249:22 256:6 265:11	<b>differing</b> 207:13,16 207:17 <b>differs</b> 276:10 <b>difficult</b> 142:10 154:20 <b>difficulties</b> 142:2,3 <b>difficulty</b> 132:22 220:11 <b>direct</b> 108:4,13 110:20 116:2 286:1 347:18 <b>directed</b> 112:18 <b>directing</b> 262:17 <b>directly</b> 153:14 345:13 346:23 <b>director</b> 158:22 183:2 247:23 287:1 313:10 314:7,9 316:13,14 317:11,13 318:3,6 335:25 350:1,2 <b>directors</b> 182:11 <b>disappeared</b> 338:16 <b>disbursement</b> 250:1 <b>disciplinary</b> 233:11 257:9 295:2,3 <b>discipline</b> 181:18 243:24 294:11,12 321:23 352:2 <b>disciplined</b> 273:4 338:22 <b>disciplines</b> 136:24 244:12 271:10 <b>discover</b> 142:12 <b>discoveries</b> 239:21 <b>discretion</b> 304:5 <b>discuss</b> 139:18 148:10 152:6 173:12 181:21 196:21 298:18 300:24,24 302:23 304:12 305:4,5,8 307:2 328:10 341:23,25 344:2 345:3
--	---	--	--	--

<b>discussed</b> 139:6 159:21 163:13,15 172:23 195:11 212:6 255:22 264:4 308:19 314:17 316:17,18 343:22	111:7 <b>dividing</b> 169:12 <b>divinity</b> 114:10 <b>division</b> 112:1,3,5 112:12 113:8 114:15,21,23,25 115:6,8,11 116:4 116:13,20 117:9 117:10,12 118:22 118:25 119:6,15 119:18 120:4,16 120:20 121:8,16 121:24 123:7 124:11 125:12 126:19 130:1 133:3,8 134:10 136:17 138:3 154:8,10 155:22 156:5,6 157:7,8 161:3 165:10 168:11,11,14,22 169:11,21 170:23 171:3 175:18 176:1 177:8 188:19 189:10,14 190:22 191:16 198:22 199:5,16 203:23 213:7,19 214:14,16 215:12 222:3,5,14 224:5 233:18 236:19 237:6 242:6,8 252:17,20 253:3,7 253:10 261:24,25 262:1,1 266:13,16 268:20 274:24 275:3 276:11 277:15 286:16,17 288:18,25 289:12 289:14,20,25 290:22,24 293:19 293:22,23,24 294:6,17 295:10 295:20,21 319:7 320:25 321:13 323:2,16,21 332:21 339:24	341:16 351:24,25 352:15 <b>divisions</b> 111:18 120:1,8,10 132:25 213:18 236:3,20 266:11 289:22 <b>doc</b> 191:25 192:5 204:18 <b>docs</b> 138:18 191:13 191:16,17,21 196:17 260:16,18 <b>doctoral</b> 134:18 <b>document</b> 115:17 124:14,19 132:18 132:21 133:2,17 150:2,20 151:2,25 153:3 165:1,9 166:9,21 176:12 176:17,21 180:16 198:24 199:6 221:7 228:1,13 234:11,24 268:12 269:8 273:16,18 274:21 275:7 <b>documents</b> 166:3 180:14,18 225:7 233:24 234:2,7 <b>doesnt</b> 117:17 143:14 169:2 172:25 202:23 216:3 219:15 231:17 243:23 264:6 275:6 298:25 304:1 305:21 317:4 320:4 323:14 337:20 338:6 341:3 <b>dogma</b> 154:15 155:10 <b>doing</b> 128:5 138:6 147:21 154:3 162:19 164:10 171:15,18 173:21 173:22 180:5 191:4 196:6 206:16 211:3	228:11 230:13,23 230:25 231:1,6 237:1,22 238:11 238:14 244:20 245:6 249:3 265:23 270:8,14 272:13 280:21 282:11,12 284:13 293:11 300:5 314:15 320:1 327:18 331:8 343:24 350:20 <b>dollar</b> 125:10 <b>domain</b> 154:21 170:3,8 189:13 190:25 214:2 <b>dont</b> 118:7 120:9 126:14 127:12 128:25 130:25 136:20 140:24 142:20 146:20 149:5 154:3,5,14 155:1 156:8 160:3 160:17 162:9 163:25 164:19 167:10,12 170:3,7 170:16 171:24 172:3,10,10 173:25 175:3,18 175:19 179:6 181:8 184:21,22 186:14 187:15 188:1 189:4,12 190:8,24 191:14 193:8,11,18 198:16 199:25 200:7,19,20 201:14,20,21 202:5,9,13 203:8 203:21 204:13,20 205:14,20 207:1 208:14 209:3,4,6 211:19 212:9 213:9,10,21,22 214:3,8,18,22,24 215:5,6,14,24 216:2 218:8,12,16	220:19 222:11,12 222:25,25 223:22 223:25 224:9,18 224:18 225:11,14 225:16,18,21 226:7,11,13 227:17,17,25 228:3,9,15,18,18 228:23,25 229:5,6 229:9 230:8,9 231:1,2,5,20,22 233:22 234:8,9,10 234:13,13,17 235:10,21 236:11 236:24,25 239:11 239:25 241:23 244:7,11,11 246:21,22 247:2 247:15 248:17,21 250:10,16 251:3,6 251:9,15,18,20,23 251:24 252:2 253:8,17 259:25 259:25 261:13,14 261:17 262:22,24 263:4,24 266:17 269:19 270:2,9 271:4 273:20,21 274:14,18 275:10 275:24,24 276:24 277:8,11 278:1,17 278:25 279:2,4 280:11 281:16 282:1 284:8 307:22 309:25 311:4 315:18 319:2,20 320:4 323:3 324:2 327:15,19 330:2 330:10 331:6 339:23,23 350:14 351:14,17 352:7 352:20 353:5 354:1,8 <b>dossier</b> 345:12 <b>double</b> 119:24 <b>doubt</b> 246:16
---	---	---	--	--

<b>dowd</b> 107:10	<b>easier</b> 145:16	<b>eight</b> 117:11	268:23	<b>etcetera</b> 139:8
<b>dr</b> 286:3,23 287:5	<b>easily</b> 132:1	328:25 333:21	<b>employment</b> 221:9	140:7 173:1
290:4 295:12	<b>eastern</b> 111:22	350:22	222:5 223:15,21	239:14 259:16
304:23 310:3	336:13	<b>eighth</b> 106:15	264:5	279:19 282:20
325:20 336:17	<b>econ</b> 179:1 188:13	<b>either</b> 142:18	<b>enable</b> 164:7	297:5 308:21,21
339:13	<b>economic</b> 123:23	220:17 263:12	<b>encounter</b> 302:3	309:18 336:16
<b>draft</b> 158:11	130:14 188:21	313:17 325:13	<b>ended</b> 262:9,12	<b>ethics</b> 342:23
300:18,19,21	353:23	<b>elaborate</b> 327:24	<b>ends</b> 136:12 148:13	<b>european</b> 190:9
<b>draw</b> 154:16	<b>economically</b>	341:1 349:9	230:5	259:16 260:6
305:18 319:2,21	143:18	<b>elaborated</b> 243:17	<b>energy</b> 130:10	<b>evading</b> 211:4
<b>drawing</b> 336:15	<b>economics</b> 112:10	<b>elementary</b> 311:15	<b>engage</b> 185:4	<b>evaluate</b> 279:21
<b>draws</b> 335:9	123:21 163:21	312:17 313:3	<b>english</b> 295:4	<b>evaluated</b> 335:15
<b>driven</b> 129:4	188:11,17 224:14	328:1	315:18 352:8	335:17,18
160:25	224:21 232:14	<b>elses</b> 185:24	<b>enhance</b> 292:17	<b>evaluating</b> 146:24
<b>drives</b> 223:14,17	242:20 271:11	<b>elucidate</b> 147:10	<b>enormous</b> 132:10	298:24
<b>dropped</b> 113:13	275:3	<b>email</b> 240:18	<b>enrollment</b> 171:10	<b>evaluation</b> 267:4
<b>due</b> 188:9 330:6	<b>economist</b> 113:5	<b>emerged</b> 118:13	200:8,10 252:23	336:6
<b>duly</b> 110:11,18	129:3	<b>emerges</b> 238:16	253:16 319:17	<b>evaluations</b> 268:6
285:18,24	<b>ecosystem</b> 189:6	<b>emerging</b> 190:12	<b>enrollments</b> 319:19	336:3,5
<b>dus</b> 315:21 316:12	<b>edgar</b> 111:6	<b>emphasize</b> 138:10	319:21 320:2	<b>event</b> 263:6
<b>duties</b> 155:15	<b>edition</b> 241:7	<b>employed</b> 110:23	335:10	<b>eventually</b> 277:9
184:15 344:22	<b>educate</b> 186:9	130:21 132:6	<b>ensure</b> 197:5 346:9	<b>everybody</b> 237:21
	<b>education</b> 113:14	286:4	<b>entered</b> 208:3	273:1
	124:22 125:6	<b>employee</b> 111:2	285:5	<b>evidence</b> 108:16
<b>E</b>	155:8 170:11	113:15 199:5	<b>enters</b> 189:24	109:3 117:4
<b>e</b> 107:1,1 108:1	189:20 194:12	353:15	<b>entire</b> 139:17	126:10 166:15
292:14 294:12	197:25 210:8,20	<b>employees</b> 130:19	<b>entirely</b> 293:1	167:1 177:1 269:4
297:3 311:5	217:11,12 218:3,6	199:11 354:8	<b>entitled</b> 130:12	356:11
313:24 326:17	218:8,18,20 219:2	<b>employer</b> 106:5	134:18 176:13	<b>exact</b> 119:19
327:21 329:12	228:20,21 229:7,9	107:2 108:18	<b>entity</b> 181:4	<b>exactly</b> 160:4 181:8
331:11 333:13	230:10 259:1,10	109:5 110:4	<b>equally</b> 183:15	194:5 215:25
334:21 335:19	266:15 288:19,21	115:13 117:1,3	273:2	262:7
348:20 350:4	288:24 289:6,10	124:16 126:7	<b>equip</b> 164:9 275:1	<b>exam</b> 145:10 146:3
<b>eager</b> 183:10	289:23 290:3	132:14,18 133:14	<b>equipment</b> 238:6	<b>examination</b> 108:4
<b>earlier</b> 122:14	333:12 352:13	133:17 149:24	<b>escapes</b> 243:13	108:6,8,13 110:20
150:7 162:6	<b>educational</b> 113:10	158:18 164:23	<b>especially</b> 155:24	264:17 286:1
170:14 221:17	125:11 137:22	165:1,19 166:12	173:17 197:9	<b>examined</b> 110:18
226:12 301:24	150:8 287:6	166:14,22,25	203:6 219:19	285:24
325:11 351:15,18	<b>effect</b> 273:19 280:7	176:8,13,23,25	<b>essay</b> 343:25	<b>example</b> 127:5
<b>early</b> 150:14	323:15	216:18 225:17	<b>essential</b> 197:20	128:2 129:1
167:25 168:2	<b>effective</b> 267:20	227:2 235:15	301:6 303:7	135:25 137:25
289:7 302:4	302:23 303:8	264:10 268:10,13	307:18 347:13	138:12,22 141:20
323:18 344:3	<b>effectiveness</b>	269:1,3 273:16	<b>essentially</b> 192:7	142:6,9 143:14,15
<b>earmarked</b> 159:25	307:11	274:11 285:3,4	192:10,24	143:21,23 146:24
<b>earn</b> 148:7 156:5	<b>effort</b> 171:25 203:5	<b>employers</b> 115:18	<b>establish</b> 130:12	152:13 156:11,14
168:12,23 224:16	204:13 205:6	116:24 126:9	<b>establishes</b> 293:17	167:5,23 172:25
351:21	308:20	137:17 260:15	<b>esthetics</b> 343:16	175:3 177:25
<b>earning</b> 261:10				

178:19 179:8	164:23 165:2	294:25 298:25	<b>faculty</b> 112:20	347:14 351:4
180:22 184:5	166:22,25 176:8	300:3 319:4	114:22 115:4,11	<b>fail</b> 208:23
194:1,10,13	176:13,23,25	321:21 323:19	118:21 138:18	<b>fair</b> 141:13 154:23
209:10 214:21	198:25 199:1	326:3 332:10	139:17 140:9	184:16 205:14
231:5 233:13	221:4,8 225:8,17	341:19 342:15	151:6 152:10,19	218:11,12 297:6
239:17 241:14	227:3 235:15	<b>experienced</b> 256:25	155:5,24,25 163:4	<b>fairly</b> 144:12
242:14 246:6	266:21,23 268:9	296:13,21,22,24	164:17 174:2	163:11 191:8
250:20 254:22,22	268:10,13,24	342:20 345:23	177:14 181:21,23	212:10
256:8 257:20	269:1,3 273:16	<b>experiences</b> 146:10	182:11,15 187:8	<b>fairy</b> 335:14
260:3 271:18,20	274:11 283:16	226:9 313:13	191:13,18 192:5	<b>faith</b> 175:24
317:1,11 332:15	324:2,6,8 356:12	<b>experiential</b> 296:15	194:14 195:19	<b>fall</b> 119:6 122:24
344:4	<b>exhibits</b> 109:1	300:6	196:9,16 202:19	293:15 334:16
<b>examples</b> 343:25	166:14 356:10,11	<b>experimental</b>	202:23 203:9	<b>falling</b> 312:20
<b>exams</b> 146:4	<b>expand</b> 222:6	147:17	204:5,18,23,25	<b>falls</b> 298:13,19
155:17 201:24	259:25	<b>expert</b> 342:13	205:8,9,10,18	<b>familiar</b> 120:19
202:11,21	<b>expatiate</b> 115:9	351:9	217:17 218:23	171:8 181:3 199:5
<b>exceed</b> 163:9,15	137:9	<b>expertise</b> 316:3	219:19,19,23	221:10,15,16
224:6 225:9 227:7	<b>expatiating</b> 201:18	<b>experts</b> 343:1	226:20 232:25	234:23 235:16
277:20	<b>expect</b> 138:3 148:9	<b>explain</b> 143:17	233:2,5,10,15	274:3 295:12
<b>exceeding</b> 277:22	209:7	147:2 171:20	235:25 236:8,10	308:23 317:23
<b>exceedingly</b> 111:17	<b>expectation</b> 161:8	<b>explained</b> 318:1	236:15,21 237:12	320:16 321:5
<b>excellence</b> 191:23	173:3	340:25	238:12,22 239:10	346:17
<b>excellent</b> 137:1	<b>expectations</b>	<b>exposure</b> 190:18	240:5,11 242:11	<b>familiarity</b> 196:12
189:8	208:21	204:23 327:17	242:16,19,21,25	<b>famous</b> 113:4
<b>exception</b> 119:11	<b>expected</b> 194:18,19	<b>express</b> 119:19	243:7,8,10,25	<b>far</b> 156:1 208:12
156:14,16 191:1	194:25 204:24	143:25 158:16	244:4,5,10 247:9	222:10 279:23
203:18 214:21	206:22 208:12	246:1	248:2 258:5	280:1 296:4
222:11 225:15	223:5 250:3	<b>expressed</b> 204:22	260:19,21,22	<b>farsi</b> 231:5
227:5 330:6	279:13 283:25	<b>extent</b> 130:21	262:16 266:4,5,8	<b>fasman</b> 107:4
<b>exceptions</b> 156:10	<b>expend</b> 171:24	280:3 336:9 352:3	272:1 281:21	108:4,6,8,13
156:12 214:20	<b>expends</b> 130:9	353:22	282:13,16 283:3	110:6,9,21 111:14
222:14 318:25	<b>experience</b> 125:11	<b>external</b> 251:12	289:11,16 292:18	115:15 116:23
325:9 330:3	126:20 134:17	<b>extra</b> 224:16	294:20 296:21,22	117:5 122:17
<b>exclusive</b> 129:13	135:3,6,22 137:16	308:20 330:19	296:24 297:3,8,21	124:18 126:4,11
<b>exclusively</b> 345:16	137:22,23 138:20	<b>extraneous</b> 230:12	297:25 298:5,7,14	130:8 131:2
<b>excused</b> 284:21,23	138:24 146:18,21	<b>extremely</b> 229:22	299:5,8,22 300:15	132:16 133:23
<b>execute</b> 297:23	155:14 156:12	<b>eye</b> 187:22	300:17,19,22	149:16,23 150:1
<b>exemption</b> 225:5	157:2 158:17,19		301:1,7 302:25	151:18 160:22
<b>exercise</b> 145:10,15	164:2 170:3	<b>F</b>	304:4 306:5	163:5 164:21
179:13 210:6	174:14,21,25	<b>faces</b> 146:22	308:10 309:6,8	165:16,21,25
307:16	183:14 184:19	<b>fact</b> 158:24 170:4	314:10 315:7,14	166:16,19,24
<b>exhibit</b> 108:16	191:25 192:13	178:11 188:19	315:15,19,21	167:2 168:8 174:3
115:13,18 116:24	197:10 202:6,7,22	214:2 228:20,21	316:5 317:6,20	174:8,13 176:10
117:1,3 124:16	202:23 204:8,8	229:8,9 234:5	319:5,24 328:21	176:20 177:2
126:5,7,9 132:14	214:4,5 217:18	305:18 319:11	335:20 336:1	185:19,23 186:18
132:18 133:14,18	254:6 268:22	320:3 335:13	337:18 340:12,15	193:1,3 200:23
149:24 150:3	275:1 280:6	338:9 342:5 351:7	342:19 344:17	205:12 206:6,19

207:21 208:5,8	333:2	141:14 142:12,16	<b>fixed</b> 214:25	<b>form</b> 134:17
210:10,12 211:1,7	<b>fields</b> 179:3,5	143:10 144:10	221:19,20	141:17 151:11
211:13,18 212:9	243:18,19,20	146:10 148:6,8	<b>flexibility</b> 136:15	215:24 243:3
215:23 216:13	<b>fifth</b> 116:3 134:13	150:22 155:1	152:8,18 157:5	295:6
218:12 223:17	206:11,15 278:15	161:7 163:18,19	167:17 168:7	<b>formal</b> 187:25
228:23 229:11	278:20 312:4	170:5 193:6	251:19	276:2 312:25
231:14 234:15,19	325:17 341:11	195:14 197:13	<b>flexible</b> 136:11	<b>format</b> 250:19
234:25 235:6	<b>figure</b> 148:2 204:13	224:7,8 228:2	214:24 319:9	302:2 306:12
238:24 239:2,6	<b>figures</b> 125:8,15	237:15 268:16	<b>floor</b> 106:15 107:12	335:10,12 337:10
243:2 245:7	<b>file</b> 242:1	271:7 274:10,15	<b>florida</b> 107:7	337:25 338:1
248:19 251:1	<b>filed</b> 241:25	274:25 277:1,11	<b>fly</b> 184:6	<b>formed</b> 181:6
252:8 253:21,24	<b>files</b> 356:12	277:15,20,24	<b>focus</b> 163:1 164:4	<b>forms</b> 135:22
254:2 264:12,18	<b>fill</b> 198:15 236:16	285:24 287:23	193:11 207:23	190:12
269:5,6 273:10	347:25 348:1	288:13 293:7	212:17 242:13	<b>formula</b> 261:16
279:3 281:6	<b>filling</b> 240:24	300:18,18,19	254:6 256:12	272:20
283:10,14 284:19	331:17	302:3,19 311:13	272:17,20,21	<b>forth</b> 258:12
<b>fast</b> 113:15 127:15	<b>final</b> 298:20,20	313:3 320:12	313:25 325:13	<b>forward</b> 239:25
<b>faster</b> 245:16	300:21	325:13,15 334:22	333:23 335:23	<b>found</b> 224:11
<b>federalist</b> 195:4	<b>financial</b> 120:19	337:23	336:22	230:20
<b>feed</b> 282:22	121:1,6 125:8	<b>firsthand</b> 138:24	<b>focused</b> 127:1,2,22	<b>foundation</b> 160:20
<b>feedback</b> 267:16	159:12,14 186:14	<b>five</b> 123:3,4,5 126:2	169:16 170:12	237:18 238:4
282:16,23 283:1	186:15,21,22,24	134:11 136:8	220:10 289:9	240:9,10
297:4 298:10	187:22 339:16	138:1 140:21	290:1 345:15	<b>founded</b> 112:24
299:8 300:25	<b>financing</b> 124:21	141:3 146:4,5	<b>focuses</b> 292:11	289:3
301:20 303:16	125:6	157:16,19 159:11	<b>focusing</b> 193:12	<b>four</b> 122:23,23
305:25 328:13	<b>find</b> 148:3 204:9,12	163:6,9,19 171:16	226:25 345:16	161:12 171:1,5
330:25 336:8	205:7 246:7	171:16 172:9	<b>focussed</b> 289:5	227:22 228:3
341:8 344:10,13	267:11 283:17	174:20,24 175:2,4	<b>foisted</b> 295:9	250:4 259:4 262:7
348:8	338:17	175:9,15,21,23	<b>follow</b> 150:8,9	262:10,12 278:5
<b>feedbacks</b> 336:11	<b>finding</b> 180:7	188:13 205:23	<b>followed</b> 251:2,3	329:13
<b>feel</b> 156:12 175:3,3	193:21 303:9	206:1,1,4,11,14	<b>following</b> 136:14	<b>fourth</b> 134:13
267:8 323:21	<b>fine</b> 171:13 235:5	212:8 224:6,7,8	173:19 192:17	312:4 325:8,18,19
352:12	235:10 252:8	224:16,22,24	237:2 277:23	<b>frame</b> 139:7 142:13
<b>feeling</b> 163:3	283:11,14	225:1,1,9,25	313:15 344:12	142:22
<b>feels</b> 179:22 217:16	<b>finish</b> 171:21	226:2,10,12,17	<b>follows</b> 110:19	<b>framework</b> 323:4
<b>fees</b> 125:19,23	191:22 208:5	227:8,14 228:2,6	285:25 341:16	<b>frankly</b> 211:14
<b>fellow</b> 203:9	211:1,21 215:20	232:16 250:4	<b>fomented</b> 139:7	<b>french</b> 330:9
<b>fellows</b> 138:19	216:10 217:1	253:12 261:9,11	<b>fomenting</b> 146:25	<b>frequent</b> 149:4,5
191:20	221:11 234:17	262:8,10 271:8	<b>food</b> 113:15	<b>frequently</b> 148:6,9
<b>fellowship</b> 140:7	260:3 354:22	274:10,15,25	<b>footnote</b> 243:19	257:12 258:3
<b>felt</b> 144:10,12	<b>finished</b> 207:22	275:4 277:2,12,16	<b>force</b> 304:2	<b>friday</b> 106:15
<b>fictitious</b> 165:4	234:20 235:3	277:20,20,22,25	<b>foregoing</b> 131:19	343:17
<b>field</b> 113:18 158:8	245:14,15 252:13	313:22 321:18	<b>foregone</b> 132:1	<b>fright</b> 338:4
169:4 178:15,16	<b>fire</b> 172:10	322:8 323:7 325:4	<b>forget</b> 217:23	<b>front</b> 170:17 338:5
178:17,21 179:3	<b>fired</b> 338:24	325:7 334:11	<b>forgetting</b> 334:3	<b>frustration</b> 204:23
231:3 240:21	<b>first</b> 110:18 126:2	<b>fiveyear</b> 122:24	<b>forgive</b> 128:1	<b>fulco</b> 152:16
242:12 243:12,17	134:16 139:25	129:21	<b>forgot</b> 345:6	<b>fulfill</b> 170:19

189:23 190:7 214:14 215:3 309:17 312:10 320:21 321:2,13 322:4,7,19 325:2 331:4 <b>fulfilled</b> 165:7 209:18,18 259:11 <b>fulfilling</b> 196:1 214:12 339:21 <b>fulfillment</b> 310:2 313:1 <b>fulfills</b> 352:9 <b>full</b> 121:13,16 124:6 152:4 186:15,17 228:6 267:2 <b>fulltime</b> 113:15 118:21 <b>fully</b> 128:5 154:13 160:2 166:18 211:9 216:24 <b>fullyfunded</b> 127:15 <b>function</b> 114:17,18 135:9,11 152:25 154:8 184:13,22 184:25 185:4 188:1 209:12 247:13,18 249:9 257:10 265:10 311:2 327:15 338:4 <b>fund</b> 242:8 <b>fundamentals</b> 111:23 <b>funded</b> 128:6 320:20 352:20 <b>funding</b> 121:16 122:20,23 163:7 186:25 224:17 236:1,8 237:5,7 250:25 251:12,16 268:19 320:16 321:3 352:18 <b>funds</b> 130:9 131:9 184:6 237:3 320:24	<b>funny</b> 178:4 <b>further</b> 108:8,9 125:14 273:10,13 281:5 283:19,20 284:17,19 <b>further</b> 244:5 <b>future</b> 137:17 189:8 229:24 294:19 347:14,14 <hr/> <b>G</b> <hr/> <b>gai</b> 122:5 140:21 141:4 163:6,20 168:13,23 171:16 174:16,17,18,23 174:24 207:2,4,18 208:25 225:9,25 226:11,12 232:15 269:13 273:5 278:10,24 309:18 310:2 312:10 313:1 320:22 321:13,14,16 322:2,18,20 324:19 339:20,21 <b>gain</b> 164:2 191:25 246:12 300:3 <b>gained</b> 212:16 275:1 338:12 <b>gaining</b> 174:24 <b>gais</b> 209:18 <b>game</b> 308:8 <b>garden</b> 120:13 <b>gauged</b> 157:13 <b>geared</b> 157:12 158:24 <b>gears</b> 181:1 308:22 352:16 <b>gender</b> 190:12 <b>general</b> 120:22 121:25 141:25 146:22 157:18 173:14 189:20 191:1,7 194:11,13 214:18,19 237:7 259:1,10 312:11 321:10 333:12	335:1 346:10 351:22 <b>generally</b> 121:6 134:9,11,15 180:5 194:19 200:9 229:9 254:4 265:17 267:25 282:8 311:3 347:16 352:5 353:5 <b>generates</b> 131:20 <b>generations</b> 241:2 <b>german</b> 287:8,14 287:24 288:3,14 289:4 311:16 312:3,6,6,15,16 312:18 313:3,4,5 313:12,24 321:24 321:25 322:2,3,6 322:9,10,13 323:8 326:23 327:20 328:1,12 332:15 334:21 335:22 337:2 <b>germanic</b> 286:14 286:20 311:9,12 317:21,24 319:5 323:12,23 324:8,9 325:4 339:14 340:2,11,24 342:24 <b>germanics</b> 323:10 327:10 329:25 331:2 <b>germany</b> 183:9 287:22 288:2 <b>gesturing</b> 162:6 <b>getting</b> 127:21,24 145:22 156:7 162:20 180:6 206:21 217:4,5 218:4 227:21 243:1 245:13 249:10,11 277:17 307:7 325:15 <b>gi</b> 122:12 <b>gifts</b> 147:25	<b>gildamen</b> 113:12 <b>give</b> 131:7,10,17,17 142:6 143:25 144:11 156:14 167:23 183:14 198:4 217:11,12 239:16 278:8 280:15,20 298:10 299:7 301:1 303:16 304:5 305:11 312:16 319:3,13 320:3 336:8,11 <b>given</b> 143:12,12 147:16,16 161:13 168:19 181:17 190:23 191:3,8,10 192:3 206:12 212:24 256:8 279:24 303:11,19 311:17 312:8 313:5,18 315:5 336:18 341:24 342:2 344:13 356:9 <b>gives</b> 212:24 305:25 327:16 328:13 329:22 <b>giving</b> 131:14 155:16 297:4 <b>glades</b> 107:6 <b>glean</b> 354:4 <b>go</b> 114:14 122:18 127:19 128:10 136:6,22,22 137:24 139:22 146:15 150:17 153:13 158:5 160:23 169:3,18 171:14 192:23 193:21 219:4 227:21 231:24 235:1 252:14 260:13 262:13 267:2 270:2 274:18 296:7 307:3,8 313:3,4	332:18 336:20,20 339:22 354:13,15 <b>goal</b> 150:21 220:4 278:8,18,19,21 342:10 <b>goals</b> 196:23 <b>goes</b> 138:2 261:5 297:4 <b>going</b> 110:4 122:3 135:8,9 142:14,18 144:17,18 148:4 148:20 149:7 150:23 157:1 158:1 159:1 161:11 167:3 168:1,3 198:12,24 199:23 200:2,23 206:6 207:21 215:23 218:22 219:9,12 224:10 224:23 225:13 227:1 233:4 234:19,24 235:1 240:21 243:2 245:3 248:11 249:12 251:1 255:21 260:4 265:23 266:8 267:3 268:1 271:2 271:3 272:9 280:15 295:24 301:1 303:23 304:14 312:14 316:7 349:5,6 <b>golden</b> 239:18 <b>good</b> 137:9 143:10 143:10 146:25 147:9 149:17 153:3 158:21 171:15,17 173:8 175:8,24 181:17 181:17 198:4 201:17 231:11,17 231:21,23 232:6 232:21 256:3,4,7 273:2 282:18 286:3 295:19
---	---	---	--	--

<b>gotten</b> 215:7	159:15 160:15,16	302:2,4,13 303:4	<b>greater</b> 213:15	290:16 295:5
<b>governance</b> 275:23	162:25,25 163:25	304:24 306:2	<b>greece</b> 345:7	339:23
<b>grad</b> 187:20,23	168:12 177:4,9,20	307:5 308:2	<b>greek</b> 345:6	<b>handled</b> 339:24
194:14 206:10	177:21,25 178:25	309:11,14,15	<b>grimms</b> 335:14	<b>handles</b> 120:24
216:8 220:16	180:9,11,12	310:21 314:24	<b>grounds</b> 210:11	135:19
256:19 257:1	181:20,22 183:10	316:13,21,22	<b>group</b> 118:13,19	<b>hands</b> 340:7,12,14
319:14	183:16 185:9	319:3 321:12	127:11 139:17	<b>handson</b> 343:13
<b>graduation</b> 278:2	187:1,3,6,7,13	322:1,14 323:18	145:11,14 148:23	<b>hannah</b> 113:2
<b>grade</b> 144:24	189:2,5 191:13,19	323:20 325:21,23	152:19 195:1	<b>happen</b> 170:21
201:24 202:20	191:22 192:6	325:25 326:9,13	196:20 255:8	252:22 253:15
207:9 212:23,24	195:21 196:11,17	326:14,21 327:9	276:21 279:25	258:15 272:24
271:24 298:11,19	202:20 203:14,17	328:11 329:14,17	301:2,25 302:1,8	341:5 349:4
298:20,21,23	203:18 204:5,18	331:6,14,16	302:14 303:1,5	<b>happened</b> 178:20
299:4 300:14,15	205:23,24,25	332:11 333:2	306:17 313:9	248:14,15,17
300:18 301:1,5,8	206:3,13 209:23	334:18 335:25	328:15,25 341:4	338:7
<b>graded</b> 140:14	212:7 213:6,11,17	336:23 338:9,10	349:17	<b>happening</b> 172:16
202:10	214:14 215:2,16	340:3 341:20	<b>groups</b> 138:18	172:19
<b>graders</b> 272:5	216:23 217:7,8,20	342:5 343:4,7	259:7	<b>happens</b> 141:7,22
<b>grades</b> 145:3	218:7 219:11	344:5,8,24,25	<b>growing</b> 190:5	146:9 150:16,18
<b>grading</b> 139:15	220:12,14 224:5	345:2,3,9 346:9	<b>grows</b> 313:6	168:17 169:3,7
145:4,7,8,13	224:15,25 225:24	346:12,21,24	<b>guarantee</b> 320:2	171:17,18,21
146:2,24 148:18	227:11 230:15	347:2,4,9,12	<b>guess</b> 145:2 172:6	205:8 248:13
203:2,7 209:24,25	231:10,12 232:5	349:9,22 350:8,24	199:13 225:16	284:7 295:19
210:4,9,18,21,22	232:20 233:4,17	351:11,18,23	226:5 250:11	305:9 306:25
212:6,19 271:23	233:24 235:17	356:5	267:10	320:6 336:17
272:15,18 279:13	236:2,4,5,6,9,21	<b>graduated</b> 338:8	<b>guessing</b> 224:12	337:15,16,20
279:16,20 280:1	237:8,13 238:7,10	<b>graduates</b> 237:14	<b>guest</b> 303:11,19,24	<b>happy</b> 218:9
282:21 283:24	238:13,16 239:22	250:3 294:11	304:8,24 305:16	<b>hard</b> 142:12 169:9
284:13 298:12,12	239:23 242:11,15	<b>graduating</b> 119:21	306:6,24 308:4	169:10,12 201:16
298:15 299:1	242:16,20,21,23	<b>graduation</b> 303:10	<b>guiding</b> 329:7	218:20,21 229:22
300:24 301:6,18	243:6 244:3,8,18	321:22		238:8 293:12
326:19 328:18	244:24 246:2,20	<b>grant</b> 168:6 177:14	<b>H</b>	<b>harder</b> 231:12
331:1	247:1,5,9 248:2	177:14,17 225:15	<b>h</b> 107:4	268:2
<b>gradings</b> 212:8	249:21 255:14	235:25 236:8,10	<b>hadnt</b> 202:12	<b>harming</b> 230:3
<b>graduate</b> 106:7	262:1 265:1	236:13,14,16	207:22	<b>harper</b> 138:19
112:20 114:22	267:17,23 268:5	237:1 238:5,5,12	<b>half</b> 327:19 332:2	191:20
115:4,7,8 117:18	275:8 276:9,18	251:18 263:17	<b>hand</b> 276:6 292:22	<b>hasnt</b> 195:14
120:8,20 121:10	277:14 281:9	276:17	292:23 297:8	231:21 248:14,15
122:13,15 123:12	287:2 288:24	<b>granted</b> 261:20	302:2 305:6	<b>hate</b> 249:1
127:7,7 128:11	289:6,10,19,23,24	<b>grants</b> 131:9	346:23 347:12	<b>havent</b> 121:12
130:6 131:8,17,24	290:5,9,11,19,21	177:17 236:22	<b>handed</b> 115:16	127:13 134:4
132:24 135:5	290:21,23 292:19	237:10,14	150:2 268:12	146:16 150:6
136:21 138:21,25	292:21 294:7,9,14	<b>great</b> 167:3 168:15	<b>handful</b> 124:7	165:19 234:3
147:24 150:8	294:16,19,19	181:1 183:8	205:5 230:20	274:25 283:9,13
154:2,11 155:2	295:13,22 296:3	187:10 218:19,21	<b>handing</b> 221:7	284:8
156:23 157:13	297:8,11 299:7,25	218:22 226:25	304:18	<b>hayek</b> 113:5
158:7,22 159:2,4	300:13 301:4,18	227:23 245:3	<b>handle</b> 172:4,5	<b>head</b> 231:9 280:8

281:1	285:2,7,10,14,15	<b>high</b> 113:12,13	287:7,8	256:23
<b>health</b> 121:18,19	285:19 295:23	144:17 162:21,21	<b>hospital</b> 217:14	<b>hypothetically</b>
125:24 129:1,3	296:7 299:13,16	180:9 187:13	<b>hour</b> 222:23 327:19	172:6
<b>healthcare</b> 126:15	299:20 300:10	213:9 218:6	<b>hourly</b> 242:4	
126:16,17 353:11	307:22 311:19,22	219:24 220:8	<b>hours</b> 144:14 161:3	<b>I</b>
<b>hear</b> 168:6,6	311:25 316:11	323:3	161:15,16,17	<b>id</b> 116:23 126:4,24
172:24 183:10	318:15 324:2,4	<b>higher</b> 123:13,19	162:2,2,4 203:15	137:9 176:20
197:21	329:9,15 339:8,11	123:21 187:3	203:20,23 207:10	180:1 219:4
<b>heard</b> 172:15,19,22	353:18 354:1,13	188:14,17,20	221:23 222:21	<b>idea</b> 181:12,19
216:6 297:14	354:19 355:2	205:19 213:13	223:1,3,5,16,21	230:25 231:8
<b>hearing</b> 106:13,14	356:10	<b>highly</b> 135:24,24	223:24 230:8	247:8 249:5,5
110:1,7,12,16	<b>hearsay</b> 160:21	139:24 158:24	241:21,23,24	294:18
117:1 122:11	164:19	282:13	264:1,2,6 283:25	<b>ideally</b> 139:11
126:7 130:23	<b>heart</b> 178:20	<b>hill</b> 287:25	284:14 330:5	140:2 271:17
132:20 133:22	<b>held</b> 149:21 174:10	<b>hire</b> 175:4 188:9	<b>house</b> 349:14	278:4,6 282:23
149:18,22 151:13	203:23 249:17	260:16,21,23	<b>housed</b> 293:1	<b>ideas</b> 195:9 196:24
162:1,5 164:12,20	264:15 285:1	268:2	349:15	<b>identification</b>
165:18,23 166:1,4	286:18,23 287:1	<b>hired</b> 185:9	<b>houston</b> 114:3	115:14,17 124:15
166:8,12,18,22	339:4,10 354:18	<b>hiring</b> 267:1	<b>huge</b> 219:1 238:1	124:17,20 132:15
174:7,9,12 176:23	356:7	<b>historian</b> 113:8	<b>human</b> 117:25	132:19 133:15,17
185:25 193:25	<b>helen</b> 281:20	181:10 183:9	118:6,12 281:17	149:25 150:3
194:6,9,17 197:19	<b>help</b> 142:2 143:22	245:4	333:25 334:2,3	164:24 176:9,12
206:21 208:1,7,10	148:3 158:16	<b>historians</b> 156:20	342:21	199:2 221:5
208:17 210:11,15	173:10 197:2	<b>historical</b> 117:13	<b>humanities</b> 120:10	268:11,13
211:15 212:1	202:23 244:14,20	<b>historically</b> 127:2,6	156:21 157:7	<b>identified</b> 108:16
214:8 216:5,17	245:13 246:8,9,9	<b>history</b> 111:8,20	190:1 286:15,17	109:3 235:15
225:23 226:14	246:11,11,16	112:9 113:21	288:18 289:11,14	286:19 324:7
229:1,14 231:19	257:7 270:5 307:5	114:9,12,12 118:7	290:22,24 293:18	347:25
234:17 235:2,5,8	328:22 346:25	118:11 179:1	293:19,21,23,24	<b>identify</b> 133:25
237:17,19 243:4	<b>helped</b> 240:22	190:19 194:3	294:17 295:16,17	176:16 273:17
249:15,18 252:5	241:1,5 246:3	259:9,14 289:2	295:20,20 296:2	<b>idiosyncratic</b>
252:10,12,22	<b>helpful</b> 139:22	<b>hoc</b> 336:12	301:7,9 319:6	147:20 148:25
253:3,6,14,19,23	239:15 298:24	<b>hold</b> 192:23 203:15	321:6,12,16 323:2	<b>ids</b> 145:10
254:1,3,16 255:10	<b>helping</b> 177:24	207:9 209:8	323:7 329:17	<b>ii</b> 112:25
255:19,21 256:17	230:3	283:25 287:7,13	332:21 333:19,20	<b>ill</b> 115:23 122:18
256:22 257:11,15	<b>helps</b> 180:13	288:1 332:22	334:19,25 335:1	125:3 131:4 146:4
257:18 258:2,7,11	202:19 244:4	<b>holding</b> 284:13	341:15,16 346:4	171:19 179:21
258:18 259:17,22	328:4,16 330:15	331:20	347:13 348:22,22	210:12 212:2,22
260:7,11,19 261:2	346:23 348:24	<b>holds</b> 270:17	350:6 351:24,24	218:9 235:11
261:6,16,18 262:3	<b>hernia</b> 196:6	<b>home</b> 289:24	352:3,4,6,9,11,13	272:16,19 280:2
262:9,14,19 263:7	<b>hes</b> 178:15 208:3,5	<b>homed</b> 289:19	352:14,15	283:14 333:10
263:15,19 264:3,9	211:3,5 234:23	<b>honestly</b> 189:17	<b>hundreds</b> 132:13	335:13
264:14,21 269:1	283:4,7	246:16,16	<b>hutchins</b> 259:2	<b>illinois</b> 106:15
272:23 273:12	<b>hesitant</b> 160:2	<b>honor</b> 285:12,15	<b>hypothesizing</b>	107:12 356:6
274:5 279:5,12,23	<b>hesitate</b> 175:13	<b>hope</b> 304:11 317:15	227:17	<b>im</b> 111:12,20
280:22 281:3	<b>hesitation</b> 214:1	<b>hopes</b> 208:21	<b>hypothetical</b>	113:11 116:1
284:17,21,24	<b>hidden</b> 237:24	<b>hopkins</b> 114:1	206:25 231:14	121:12 128:3

129:3 141:20	173:25 197:12	291:6,11 335:21	230:19 267:15	<b>intellect</b> 245:21
142:7 146:12,14	204:12 207:5	<b>included</b> 342:4	<b>initial</b> 150:13,13	<b>intellects</b> 181:11
147:12,13 148:24	213:9 224:18	<b>includes</b> 112:9	160:1 239:24	<b>intellectual</b> 145:17
150:12 159:6,6,13	226:23 227:16	161:18 236:17	261:4	183:25 184:1,24
159:19 163:11	231:3 234:13	335:11	<b>initiated</b> 122:5	309:9
164:17 166:11	244:7 247:15	<b>including</b> 196:16	<b>initiative</b> 121:10	<b>intellectually</b>
171:12,12,15,17	249:12 263:5	279:22 326:19	122:13,15 128:11	246:11 249:11
171:18,23,23	284:2 315:13	<b>income</b> 177:15	<b>input</b> 298:21 299:7	265:7
172:4 175:17,21	339:25	<b>incoming</b> 293:15	<b>inputs</b> 232:1	<b>intellectuals</b> 245:21
175:23 186:1	<b>imagined</b> 171:7	346:5	<b>insofar</b> 209:21	<b>intelligence</b> 188:2
187:17,24 192:15	187:15	<b>inconsistencies</b>	290:6 347:16	<b>intensive</b> 146:1
193:4,8,9,11,15	<b>immediately</b>	145:22	<b>instance</b> 232:4	<b>interact</b> 141:22
194:22 198:24,24	287:10	<b>increase</b> 122:9	258:13 293:14	182:20,23
200:8,11,16,23	<b>immensely</b> 344:6	128:20,22	336:2,13 337:2	<b>interaction</b> 141:17
201:18 204:21	<b>impact</b> 323:11	<b>increased</b> 129:2	343:16 344:19	283:6 297:7
205:20 206:6,6,7	<b>implemented</b> 337:8	<b>increases</b> 122:6	352:7	<b>interactive</b> 299:9
207:19,21,23	<b>implementing</b>	128:23,25 129:4	<b>instances</b> 256:24	<b>interdepartmental</b>
208:15 209:5,14	297:24	<b>increasing</b> 122:4	<b>instinct</b> 142:16	119:13
209:15 210:13	<b>imply</b> 222:11	140:1,14	<b>institution</b> 169:15	<b>interdisciplinary</b>
211:5,24 212:11	<b>importance</b> 145:15	<b>increasingly</b>	271:5	113:2 118:19
212:21 214:3,6	<b>important</b> 134:19	336:14 340:10	<b>institutions</b> 182:6	<b>interdivisional</b>
215:23 221:7,16	139:20 143:3	349:4	242:16	119:14
222:9 223:20,25	145:4,5,14,17	<b>incurs</b> 130:25	<b>instruction</b> 140:11	<b>interest</b> 144:18
224:12 227:2,16	158:1 162:10,10	<b>independence</b>	335:24 348:6	175:14
231:18 235:10	162:11 164:8	140:2 195:4	<b>instructional</b> 291:6	<b>interested</b> 171:24
236:12,12 239:9	167:11 195:9	282:10	292:13 310:13	255:7
241:22 242:12	196:24 197:11,15	<b>independent</b>	<b>instructor</b> 271:1,25	<b>interesting</b> 236:18
243:2 244:17	197:21 198:3	139:25 295:6	296:25 297:2	241:3 266:10
245:9,10,24 246:1	203:2 210:6,7,19	313:7	298:13 299:5,8	<b>interests</b> 167:21
248:7 251:1,2,13	210:19 214:23	<b>indicated</b> 321:8	301:16 303:25	244:6 309:10
257:7 262:22	215:8 218:5 227:1	326:22 334:21	305:22 311:5	<b>interfere</b> 167:13
265:20,22,23	233:2,4 239:20	<b>indicates</b> 243:14	322:19 326:16,17	219:16
267:10 270:5	243:25 244:8,10	324:21	326:25 330:24	<b>interim</b> 153:12
271:2,3,13 277:17	260:1 271:13	<b>indirect</b> 131:13	331:12 335:19	<b>intermediary</b> 311:6
277:18 281:9	275:25 314:24	238:2	340:19,20 343:20	312:3
282:5 286:20	315:3,5 347:15	<b>individual</b> 238:18	344:3 345:22,23	<b>intermediate</b>
291:5 292:4,22	<b>imposed</b> 167:9	255:23 279:8,12	349:1	269:16 312:15,18
293:18 298:17	<b>improper</b> 216:13	280:3 291:25	<b>instructors</b> 194:20	313:4
299:15 308:5,6	<b>improve</b> 292:18	300:25 304:4	258:4 292:25	<b>intern</b> 150:22
309:2 311:20	336:23,24 337:6	307:12 309:25	293:3,16 311:16	153:22 173:20
315:9 319:5	337:20	323:4 330:22	322:19 334:13	202:2,4 215:4
332:14 334:3	<b>inaudible</b> 176:4	<b>individuals</b> 261:8	337:3 342:2,17	255:17,22 257:12
339:19 342:24,25	183:9	279:25 280:4	343:23 346:10	257:13 258:13
347:21 351:16	<b>incentives</b> 331:8	294:13	<b>insurance</b> 121:18	265:15,21 269:23
353:1,4,18 354:9	<b>incidental</b> 197:15	<b>inferno</b> 342:24	121:19 125:25	270:13,14 273:24
<b>imagine</b> 155:21	203:11	<b>informal</b> 143:24	129:1	274:1 280:7 281:2
164:19 172:6	<b>include</b> 122:20	<b>information</b> 197:6	<b>integral</b> 137:22	301:10,14,17

330:12,13,15	336:1	<b>jessica</b> 144:5	222:5 259:9	200:20 201:12,20
331:10 332:3,20	<b>involvement</b> 293:9	<b>jewish</b> 111:23	262:25 267:20	201:21 202:3,5,7
334:24 345:21	315:7	190:16	276:12 280:9	202:9,13 203:8,16
347:22 348:18,19	<b>involves</b> 203:4	<b>job</b> 111:5 127:21	282:21 306:11	203:21,25 204:4,9
348:21 350:5,12	<b>iphone</b> 344:1	147:21 153:3	310:25 311:1	204:11,20 205:2
351:13	<b>islam</b> 167:25 168:2	156:25 157:3,21	312:12 319:2,21	205:20 207:1,12
<b>interns</b> 153:3	<b>islamic</b> 190:16	158:1,6,8,9	336:21 340:22	208:25 213:6,10
254:13 258:12	260:5	171:15 173:10	350:14 351:6,7	213:21,22 214:8
269:11,15 270:6	<b>isnt</b> 134:21 161:19	175:9,10 196:10	353:9	214:21,22,24
301:12 326:9	251:8 276:21	197:3,23 199:23	<b>kinds</b> 121:20 131:9	215:2,5,6,6,7,10
331:3 336:7 342:4	313:25 317:5	220:15 223:8	136:14 138:19,20	215:14,24 217:13
345:20 347:6,7	<b>issue</b> 130:19 299:3	231:11,17,22,23	144:18 153:17,24	217:15,15 218:25
350:17,18	<b>issues</b> 148:10	232:6,21 277:10	197:14 231:3	219:4,10 220:19
<b>internship</b> 223:1	172:21 328:10	303:10 307:18,18	<b>klitsky</b> 113:6	221:18 222:10,11
331:9 334:22	<b>italian</b> 114:19	322:23	<b>knew</b> 144:12	222:12 223:13,22
347:18 349:25	156:25 157:2,4,6	<b>jobs</b> 157:14 220:17	183:11	223:22,23,25
350:2,10 351:17	<b>italicized</b> 167:6	220:20,23 221:2	<b>know</b> 114:18 120:9	224:9,10,12,18,19
<b>internships</b> 152:1,2	<b>item</b> 135:2	237:12	120:23 121:15,20	226:7,11,13,19
153:13 166:9	<b>iteration</b> 283:16,16	<b>joe</b> 281:19	122:9 123:23	227:25 228:5,9,15
169:13 278:3,6	<b>ive</b> 114:2,3,8,9,10	<b>johns</b> 114:1 287:7,8	127:2 130:24,25	228:23 230:8,9,10
<b>interrupted</b> 211:10	114:11,12 115:16	<b>joint</b> 116:12	135:1 136:10,12	231:1,2,3,6,20,21
211:19	124:19 132:17,20	<b>jointly</b> 114:10,12	137:18,19,19	231:22 234:5,8,9
<b>interview</b> 307:18	133:16 138:23	346:3	142:19 143:10,10	234:10,13,14
<b>intimate</b> 179:5	140:24 146:15,16	<b>jonathan</b> 113:6	143:11 144:10	235:10,20 236:6
<b>introduce</b> 152:13	150:2 151:5	<b>judged</b> 140:9	145:1 147:5,7,22	236:11,25 237:3
183:16 266:21	156:18 164:25	<b>judges</b> 140:10	152:13,17 153:16	237:10,20,24
<b>introduced</b> 191:24	169:7 171:14	<b>judgment</b> 294:24	154:4,5,14,22,22	238:9 239:11,12
<b>introducing</b> 247:19	172:15,19,22	<b>judgments</b> 295:7	155:1,22 156:1,20	241:6,22,24
247:19	173:11 176:11	<b>jumping</b> 258:12	159:13 160:3	243:12,24 244:11
<b>introduction</b>	185:19 187:15		161:20 163:11	244:18,22 245:17
240:24 247:22,24	195:3 196:18	<b>K</b>	164:19 167:24,25	245:23,25 246:21
<b>introductory</b>	198:16 199:7	<b>kathy</b> 350:3 351:6	169:6,7 170:11,16	246:22,24,25
141:13,13 272:6	207:11 220:2	<b>keep</b> 171:19 244:24	170:24 171:19	247:2,6,12,15,17
333:13	241:4 247:21	248:11 258:12	172:3,3,8,10,24	248:4,13,17
<b>invented</b> 182:5	248:10,12,16	<b>keeps</b> 187:21	172:25 173:6,17	250:16 251:4,6,15
<b>investigator</b> 238:5	254:13,14 257:5,8	<b>keith</b> 181:10	173:25 174:19	251:18,20,21,23
240:4,5	257:8 268:12	<b>key</b> 145:19	175:7 177:7	251:24 252:23
<b>investment</b> 229:23	280:8,25 281:1	<b>kind</b> 112:11 118:11	178:17,21 179:20	253:15 254:17
332:11	282:15 342:24,25	128:8 135:19	181:8,9 183:8,22	256:14,15 257:8
<b>investments</b> 219:1		139:24 140:14	187:15,16 188:2,4	257:19 259:25
<b>invite</b> 181:24	<b>J</b>	142:15 145:10	188:6,6 189:12	260:12,15 261:12
<b>involve</b> 175:19	<b>j</b> 107:5,11	146:6 148:14,22	190:8,25 193:8,8	261:13,14,17,18
306:17	<b>jannota</b> 111:7	154:4 160:1	193:11,18,19	261:21 262:19,24
<b>involved</b> 137:8	<b>japanese</b> 330:5	164:15 179:3	194:1,14,22 196:5	263:2,4,9 265:3
292:20 309:7	<b>jeanine</b> 356:16	180:22,22 183:12	196:7 198:17	266:20,21 267:25
315:14,16,20	<b>jerusalem</b> 144:6	184:14 189:19	199:8,10,14,17,22	269:19 270:9
317:13,16 335:25	254:23 257:21	193:10 217:10,14	199:25 200:11,19	271:2,4,4 272:10

272:11,19,21	<b>known</b> 204:21	148:24,25 153:23	197:10 247:10	<b>lecturers</b> 153:5
273:20,21 276:10	224:10 237:25	168:1 170:11	294:10,15 297:25	326:9 327:11,21
276:24 277:5,8,11	<b>knows</b> 142:11	186:23 201:6,7	<b>learners</b> 308:8	342:8 343:5
278:1,17,25	173:20 180:2	203:4 223:13	<b>learning</b> 139:4	<b>lectures</b> 155:16
279:21,24 280:11	202:25 260:4	254:9 259:7	145:6 147:12,12	207:5 296:23
280:11,13,14	343:2	291:17,19	147:14,23 150:14	306:24 347:7
281:16 282:1	<b>konstanz</b> 287:22	<b>largely</b> 140:2	159:16,16,20	<b>lectureship</b> 136:1
284:6 291:20	288:2,6	294:13	175:14 184:1	140:17 152:3
292:4 293:1		<b>larger</b> 162:7	296:15 300:6	153:7,14 175:22
294:10 295:15	<b>L</b>	173:17 200:16	307:20,23 308:5	227:13,23 228:2,7
296:12 298:6,17	<b>lab</b> 176:19 237:21	201:6 279:19,25	342:15	232:5 234:1,12
298:22,25 300:3	237:21,23 238:2	<b>largest</b> 118:25	<b>learns</b> 180:18,23	269:16 274:20,22
300:20,24 301:4,8	238:14,15 240:6	119:3,23 252:17	<b>leave</b> 174:3 271:3	275:6,14 281:20
302:6,17,18	242:19,20,24,25	<b>lasted</b> 262:10	310:18 351:24	282:4 331:20
304:12 305:5,9	243:7 276:15	<b>latin</b> 173:4,5	<b>lector</b> 347:19,23	332:5
306:9,13,22	<b>label</b> 281:17	190:10	349:11,12,22	<b>lectureships</b> 155:2
307:17 308:5,17	<b>labor</b> 106:1 130:14	<b>latisha</b> 199:8	350:13	218:16 227:5
308:18 309:3	221:17 266:11	<b>laws</b> 160:25	<b>lectors</b> 326:11	232:10,11,20
310:19 311:12	356:3	<b>lead</b> 154:2 201:12	350:17,18	271:18 274:13,14
315:2,17,25 316:2	<b>laboratories</b> 177:5	280:2 283:24	<b>lecture</b> 144:11,14	281:11 284:12
316:22 317:5	<b>laboratory</b> 175:25	301:24 302:14,23	144:15 147:3,4,17	332:22
318:22 319:9,20	<b>labs</b> 131:14 176:14	303:1,5	148:11 153:4,23	<b>lecturing</b> 144:4,17
319:24 320:1,9	235:16,18,23	<b>leader</b> 149:8	201:7 213:18	147:19 298:5
321:21,24 325:9	238:11,19,20	<b>leading</b> 152:19	226:1 239:18	304:9 305:16
325:13 326:7,22	239:8	153:15 201:25	254:10,15 303:12	306:6
327:6 331:6,8	<b>lack</b> 262:20	257:4,6 262:15	303:14 304:12,16	<b>led</b> 182:9 255:24
332:9,14,16,17	<b>laing</b> 178:5	272:19 279:20	304:19,20,25	262:4 281:2
333:6 335:11	<b>language</b> 146:2	284:12 300:8	306:14,14,16	<b>leeway</b> 191:9
336:24 337:1,6,23	167:6 215:11	302:8 307:21	308:4 330:17	<b>lesson</b> 304:21 305:8
338:6,11 339:20	311:14 313:11	<b>leads</b> 160:17	335:8,12 340:10	305:10,14,25
340:7,25 341:7,8	314:1,7,9 315:18	<b>leadup</b> 229:12	<b>lecturer</b> 152:22	306:3,9,10,18
341:9 342:12	315:23 317:13,14	<b>learn</b> 142:24	153:11 195:13	307:2 343:18,21
343:11,23,24,25	318:3,6,7 322:15	143:18,22,22	205:24 206:3,12	343:22 344:10,11
344:4,6 345:12	322:16,17 326:10	149:11 161:20	206:15 207:3	<b>letter</b> 144:8 320:10
346:9,14 347:14	327:13,14,14,15	168:2 170:20	208:12 215:4	345:11,16
348:15 350:14	327:16,17 328:7	173:4,7 180:15	270:2,4,16,17,19	<b>letters</b> 198:18
351:14,17 353:4	328:10 329:20,21	181:12,14,15	270:25 271:7,12	233:17,20,22
354:1,4,6,8	329:22,23 330:1,2	217:20 219:12,13	271:13,14 274:10	<b>level</b> 156:8 172:23
<b>knowing</b> 144:20	330:8,11 331:5	219:14 233:5	275:16,18 276:4,7	180:9 229:18
197:13 347:16	332:1 334:2	249:2,6 265:21	276:23,25 277:24	243:15 267:14
<b>knowingly</b> 155:11	335:23,23 348:12	296:12,19 297:20	278:12,14 303:20	279:24 283:5
<b>knowledge</b> 135:20	349:5	298:2,6,8,9,11	303:24 311:5	292:18 313:5,24
170:8 177:10,12	<b>languages</b> 111:9,21	300:4,4,13 301:25	314:6 315:23	315:7 316:2 317:2
181:7 228:19	270:23 295:5	303:7 308:2 343:3	318:9,10 326:13	317:3 328:10
229:6 245:23	330:4,8 336:14	<b>learned</b> 142:23,24	326:14,15 331:11	<b>levels</b> 123:19
246:12 328:6	<b>large</b> 138:12	142:25 145:6	334:24 338:14	138:20 188:9
348:3	141:24 144:22	175:7 178:15,16	344:18	322:1,15

<b>liaison</b> 184:11	<b>logical</b> 332:24	<b>M</b>	199:11 213:23	<b>maximum</b> 222:19
<b>liberal</b> 137:12	<b>long</b> 111:17 112:12	<b>m</b> 106:16 107:11	233:6,7 266:12,14	<b>meadow</b> 239:18
<b>libraries</b> 131:15	118:7,11 148:15	354:25 355:2	266:18 267:4,7	<b>mean</b> 119:9 124:6
<b>library</b> 180:7 264:8	182:7 189:19	<b>ma</b> 113:17 124:13	286:15 288:18	130:4 134:2 138:5
<b>licence</b> 356:17	205:12 235:1,12	129:8 325:10	319:6	141:23 151:20
<b>life</b> 125:24 134:23	259:3 264:22	<b>maam</b> 165:25	<b>masters</b> 120:14,15	153:2,16 155:24
136:20,22 144:3	286:18 287:15	<b>madam</b> 285:6,15	121:3 124:2,2,4,6	157:16,18,23
195:14	288:5 293:5	324:1	125:8,10 126:12	161:19 162:8
<b>lifelong</b> 308:8	323:11 335:1	<b>main</b> 151:2 298:5	126:18 127:9,10	163:10,18 171:12
<b>lifes</b> 239:19	339:19 350:19	<b>maintain</b> 180:13	127:20,22 128:1	172:1,16 173:14
<b>limit</b> 161:3,10	<b>longer</b> 121:14	246:3	131:20,21 169:20	173:25 181:8,13
221:16,23	143:16	<b>major</b> 113:3	170:6,7,22 188:3	181:25 184:21
<b>limitation</b> 161:6,14	<b>longterm</b> 196:9	119:21,25 213:14	199:16 228:17	185:8 187:15,25
325:20	<b>look</b> 115:18,20	<b>majority</b> 277:4	229:5,17 230:13	188:10 190:24
<b>limitations</b> 167:4,8	124:14,23 125:1	322:5	230:14,20 258:24	193:23 194:4
167:16	133:1,11 140:6	<b>majors</b> 115:1 119:5	293:8 338:13	197:12,16 202:16
<b>limited</b> 184:6	150:4 154:15	119:17,24 120:2	346:4 348:1	206:18,25 207:17
<b>line</b> 344:9	158:2 162:8 165:1	253:2	352:17,18,20,25	210:1 214:19
<b>lines</b> 155:17 168:10	172:1,16 180:17	<b>making</b> 151:10	353:2,7,8,12	218:2,21 220:25
<b>linguists</b> 118:18	183:7,13 220:4	169:16 200:11	<b>match</b> 167:21	222:6 225:21
<b>list</b> 204:16,17	233:8 245:24	217:8,9 218:25,25	309:12	227:11,15 229:16
235:16	260:16 266:6,8,19	290:13,25 317:18	<b>matched</b> 339:1	232:25 233:2
<b>listed</b> 115:25	267:9,11,13	323:17	<b>matching</b> 168:25	236:11,11 240:7
117:23 133:20	268:14 269:8	<b>manage</b> 115:1	171:16 308:23	244:11,23 245:15
177:5 239:17	319:18,19	<b>manageable</b> 256:15	<b>material</b> 139:5,20	246:16 247:22
265:6 274:15	<b>looked</b> 272:6,7	<b>managed</b> 317:2	143:1,2 144:12	248:7 249:1
345:7	<b>looking</b> 158:18	<b>manner</b> 293:6	147:16 148:19	252:25 256:2
<b>listing</b> 116:11	193:15 205:3	<b>map</b> 183:12	149:12,14 179:18	257:3,5 262:23
274:12	225:17 227:2,4	<b>maps</b> 145:11	192:25 195:15,21	265:3,19,22
<b>listings</b> 204:20	230:2 240:17	<b>march</b> 273:18	196:13 208:20	270:22 271:9
<b>lists</b> 274:13	260:16 274:10	<b>mark</b> 124:15	213:2 219:7	272:10 273:5
<b>literature</b> 111:9,22	<b>looks</b> 176:18	<b>marked</b> 115:14,17	240:24 244:25	274:13,19,20
113:7 114:11	<b>loose</b> 275:13	124:17,19 132:14	247:20 267:18	275:11,12 277:7,8
156:22,25 157:4	<b>loosely</b> 235:22	132:18 133:15,17	304:18 307:8,10	277:13,19 281:15
287:8 288:4 334:2	<b>loquacious</b> 142:7	149:25 150:3	<b>materially</b> 246:9	282:8 300:16
345:6	<b>lot</b> 114:18 120:17	164:24 165:1	<b>materials</b> 149:11	302:16 315:10
<b>little</b> 135:16 189:18	129:2 146:19	176:8,12 199:2	196:21 256:9	317:3,8,8 323:1
194:23 258:19,20	178:15,16 179:1	221:5,8 268:8,10	298:8 305:6,7	333:4 337:21
268:2 290:7 294:2	190:5 211:3	268:13	306:10 313:18	340:17,18 351:16
302:6 326:22	267:15,16,18	<b>market</b> 123:20	332:16 334:14	<b>meaning</b> 128:6
337:9 340:1	295:17 321:8	157:3,21 158:1,6	342:13 343:14,15	139:13 145:12
349:13	<b>lots</b> 114:13	188:9,10 322:23	344:21	147:20 154:22
<b>llp</b> 107:3	<b>love</b> 137:9	<b>marking</b> 198:25	<b>matter</b> 106:12	237:21
<b>local</b> 295:18 309:2	<b>low</b> 144:18 319:16	297:4	264:6 268:4	<b>meaningful</b> 210:8
309:3 321:8	<b>lowest</b> 323:20	<b>master</b> 116:17,19	318:20,21 356:4	210:20 246:10
<b>lodged</b> 289:9	<b>lunch</b> 234:18 252:6	169:10 189:13	<b>matters</b> 194:21	<b>means</b> 189:15
<b>logic</b> 143:24 312:24	<b>luncheon</b> 252:11	191:15 198:22	<b>mauerbach</b> 107:13	228:5 245:25

274:21 276:25	242:19,25 243:7,8	<b>mentors</b> 339:2	174:7,9,12 176:23	<b>move</b> 116:23 126:4
298:13 313:24	243:11 244:4,10	340:4	185:25 193:25	165:16,21 166:16
326:15 340:18,19	248:3 272:1	<b>mentorship</b> 351:7	194:6,9,17 206:21	176:20 208:8
<b>meant</b> 188:11	296:21,22 297:3,9	351:8	208:1,7,10,17	212:1,16 268:23
217:22 218:19	297:21,25 298:5,7	<b>merely</b> 282:6	210:11,15 211:15	306:16 312:24
220:19 247:5	298:14 299:6,23	<b>met</b> 203:18 225:25	212:1 214:8 216:5	337:24
<b>measured</b> 119:2	300:16,19,22	226:2	216:17 225:23	<b>moved</b> 111:3
<b>mechanical</b> 201:17	301:1 302:25	<b>methods</b> 276:16	226:14 229:1,14	165:19 166:3,5
<b>mechanics</b> 199:17	306:5 309:7,8	<b>metier</b> 130:11	231:19 234:17	239:24
250:16 348:24,25	317:20 319:5,24	<b>michigan</b> 107:12	235:2,5,8 237:17	<b>moving</b> 131:11
<b>media</b> 334:5,6	328:21 335:20	<b>microdetail</b> 120:23	237:19 243:4	165:24
343:16	340:12 344:17	<b>middle</b> 111:22	249:15,18 252:5	<b>multiple</b> 183:2
<b>medicine</b> 154:16	<b>members</b> 177:14	211:23	252:10,12,22	207:5 238:16
219:5	191:18 196:16	<b>mind</b> 259:5	253:3,6,14,19,23	254:10 274:19
<b>medieval</b> 114:9,11	202:19 203:9	<b>mine</b> 259:5	254:1,3,16 255:10	<b>mundane</b> 241:6,12
182:12,15,17,19	205:8,18 226:20	<b>minimal</b> 152:9	255:19,21 256:17	241:12 244:19
262:5 265:4	236:10 238:12,22	<b>minimum</b> 122:2	256:22 257:11,15	<b>muster</b> 350:4
<b>mediterranean</b>	239:10 242:21	<b>minimums</b> 294:24	257:18 258:2,7,11	<b>mutual</b> 180:21
190:11	243:25 244:6	295:2	258:18 259:17,22	<b>mutually</b> 137:13,13
<b>meet</b> 145:23 148:9	294:20 300:17	<b>minute</b> 166:2,11	260:7,11,19 261:2	
173:12 194:21	336:1	174:5 186:1	261:6,16,18 262:3	<b>N</b>
195:8 257:12,15	<b>memo</b> 320:13	264:13	262:9,14,19 263:7	<b>n</b> 107:1 108:1
258:3 341:22,24	<b>mentioned</b> 112:21	<b>minutes</b> 249:14	263:15,19 264:3,9	<b>name</b> 110:13 183:3
<b>meeting</b> 148:12,15	121:23 122:19,21	256:12 327:19	264:14 269:1	243:20 247:3
148:21,23 151:21	128:11 141:11	<b>misbehave</b> 172:17	273:12 274:5	281:19 285:7,20
171:17 178:12	150:17 157:10	172:18	279:5,12,23	314:3 316:7,7,8,8
255:20 257:21	170:13 215:13	<b>missed</b> 241:7	280:22 281:3	<b>named</b> 123:16
293:14 308:3	244:18 254:24	<b>missing</b> 356:12	284:17,21,24	<b>names</b> 183:3
316:6 327:18	260:12 262:4	<b>mission</b> 130:11	285:2,10,14,19	243:14 316:17
343:17,18	274:23 295:25	186:8 198:3	295:23 296:7	<b>narrow</b> 127:11
<b>meetings</b> 149:2,9	298:4 300:2	<b>misunderstanding</b>	299:13,16,20	142:17 209:22
150:13,14 151:4,8	301:24 312:20	354:9	300:10 307:22	<b>national</b> 106:1
151:10 192:23	314:3 318:2,5	<b>model</b> 289:2,4,8	311:19,22,25	237:18 238:4
196:14 255:1,18	329:21 332:23	<b>modeled</b> 184:2	316:11 318:15	240:9 356:3
255:19 256:23	345:19 351:18	<b>modern</b> 162:14	324:4 329:9,15	<b>native</b> 231:5
258:6 279:19	<b>mentor</b> 305:2	<b>modular</b> 275:5	339:8,11 353:18	<b>near</b> 336:13
328:9 342:1,4,6,8	340:3 344:25	313:16 328:2	354:1,13,19	<b>necessarily</b> 127:13
342:10 343:8	<b>mentored</b> 135:24	<b>mohammad</b> 178:7	<b>moment</b> 122:18	217:25 218:1
344:8	136:2 139:24	178:12 185:2	135:13,14 252:14	261:3 267:20
<b>melissa</b> 107:11	304:24 351:1	<b>mols</b> 106:13 110:1	253:20 308:22	<b>necessary</b> 156:13
<b>member</b> 182:15	<b>mentoring</b> 135:7	110:7,12,16 117:1	318:19 352:16	230:1 275:1
192:5 195:19	151:11 152:5	122:11 126:7	<b>monday</b> 354:24	323:19
196:9 202:24	155:4 297:9	130:23 133:22	<b>money</b> 121:20	<b>need</b> 127:19,24
204:5,18 205:1,10	302:21 304:8	149:18,22 151:13	170:11,13 236:13	131:1 141:25
205:10 233:10	305:13 340:2,11	162:1,5 164:12,20	<b>months</b> 177:13	143:9 144:19
235:25 236:8,15	340:22 341:1,12	165:18,23 166:1,4	<b>morning</b> 354:24	154:21 156:5
240:6,11 242:11	341:13	166:8,12,18,22	<b>motivational</b> 160:5	157:1,8 161:21

162:16 164:9	<b>nirenberg</b> 108:3	221:1,4 223:1,2,5	307:13 338:14	<b>offhand</b> 324:2
167:12 169:17	110:10,14,15,17	224:9 225:8	<b>observes</b> 328:11	<b>office</b> 165:14 188:1
170:19 174:24	110:22 115:16	231:15 233:10	<b>observing</b> 297:21	203:15,20,23
191:15 202:16	124:19 132:17	241:20 268:10	300:4 305:22	207:9 273:22
208:20 219:12,14	133:16 150:2	269:3 302:7	<b>obtain</b> 136:8	283:25 284:14
225:5,9,19 227:12	164:25 174:14	307:13 308:16	321:17	291:16,18,21
228:3 230:11,16	176:11 177:3	319:1,12,15	<b>obtained</b> 331:15,19	293:8 310:8
235:7 246:3,12,13	185:21 264:19	321:13,14 322:2	<b>obtains</b> 205:24	<b>officer</b> 106:14
246:15 260:5	269:7	322:11,24 323:3,5	206:12 332:5	110:1,7,12,16
272:11 278:22	<b>nlr</b> 356:4	324:3 331:15	<b>obvious</b> 131:16	117:1 122:11
294:9,14 301:4,8	<b>nobel</b> 113:6	335:20 353:3	<b>obviously</b> 141:23	126:7 130:23
301:13 303:7	<b>non</b> 135:1 221:18	<b>numbers</b> 252:23	151:10 301:21	132:21 133:22
309:17 310:11	<b>nonlab</b> 185:1	253:16,21 319:2	304:1 316:20	149:18,22 151:13
312:12 316:21,22	<b>nonresearch</b>	<b>numerically</b> 138:7	330:20	162:1,5 164:12,20
322:6,23 324:15	221:18	<b>numerous</b> 127:8	<b>occasion</b> 182:20	165:18,23 166:1,4
330:9,10 341:9	<b>normal</b> 138:2	<b>nutshell</b> 305:13	248:1,2 265:25	166:8,12,18,22
346:25 350:9	257:24		310:1	174:7,9,12 176:23
351:19 353:19	<b>normally</b> 138:25	<b>O</b>	<b>occasionally</b> 113:8	185:25 193:25
<b>needed</b> 142:23	240:10 298:18	<b>o</b> 311:18,19 312:2	219:21 348:14	194:6,9,17 206:21
214:20 322:25	305:9 306:7	<b>object</b> 200:23	352:21	208:1,7,10,17
<b>needs</b> 142:23,25	309:12 319:21	205:12 206:6	<b>occasions</b> 215:18	210:11,15 211:15
143:6 167:18,21	320:3,5 325:25	207:21 213:3	338:15	212:1 214:8 216:5
180:15 294:6	<b>north</b> 287:25	215:23 229:11	<b>occurred</b> 319:11	216:17 225:23
295:3 310:14	<b>note</b> 167:15	243:2 251:1	<b>occurs</b> 267:10	226:14 229:1,14
312:15,17	<b>notice</b> 106:13	<b>objection</b> 116:25	303:18	231:19 234:17
<b>neglecting</b> 282:20	<b>noticed</b> 156:19	126:6 130:7	<b>oclock</b> 234:20	235:2,5,8 237:17
<b>neither</b> 254:8	<b>notified</b> 199:22	160:20 166:6,7,10	235:3 252:7,8	237:19 243:4
<b>neubauer</b> 112:19	200:1,7	166:20 176:22	<b>odd</b> 181:9	249:15,18 252:5
<b>never</b> 139:25	<b>notifying</b> 233:24	193:1 206:19	<b>offer</b> 122:22 123:13	252:10,12,22
146:15 151:5	<b>notion</b> 245:22	210:10 212:9	124:5 130:5	253:3,6,14,19,23
171:6,15 172:7,15	<b>nourishing</b> 115:4	216:14 229:12	131:23,25 187:1	254:1,3,16 255:10
172:19,22 187:15	<b>novelist</b> 113:5	231:14 238:24	187:19,19 188:8	255:19,21 256:17
195:3 198:16	<b>nsf</b> 177:17 237:1,17	239:2 248:19	188:15,20 280:16	256:22 257:11,15
199:7 207:11	276:17	268:25 283:7	280:17,19 313:14	257:18 258:2,7,11
248:10,12 257:8	<b>nsfs</b> 237:16	299:10 300:8	319:2 330:21	258:18 259:17,22
280:8,25 353:5	<b>number</b> 115:13	307:21 353:17	<b>offered</b> 108:21	260:7,11,19 261:2
<b>nevertheless</b>	117:3 119:19,20	<b>objections</b> 166:1	109:8,9 116:13,20	261:6,16,18 262:3
319:13	121:9 123:10	<b>objects</b> 180:7,7	126:18 187:22	262:9,14,19 263:7
<b>new</b> 127:18 141:20	124:16,20 126:9	<b>obligation</b> 174:25	188:13,15 190:6	263:15,19 264:3,9
148:7 149:12	129:6 130:4	175:6	194:11 219:18	264:14,21 269:1
152:18 155:24	132:14,19 133:14	<b>obnoxious</b> 211:13	255:3	272:23 273:12
180:22 190:5	133:18 138:12	<b>observations</b> 341:5	<b>offering</b> 155:23	274:5 279:5,12,23
219:19,22 240:23	149:24 150:3	<b>observe</b> 296:24	319:25	280:22 281:3
344:23 346:2	164:23 166:25	298:4 303:16	<b>offers</b> 116:5 128:6	284:17,21,24
<b>nicomachean</b>	176:8,25 184:7	336:11 337:4,5,7	128:6 187:4,21	285:2,7,10,14,16
342:22	186:23 189:25	344:23 345:1,9	188:4,4 292:15	285:19 295:23
<b>nih</b> 177:17 237:1	194:2,12 199:1	<b>observed</b> 297:24	310:25	296:7 299:13,16

299:20 300:10	253:14,19 257:11	<b>option</b> 259:23,24	163:8 339:20	298:12 300:6,18
307:22 311:19,22	261:18 264:25	260:1	<b>packages</b> 131:6	301:6 306:18
311:25 316:11	265:10,24 268:23	<b>optional</b> 152:12	187:22	307:16 310:2
318:15 324:2,4	271:22 272:22	336:10	<b>page</b> 108:2 109:1	312:22 314:13,17
329:9,15 339:8,11	276:18 288:10	<b>orchestrated</b>	116:3,16 125:7,14	316:3 332:11
353:18 354:1,13	299:20 300:13	306:16	133:2 273:17	339:20,23 342:8
354:19	325:1	<b>order</b> 127:19,25	<b>pagebypage</b> 146:7	343:5 344:22
<b>official</b> 263:5	<b>old</b> 255:7	156:25 157:7	<b>paid</b> 125:20 189:18	348:11
281:17	<b>once</b> 144:2 151:24	243:14,19 278:23	242:4,6 246:10	<b>partial</b> 186:16,16
<b>officially</b> 235:23	152:1 160:9	305:2	249:21 250:14	352:22
282:1,2	166:17 169:7	<b>orders</b> 344:20	251:14,22 261:15	<b>participant</b> 248:16
<b>offtherecord</b>	185:9 219:12	<b>organized</b> 117:10	281:25	<b>participate</b> 177:4
132:20 354:20	226:10 229:11	148:22 219:22	<b>paper</b> 139:8,21	249:8,9
<b>oh</b> 119:9 121:4	255:3 258:1,9	333:20 346:3	143:16,16,17	<b>participated</b>
126:21 129:15	303:21 320:6	<b>orientation</b> 293:15	181:17 183:17,22	179:23 182:9,13
130:2 154:14	339:1	311:21 346:1	212:24 247:24	<b>participating</b> 151:3
189:12 218:19	<b>onceaweek</b> 148:23	<b>original</b> 356:8	298:20,24 300:25	184:24 279:18
220:19 236:18	<b>oneonone</b> 348:5	<b>outcomes</b> 267:22	301:8 328:20	298:16 344:7
250:9 258:23	<b>onepoint</b> 227:21	267:22	348:8	347:10
269:18 275:11	<b>ones</b> 138:9 188:15	<b>outline</b> 306:9,10,19	<b>papers</b> 144:25	<b>participation</b>
278:1	190:6 240:19	306:20	181:25 195:5	351:10,12,13
<b>okay</b> 111:25 113:9	248:14 267:25	<b>outlines</b> 268:20	201:24 202:10,20	<b>particular</b> 147:23
116:23 117:20	272:7 280:11	309:1,19	207:9 212:19	147:25 151:22
119:10 120:3	282:15 335:7	<b>outside</b> 153:21	239:20,24 297:4,5	167:21 183:11
121:21 123:1	<b>online</b> 193:16	157:21 214:15	298:10,11,18	188:12,14 194:7
124:1,9 126:4,12	<b>opera</b> 114:19	221:3 257:15	299:1 300:14	196:16 233:25
128:10,18 129:5	<b>operate</b> 154:17	280:16	301:5,6,20 330:25	254:11 259:19
129:15 131:4	<b>operation</b> 146:1	<b>outsiders</b> 181:24	<b>paragraph</b> 143:14	294:18 305:5
134:4 135:15	196:7	<b>outstanding</b> 166:13	167:6 269:8	309:16,21 310:14
136:5 141:5,11	<b>opinion</b> 251:24	187:8	<b>parallel</b> 334:7	310:20,24 311:2
144:15 148:16	353:14,19 354:2	<b>overall</b> 253:15	<b>parent</b> 217:6	312:13 318:18
153:16 154:7	<b>opportunities</b>	280:9	<b>part</b> 112:5 115:10	319:23 326:16
156:4 158:11	163:23 167:19	<b>oversee</b> 288:19	130:11 131:10	328:5,20 330:7
159:2 160:7 162:5	168:12 169:1,12	290:10	134:19 140:22	333:23 344:24
165:9,18 168:9	169:16 219:11	<b>overseeing</b> 309:22	158:1 159:12,12	350:6 352:2
170:21 171:8	281:18 347:4	329:7	159:19,23 160:5	<b>particularly</b> 178:19
174:3,6 175:25	351:19	<b>overseen</b> 340:8	175:6,11 178:16	183:24 255:7
177:22 181:1	<b>opportunity</b> 167:20	<b>oversight</b> 279:24	182:4,4 186:8	267:12 310:20
184:15 185:1,19	217:19 226:25	<b>overview</b> 315:24	189:18 190:3	315:17 325:10
193:24 198:20	255:4 277:10	<b>owe</b> 244:24	214:1 222:24	352:4
199:10 200:13	278:9 280:20	<b>oxford</b> 289:8	228:18 229:5	<b>parties</b> 354:21
202:7 214:10	281:22,24 284:11		253:4 254:14	<b>partly</b> 197:2,5,18
215:2 217:5	303:11,19,23	<b>P</b>	257:4 259:1	201:15 210:23
221:14,22 222:4	304:3,6 319:13	<b>p</b> 107:1,1 355:2	260:25 261:3,4,15	<b>parts</b> 159:8 238:3
225:16 226:14	349:8	<b>package</b> 121:6	261:24 263:12	243:15 276:11,11
227:2 228:5 235:6	<b>opposing</b> 132:21	123:1 131:10	265:8 275:23	<b>pass</b> 328:6
240:17 245:5	<b>opting</b> 131:24	159:12,14,20	276:17 278:5	<b>passage</b> 256:13

<b>passed</b> 206:15 334:20	311:14,17 327:24 328:8 335:21	345:4	252:13 273:12 279:7	<b>physical</b> 120:12 190:1 349:14
<b>passes</b> 350:4	336:2,15 341:2,3 351:9	<b>performances</b> 256:3	<b>petitioners</b> 198:25 199:1 221:4,8	<b>pi</b> 239:14 240:3,8
<b>path</b> 140:14 160:16	<b>pedantic</b> 193:10	<b>performed</b> 184:2 263:12,16	<b>petitioning</b> 226:1	<b>picked</b> 129:12
<b>paths</b> 138:7 214:23	<b>peers</b> 127:1 265:5 313:17	<b>performer</b> 255:23 257:2 272:24 273:1	<b>ph</b> 113:17,19 116:13 119:2 120:3 121:2,5,7 121:13,15,23 125:15,18,23 127:12,15,19 128:5,7 129:8,9 129:25 131:22 136:9 137:24 157:24 159:17 160:17 161:22 170:2,15 191:22 230:1,15 252:17 252:20 258:5 259:18 260:12 265:2 270:17 276:5 279:9 283:22 284:10 287:7 301:9 321:6 321:17 323:12,13 323:23 327:10 328:7 329:25 331:2 340:3 347:25 348:3 351:23 352:14,19	<b>piece</b> 143:8,12,19 241:10
<b>patient</b> 154:17	<b>people</b> 113:1,4,4 118:14 119:25 127:11,11,23 135:8 138:6 140:17 141:2 143:2 150:8,14 151:11 156:20,22 157:3 168:25 169:4 174:18,19 174:23 175:2,9 178:24 183:7 184:7,7,7 196:20 197:2,12 198:23 202:17,17 203:18 223:14,18 243:11 251:13 258:24 259:8 263:1 271:4 272:16 274:14 275:25 276:2 277:1,4,20 278:8 278:15,19,21 280:9 284:3,5	<b>performing</b> 338:21	<b>ph</b> 113:17,19 116:13 119:2 120:3 121:2,5,7 121:13,15,23 125:15,18,23 127:12,15,19 128:5,7 129:8,9 129:25 131:22 136:9 137:24 157:24 159:17 160:17 161:22 170:2,15 191:22 230:1,15 252:17 252:20 258:5 259:18 260:12 265:2 270:17 276:5 279:9 283:22 284:10 287:7 301:9 321:6 321:17 323:12,13 323:23 327:10 328:7 329:25 331:2 340:3 347:25 348:3 351:23 352:14,19	<b>pieces</b> 328:16
<b>pay</b> 124:3,4,9 125:11,18,23 126:15,15,17 177:18 186:11,14 186:16,20,22 236:9 266:17 268:7 275:24,24	<b>percent</b> 119:20 120:1 128:4 163:12 224:5 231:9 253:10,12 253:13 277:14,19	<b>period</b> 122:25 129:21 134:14 161:12 163:6 177:19 191:23 230:11 273:5 278:23	<b>ph</b> 113:17,19 116:13 119:2 120:3 121:2,5,7 121:13,15,23 125:15,18,23 127:12,15,19 128:5,7 129:8,9 129:25 131:22 136:9 137:24 157:24 159:17 160:17 161:22 170:2,15 191:22 230:1,15 252:17 252:20 258:5 259:18 260:12 265:2 270:17 276:5 279:9 283:22 284:10 287:7 301:9 321:6 321:17 323:12,13 323:23 327:10 328:7 329:25 331:2 340:3 347:25 348:3 351:23 352:14,19	<b>placed</b> 176:11
<b>paying</b> 131:22 170:10,12 228:19 228:21 229:7,8 266:16	<b>percentage</b> 131:19 213:6 277:5,11 278:25	<b>periodic</b> 122:6	<b>ph</b> 113:17,19 116:13 119:2 120:3 121:2,5,7 121:13,15,23 125:15,18,23 127:12,15,19 128:5,7 129:8,9 129:25 131:22 136:9 137:24 157:24 159:17 160:17 161:22 170:2,15 191:22 230:1,15 252:17 252:20 258:5 259:18 260:12 265:2 270:17 276:5 279:9 283:22 284:10 287:7 301:9 321:6 321:17 323:12,13 323:23 327:10 328:7 329:25 331:2 340:3 347:25 348:3 351:23 352:14,19	<b>places</b> 114:4 128:3 220:2
<b>pays</b> 266:18 291:4	<b>percentages</b> 253:1	<b>periodically</b> 183:4 183:6	<b>ph</b> 113:17,19 116:13 119:2 120:3 121:2,5,7 121:13,15,23 125:15,18,23 127:12,15,19 128:5,7 129:8,9 129:25 131:22 136:9 137:24 157:24 159:17 160:17 161:22 170:2,15 191:22 230:1,15 252:17 252:20 258:5 259:18 260:12 265:2 270:17 276:5 279:9 283:22 284:10 287:7 301:9 321:6 321:17 323:12,13 323:23 327:10 328:7 329:25 331:2 340:3 347:25 348:3 351:23 352:14,19	<b>plan</b> 293:14 304:21 305:9,10 306:9,10 306:19 308:17 343:21,22
<b>pdf</b> 241:15	<b>perfectly</b> 212:22 214:9	<b>permission</b> 227:12 228:7	<b>ph</b> 113:17,19 116:13 119:2 120:3 121:2,5,7 121:13,15,23 125:15,18,23 127:12,15,19 128:5,7 129:8,9 129:25 131:22 136:9 137:24 157:24 159:17 160:17 161:22 170:2,15 191:22 230:1,15 252:17 252:20 258:5 259:18 260:12 265:2 270:17 276:5 279:9 283:22 284:10 287:7 301:9 321:6 321:17 323:12,13 323:23 327:10 328:7 329:25 331:2 340:3 347:25 348:3 351:23 352:14,19	<b>planned</b> 157:17 297:2
<b>pearlman</b> 107:5 285:6,7,8,12,17 286:2 296:8 299:18,21 300:12 307:24 312:7 316:15 318:17 324:5 329:16 339:12 353:20 354:11	<b>perform</b> 255:25 297:11	<b>permitted</b> 161:3 325:21 334:18	<b>ph</b> 113:17,19 116:13 119:2 120:3 121:2,5,7 121:13,15,23 125:15,18,23 127:12,15,19 128:5,7 129:8,9 129:25 131:22 136:9 137:24 157:24 159:17 160:17 161:22 170:2,15 191:22 230:1,15 252:17 252:20 258:5 259:18 260:12 265:2 270:17 276:5 279:9 283:22 284:10 287:7 301:9 321:6 321:17 323:12,13 323:23 327:10 328:7 329:25 331:2 340:3 347:25 348:3 351:23 352:14,19	<b>planning</b> 155:16 308:21
<b>pedagogged</b> 162:13	<b>performance</b> 172:21 273:4,8 303:17 305:24 336:18,25 337:11 337:13 339:16,18	<b>person</b> 114:20 141:24 151:7 183:9 195:7 200:11 201:25 202:1 203:1 204:4 204:16,18 206:1 238:13 254:24 265:6 267:5,23 270:18 272:10,12 276:18,19,22 283:6	<b>ph</b> 113:17,19 116:13 119:2 120:3 121:2,5,7 121:13,15,23 125:15,18,23 127:12,15,19 128:5,7 129:8,9 129:25 131:22 136:9 137:24 157:24 159:17 160:17 161:22 170:2,15 191:22 230:1,15 252:17 252:20 258:5 259:18 260:12 265:2 270:17 276:5 279:9 283:22 284:10 287:7 301:9 321:6 321:17 323:12,13 323:23 327:10 328:7 329:25 331:2 340:3 347:25 348:3 351:23 352:14,19	<b>plans</b> 343:18 344:10,11
<b>pedagogical</b> 134:17 135:3,6,7 137:21 157:24 167:10,12 167:20 172:11 215:8 268:21 280:10 306:12 309:16 310:22 311:8 312:23,23 313:1 316:3 326:2 326:24 330:7 341:18	<b>personally</b> 175:17 175:19 177:23 254:5 256:24 261:19 262:4,14 263:8 280:23 304:23 354:7	<b>personnel</b> 236:17	<b>ph</b> 113:17,19 116:13 119:2 120:3 121:2,5,7 121:13,15,23 125:15,18,23 127:12,15,19 128:5,7 129:8,9 129:25 131:22 136:9 137:24 157:24 159:17 160:17 161:22 170:2,15 191:22 230:1,15 252:17 252:20 258:5 259:18 260:12 265:2 270:17 276:5 279:9 283:22 284:10 287:7 301:9 321:6 321:17 323:12,13 323:23 327:10 328:7 329:25 331:2 340:3 347:25 348:3 351:23 352:14,19	<b>platos</b> 143:3,4
<b>pedagogically</b> 138:8	<b>personnel</b> 236:17	<b>perspective</b> 307:4 334:1	<b>ph</b> 113:17,19 116:13 119:2 120:3 121:2,5,7 121:13,15,23 125:15,18,23 127:12,15,19 128:5,7 129:8,9 129:25 131:22 136:9 137:24 157:24 159:17 160:17 161:22 170:2,15 191:22 230:1,15 252:17 252:20 258:5 259:18 260:12 265:2 270:17 276:5 279:9 283:22 284:10 287:7 301:9 321:6 321:17 323:12,13 323:23 327:10 328:7 329:25 331:2 340:3 347:25 348:3 351:23 352:14,19	<b>played</b> 245:4
<b>pedagogs</b> 294:15	<b>petition</b> 225:5,10 225:19 227:6	<b>petitioner</b> 106:8 107:9 109:7	<b>ph</b> 113:17,19 116:13 119:2 120:3 121:2,5,7 121:13,15,23 125:15,18,23 127:12,15,19 128:5,7 129:8,9 129:25 131:22 136:9 137:24 157:24 159:17 160:17 161:22 170:2,15 191:22 230:1,15 252:17 252:20 258:5 259:18 260:12 265:2 270:17 276:5 279:9 283:22 284:10 287:7 301:9 321:6 321:17 323:12,13 323:23 327:10 328:7 329:25 331:2 340:3 347:25 348:3 351:23 352:14,19	<b>please</b> 110:12 115:19 126:5 164:22 220:20 285:19 286:12 287:5,9 339:6
<b>pedagogy</b> 157:19 161:23,24 162:9 292:13,14 302:8 302:10 310:24	<b>petition</b> 225:5,10 225:19 227:6		<b>ph</b> 113:17,19 116:13 119:2 120:3 121:2,5,7 121:13,15,23 125:15,18,23 127:12,15,19 128:5,7 129:8,9 129:25 131:22 136:9 137:24 157:24 159:17 160:17 161:22 170:2,15 191:22 230:1,15 252:17 252:20 258:5 259:18 260:12 265:2 270:17 276:5 279:9 283:22 284:10 287:7 301:9 321:6 321:17 323:12,13 323:23 327:10 328:7 329:25 331:2 340:3 347:25 348:3 351:23 352:14,19	<b>plenty</b> 119:25 200:18

311:2 322:18	339:16,18	<b>postgai</b> 207:15	258:15 259:15	<b>prize</b> 123:11 140:7
327:8 332:2	<b>poorly</b> 338:21	209:4,6	260:14 296:23	155:1 175:22
338:17 349:10	<b>popular</b> 138:23	<b>potential</b> 187:23	304:21 313:13	178:5 187:2
354:12	<b>popularity</b> 267:19	<b>potentially</b> 179:19	344:9	218:16 227:23
<b>pointing</b> 266:11	267:19	226:5	<b>presentation</b>	228:1 232:5,9,11
<b>points</b> 134:11,12	<b>portfolio</b> 266:6,9	<b>power</b> 259:6	305:24 306:15	232:19 271:18
136:4,6,9 138:1	267:5,8,11	291:21	<b>presented</b> 181:22	274:22 281:11,20
139:10 140:1,22	<b>portfolios</b> 265:24	<b>powers</b> 117:18	181:23 305:14	282:3 284:11
145:15,16 148:9	<b>portion</b> 116:5	<b>practica</b> 135:23	344:11	<b>prizes</b> 113:6 283:4
150:23 152:2	133:19 134:3	<b>practical</b> 134:16,16	<b>presenter</b> 183:16	<b>probably</b> 126:25
153:5,7,9 156:6	159:24 291:9	135:3 137:21	247:19 248:9	224:11 337:23
157:7,16 159:9,10	<b>porzio</b> 107:5	268:21	<b>presenting</b> 343:20	353:10
159:11 160:6	<b>position</b> 150:24	<b>practice</b> 280:14	<b>prestige</b> 187:12,16	<b>problem</b> 172:22
163:9,16 168:13	168:20 205:24	329:23	<b>presumably</b> 157:1	211:18 233:9
168:23 171:16	206:12 213:24	<b>practices</b> 295:18	282:14	257:7
172:9 173:19	234:1 266:7,8	300:17 309:2,4	<b>presume</b> 129:3	<b>problems</b> 143:23
174:16,17,18,20	272:24 274:4	321:8	<b>pretend</b> 118:7	143:23 338:15
174:23,24 175:2,5	276:4,22,23	<b>practicum</b> 226:9	<b>pretty</b> 150:21	<b>procedure</b> 266:22
175:9,15,21,23	278:12,13 279:7	<b>pre</b> 207:17	163:3 168:24	<b>proceedings</b> 110:2
206:1,4,11,14	281:8,13,15 286:9	<b>preceded</b> 148:13	178:22 267:25	354:24 356:3
215:7 224:6,16	286:12,22 287:1	<b>preceptor</b> 328:14	295:19	<b>process</b> 199:18
225:1,9,25 226:2	287:13 288:1,12	328:15 331:24	<b>preview</b> 343:18	262:25 263:1,4
226:4,5,8,10,18	310:16 320:19,24	349:16	<b>previewing</b> 316:9	267:3 290:11,16
227:8,14,20,22	331:16 338:13,24	<b>preceptors</b> 328:24	<b>previously</b> 178:12	298:16,22 299:9
228:3,6 232:16	350:25 354:11	329:6,13,18	264:4	300:7,20,24 308:3
249:25 251:8	<b>positions</b> 198:9	<b>preceptorships</b>	<b>price</b> 132:1 187:20	308:24 309:5,23
261:9,11 269:13	266:1,4,5 269:12	326:10 328:24	<b>primarily</b> 112:25	310:9,22 314:11
269:13,21 274:16	269:17,18,21	<b>precondition</b>	115:3 120:13	315:8 316:16
275:18 277:20,23	274:12 276:2	331:10	123:21 163:2	317:2,16,23
278:10 309:18	278:23 286:19,23	<b>predominant</b> 138:8	289:5 301:19	328:17,23 329:2,4
310:2 312:11	292:1 318:4	<b>preference</b> 312:16	313:25 327:21	329:7,8 330:15
313:2 320:21,22	320:17 347:24	<b>preferences</b> 204:11	329:24 333:7,20	<b>produce</b> 158:10
321:2,14,14,16	348:1 354:5	205:3	335:18 340:8	220:15
322:2,5,9,12,20	<b>possibility</b> 153:14	<b>prefers</b> 344:3	345:14 348:7	<b>producing</b> 127:3,4
322:22,24 323:5,7	333:6	<b>pregai</b> 207:15	<b>primary</b> 112:24	132:8
324:19 331:5,15	<b>possible</b> 131:5	<b>preliminary</b> 301:14	180:13 289:13	<b>productively</b> 132:6
331:19 332:6	160:15 167:22	<b>premiums</b> 126:16	294:21 336:22	<b>professor</b> 110:22
339:21 351:11	168:11,14 210:6	126:17 353:12	344:24	111:7,15,19,20
<b>policy</b> 118:2 120:25	212:22 323:18	<b>preparation</b> 229:19	<b>princeton</b> 113:17	112:16,17 113:23
134:6 221:15	346:11	<b>prepare</b> 260:14	<b>principal</b> 162:18	114:1,2,4 115:16
303:14	<b>possibly</b> 217:12	<b>prepared</b> 310:11	162:19 238:5	124:19 132:17
<b>political</b> 112:10	<b>post</b> 138:18 191:13	328:1 332:16	240:4,5	133:16 139:5
138:22 139:12	191:16,17,21,25	346:11	<b>prior</b> 112:15,17	140:5 141:18
259:6	192:5 196:16	<b>prepares</b> 310:12	185:5 232:21	144:7 146:22
<b>poor</b> 255:23 257:1	204:18 260:16,18	<b>preparing</b> 144:9,9	287:17 304:8,24	159:16 160:13
272:24,25 273:4,8	<b>postcolonialism</b>	260:13 304:16	<b>priority</b> 312:8,21	168:1 172:16
336:18 337:12	152:13	<b>present</b> 181:24	<b>private</b> 342:7	173:2,12 174:14

176:11 177:3	314:23 315:1	<b>psychologists</b>	216:9,24	<b>questioning</b> 252:13
185:20 200:13	316:9,23	118:17	<b>qualifies</b> 350:16	<b>questions</b> 124:24
201:11 211:5	<b>progressing</b> 315:4	<b>psychology</b> 112:10	<b>qualify</b> 274:13	133:12 138:15
218:2 264:19	<b>progression</b> 301:15	118:12,14,15,16	<b>quality</b> 187:13,16	174:6 185:20
269:7 270:10	311:3 312:24	176:4,7,13,19	198:4 218:6	205:13,14,22
286:14,20 287:14	315:25 334:21	178:22,24 224:22	219:24 220:8	211:6,17,25
287:21,23,24	341:17	235:16,21,21	229:21	215:15 216:1,8
288:3,13,14 300:1	<b>prohibited</b> 225:19	236:2,4 237:4,8	<b>quarter</b> 139:2,3	231:16 248:9
306:25 308:3	<b>prohibiting</b> 224:25	237:10,11,12	161:13 168:19	252:3,15 264:10
<b>professorial</b> 111:16	225:4	238:11 242:14,18	173:11 190:23	264:19 271:22
158:9,25 245:19	<b>prohibits</b> 225:6	242:18,23 243:7	222:19 253:9	272:22,23 273:11
<b>professoriat</b> 136:23	228:10	276:15	303:21 314:15	273:13 277:24
136:24	<b>project</b> 243:22	<b>public</b> 113:12	315:5 319:15	279:8 282:22
<b>professors</b> 127:4	244:4 263:24	144:17	344:9 345:21,22	284:18,19
135:9,12 146:20	<b>projected</b> 128:20	<b>publicly</b> 182:2	350:21	<b>quick</b> 122:11
172:24 183:22	<b>promoted</b> 267:5	<b>publish</b> 244:1	<b>quarters</b> 139:4	149:17 164:12
211:8 219:13	<b>promotion</b> 267:1,2	<b>published</b> 178:12	259:13 333:22	295:23 316:11
238:18 302:13	267:14	180:20 243:9	334:23 335:3	<b>quickly</b> 322:21
<b>profit</b> 344:6	<b>proper</b> 216:2	<b>pull</b> 182:1	<b>question</b> 139:8	<b>quite</b> 152:9 179:7
<b>program</b> 111:23	<b>proportion</b> 213:15	<b>purchase</b> 238:6	142:9,13,13,17,22	180:6 197:14
117:12,19 127:18	278:1	<b>purpose</b> 170:13	147:9 154:5,9	213:9 214:3 275:5
128:2,3,5,8	<b>proposal</b> 325:15	248:24 249:1	160:2 164:12	315:9
131:11 134:18	<b>proskauer</b> 107:3,8	289:23 296:9	168:9,15 206:7	<b>quote</b> 114:19
144:5 171:25	<b>prospective</b> 260:15	343:17	207:24 209:22	<b>quoting</b> 155:18
175:6 215:4 230:4	<b>protocol</b> 243:12	<b>purposes</b> 151:14	210:16 211:9,20	
230:4 268:18	<b>proud</b> 113:11	160:5	211:22 214:2	<b>R</b>
295:13 313:11	128:3	<b>pursuant</b> 106:13	215:24 216:2,11	<b>r</b> 107:1 111:6
314:8 315:19,23	<b>proven</b> 127:13	<b>purview</b> 293:2	216:18,22 218:10	<b>race</b> 190:13
317:13,14 318:3	256:8	<b>put</b> 131:25 132:17	218:13 223:20	<b>ran</b> 255:9
327:14,24 328:12	<b>provide</b> 135:4,6,7	133:16 158:20	224:11 225:24	<b>rare</b> 124:5,8 140:25
333:9 335:23	174:25 217:19	170:17 172:18	228:25 229:2,4,12	168:24 214:17
346:16,17,20,22	219:10 236:24	204:13 233:3	229:13,15 233:13	337:14,22 352:22
347:1,6,10 348:17	280:16 282:22	236:13,19,21	233:15 239:5,15	<b>rarely</b> 170:4 188:5
349:9,15 350:3	346:7,15	250:11 253:8	239:25 241:3	331:4,12 337:14
351:5,10,14	<b>provided</b> 120:20	266:3 272:25	245:1,1,2,23	348:11 349:3,20
<b>programs</b> 112:18	121:2,7 305:15	277:7 305:7,10	246:13,15 251:2	<b>ratio</b> 318:23 319:10
116:4,6,11,12	341:8,13	310:23 312:14	253:18 255:11	320:4
117:7 119:5,15,18	<b>provides</b> 337:16	348:23	256:4,5 258:23	<b>rationale</b> 313:2
120:8 124:13	347:1 348:5 351:6	<b>putting</b> 304:20,20	271:3,5 277:18	<b>raton</b> 107:7
127:9,10,15,17	351:7	305:8	279:5,6 281:4	<b>reach</b> 141:2 171:10
128:7 138:1,13,17	<b>providing</b> 219:3		292:7,8 293:18	308:15 316:2
170:16 175:25	220:7,8	<b>Q</b>	294:1 295:16,23	320:1,4
247:8 292:17	<b>provost</b> 290:18	<b>qua</b> 135:1	299:14,17,19	<b>reaction</b> 173:24
302:8 323:24	291:16,18,21	<b>qualification</b> 325:6	310:19 315:10	174:1 232:25
327:13 335:21	310:8	326:15 348:16	321:7 324:12	<b>read</b> 134:4 158:11
350:19 353:3,8	<b>psychologist</b>	<b>qualified</b> 154:13,18	333:4 338:1 339:7	158:22,23 180:18
<b>progress</b> 153:13	239:17	154:19 215:17	353:21	195:11 203:19

219:7 225:7	170:1 188:9,10	<b>recommended</b>	333:10	<b>relayed</b> 197:6
241:15 268:16	210:22,24 224:20	325:2	<b>referred</b> 223:12	<b>relevance</b> 130:7,8
342:22	308:16 349:21	<b>recommending</b>	296:14	228:20 229:8
<b>reading</b> 142:14	<b>recall</b> 241:19 262:6	226:17 310:4	<b>referring</b> 122:12	<b>relevant</b> 179:18,19
143:3 221:11	324:2	<b>reconciled</b> 217:25	122:13 151:15	233:13 354:8
228:1 282:19	<b>receive</b> 126:13	218:1	162:7 220:23	<b>relief</b> 203:7
334:2	136:9 153:5	<b>record</b> 110:1,13	329:10	<b>religion</b> 114:9
<b>readings</b> 152:7	165:10 177:20	115:23 125:3	<b>reflect</b> 162:1,9	<b>remaining</b> 354:23
191:4 305:8 334:1	186:14,15 187:20	135:17,18 141:17	233:10 307:10	<b>remedy</b> 338:18
344:21	217:10 218:6	149:19,21,22	<b>reflected</b> 250:1	<b>remember</b> 119:24
<b>ready</b> 124:24	236:4 237:9	161:25 174:9,11	251:20	149:5 200:7 216:3
144:10 155:12	251:22,25 291:24	174:12 249:15,17	<b>reflective</b> 239:22	218:8,13 253:9
170:1,2 185:25	304:8 340:23	249:18 252:10,12	<b>reflects</b> 145:4	258:8 262:23
186:1	345:18,20	253:22 258:20	203:3	<b>remembered</b> 144:9
<b>realize</b> 349:4	<b>received</b> 117:2,4	264:14,16 266:24	<b>refugee</b> 113:1	<b>remembers</b> 215:25
<b>really</b> 127:1 143:2	123:13 126:8,10	269:10 271:1	<b>regard</b> 256:17	<b>reminded</b> 144:4,6
143:5 145:6,19	135:5 160:10,11	283:15 284:24	258:11 259:17	<b>remission</b> 352:21
146:6 158:3 163:1	166:13,15,23	285:1,2,5,20	263:7 265:24	352:22
169:25 172:7	167:1 176:24	297:3 298:13	293:5 294:18	<b>removed</b> 172:13,17
178:23 179:2	177:1 178:5,6	299:5 303:25	295:21 299:9	<b>renew</b> 209:10,10
182:1 186:24	187:3 269:2,3	305:22 322:19	305:3 310:2	<b>repaired</b> 196:6
195:1 213:12	326:3 356:11	324:16 326:17	<b>regardless</b> 209:17	<b>repeat</b> 136:21
214:24 215:19	<b>receives</b> 236:5	330:25 335:19	<b>region</b> 106:2 356:4	176:6 210:15
216:10 226:24	271:24	339:5,8,10,11,13	<b>registrations</b>	216:17 291:9
239:16 241:6	<b>receiving</b> 135:25	354:14,16,18,19	253:10	299:16 339:6
244:9 248:21	136:3 163:7	355:1 356:7	<b>regular</b> 248:16	<b>repeated</b> 292:7
258:23 268:4	203:11 225:12	<b>recorded</b> 176:15	328:9,12 336:11	<b>rephrase</b> 205:16
270:9 274:3,14	251:11,14	223:16	<b>regularly</b> 263:1	243:4 263:13
281:13,21 292:12	<b>recess</b> 252:11	<b>recording</b> 356:10	293:14 335:4	280:2 307:25
293:7,19 294:3	<b>recite</b> 111:17	<b>recrossexaminati...</b>	345:8	<b>replacement</b>
307:5 313:21	<b>recognizability</b>	108:7,9 273:14	<b>reimbursed</b> 184:10	191:10
315:20,24 317:8	229:21	283:20	<b>rejected</b> 356:12	<b>reported</b> 176:5
318:7 326:24	<b>recognize</b> 243:21	<b>red</b> 349:13	<b>relate</b> 174:15	<b>reporter</b> 111:10
327:16 332:24	<b>recognized</b> 239:19	<b>redesign</b> 344:20	270:10	291:8 292:6
336:11 337:9	<b>recommend</b> 175:22	<b>redesigned</b> 345:5	<b>related</b> 128:25	<b>represent</b> 115:23
338:10,20 343:13	175:24 290:15	<b>redirect</b> 108:6,8	215:16 216:8	125:3 129:24
344:6	291:13 320:14	252:14 264:11,17	238:12,14 239:9	133:18 147:9
<b>reason</b> 123:14	<b>recommendable</b>	264:20 266:22	319:25	283:14
130:5 147:18	138:9	273:11 283:19	<b>relations</b> 106:1	<b>representation</b>
157:23 158:4	<b>recommendation</b>	354:22	356:3	208:2
160:11 162:18,19	144:8 198:18	<b>redirectexaminat...</b>	<b>relationship</b> 135:24	<b>represents</b> 134:5
167:13 170:10,10	199:15,20 290:17	281:5	136:2 157:20,22	<b>reputation</b> 205:11
181:7 218:24	319:23 320:11,13	<b>reduced</b> 250:6,11	264:25 297:9	205:19
225:15 312:19	345:12	250:13	353:24 354:5	<b>requested</b> 111:10
327:23 328:23	<b>recommendations</b>	<b>reduction</b> 250:15	<b>relatively</b> 127:6	176:5 291:8 292:6
<b>reasons</b> 123:20	140:12 291:15,23	<b>refer</b> 275:7 285:15	271:10 274:17	<b>require</b> 134:8,11
130:4 162:11	291:24 310:6	292:4,9 296:10	349:3,9,20	251:8,12 260:25

323:7 330:4 349:6	238:21,23 239:9	304:17 309:22,24	226:24 230:22	<b>russian</b> 330:5
<b>required</b> 149:2	239:10,13 240:14	310:3 326:18,25	232:10,11 234:19	
190:4 321:17	240:15,25 242:7	327:3,5,7,22	240:7,23 250:22	<b>S</b>
322:12 324:19	243:16 244:4,13	328:15,18,18	251:13 252:5	<b>s</b> 107:1 252:20
<b>requirement</b> 136:8	254:5 261:1 262:1	329:6 332:13	256:7,21 262:16	265:2
136:10,16,19	263:8,10,25 264:7	340:20 343:20	265:13 268:8	<b>sake</b> 333:11
156:4 165:8	266:16 276:14,15	348:23	269:23 270:11	<b>sale</b> 270:14
169:22 175:11	289:4,9 308:9	<b>responsibly</b> 170:9	272:2,10 281:13	<b>sameness</b> 193:9,13
189:21,23 190:7	316:24,25 340:6	170:17,18	282:7 299:18	<b>sample</b> 272:8 350:1
196:2 221:24	<b>researcher</b> 137:7	<b>rest</b> 123:22 144:2	303:3 320:12	350:4
229:25 259:11	189:8 237:24,25	315:21	323:22 324:11	<b>sat</b> 281:1 307:1
321:11 323:10	<b>researchers</b> 127:3	<b>restate</b> 134:7 229:1	325:1 326:12	<b>satisfactory</b> 274:16
324:13,22 325:3	187:11 238:2	<b>restricted</b> 214:3	333:25	<b>satisfying</b> 196:3
352:8,10,24	<b>resident</b> 196:6	<b>restrictive</b> 258:25	<b>rights</b> 195:4	<b>saul</b> 113:5
<b>requirements</b>	351:8	<b>resume</b> 354:24	<b>risk</b> 142:20	<b>saw</b> 171:1 227:20
132:23 133:3,7	<b>resources</b> 131:7	<b>resumed</b> 110:2	<b>road</b> 107:6	<b>saying</b> 151:19
134:9 136:11	132:5 219:1 246:8	<b>return</b> 179:24	<b>role</b> 161:8,9 169:6	195:24 196:10
157:11,24 196:4	281:17 305:18	235:19	171:5,7 198:17	208:15 216:4,9,25
214:13,15 215:3	341:9	<b>returning</b> 346:2,5	233:16 245:4	217:1 223:20
259:18 268:19,21	<b>respect</b> 214:12	<b>revenue</b> 131:20	265:6 311:1,7,8	226:9 229:17
274:12 283:18	246:2 292:20	132:8	317:4 320:9	230:6 234:11
295:3 296:1,3,4	315:8 346:12,21	<b>review</b> 212:19	<b>roles</b> 159:25 290:12	237:5 240:18
321:6	347:24	265:25 267:2	<b>romance</b> 111:21	241:6 247:22
<b>requires</b> 137:1	<b>response</b> 216:19,20	307:2 314:14	330:7	256:4,5 267:10
276:5 294:25	<b>responsibilities</b>	<b>reviewing</b> 149:15	<b>rome</b> 345:7	332:5
323:8 332:9,10	207:9,14,16,19,25	<b>rice</b> 114:3	<b>room</b> 343:2	<b>says</b> 116:5 151:1
<b>research</b> 112:18	208:3,11,15,23	<b>right</b> 114:14 117:6	<b>rooms</b> 201:16	152:16 173:2
115:5 121:19	209:14,15,17	118:8 120:17	<b>rose</b> 107:3	199:4 213:3
122:20,23 127:23	217:24 223:10	128:13 129:17	<b>rough</b> 163:12	223:17 225:18,19
131:8,9,12,16	288:16,17 290:4,8	133:10 136:7	<b>roughly</b> 125:9,10	227:5 234:23
132:3,4,9 134:25	<b>responsibility</b>	142:20 148:1,13	161:16 192:24	243:19 257:6,6,7
137:2,4,7,13	136:3 140:15	149:14 151:17	253:11 318:22	268:5 272:11
160:18 161:16,20	144:21 146:23	152:23 153:2,6	<b>row</b> 247:14	324:8,18 325:2
161:23,24 162:12	151:2 152:4 172:2	159:3 160:1 161:2	<b>rule</b> 214:19,19,25	<b>scaffold</b> 341:19
162:15 163:1	172:8 203:12	166:10 167:7	214:25 215:1	<b>scaffolding</b> 341:18
164:7 167:13	209:5,21 271:16	171:21 178:23	221:19,20 224:25	<b>scenario</b> 254:11
177:11,13,16,19	299:3	180:25 186:12,22	225:3,6 226:25	256:18 257:12
177:22,24 178:9	<b>responsible</b> 139:13	186:25 188:24	318:25	<b>schedule</b> 167:18
179:4,4,19,20	139:14 151:9,12	191:6,9 192:15,19	<b>rules</b> 156:10 240:8	<b>scheduling</b> 122:9
180:4,5,23 181:16	182:15 209:1,8	192:22 193:9	240:10	<b>scholars</b> 113:1,1
183:14 185:1,10	270:18 271:23	197:1,11,18	<b>run</b> 139:11 155:3	<b>scholarship</b> 123:16
185:12 187:17	272:2 274:22	198:14 202:16	158:14,20 198:23	<b>school</b> 113:13,13
205:6 220:21	275:11,14 278:9	204:7 206:24	200:22 218:16	114:10 162:21,21
225:12 227:1	278:11 284:12	207:17 211:12,16	255:1,5 305:11	211:7,11 349:14
235:17,22 236:7	289:22 290:13,25	213:14 219:22	<b>running</b> 139:14	<b>schools</b> 111:18
237:5,9,22 238:12	291:3,5 298:15	220:10,22 222:6	256:9	127:7,7 213:17
238:14,19,19,20	300:21 301:3	223:9,11 226:10	<b>runs</b> 151:7 315:23	<b>science</b> 112:10

117:13 119:17	170:10 196:6	225:11,12,16,18	241:14 268:6	352:9
120:4,20 121:7,24	205:3 206:13	233:9,20,22 234:1	<b>sending</b> 233:16	<b>sequences</b> 190:2,3
123:7 124:10	273:17 286:21	234:6 257:25	<b>sends</b> 234:4,7,10	190:6,9 192:1
126:19 127:18	311:14,15 312:2	265:4 272:12	<b>senior</b> 314:6	196:18,19 269:24
130:1 136:17	325:17 327:25	280:15,20 290:10	315:22 318:10	333:21,23,24
154:8,10 155:21	328:7	309:25 310:1,1	329:1	334:8,12,13,16,17
169:11,21 170:23	<b>secondary</b> 289:14	312:22 324:1,7,11	<b>seniors</b> 328:16	334:25 335:2
171:3 189:10	<b>secretary</b> 317:10	324:22 326:23	329:12	342:3 343:13
190:21 199:15	<b>section</b> 129:6	332:24 337:7	<b>sense</b> 137:21	<b>series</b> 125:7 133:12
203:22 204:1,2	139:11 141:19	339:23 347:17	146:23 147:15	<b>serve</b> 301:12
213:7 214:13,16	150:19 151:12,12	352:10	152:5 178:18	322:17,18 332:19
222:13 224:5	152:5 153:8,15	<b>seeing</b> 181:16	179:17 189:7	334:23 340:9
231:7 237:18	190:23 192:4	<b>seek</b> 205:9 211:15	195:15 208:24	342:7 350:12,12
240:9 261:25	195:12 197:7,24	211:16 331:13	210:5 220:3,3	350:16
277:15 346:4	200:22 202:1,2,3	346:25 348:15	236:13 240:20,20	<b>served</b> 345:4
<b>sciences</b> 111:13	206:16 210:3	349:7	240:21 241:1,16	<b>serves</b> 311:7 320:9
112:1,3,5,7,13	222:20 223:2	<b>seeking</b> 168:12	242:7 243:17,18	<b>service</b> 111:7
113:7 114:15,21	236:16 254:19	216:19	244:23 249:3	<b>services</b> 280:17
116:5,14,21	255:17 256:9,18	<b>seen</b> 150:6 198:16	281:16 282:9	<b>servicing</b> 271:12
117:10 118:22	256:19,20 257:6	199:7 213:1 219:6	295:19 298:14	301:15 314:8
119:6,22 120:11	265:21 275:9,11	233:21 248:10,12	301:22 310:18	331:9 351:12
120:12,15 126:23	275:12,15 276:20	255:4 257:1,5,8,9	322:21 323:16	<b>session</b> 256:12
128:2 133:3,7,19	276:21 278:7,9,11	273:3	325:17 327:6,9	257:6,14,16
134:10 136:25	279:10,14,15,18	<b>segment</b> 140:16	328:19 329:7	258:14 298:6
137:12,25 138:15	280:5,13,21,24	151:22	330:14,20 338:6	330:24
141:1 147:11	282:6 283:23	<b>segmentation</b>	338:18,19 342:11	<b>sessions</b> 173:1
154:25 156:5	284:6 298:8	118:11	342:14,17 352:12	255:6 256:10
157:8,25 158:9	330:19,23 345:24	<b>select</b> 240:22 298:6	<b>sentence</b> 134:16	284:4 297:1
161:2,22 162:13	348:21 350:6	<b>selected</b> 272:7	215:20 227:4	306:23 343:19
165:10 168:10,22	351:5	<b>selecting</b> 314:11	<b>separate</b> 192:16,18	344:11
176:1 177:8	<b>sections</b> 139:1,2	<b>selects</b> 317:24	223:20 315:19	<b>set</b> 120:25 124:12
188:19 189:14	151:20 154:1,2	<b>selfdesigned</b> 312:5	336:5	139:21 152:11,19
190:1,1 191:16	191:2,3,4,8,11,17	<b>selfreflect</b> 307:6	<b>separately</b> 250:7	180:22 223:23
198:21 199:4	192:4,4,16,18,24	<b>semantics</b> 206:22	250:14	258:25 280:18
213:19 215:12	194:3,13,15,20,22	208:14	<b>sequence</b> 138:2	294:14,23 295:2
218:15 222:3	201:2,10,13,20	<b>seminar</b> 219:22	139:2 146:16,17	309:9 321:25
233:18 236:21	204:3 222:16,19	231:8 237:15	148:8 150:8,17,18	323:3,5
237:7 252:16	254:10,20 255:1,5	271:20 302:10,18	150:24,25 151:15	<b>sets</b> 296:1 322:2,24
259:4 268:20	255:5,13 258:3,4	310:24 311:14	151:16 157:20	<b>setting</b> 139:25
277:6 333:19	259:8 280:14	328:9 329:1 341:2	190:21 254:24	152:8 254:10
352:4	297:1 308:18	341:3	255:16 258:21,22	308:13 330:10
<b>scientist</b> 134:23	330:17 334:7	<b>seminars</b> 155:23	259:19 269:12	<b>settings</b> 254:18
<b>script</b> 180:19	335:11	158:14,20 219:18	312:13 333:17,18	<b>seven</b> 200:6 226:5
<b>season</b> 167:14	<b>see</b> 113:12 125:15	302:3 336:2 347:3	333:22 341:23,24	323:25
<b>seats</b> 253:1	142:2 159:2	349:13 350:15,15	341:25 342:2	<b>severe</b> 338:3
<b>second</b> 131:13	179:17,21 193:11	<b>send</b> 135:8 188:3	343:12,12 344:16	<b>share</b> 196:24 329:5
146:3 161:10	208:13 213:4	199:14,15,16,19	345:5 348:22	<b>shared</b> 242:20

282:11	126:13,22 129:6,9	<b>smaller</b> 120:11,12	352:3	<b>speaker</b> 231:5
<b>sharp</b> 178:22	129:13 133:1	213:14 254:17	<b>society</b> 112:19	<b>speaking</b> 134:9
<b>sheet</b> 226:11 234:5	150:5 155:13	319:9	259:7	144:17 319:5
<b>shes</b> 239:6 299:18	177:5 268:15	<b>smiled</b> 147:18	<b>sociologists</b> 118:17	<b>speaks</b> 173:2
316:3 351:8	269:13,24 271:23	<b>smith</b> 281:19	<b>sociology</b> 112:10	<b>special</b> 319:22
<b>shift</b> 181:1 308:22	320:23	<b>smurphy</b> 165:6,6	<b>socrates</b> 272:10	<b>specialist</b> 156:24
352:16	<b>sit</b> 145:11,13	<b>snaps</b> 211:22	<b>software</b> 223:13,15	<b>specialization</b>
<b>shop</b> 205:17	180:17 227:17	<b>so-called</b> 313:8	<b>solitary</b> 329:3	309:10 325:24
<b>short</b> 353:8	265:16,17 280:23	317:6,9 349:13	<b>solutions</b> 142:3	<b>specialized</b> 118:14
<b>shorter</b> 350:22	302:5 307:1 316:4	<b>social</b> 111:8,13,21	<b>somebody</b> 250:19	143:2
<b>shorthand</b> 143:25	337:5 345:3,10	112:1,3,5,7,13,22	250:20	<b>specific</b> 120:24
<b>show</b> 130:12 146:4	<b>sitting</b> 240:16	112:23 113:7	<b>someones</b> 280:24	143:1 211:17
157:1 158:5 164:2	302:18	114:7,15,21 116:4	<b>somewhat</b> 315:19	225:14 238:9
198:24 212:8	<b>situation</b> 141:18	116:14,21 117:10	348:23	265:6 270:7 276:4
234:24 260:5	172:4 207:1,12	117:22,23 118:22	<b>soon</b> 221:11	290:7 308:25
271:17 280:20	257:24 275:7	119:6,12,17,21	<b>sorry</b> 159:13	311:9 327:12
353:23,24,25	320:20 321:1	120:4,15,20 121:7	193:10 194:23	352:1,2
354:2	339:15	121:22,24 123:7	248:7 255:6	<b>specifically</b> 116:1,2
<b>showed</b> 153:18	<b>situations</b> 123:18	124:10 126:19,23	263:13 299:15	129:6,11 154:6
175:14 226:11	168:18 171:9	127:17 128:2	311:20 316:13	159:18
<b>showing</b> 173:5	231:4	130:1 133:3,7,19	347:21 351:16	<b>specify</b> 294:2
192:13	<b>six</b> 182:25 226:4	134:9,23 136:17	<b>sort</b> 163:24 179:5	<b>spell</b> 110:13 285:20
<b>shown</b> 191:23	268:2 323:25	136:25 137:25	254:4 304:13	<b>spelling</b> 178:7
<b>shows</b> 172:7	<b>sixth</b> 125:14 227:8	138:15,22 139:12	305:12 306:11,15	183:6
<b>side</b> 219:16 312:25	<b>size</b> 318:19	141:1 147:11	316:1 327:16	<b>spend</b> 127:16
314:2 316:24	<b>skill</b> 127:21 158:4	149:6 154:7,10,25	329:1 330:13	161:15 225:13
<b>signed</b> 204:24	180:16 215:9	155:21 156:5,18	338:11,15,16	293:10
<b>significant</b> 195:2	230:17 231:4	156:24 157:8,25	341:1,19 343:13	<b>spent</b> 195:14
<b>signing</b> 204:1,6	303:7 351:23	158:8 161:2,22	344:18 346:22	<b>split</b> 300:23
<b>signs</b> 204:15	352:1	165:10 168:10,22	<b>soul</b> 272:11	<b>spring</b> 314:15
<b>similar</b> 125:15	<b>skills</b> 127:13,14,18	169:11,20 170:22	<b>sounds</b> 155:18	316:6 334:17
127:9 185:7	127:24 147:1	171:3 176:1 177:8	227:25	335:13
217:13 334:21	170:14 180:8,9	188:19 189:10,13	<b>south</b> 106:14	<b>ssd</b> 124:3,4 163:8
341:16 349:16	212:16,17 229:20	189:25 190:13,21	107:12 325:25	<b>staff</b> 151:4,9
<b>simply</b> 135:1 141:1	298:2 301:18	191:16 198:21	<b>space</b> 237:20 238:8	191:14 255:18
163:22 198:18	<b>skip</b> 169:18	199:4,15 203:22	242:20	258:6 336:8
218:19 290:15	<b>slightly</b> 120:10	204:1,2 213:7,19	<b>spaces</b> 131:14	<b>stage</b> 142:4,5 145:9
310:22 311:4	223:3 350:22	214:13,15 215:12	<b>spain</b> 240:18	313:6 338:3
332:17 338:3,4	<b>slowly</b> 111:11	215:13 218:15	<b>spanish</b> 114:11	<b>stages</b> 150:14,16
<b>simultaneously</b>	<b>slug</b> 125:24 133:21	222:3,13 224:4	330:8	<b>stand</b> 110:10
222:17	<b>slugget</b> 116:1 125:4	231:6 233:18	<b>speak</b> 111:11	211:20 240:3
<b>sine</b> 135:1	<b>small</b> 127:6 254:13	236:21 237:6	122:16 138:24	273:25
<b>single</b> 338:2	275:8,11,12	242:3 252:16	200:15 203:16	<b>standalone</b> 232:12
<b>sir</b> 111:5,19 112:4	276:21 301:24	255:16 258:10	204:7 222:2	275:17 301:16
113:10,18,25	302:1,8,14 303:1	259:3,5 261:25	240:19 295:16	311:4 322:18
115:19,21 116:10	303:5 316:7 325:6	268:20 277:5,15	304:10 309:3	326:16,25 331:11
121:25 124:25	349:12,17	333:19 346:4	345:13	337:3 340:16,18

340:19,20 341:10 <b>standard</b> 221:24 250:19 266:22 <b>standardized</b> 191:8 <b>stands</b> 310:8 <b>start</b> 121:5 142:9 182:7 186:2 286:6 311:5,13,24 313:3 345:19 <b>started</b> 215:18 216:9,24 247:8 255:2 <b>starting</b> 139:19 <b>starts</b> 341:2 <b>state</b> 110:12 134:15 285:19 <b>stated</b> 125:5 <b>statement</b> 158:10 158:12,12,21,23 184:16 220:16,20 261:1 268:3 <b>statements</b> 260:14 260:17 268:4 <b>states</b> 106:1 <b>statistics</b> 277:18 <b>statute</b> 270:20 <b>statutes</b> 270:16 275:19,21 276:5 <b>staying</b> 117:6 <b>step</b> 153:12 301:14 302:19 304:14,16 311:6 <b>stepped</b> 293:7 <b>steps</b> 341:18 <b>steven</b> 107:5,5 285:7 <b>stimuli</b> 139:21 <b>stipend</b> 121:13,17 121:23 122:19,25 123:7,11,16,19,21 123:24 126:13 128:7 129:16 159:8,24 160:6,13 160:14 164:6,9 177:20 188:9,17 188:18 225:12 236:5,24 249:21	250:1,6,10,13 251:11,14 261:9 263:16 339:22,24 <b>stipends</b> 187:2,20 188:12,20 236:22 <b>stipulate</b> 165:5 <b>stop</b> 142:6 226:6 249:12 <b>strategies</b> 337:6,8 <b>street</b> 106:14 <b>strike</b> 154:9 208:8 <b>strive</b> 323:17 <b>strong</b> 205:11 <b>struck</b> 323:22 <b>structural</b> 149:2 <b>structure</b> 153:20 163:23 280:10 284:5 311:9 <b>structured</b> 138:14 149:1 <b>structures</b> 173:18 <b>struggling</b> 338:20 <b>stuck</b> 140:24 <b>student</b> 121:13 123:13 124:6 125:10,24 129:25 131:23 132:12,13 135:5 136:12 137:24 138:25 143:7,20 145:8 147:8 154:2 156:23 157:6 158:7,16 159:15 160:16 162:25,25 163:25 165:10 168:19 169:3 170:22 173:24 174:1 177:25 178:6,10 179:9,13 179:13,14 180:1,2 180:10,11,12 183:10,16 187:7 188:3 192:6 195:22 196:11 199:21,22 203:18 204:1,4,5,15,19 205:24,25 206:4	206:10,13 212:7 212:25 213:2,3,16 215:14 220:14 221:9 222:5 225:1 225:24 226:22 231:10,12,21 232:20,24 236:5 236:22 238:7,17 240:13 242:11,23 243:6 244:3,8,16 244:18,25 245:6 245:10 246:2,8 248:2 250:18,23 256:19 257:1,3,5 265:1 268:5 271:14,24 272:12 275:8 279:9 281:9 299:7,25 301:4 306:2 308:2 309:11,15 310:10 310:21 311:7 312:14,16 314:14 314:15 315:25 316:17 319:23 320:20 321:1,12 321:22 322:1 326:9,13,14,21 329:22 332:11 333:14 336:3,4,5 336:17 338:3,8,9 338:12,20 339:1,2 344:13 345:3,17 349:22 350:9,25 353:14,16 <b>students</b> 106:7 112:20 114:22 115:4 116:13 119:2,16 120:3,14 120:15,21,24 121:2,3,5,7,15,23 124:2,2,4 125:18 125:23 126:12 128:4 130:6,10,13 130:17,19,22 131:8,10,21,22 135:19 136:5,21 137:16 138:21	139:14,15,16 141:18 142:19 144:1 145:5 146:24 147:13,14 147:23,24 148:18 150:9 151:22 153:24 154:11,12 155:2,5,22 156:1 156:9 157:14 158:10 159:2,4,24 160:15 161:3 163:7,8,14 164:3 165:14 167:17,21 168:6,12 169:20 170:2,7 171:2,4 171:10 177:4,9,20 177:21 178:25 181:21,22 183:23 185:9 187:1,3,6 187:13,20,23 189:3,5,24 191:13 191:19,22 194:14 194:19 196:17 197:25 198:5 200:9 201:5,24 202:20 203:14,17 204:9,12 205:23 209:23 210:4 213:7,11,17 214:14,23 215:3,6 215:10,16 216:8 216:23 217:7,9,20 218:7 219:6,11 220:12,16 221:1,1 224:6,15 225:10 225:20,22 227:5,6 227:11,12,18 228:8,17 229:5,17 230:15,15,21 232:5 233:4,17,17 233:25 235:17,23 236:2,4,7,9 237:8 237:15 238:10,13 239:22,23 242:15 242:16,20,22 244:14 246:20 247:1,5,10 249:21	252:17 255:4,14 257:22 258:5 259:18 260:12 262:23 263:22,23 264:1 265:4 267:16,17,23 268:19 273:22 276:9,19 277:14 279:14 282:23,25 283:12,22,25 284:10 289:19 290:5,9,11,19,21 290:22,23 292:19 292:21 294:7,9,14 294:19 295:22 296:4,19 297:8,11 300:13 301:2,9,11 301:18 302:4,5,14 302:17,25 303:4 304:24 307:5,5 309:15 311:13 312:8,10,11,19 313:6,11,14 314:11,23,24 316:9,21 317:24 318:24 319:3,12 319:14 321:6,17 322:3,6,14,16 323:18,20 325:7 325:21,23,25 327:10,16,18,20 327:25 328:12,17 328:24,25 329:11 329:13,14,17,25 330:15 331:2,12 331:17 332:22 333:2,15 334:18 336:23 338:10 340:3,3,22,24 341:20 342:5,7 343:4,7 344:1,5,8 344:24,25 345:2 345:10 346:10,12 346:21,24 347:2,4 347:9,12,25 348:1 348:3,6,12,15,24 349:4,17,18
---	--	--	---	---

350:16 351:11,18 352:17,19,19,20 352:25 353:2,7,12 354:4,6 356:5 <b>studies</b> 111:22,23 117:13 181:3,20 182:12,16,17,19 184:6,10 190:13 190:14,16 246:19 262:5 263:6 286:15,20 287:2,2 311:10,12 316:14 316:14 317:21,24 319:6 323:12,23 324:8,9 325:4 336:1 339:14 340:2,11,25 342:25 <b>study</b> 122:24 134:13 170:5 190:16 227:9 333:2,13 351:20 <b>studying</b> 259:11 <b>stuff</b> 197:15 <b>style</b> 335:12 <b>subject</b> 135:14 163:13 168:3 194:21 237:23 264:21 <b>subjects</b> 114:5,13 178:23 <b>subjectverb</b> 143:24 <b>submit</b> 128:8 140:7 220:20 282:8 306:5 349:25 <b>submitting</b> 140:10 <b>subsidized</b> 137:3 <b>subspecialty</b> 269:20 <b>substitute</b> 299:22 <b>succeed</b> 209:3,6 <b>success</b> 128:9 347:14 <b>successful</b> 161:22 267:21 282:24 283:1 303:9 346:13	<b>successfully</b> 199:23 338:8 <b>suddenly</b> 328:3 <b>sufficient</b> 335:9 <b>sufficiently</b> 172:17 <b>suggest</b> 149:16 171:20 343:23 <b>suitable</b> 350:3 <b>suite</b> 107:6 <b>suited</b> 310:20 <b>summarizing</b> 132:23 <b>summer</b> 121:19 122:20,22 177:13 177:15,16,18 235:24 236:1,7 237:5,9 238:11 276:17 350:21 <b>summers</b> 122:24 <b>supervise</b> 300:20 <b>supervised</b> 135:24 200:5 283:12 284:8 <b>supervising</b> 155:6 302:20 <b>supervision</b> 231:25 313:10 <b>supplemental</b> 177:15 <b>supplies</b> 129:14 <b>support</b> 238:6 <b>supported</b> 137:13 282:16 <b>supporting</b> 131:23 <b>suppose</b> 200:17 <b>supposed</b> 311:1,2 <b>sure</b> 137:15 143:5 145:20 147:13 149:18 151:10 155:4 159:6,6 160:2 164:17 169:16 172:4 174:5 179:25 184:9 187:24 193:4 197:15,18 202:24 205:20 206:7,7 210:13	213:25 217:8,9,19 218:5,23 219:15 222:9 232:7 237:2 241:22 245:25 251:2 254:2 260:25 263:14 268:17 270:5 315:9 316:21 317:18 323:2,18 327:24 341:7 353:18 <b>surgeon</b> 196:8 <b>surgeons</b> 219:13,14 <b>surprised</b> 201:21 202:12,14,17 <b>susan</b> 239:17 <b>sustainable</b> 132:10 <b>switch</b> 124:1 <b>sworn</b> 110:11,18 285:18,24 <b>syllabi</b> 155:5 <b>syllabus</b> 140:6,12 152:9,11,14 192:12,17 195:16 282:11,12,17 327:4,6 334:15 343:15 344:20 <b>symbols</b> 143:22 <b>synonymously</b> 297:18 <b>system</b> 135:15,16 139:3 159:8 168:25 222:8,24 223:14,15,21 224:2 278:2 341:1 <b>systematically</b> 312:25 <b>systems</b> 223:23	185:7,10 195:13 199:24 200:2,2,3 212:7,18,23 213:18 261:20 269:13 270:1,8,10 270:13 272:24 296:11 297:18 298:21,25 300:18 300:22 301:2,3 303:15,19 304:1,1 304:2,2 305:10 306:2,4,19,24,25 308:24 310:19 318:11,20,22,24 319:17 320:6,8,9 322:17 330:13,16 335:15,17,18 336:8 337:12,18 337:23,24 338:7 338:20 339:1,15 339:17 348:19 353:15 <b>tail</b> 309:24 <b>take</b> 115:2,18,20 124:14,23 132:5 133:1,11 138:6,16 138:21 141:19 150:4 157:15 161:9 163:2 164:25 167:17 168:4 173:15,23 174:1,5 189:24 192:21 196:2 197:14 204:1 205:6 209:4,7 223:6 227:6,13 228:6 232:24 233:3 235:9,12 249:13 254:22 256:13 257:20,21 262:18 264:12 268:14 269:8 280:16 288:22,24 304:3,13 308:20 308:20,20 311:13 313:17 325:11 333:2,15 344:1	351:19 353:7 <b>taken</b> 115:24 125:3 133:18 176:14 256:1 263:12 <b>takes</b> 159:16 161:8 223:25 262:16 323:12 <b>tales</b> 335:14 <b>talk</b> 128:10 135:13 135:14 144:15 145:23 147:6 149:3,10 152:7 183:4,6 191:15 192:20 193:25 194:6,9 195:8 204:14 233:9 245:18 257:24 276:1 308:22 309:13 318:18 340:1 346:16 352:16 <b>talked</b> 140:16 189:9 196:14 204:22 205:5 209:23 221:17 232:4 240:13 242:9 246:18 275:7 <b>talking</b> 121:1 123:1 148:8,16,19 150:13 157:12 167:5 186:25 192:15 194:5 201:1 209:14,15 214:4 242:10,12 244:17,24 266:4 272:4 274:11 275:22 277:22,23 292:5 294:4 298:22 336:22 339:15 <b>talks</b> 133:2 173:21 211:5 <b>tank</b> 112:20 <b>tas</b> 141:14 142:12 143:22 145:13 146:18 148:12
---	--	---	---	--

---

**T**


---

**ta** 135:25 139:1,10  
144:5,22 146:10  
146:15 153:4,21  
153:23 154:3  
171:11,14 172:13  
172:20,25 173:2  
173:12 175:21

200:10 201:6 209:24 254:5,6,7 254:13,14 255:14 270:1 296:19,23 298:2,18 299:22 300:23 301:24 302:20,21 303:11 303:15 304:8,13 307:5,14 308:11 308:13,14,23 309:8,20 319:4 327:15 335:5,21 336:6,17 337:19 340:9 <b>taship</b> 153:6 <b>task</b> 203:11 223:24 231:24 <b>tasks</b> 148:17 244:19 <b>taught</b> 114:5,9,9,10 114:11,13 137:19 138:23 141:12 143:6 146:17 149:13 171:2 186:5,6 190:23 191:12,18,18 192:4,5,6 194:2 195:3,18,21,21 196:18,19 204:3 204:25 219:5 220:2 230:21 255:12,13,15 303:5 312:15,17 313:12,18 316:2 322:1 338:13 342:21 343:7 345:2 352:7 <b>tax</b> 160:25 252:1 <b>teach</b> 114:8 115:1 140:8 144:19,24 146:20 149:8,9 150:15,25 154:12 154:18,22,23 155:2,12,12,24 157:6 159:20 161:4 162:10,16 162:17 168:3	170:1,2,4,9,20,22 172:2,2 173:4,7 175:7,10,10,15 184:19,21 192:21 195:12 198:7 202:17 203:12,13 206:22 213:7 215:17 216:9,23 217:21 218:7 219:20,23 222:18 224:15,23 226:1,3 227:23,24 228:18 229:5,10 230:2,14 230:16 233:5 248:24,25 249:22 250:4,10,15 259:19 260:5 265:22 271:15 275:8 284:11 290:6 293:3 295:22 296:13,19 296:20 297:20 300:4 301:13,17 301:22 302:13 303:14,15 307:9 310:20 311:15 312:3,5,12,15,18 313:22 322:14,16 325:8,22,25 328:4 332:18,19 333:7 334:13,19,24 335:4,8,13 341:7 342:15 343:7,8,15 345:24 347:16 349:5,6,16 350:8 350:16 351:25 352:25 353:2,5,6 <b>teacher</b> 127:4 147:22 162:21 175:14 178:10 202:4 205:11,19 217:6 218:21,22 219:8 220:8 265:20 267:20,24 272:11 274:22 296:13 317:5,7 349:12	<b>teachers</b> 127:4 140:4 146:19 148:4 187:11 220:5,6 290:12 292:12 294:15 303:8 307:6,14 308:9 310:10 313:7 328:6 332:25 341:22,24 342:20 344:13,23 345:18 346:2,2,6 346:14 347:2,5,12 347:15 348:13 <b>teaches</b> 115:10,12 253:10 267:15 301:19,21 302:25 330:16 340:12 342:12 <b>teaching</b> 127:24 130:10,13 132:7 132:23 133:2,7 134:6,8,17,25 135:22 136:9 137:2,4,7,12,16 138:20 139:18 141:19,20 142:4,5 145:12 146:20 147:1,2,25 148:7 151:9,11,19,21 152:8,25 153:8,15 154:20,24 155:14 155:16 156:2,6 157:2,11,19,25 158:4,10,12,12,15 158:17,19,21,23 159:1,5,9,10,11 159:25 160:6,18 161:11 162:21,24 163:9,16,23 164:8 165:3 168:1,11,20 169:5,21 171:24 172:12 174:2,16 174:16,17,19 175:1,5 181:13 184:20,22 185:4,4 191:24 192:1,7,10 192:13,15,24	194:15 195:10,13 196:10,15,20 197:3,23,24 198:7 200:8,16,21 201:12,23 202:2 202:10,18 203:14 203:22 204:4,17 205:7,9 206:2,20 207:5 209:16,23 210:1,3 213:16 214:12,13 217:9 217:14,17,19 219:25 220:12,12 220:13,15,21 222:7,16,20 223:2 223:25 224:6 225:11,13 226:17 227:3,7 228:22 230:14,16,23 231:11,13,17 232:8,22,25 233:3 233:12 237:13,13 237:14 249:3,25 250:8,15,19,21 251:8,8,15,22 252:1 254:19,20 256:18,19 259:18 260:2,14,17 261:1 261:8,12 265:15 265:16,17,23,24 266:6,9 267:5,8 267:11 268:1,3,4 268:6,18 270:3 272:5 273:3 274:11,12 276:20 278:22 279:9 280:4,19 283:17 283:23 290:11,13 290:19,22,23,25 291:4,11,25 292:3 292:9,11,15,16,17 292:18 294:3,9,25 295:13 296:4,9,10 296:25 297:12,19 298:17 300:3 302:11,22 305:19 306:3 307:8,9	308:6 311:17 312:9 313:13 314:16 315:1,5 316:9,25 317:25 318:7 320:17,19 320:20,21,24 321:2,2,5,11,16 321:21 322:12,22 322:24 323:5,7,19 324:12,19,21 325:3,19 326:3,5 326:8 327:1,8,21 327:25 328:10,12 331:5,5,15,19,22 332:2,6,19 333:1 333:3,7 336:23 337:5,7,19 338:21 340:6,8,10 341:9 341:15,19,20,25 342:11,13,15,18 343:5,14 344:5,14 344:25 345:9,9,13 345:16 346:13 349:7 351:4,11,19 351:21 354:4 <b>team</b> 148:15 <b>technically</b> 117:17 270:15,16 290:15 291:18 317:5 <b>techniques</b> 302:11 <b>technology</b> 292:13 <b>tell</b> 113:9 114:15 121:24 124:24 135:15 141:16,17 150:4 164:4 165:2 165:15 180:20 188:5,7 189:15 212:7 218:10 226:23 254:8 268:14 286:12 287:9 288:5 289:1 290:8 302:24 310:9 <b>telling</b> 146:12 229:23 230:12,13 230:15 332:17 <b>ten</b> 121:11 128:23
--	--	--	---	--

129:2 241:4,23 328:25 <b>tend</b> 242:18 330:3 330:4 <b>tendency</b> 162:22 <b>tender</b> 354:12 <b>tension</b> 217:22 <b>tenure</b> 118:21 260:22,23 266:3,7 267:2 <b>tenured</b> 172:16 267:6 <b>term</b> 140:19,24 262:20 270:7 273:25 274:2,7 275:6,14 281:12 297:14 316:12,23 326:15 336:18 339:3 341:18 <b>terminated</b> 273:8 <b>terms</b> 119:2 121:25 140:23,25 157:13 157:18 205:8 222:9 229:19 239:12 245:10 252:17,25 253:1,2 302:25 312:11 313:25 316:23,25 317:17 318:20 340:5 <b>terrified</b> 173:9 <b>territory</b> 208:3 <b>testament</b> 255:7 <b>testified</b> 110:19 125:22 128:12 130:18 212:14 216:16 229:4 252:16 254:4 265:14 269:11 285:25 299:11 354:3,5 <b>testify</b> 128:19,21 <b>testimony</b> 185:23 188:16 208:10 216:1 224:4 228:25 <b>text</b> 139:18 147:9	180:19 197:13,13 241:17,17 328:5 345:7 <b>texts</b> 180:20 192:21 195:1,2,9,10 196:25 203:19 219:7 343:3 <b>thank</b> 110:16 111:15 131:3 133:10,24 149:23 164:20 166:19,24 168:15 174:8 185:20,22 212:4 221:13 226:14 237:19 252:9 254:1 261:2 265:14 269:5 273:10,11 281:3 284:19,22 285:10 311:22,25 324:6 329:15 <b>thankfully</b> 343:2 <b>thanks</b> 221:14 <b>thats</b> 114:7 117:20 120:19 123:8 126:3 127:5 128:20 129:12,18 130:10,11 132:2,5 133:20 134:25 137:2,5 139:3 140:19 141:9 142:16 143:8 144:21 145:17 147:8,8 148:23 150:3 151:17 152:24 153:9,10 154:14,20 156:2 156:13 157:2 161:1 162:2,13,17 162:18 163:2 164:6 167:7 170:9 171:13 172:23 173:2 178:18,25 179:20 180:22 184:22,23 188:22 188:23,24 189:13 189:17 193:6,10	195:23 197:1,2,16 197:18 198:3 199:17 200:16 201:11,15 202:1 203:8 205:13,14 206:24 208:1,9 209:20 210:7,25 211:5,23 212:11 212:22 213:24 214:17 215:8 216:2 217:14,17 218:12,20,22 219:2,9,24 220:1 220:7 221:7 223:4 223:15 224:13 225:10,21 226:25 227:23 228:25 229:22 230:9 232:2,7,12 234:20 235:5,25 236:18 237:22 248:19 249:3,4,6 252:21 253:17 258:23 261:23 264:9 265:6 266:10,21 268:3,6 269:23 270:3,15,24 272:1 275:13,19 276:12 276:25 278:11,13 280:8,14 281:12 281:21 282:5,7,15 283:11,14 284:16 285:6 288:9 293:12 294:1,21 294:21 295:1,8,15 296:16 297:10 298:13 303:2,6 305:12 308:6 311:20 312:1 313:9 314:16 324:20,20,25 325:6 326:11 327:8 328:2,20 330:6 333:4 339:24 341:13 348:13 352:12 354:8	<b>theirs</b> 238:20 <b>thematic</b> 333:23 <b>theory</b> 165:6 214:18 <b>thesis</b> 328:22 329:12 <b>theyre</b> 239:22 272:13 <b>theyve</b> 139:10 151:24 152:1 170:3 185:3 215:7 227:13 232:22 <b>thing</b> 112:24 133:12 135:19 137:9,18 142:10 143:9 147:11 148:18 155:9 159:22 165:6 167:15 171:25 181:13,15 184:14 189:17 195:23,24 201:17 202:16 227:24 236:18 270:14 281:23 282:4 <b>things</b> 121:20 128:25 130:5 131:9 134:24 137:2 142:12 143:21 144:19,20 149:3 153:24 155:17 161:21 169:13 178:14 179:2 180:6,6 193:11 197:10,14 197:20 201:16 209:7 219:17 240:16 241:6,12 241:12 246:7 256:16 267:13 270:22 272:14 274:19 280:15 302:9,22 306:18 308:18,20 317:19 332:16 344:21 <b>think</b> 112:20 114:21 116:3	117:16 118:4,24 120:10,11 121:11 122:3 123:6,25 125:22 127:11 128:12,18 130:8 130:11 131:6 132:19 137:8 138:8,14 141:12 142:14 143:3 146:22 147:21 149:8 150:12,12 150:20 151:24,25 152:12 153:2 156:7 158:7 160:12,12,14,17 161:13 162:17,22 163:3,20,25 165:22 169:15,25 173:1,6,17 175:7 175:8,12 178:13 179:3,16,18 180:12,19 183:5 184:22 185:23 187:24 189:4 190:24 195:8 197:10,20 198:2 201:11,17 203:1 205:14,18 206:24 207:11,15,20 208:14,19 209:20 209:20 210:25 211:13,19,24 212:9,22 214:17 214:20,21 215:5,8 216:2,13 217:5,7 217:12,14 218:12 219:9,22 221:17 222:6,18 223:17 225:6,17 226:7 227:15 228:25 233:14,14 234:25 235:2 238:13 239:11,25,25 240:19,21 244:8,9 244:10,15,22 245:3,7,12,17,19 246:6,23 247:11
---	---	---	--	---

249:2 250:9	242:3 253:24	354:23	130:17,25 167:11	168:18 171:19
251:17 252:19	255:16 258:10	<b>times</b> 195:11,11	167:12 219:11	203:3 209:6,22
258:18 259:4,4	259:6	216:7,7 219:6	289:24 292:21,25	211:6 212:21
260:1,2,24 261:13	<b>thoughts</b> 299:8	259:15 275:2	293:2 301:10,13	215:21 216:11,12
261:14,14,14	<b>thousand</b> 120:6	293:13 319:15	301:17 305:15	217:2,3 220:22
264:24 265:3,4	122:4 132:11	<b>title</b> 111:5 235:22	309:16 310:22	246:1 262:22
266:23 267:21,22	<b>thousands</b> 132:13	270:15 276:6	312:23,23 313:1	270:24 277:18
267:23 270:6	<b>three</b> 131:6 139:1,2	350:14	326:2,24 331:9	304:19 354:10
271:2,9,9,15	139:3,9,10,10	<b>titles</b> 111:16 276:2	332:25 334:22	<b>tuition</b> 121:14,17
272:5 274:19,20	140:1 146:10,15	276:4	345:17,21 346:8	124:3,5,6,9,12
274:23 275:2,10	146:17 150:22	<b>today</b> 121:15	347:2,4,18,19,19	125:24 128:6
275:10 276:25	151:25 152:2	220:20	348:16 349:25	131:22 186:11,15
277:17,18 278:17	153:13 173:19	<b>told</b> 118:4 161:1	350:2,5,9,14,19	186:16,17,20,23
282:25 289:6	184:7 198:12	226:20 276:22,24	351:17 353:9	230:7 352:21,22
293:12 295:18	205:13 250:4	<b>tone</b> 245:19	<b>trains</b> 347:7	<b>turn</b> 116:16 125:7
296:18 297:10	259:12 262:8,10	<b>top</b> 125:24 130:16	<b>transcript</b> 165:3	129:5 148:3
299:18,19 300:10	278:3,4,5 282:19	130:18 188:13,20	227:3 253:25	185:24 192:1
303:2,2,3 305:12	322:1,15 325:7	188:25 189:1,2,5	356:9	240:23 288:15
307:7,22 308:7	330:21 333:22	<b>topic</b> 139:8 180:2	<b>transformations</b>	320:13
315:13 318:15	335:3 347:24	181:2 255:6	345:8	<b>turned</b> 188:6
322:22 326:11,12	<b>thrown</b> 311:4 328:3	271:19,21 305:4	<b>transition</b> 143:23	204:25
333:6 334:3	<b>thrust</b> 155:15,22	309:13 328:20	220:3	<b>turns</b> 262:17,18
336:19 338:2	<b>thrusting</b> 156:1	<b>topical</b> 268:18	<b>traveling</b> 257:22	<b>tutelage</b> 296:21
345:5 350:17,22	<b>time</b> 112:15,17	<b>topics</b> 194:21	<b>tremendous</b> 130:9	<b>tutor</b> 347:19,21
351:22,23 352:4	115:25 122:16	<b>total</b> 120:2 129:18	<b>trend</b> 130:16	348:4,5
353:5,20	125:5 133:20	129:25 161:14	<b>tried</b> 143:13	<b>tutors</b> 326:11 347:8
<b>thinking</b> 162:23	141:14 146:3	227:7	<b>trivial</b> 143:9	348:9 350:18
204:21 246:6	149:17 161:8	<b>totally</b> 118:8	<b>trivially</b> 217:25	<b>twice</b> 303:21
<b>thinks</b> 160:13	163:14,14 165:11	185:10 212:21	218:1	<b>two</b> 113:6 118:3
187:8	165:11 170:25	282:19	<b>trouble</b> 272:15,16	127:17 134:24
<b>third</b> 112:14	176:15 179:21	<b>town</b> 114:20	272:18,18	136:3 137:1 153:7
131:16 134:13	182:25 191:23	<b>track</b> 118:21 266:7	<b>troubles</b> 337:19	153:9 161:12
161:14 281:25	192:8,11 193:6	316:22	<b>true</b> 123:8 126:25	169:25 170:5
312:2 313:8,8	195:14 197:13	<b>tracking</b> 234:5	147:13 148:23	171:5 184:7
333:14 341:5	204:6 217:18	<b>tracks</b> 165:7	218:23 250:2	205:17 215:18
<b>thirdyear</b> 312:6	219:1 224:21	226:12	270:15 276:21	217:24 222:16,19
313:12,24 341:4,6	225:13 230:11	<b>tradition</b> 181:25	356:8	250:24 263:3
<b>thon</b> 345:6	241:25,25 242:1	182:5	<b>truly</b> 338:10	275:18 281:7
<b>thorough</b> 267:3	245:1,1 249:4	<b>traditional</b> 152:14	<b>truth</b> 165:12	288:7 289:16
352:13	259:3,12 270:21	<b>traditions</b> 345:7	<b>try</b> 170:14 172:2	293:8 303:15
<b>thought</b> 111:8,21	272:17 283:2	<b>train</b> 130:22	204:9 205:12	322:20 325:4,7,17
112:22,23 114:7	292:9,9 293:10,13	208:25 347:6	211:24 231:24	331:21 344:11
117:22,23 119:12	294:10,15 296:10	<b>trained</b> 130:13	246:7 248:11	346:22 350:15
138:22 139:12	296:11 305:6	217:9 295:22	256:11,14 309:12	<b>twofold</b> 347:11
149:6 156:18,24	308:20 314:16	348:12	320:5 336:19	<b>tying</b> 137:4
215:14 219:8	323:11,15,21,24	<b>trainers</b> 276:9	<b>trying</b> 143:7,17	<b>type</b> 165:9 180:16
221:18,20 241:15	332:10 349:10	<b>training</b> 129:25	147:10 148:2,7,17	234:23 283:5

325:21 329:1 331:16 337:24 350:9 <b>types</b> 164:14 326:5 327:2,3,4 350:15	<b>undergraduates</b> 114:24 115:2,10 115:12 131:21 132:7 138:16 139:7,22 154:15 154:19 155:8,12 186:9,11 197:7,19 204:21 205:6,17 209:16 210:8,20 215:19,21 216:10 216:25 217:2,10 217:18 218:5,18 218:24 219:25 220:9,11 230:7 267:22 279:15 329:10 338:5 348:7	117:24 119:1,23 123:14 125:4,12 126:23,24,25 129:12 130:1,9,25 132:3,4,4,24 134:24 137:17 144:7 155:13,20 156:21 157:15 159:5,15,24 160:8 162:14,16 164:10 176:14 178:1,5 186:12 187:5,13 187:19,21 189:19 189:24 193:16 198:4 201:15 213:18 220:1,17 220:18,23 221:2 222:1,2 236:23 238:1 240:8,12 247:7 250:3 254:12,16 266:1,7 266:12 270:23 275:23 276:7,12 281:8 285:8,12 286:5,7,10,24 287:8,10,22,24 288:2,6,16,20 289:3,4,9 295:13 318:4,8 319:13 346:7 353:11 356:4	275:13 276:8,9 281:12 297:18 308:11 316:12 344:3 <b>useful</b> 144:2 267:12 268:6 <b>uses</b> 237:3 <b>usually</b> 140:6 146:18 148:14 192:1 201:2 227:21 232:13 235:24 247:23 248:1 259:12 263:3 267:18 274:25 279:18 304:2 325:7,16,23 331:14 345:11	<b>viceversa</b> 241:8 <b>video</b> 280:19 <b>videotapes</b> 305:24 <b>view</b> 129:24 159:14 179:12,20 203:6 236:3,3 301:5 <b>views</b> 205:4 <b>virginia</b> 144:7 <b>vision</b> 127:25 <b>visiting</b> 114:3 287:21 288:3 <b>visitor</b> 184:9,12 <b>visitors</b> 183:23 <b>visàvis</b> 290:9 <b>vitae</b> 134:19,21 <b>vocabulary</b> 307:13 307:17 <b>voice</b> 148:3,5 <b>volume</b> 291:17,20 <b>voluntary</b> 263:20
<hr/> <b>U</b> <hr/>				<hr/> <b>V</b> <hr/>
<b>u</b> 260:15 <b>ucla</b> 287:12,13,15 287:18 <b>uhhuh</b> 116:7,18 129:10 194:16 227:10 279:11 314:4 323:9 324:14 <b>ultimate</b> 299:3 310:4 <b>ultimately</b> 242:7 271:23 303:9 338:7 <b>umbrella</b> 279:19 <b>unc</b> 288:10 <b>unclear</b> 269:9 <b>undergo</b> 301:10,13 334:22 348:16 350:5,9,13 <b>undergone</b> 310:23 <b>undergrad</b> 193:15 195:18 <b>undergrads</b> 186:20 186:23 189:7 193:21 194:2 215:18 <b>undergraduate</b> 113:3 115:2 119:5 119:5,14,16 127:8 131:19,25 132:2 171:9,10 180:4 190:4,7,18 195:20 196:3 197:25 198:4,5 203:25 204:3 205:9 212:25 266:15 267:16 287:2 288:19,21 290:3 316:14 318:23 330:23	<b>underlying</b> 313:2 <b>understand</b> 145:8 171:4,6 192:22 209:21 216:11 217:2 218:2 249:24 315:9 354:11 <b>understanding</b> 134:5 147:22,24 153:10 160:3,7,24 221:22 249:20 285:4 <b>uniformity</b> 197:6,9 197:17 <b>unions</b> 192:20 <b>unique</b> 126:19,21 126:22 <b>unit</b> 281:20 <b>united</b> 106:1,7 356:5 <b>universities</b> 130:16 137:10,11 187:4 187:21,23 188:12 188:20 189:1,1 254:14 <b>university</b> 106:4 110:9,24 111:1,2 111:3 112:6,8,9 114:3,6 115:7,9 115:11,24 117:16	222:1,2 236:23 238:1 240:8,12 247:7 250:3 254:12,16 266:1,7 266:12 270:23 275:23 276:7,12 281:8 285:8,12 286:5,7,10,24 287:8,10,22,24 288:2,6,16,20 289:3,4,9 295:13 318:4,8 319:13 346:7 353:11 356:4 <b>universitys</b> 124:21 221:9 301:5 <b>unsuccessful</b> 282:24 <b>unuseful</b> 267:12 <b>unusual</b> 271:8,10 274:9,17,24 <b>updating</b> 240:25 <b>uphold</b> 320:5 <b>url</b> 133:22,24 176:15 <b>use</b> 123:11 180:15 187:2 208:18 238:6,7 239:12 246:17 270:7,20 270:21,21 274:2,7	<b>value</b> 135:23 245:1 298:21 326:20 <b>variance</b> 311:10 321:19 322:11 <b>variation</b> 122:1 <b>varies</b> 120:17 123:10 213:12 294:12 302:6 303:13 321:14 <b>variety</b> 146:19 219:6 240:16 340:4 <b>various</b> 117:7 128:19,19 154:8 167:4 243:22 290:12 292:16,17 294:3 300:16 314:11 316:18 338:15 347:3 350:11 <b>vary</b> 123:7,9 259:20 315:8 331:16 <b>varying</b> 309:2 <b>vast</b> 202:7 221:1 <b>version</b> 333:12 <b>vested</b> 290:17 <b>vetted</b> 282:13	<hr/> <b>W</b> <hr/> <b>wait</b> 166:7 186:18 <b>waiver</b> 121:17 124:6 <b>walk</b> 136:22 <b>want</b> 114:8 123:12 127:12 133:21 135:13 136:20,21 136:22 140:24 142:15,20 143:5 145:6 152:16 154:21 157:5 158:25 162:9 167:10,11,12,20 168:2 181:1 182:8 183:8 186:2 187:5 187:7 189:8 197:15 203:19 205:21 209:24 210:5,18,22,23 215:16 217:11,19 217:23 218:7,23 219:24 220:3 224:23 225:9,14 227:20,24 250:21 252:7 254:6

259:25 260:2,6	274:16 302:24	156:2 292:14	285:11,13,18,21	337:22 340:5,14
262:2 263:23	307:9 340:4	<b>whos</b> 195:10 257:3	291:9 296:6	340:14 345:15
264:12 266:6,20	343:24	<b>widely</b> 303:13	299:12,15 311:20	347:20
271:14,15 272:12	<b>website</b> 115:24	<b>wild</b> 108:12 285:13	311:23 312:1	<b>workday</b> 222:24
277:9 278:21	124:21 125:4	285:21,22,23	316:13 329:11	223:12
279:21 282:17	133:19 134:3,4	286:3,23 287:5	339:6 354:12,22	<b>worked</b> 113:14
301:12,12 304:1	176:14,19 221:9	290:4 295:12	<b>won</b> 283:3	144:13,16 177:22
304:15 308:8	<b>week</b> 139:16 152:6	304:23 310:3	<b>wonder</b> 150:4	177:23 178:3
316:1 318:18	161:4 162:2,4	325:20 336:17	268:14	179:9 185:2,3
319:3 354:13	221:23 230:8	339:13	<b>wonderful</b> 112:24	190:14 219:7
<b>wanted</b> 230:6	241:21,23 255:3	<b>william</b> 183:5	<b>wont</b> 114:19 131:2	231:8 240:13
240:22 256:10,10	258:1,9,9 282:19	<b>willing</b> 127:16	162:12 183:3	241:23,24 243:21
<b>wanting</b> 216:8	311:18,19,21,23	132:5	<b>word</b> 142:5 208:14	244:13 293:5
<b>wants</b> 183:21 260:4	312:2 343:19,21	<b>winter</b> 334:17	208:17 209:11	342:24,25
304:2	343:21 344:12	342:21	274:19	<b>working</b> 110:25
<b>war</b> 112:25 113:1	<b>weekly</b> 148:14	<b>withdraw</b> 210:12	<b>words</b> 134:7 143:15	136:2 140:5
<b>wasnt</b> 154:17,19	192:20,22 196:14	<b>withholdings</b> 252:1	174:18 186:20	167:24 178:13
160:2 215:20	255:19 256:22	<b>witness</b> 108:3,12	270:22 293:10	180:24 193:8
277:22	296:23 341:25	110:4,8,11,14	<b>wordy</b> 194:23,24	203:22 206:20
<b>watching</b> 245:2	342:4 343:16	111:11,12 122:15	<b>work</b> 123:9 137:1	212:7 236:17
284:4 345:22	<b>weeks</b> 350:22	130:17 131:4	143:15 149:1	238:14,18,19
<b>watkins</b> 356:16	<b>weighting</b> 282:21	151:17 162:4,8	150:19 158:12	242:24 243:6
<b>way</b> 117:6,8 126:19	<b>weitzman</b> 107:4	164:15 176:6,7	169:9,10 173:3	264:7 286:6
136:25 137:2	<b>welcome</b> 247:22	185:22 193:6	179:6 180:11,14	287:17 313:9
145:21 147:21	<b>went</b> 113:12,16,16	194:4,8,16,24	181:22 183:21,22	319:24 320:1
155:19 157:3	241:9 269:12	206:24 207:22	183:23,23 184:9	337:18 341:4
158:17 159:3	307:3,15	208:13,19 210:13	198:7 201:6 202:3	<b>workload</b> 308:10
162:14 169:5	<b>west</b> 107:6	211:19 212:2	202:24 205:23	<b>works</b> 135:15,16
172:5 179:6,14,22	<b>weve</b> 115:17 128:18	214:10 226:7	206:2,17 221:18	150:21 157:3
182:24 184:19,22	132:18 133:17	229:16 231:20	221:23 224:2	168:25 169:11
187:25 203:2	145:21 165:1	235:7,10 237:18	227:20 229:21	184:5 231:10
209:2,3,9 214:3	176:12 197:10	237:20 239:7,11	230:7,24 235:17	244:3 348:25
222:7,12,17 226:8	268:12 283:17	248:21 251:3	235:20,21 236:7	<b>workshop</b> 182:4,12
236:1 238:3	318:16	252:19,25 253:5,8	238:10,15 239:16	182:20,21 183:18
239:19 240:1	<b>whats</b> 118:5 121:2	253:17 254:12,21	239:19 241:9,16	184:3,4,8,18
245:16 246:6	135:11 139:19	255:15,20 256:2	241:20 242:4,13	185:15 246:19
249:25 250:11	143:8,11,17,19	256:21 257:3,14	242:18 243:23	247:9,13,18,20,25
251:20 253:8	145:4,14,17 154:8	257:17,19 258:6,8	244:11,20 245:6	248:4,15,23,24
263:17 266:20	157:21 182:3	258:17,23 259:21	246:10 247:10,11	249:2,6,9,12
282:18 296:16	189:20 196:24	259:24 260:9,18	250:21 255:24	262:4,5,17,20,24
333:18	208:12 210:6	260:21 261:3,13	263:11,11,15,23	264:20 265:1,2,8
<b>ways</b> 123:10 134:12	229:7 264:25	261:17,22 262:7	287:9,15,17 288:5	311:17 329:5
138:6,9 147:19,23	296:9 299:25	262:12,16,22	288:10 291:22	346:1 349:18
148:25 153:21	312:19 329:20	263:14,18,21	292:23 293:3	<b>workshops</b> 181:20
171:20 233:11,11	342:10 347:9	264:5 279:11,17	296:20 306:5,8,17	182:10 184:12
243:21 246:8	348:4,18 349:11	280:6,25 283:9	308:13 309:5	246:19 247:21
265:11 269:21	<b>wholesale</b> 155:15	284:22,23 285:4	316:24 329:5,5	248:6 292:16

293:15 328:9 330:21 <b>world</b> 112:25 113:15 127:20 128:8 129:4 135:8 137:11 188:4 220:25 236:23 237:10 242:22 259:1 260:13 334:1 <b>worries</b> 162:23 <b>worry</b> 233:8 <b>worth</b> 145:15 <b>wouldnt</b> 134:20 141:6 154:17 165:15 172:13 173:6 175:4,4,24 191:14 201:21 209:10,11 230:3,5 246:24 265:22 270:12 304:2 327:3 <b>write</b> 143:16 178:24 228:13 241:9 243:13 244:5,9 320:10,12 345:11,15 <b>writer</b> 347:17 <b>writing</b> 143:8,10,12 143:20 146:25 153:22 155:16 198:18 215:3,4 240:23 301:10,12 301:14,17,20,23 325:14 326:9,10 326:11 328:16,17 328:22 329:3,12 330:12,13,14,15 330:16,21,22 331:3,8,9 332:3 332:19 333:9 334:22,23 336:6,7 342:3 345:20,20 346:16,17,20,22 346:24,25 347:1,3 347:5,6,7,7,8,10 347:12,15,16,18	347:19,19,21,21 347:22 348:4,5,9 348:16,18,19,20 348:24,25 349:7 349:11,12,13,15 349:17,18,23,24 349:25 350:1,3,4 350:5,8,10,11,12 350:13,16,25 351:5,9,10,13,14 351:16,16,21,22 351:25 352:6,10 352:11 <b>written</b> 204:10 241:4 245:24 306:5,8 <b>wrong</b> 142:5,21 143:8,11,17,19 150:12 182:3 209:11 <b>wrote</b> 338:10 <hr/> <b>X</b> <hr/> <b>x</b> 108:1 319:24 <hr/> <b>Y</b> <hr/> <b>yale</b> 113:16 <b>yeah</b> 114:19 122:8 128:14 138:5 146:12 147:5 150:20 158:24 173:25 176:18 189:4 190:24 192:18 201:11 229:16 244:7 245:12 246:5 250:9,9 279:17 <b>year</b> 112:14 120:17 122:2,7,8,10 127:16 128:5,20 134:13 136:13,14 161:12 164:13,17 167:25 168:5 170:14,19 171:4 183:2,7 184:8 191:24 198:12 206:11,15 219:22 227:8 229:18	237:15 247:14 250:20,20,24,25 251:16 253:9,11 263:3,4 264:24,25 265:5 278:4,16,20 286:21 293:13 310:23 311:13,15 311:17 312:3,4,4 312:5 313:8,9,15 315:6 316:10 325:8,11,11,12,16 325:18,18,19 327:25 329:13 341:6,11 346:1 350:20 <b>years</b> 118:8 121:9 121:11 122:23 123:3,4,5 126:2 127:17 128:23 129:2 141:3 163:7 163:20 170:5 181:9 183:2,12 195:10 200:6,6 205:23 206:1 224:7,8,22,24 225:2 226:12 228:2 241:4 249:22 250:2,3,4 250:6,10 253:12 262:8,8,10,11,12 268:2 271:8 274:10,15,25 275:4 277:2,12,16 277:21,25 288:7 288:10 293:8 299:1 313:11,22 323:25 325:2,4 338:2 <b>yesterday</b> 110:3 <b>yields</b> 322:18 <b>yokich</b> 107:10 <b>youll</b> 235:2 271:15 324:15 <b>youre</b> 115:6 122:12 124:24 139:25 140:10 151:14 155:18 158:2	159:1,17 161:11 161:20,21 162:15 162:18 165:23 169:5 173:5,18,21 173:22 193:12 196:10 198:12 200:1 203:3 206:25 207:13 209:22 213:25 214:6,6 219:9 222:13,16 225:11 225:13,17 226:10 226:24 227:20 228:10 237:4 249:10,10 251:11 257:9 266:4,10 268:1 272:2 274:3 275:14,16 277:19 280:21 282:11,12 282:19,20 290:25 304:19 312:14 329:10 332:5 352:18 354:9 <b>youve</b> 143:13 157:18 158:5,5 159:10,20 196:19 219:5,6,7 226:18 227:22 234:11 254:18 265:11 271:17 279:25 <hr/> <b>Z</b> <hr/> <b>zachary</b> 107:4 <b>zell</b> 281:20 <b>zfasman</b> 107:8 <hr/> <b>0</b> <hr/> <b>00</b> 106:16 234:20 235:3,11 252:7,7 252:8 354:25 <b>000</b> 122:2,7,22 129:13,18 196:8 237:9 253:9 <b>084001629</b> 356:17 <hr/> <b>1</b> <hr/> <b>1</b> 109:8 119:20 167:6 198:25	199:1 231:9 235:3 235:11 252:7 <b>10</b> 252:6 <b>100</b> 194:3 <b>109</b> 108:4 <b>10minute</b> 247:25 <b>11</b> 222:21 <b>115</b> 108:19 <b>117</b> 108:19 <b>12</b> 234:25 240:18 321:18 322:10,22 323:8,10 324:19 <b>124</b> 108:20 <b>126</b> 108:20 <b>13</b> 106:2 108:19 115:13,18 116:24 117:1,3 356:4 <b>132</b> 108:21 <b>133</b> 108:22 <b>13rc198325</b> 106:6 356:6 <b>14</b> 108:20 124:16 124:20 126:5,7,9 129:6 <b>149</b> 108:23 <b>14th</b> 180:18 <b>15</b> 108:21 132:14 132:19 165:19,21 166:5,16 234:25 256:12 295:17 296:2 324:4,6,8 334:11 <b>16</b> 108:22 133:14 133:18 165:19,21 165:24 166:4,6,12 166:14 253:9 <b>164</b> 108:24 <b>166</b> 108:22,23 <b>167</b> 108:24 <b>17</b> 108:23 119:9,14 149:24 150:4 165:19,21,24 166:4,7,8,13,14 <b>176</b> 108:25,25 <b>18</b> 108:24 164:23 165:2,19,24 166:4 166:13,22,25
--	--	--	---	--

225:17 227:3	224:5	<u>9</u>		
<b>182</b> 108:5	<b>260</b> 108:6	<b>9</b> 106:16 354:25		
<b>19</b> 106:16 108:25	<b>268</b> 109:6	<b>93</b> 128:4		
139:13 176:8,13	<b>269</b> 108:7 109:6			
176:23,25 203:6	<b>27</b> 129:18			
235:15 330:19	<b>277</b> 108:8			
356:6	<b>279</b> 108:10			
<b>1970something</b>	<b>282</b> 108:13			
182:8	<b>29</b> 253:11			
<b>1980</b> 182:8	<u>3</u>			
<b>199</b> 109:8	<b>3</b> 122:22 167:6			
<b>1997</b> 287:22 288:11	237:9			
<b>19th</b> 107:12 289:5	<b>30</b> 181:9 195:10			
<u>2</u>	253:10,13 277:14			
<b>2</b> 109:9 125:7 167:6	277:19			
221:4,8 234:20	<b>300something</b>			
252:7,8 269:8	171:2			
<b>20</b> 109:6 161:16,17	<b>30s</b> 277:8,13			
162:2,2,4 163:12	<b>3123721361</b> 107:13			
221:23 264:2,6	<b>32</b> 253:12			
268:10,13,24	<b>333</b> 124:7 171:4			
269:1,3 273:16	<b>33431</b> 107:7			
274:11 283:16	<b>335</b> 171:4			
299:1 327:19	<b>34</b> 123:25			
334:11 338:2	<b>340</b> 107:6 120:18			
<b>200</b> 118:23	<u>4</u>			
<b>2004</b> 287:21,23	<b>4</b> 133:2 355:2			
288:8,11	<b>45</b> 119:20 120:1			
<b>2006</b> 111:3 287:16	<b>46</b> 355:2			
287:21 288:8	<b>4th</b> 325:16			
<b>2007</b> 111:4	<u>5</u>			
<b>2008</b> 286:8,21	<b>5</b> 196:8			
287:16	<b>5619954760</b> 107:7			
<b>2014</b> 273:18	<u>6</u>			
<b>2017</b> 106:16 356:6	<b>600</b> 119:20			
<b>20hour</b> 221:16,21	<b>60603</b> 107:12			
222:4,14	<b>61</b> 129:13			
<b>20th</b> 289:7	<u>7</u>			
<b>219</b> 106:14	<b>75</b> 118:8			
<b>22</b> 222:6,15,18	<u>8</u>			
<b>221</b> 109:9	<b>8</b> 107:12			
<b>2255</b> 107:6				
<b>24</b> 122:2,7 171:10				
318:23,23 319:12				
<b>25</b> 122:8 153:24				
163:12 200:9				